

**THIRD PARLIAMENT OF BHUTAN  
SECOND SESSION**



Resolution No. 02

**PROCEEDINGS AND RESOLUTION OF  
THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF  
BHUTAN**

(May 23 - June 27, 2019)

Speaker: Wangchuk Namgyel

## Table of Content

1. Opening Ceremony.....	1
2. Question Hour: Group A - Questions relevant to the Prime Minister, Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs, and Ministry of Information and Communications.....	2
3. Report on the National Budget for the Financial Year 2019-2020....	5
4. Implementation of Resolutions of the First Session and Status Report.....	15
4.1 Resolution on the Review Report of Chamkharchhu Hydropower Project.....	15
4.2 Resolution on the Status Report of creating qualification criteria for Gaydrung, and possibility of placing under Royal Civil Service Commission.....	18
4.3 Resolution on Status Report to Open Entry for Tourists from Border Towns like Samdrup Jongkhar, Gelephu, Samtse, Nganglam and Panbang.....	21
5. Question Hour: Group B- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Works and Human Settlement, Ministry of Agriculture and Forests, and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.....	23
6. Resolution on the Continuation of the Implementation of Resolutions.....	26
6.1 Review Report of the Good Governance Committee on the Petition to Avail Permits for Forest Related Services from the Gewog Forest Extension Office.....	26
6.2 Resolution on the Status Report of the Establishment of Flight Services from Guwahati to Yonphula, Bumthang and Gelephu.....	30
7. Introduction of Bill.....	32

7.1 Motion for the Introduction of Mines and Minerals Bill of Bhutan 2019 for the First and Second Reading.....	32
7.2 Motion for the Introduction of Civil and Criminal Procedure Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 for the First and Second Reading.....	35
7.3 Motion for the Introduction of Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 for the First and Second Reading.....	36
8. Motion.....	39
8.1 Motion on the Need to Review and Implement Bhutan National Human-Wildlife Conflict Management Strategy as a National Flagship Program.....	39
8.2 Motion on the Government to Review the RSTA Act to Increase the Load Carrying Capacity for the Trucks.....	42
9. Question Hour: Group C- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Economic Affairs, Ministry of Finance, and Ministry of Labour and Human Resources.....	44
10. Introduction of Bill.....	47
10.1 Motion for the withdrawal of Royal Bhutan Police (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019.....	47
10.2 Motion for the Introduction of Local Government (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 for the First and Second Reading.....	48
11. Resolution on the Review Report by Good Governance Committee (GGC) on the Annual Anti-Corruption Commission Report 2018.....	51
12. Question Hour: Group D: Questions relevant to the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Health.....	55

13. Resolution of the Motion to review all the existing and New Subordinate Legislations by the Parliament before it is endorsed to ensure that it is framed in line with the provisions of the parent Act.....	58
14. Report on the Pay Revision Bill of Bhutan 2019.....	64
15. Resolution on the Third Reading of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019.....	80
16. Resolution on the Sustainable Development Goal 3 - Good Health and Well-Being report.....	84
17. Question Hour: Group A: Questions relevant to the Prime Minister, Ministry for Home and Cultural Affairs and Ministry for Information and Communications.....	88
18. Third Reading of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019.....	90
19. Resolutions on the Review Report of the Pay Revision Bill 2019 by Economic and Finance Committee.....	95
20. Question Hour: Group B- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Works and Human Settlement, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and Ministry of Agriculture and Forests.....	105
21. Motion.....	108
21.1 Resolutions on the Motion to increase the Stipend of the Students of the Colleges under the Royal University of Bhutan...	108
22. Resolutions on the Review Report of the Budget for Financial Year 2019-20 by the Economic and Finance Committee.....	111
23. Question Hour: Group C- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Economic Affairs, Ministry of Finance, and Ministry of Labour and Human Resources.....	127
24. Resolutions on the Report on Sustainable Development Goal 4- Quality of Education by Social and Cultural Committee.....	131

25. Question Hour: Group D- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Health and Ministry of Education.....	134
26. Resolutions of the Re-deliberation on the Pay Revision Bill of Bhutan 2019.....	135
27. Motion.....	143
27.1 Motion to provide separate health facilities and to create separate employment opportunities for disabled people and include these programmes in Health Policy and Employment Policy.....	143
27.2 Resolution on Motion to Reduce Import of LPG through Alternative Use of Electric Ovens.....	147
28. Resolution of Report of PAC on Review of Performance Audit Reports.....	150
29. Resolution on re-deliberation Of Budget Appropriation Bill for Financial Year 2019-20.....	161
30. Resolution on Re-deliberation of the Amendment to Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer ..	167
31. Presentation of Annual Report on the State of the Nation, including Legislative Plans and Annual Plans and Priorities of the Government, by the Prime Minister of Bhutan.....	168
32. Closing Ceremony.....	177
32.1 Motion of Thanks.....	177
32.2 Concluding Address by Speaker.....	182

## **Annexure**

<b>Annexure 1:</b> Inaugural Address by Tshogpon Wangchuk Namgyel at the Opening Ceremony of the Second Session of Third Parliament of Bhutan.....	185
<b>Annexure 2:</b> Voting on the Need to Review and Implement Bhutan National Human- Wildlife Conflict Management Strategy as a National Flagship Program.....	190
<b>Annexure 3:</b> Voting on the Motion Regarding the Government to Provide Barbed Wires Fencing Materials on Cost Sharing Model (50:50) on Priority Basis as a Subsidy to all the Affected Rural Households.....	192
<b>Annexure 4:</b> Voting on the Motion for the Government to review the RSTA Act and refer the relevant section of the Act for Amendment.....	194
<b>Annexure 5:</b> Voting on the Review Report by Good Governance Committee (GGC) on the Annual Anti-Corruption Commission Report 2018.....	196
<b>Annexure 6:</b> Voting on the Motion to Review All the Existing As Well As New Subordinate Legislations by the Parliament Before it is Implemented by the Agencies.....	198
<b>Annexure 7:</b> Voting on the Bhutan Power Corporation or the Relevant Agencies Should Frame Policy, Guidelines, Rules and Regulations on the Transmission Line.....	200
<b>Annexure 8:</b> Voting on the possibility to avoid private registered land in the rural areas, and if inevitable for the need to substitute or compensate land for the ROW.....	202
<b>Annexure 9:</b> Voting On The Landscape Beauty Of The Locality Not To Be Compromised By The Construction Of Pylon Tower.....	204

<b>Annexure 10:</b> Voting on the Adoption of Third Reading of the Civil and Criminal Procedural Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019.....	206
<b>Annexure 11:</b> Amendment Bill of the Third Reading of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019.....	208
<b>Annexure 12:</b> Voting on the Adoption of the Third Reading of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019.....	212
<b>Annexure 13:</b> Amendment of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019.....	214
<b>Annexure 14:</b> Voting on the Motion for the Adoption of the Pay Revision Bill 2019.....	218
<b>Annexure 15:</b> Voting on the Motion to increase the Stipend of the Students of the Colleges under the Royal University of Bhutan....	220
<b>Annexure 16:</b> Voting on the Motion for the adoption of Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2019-2020.....	222
<b>Annexure 17:</b> Voting on the Adoption of the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2018-2019.....	224
<b>Annexure 18:</b> Voting on the Need of separate health facilities ‘to disabled people and include the Program in Health Policy.....	226
<b>Annexure 19:</b> Voting on the Need to Create Separate Employment Opportunities to Disabled People Who Suffered Body Growth and Include the Program in Employment Policy.....	228
<b>Annexure 20:</b> Voting on the Need for the Government to formulate a comprehensive policy on disabled person and report to the House in winter session.....	230

<b>Annexure 21:</b> Voting on the Need for the Government to change the policy to encourage the use of clean energy such as electricity and waive off or reduce the existing 20% tax on electric ovens and 5 % tax on related electric appliances in order to encourage the use of electric ovens .....	232
<b>Annexure 22:</b> Voting on the Need for the Government should improve the subsidized electricity in rural areas.....	234
<b>Annexure 23:</b> Royal Kasho Granted for Joint Sitting.....	236
<b>Annexure 24:</b> Voting on the Recommendations on the Performance Audit Reports by the Public Accounts Committee (PAC).....	137
<b>Annexure 25:</b> Voting on the Adoption of the Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer.....	240
<b>Annexure 26:</b> Concluding Address of Tshogpon Wangchuk Namgyel at the Closing Ceremny of the Second Session of the Third Parliament.....	242
<b>Annexure 27:</b> List of Members present during the Second Session of the Third Parliament.....	247



## **Resolutions and Proceedings of the Second Session of the Third Parliament**

### **1. Opening Ceremony**

The Second Session of the Third Parliament of Bhutan commenced on the auspicious 20<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 23<sup>rd</sup> May, 2019. His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo was received in an elaborate Serdrang and Chibdrel Ceremony by the Speaker, Chairperson of the National Council, Prime Minister, Cabinet Ministers, and Opposition Leader followed by Zhugdrel-Phunsum Tshog-Pai Ten-Drel ceremony.

The Speaker welcomed and expressed gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for gracing the Opening Ceremony of the Second Session.

The Speaker informed that on March 13, 2019, the United Nations Development Program presented a Special Award of Recognition to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo. Therefore, on behalf of the Parliament, the Speaker expressed heartfelt Tashi Delek and deep admiration to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

The Speaker also welcomed Her Majesty the Queen, representatives from the Monastic Body, foreign dignitaries, senior government officials, and the public who came to witness the Session.

The Speaker informed that His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo granted citizenship to 359 people, granted benevolent support to the victims affected by the natural disasters, victims of recent bus accident, and kidu to numerous people. His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo also offered a thousand butter lamps and prayers, in the memory of those who lost

their lives in a series of recent bomb attacks in Colombo, Sri Lanka. Therefore, on behalf of the Parliament, the Speaker offered deepest gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

The Speaker also informed the House regarding the agenda to be discussed during the Second Session. The Speaker further reiterated on the experiences from the previous two parliaments and need for continued building and adding value to the democratic system. The Speaker also highlighted on the need to continue working hard to fulfill the aspirations of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and hopes of the people during the Third Parliament. In conclusion, with the blessings of the Triple Gem, wise leadership and guidance of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, the Speaker offered prayers for the successful conclusion of the Second Session of the Third Parliament.

**Full Address is provided in Annexure 1.**

**2. Question Hour: Group A - Questions relevant to the Prime Minister, Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs, and Ministry of Information and Communications.**

The Speaker informed the House that for the day's Question Hour, there were seven questions for oral responses and one question for written response. The Speaker also informed that the opportunity to ask one supplementary question would be given in accordance with the National Assembly Rules of Procedure 2014.

**2.1 Oral Questions**

- 2.1.1 The Member from Panbang Constituency submitted that as per the Bhutan 2020 vision document, Economic Self-Reliance was the key national goal. The Member questioned the Prime Minister to brief the House regarding the status of the achievement of the goal,

Government's stand if it could not be achieved by next year, and ultimate way forward on that. The Member also questioned whether there were any major national plans and strategies to achieve it.

2.1.2 The Member from Drametse\_Ngatshang Constituency reported that one of the pledges to be implemented within 120 days of the Government was to recruit foreign domestic workers by reviewing and amending immigration rules and regulations. However, during one of the press conferences of the Government, the Minister said that the issue merit extensive discussions and analysis to ensure the country's security. The Member informed that the government was in place for more than 200 days and no development has taken place till then. Thus, the Member questioned if the security of the nation was not important then or was it ignored by the Party during the campaign. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs to inform the House as to when the foreign domestic workers would be recruited.

2.1.3 The Member from Bumdeling\_Jamkhar Constituency reported that traffic congestion has become a big challenge in the Capital City Thimphu, and it was worsening every year. The Member informed that there has been a comprehensive public transport system plan in place since some years back but not implemented till then. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Information and Communications to brief the House on the Status of the implementation of the plan, and the way forward in addressing the aggravating vehicle traffic congestion problems in Thimphu.

2.1.4 The Member from Maenbi\_Tsenkhar Constituency reported that among many favorable and important pledges of the present Government, one was the provision of vehicle quota up to Ngultrum

Fifteen Hundred Thousand for every household, and thus people are very excited about it. However, in the Fourth Pay Commission report, there was no mention of this provision and hence, the Member questioned the Prime Minister on what was the Government doing to fulfill the particular pledge and also the Government's consideration to include it in the pay revision.

2.1.5 The Member from Kanglung\_Samkhar\_Udzorong Constituency submitted that according to the Kuensel issue of 20<sup>th</sup> April 2019, Bhutan would be hiring 20 Specialists and 4 Sub-Specialists from Bangladesh at monthly salary of Nu.345,000 for specialists and Nu.311,000 for Sub-Specialists. They would be placed in JDWNRH, Mongar, Gelephu and some other District hospitals. However, the salary per month for the specialists would amount to Nu.6,900,000 and Nu.1,244,000 for sub specialists (Nu.8,144,000 per month X 12= Nu.97,728,000). It was submitted that instead of hiring Specialists from outside, the money could be used to train our national doctors or make use of the services of specialists who left the job, as a long term solution. It was reported that Government might change but hospitals would remain throughout, and thus, long term measures must be taken considering the huge financial implication when hiring from outside. Therefore, the Member asked the Prime Minister to share his thoughts on the matter?

2.1.6 The Member from Jomotshangkha\_Martshala Constituency reported that in the recent times, people from all walks of life have been clamoring about Bhutan Telecom's deduction of excess data usage. In this regard, the Member questioned the Minister for Information and Communications regarding the Ministry's plan and measures to address the issue.

2.1.7 The Member from Nanong\_Shumar Constituency submitted that the present Government pledged to increase Daily National Wage to Nu. 450 within the 120 days. It was informed that the same question was raised during the Question Hour Session of the First Session, and the Prime Minister responded that it would be included in the Pay Commission Report. It was reported that since it was not included in the Pay Commission Report, the Member requested the Prime Minister to provide clarification to the House.

## **2.2 Written Questions**

2.2.1 Written answer question submitted by the Member from Panbang Constituency to the Prime Minister.

The Member from Panbang Constituency asked the Prime Minister to give an update on the number of personnel recruited by present Government on special Contract so far and the pay perks and allowances fixed for each of them.

*Note: Detailed answers and deliberations to the above mentioned questions for oral and written responses provided separately in the verbatim book published for reference.*

**21<sup>st</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 24<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.**

## **3. Report on the National Budget for the Financial Year 2019-2020**

### **3.1 Introduction**

In accordance with Article 14.8 of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan and Section 47 of the Public Finance (Amendment) Act of Bhutan 2012, the Minister for Finance presented the National Budget for the Financial Year 2019-20 as follows:

The Minister reported that the budget for the FY 2019-20 was a means to achieve the objectives of the 12 FYP, fulfill the aspirations

of the people and the vision of Gross National Happiness. Moreover, the 12 FYP had been adopted by the Parliament and the policies and programs reviewed to align with the overarching goal of ‘narrowing the gap’. The maximum pledges of the Government for the 120 days were fulfilled and other pledges at various stages of implementation.

Similarly, with the aim to raise the morale of the public servants, the Government approved revision of pay, allowances and benefits of public servants based on the recommendations of the fourth pay commission (4PC), which would be presented to the House for consideration.

Moreover, with economic development that would go a long way towards ensuring fiscal sustainability, the construction of 720 MW Mangdechhu Hydroelectric Project (MHP) had been completed and preparation for the inauguration of the project was underway. With a generous electricity tariff already agreed, it was hopeful that export of electricity from MHP would bring substantial revenue to the Government. In order to strengthen Public Financial Management (PFM), the Government had also revised the Procurement Rules and Regulations.

His Majesty’s aspirations of “managing the available resources wisely, minimize waste, and ensuring that all our resources are directed at improving the wellbeing of the people” had been the core foundation for financial management system. For underpinning the PFM reforms, the Finance Committee within all budgetary agencies had been constituted as well.

Furthermore, as per the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan and the Local Government Act 2009, starting from 2019-20, the budget for the Gewogs had been allocated as annual grants and the Dzongkhag Development Grant (DDG) enhanced. To fulfill the objectives of the National Key Result Areas (NKRAs) and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), Gender and Climate Change considerations had been incorporated in the budget.

The Minister reported that along with the Budget Report for FY 2019-20, Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2019-20, Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2018-19, and Audited Annual Financial Statements for FY 2017-18 were submitted to the Parliament for consideration.

### **3.2 Stable Economic Outlook**

The Minister reported that, stable economic growth is essential for developing countries. Since the economic growth in the country had been stable, it was expected to grow each year. The economic growth in 2018-19 was 5.5 %. In FY 2019-20, the economy was projected to grow at 7.2 %. The economy in the 12 FYP was projected to grow at 6 % on an average.

The Balance of Payments (BOP) had remained positive owing to higher capital and financial inflows despite the persistent negative Current Account Balance (CAB). The Current Account Balance was projected to improve from a deficit of 18.3 % of GDP in the FY 2017-18, to a surplus of 5.2 % in 2021-22.

In addition, the reserves stood at USD 1,082.204 million as on 31<sup>st</sup> March 2019 which was sufficient to cover 13.7 months of merchandise imports or 23.7 months of essential imports fulfilling

the constitutional requirement. The reserves were projected to grow by 13 % on average, equivalent to USD 1,800 million by FY 2021-22.

### **3.3 Prudent Financial Management**

The Minister reported that, primary importance of having the budget policy was to keep the Budget deficit under 3 % of the total Gross Domestic Product and exercised accordingly. In order to strengthen the economy and the financial prudence in the country, it was imperative to formulate proper financial policies with the main objective to ensure efficient collection and prudent management of expenditure, through which financial surplus could be maintained sustainably.

Moreover, as per the objectives of the financial policies, recurrent expenditure should be met from internal resources, while capital expenditures should be administered through surplus revenues and grants. In order to fulfill its objectives, the government must ensure appropriate expenditure, increase domestic revenues, and strengthen the public debt management system. Also, as per the Public Debt Policy 2016, the Government must ensure to retain foreign debts at sustainable ceiling.

### **3.4 Review of the Financial Results**

#### **3.4.1 Audited Annual Financial Statement for FY 2017-18**

The Audited Annual Financial Statement for FY 2017-18 had been submitted with the Budget Report for the adoption, and the Members should understand that financial outcomes were end year outcome of 11 FYP.



#### 3.4.2 Revised Budget for FY 2018-2019

The total resources for FY 2018-19 had been revised from Nu.39,893.853 million to Nu.42,949.113 million, an increase of about 7% from the approved estimate. The increase was mainly on account of incorporation of donor funded projects, receipt of GoI program grants, additional excise duty refund and surplus transfer from RMA.

The total domestic revenue for the FY 2018-19 was estimated at Nu.34,321.818 million, an increase from Nu.33,943.967 million, of which tax revenue was Nu.26,542.925 million and non-tax revenue Nu.7,778.893 million. The tax foregone in 2017 under the Fiscal Incentive Act 2017 was estimated at Nu.4,442.600 million, accounting for 2.7 % of GDP.

During the year, the total appropriation had been revised to Nu.49,325.539 million which was about 3.4% increase from the original budget. The total expenditure was revised from Nu.45,128.177 million to Nu.46,724.585 million.

From the fiscal deficit for the FY of Nu.5,234.324 million, Nu.3,775.472 million was an improvement which was about 1.9% of Gross Domestic Product. Based on incorporations during the FY, the total appropriation for FY 2018-19 revised from Nu.47,698.129 million to Nu.49,325.539 million. Therefore, Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for the FY 2018-19 amounting to Nu.1,627.410 million was submitted to the House for consideration.

### **3.5 Budget Appropriation for the FY 2019-20**

The total budget appropriation for the FY 2019-20 was estimated at Nu.64,826.725 million, of which Nu.34,652.765 million was for current expenditure and Nu.26,544.542 million for capital expenditure. The total budget appropriation included Nu.3,306.333 million for principal repayment and Nu.323.085 million for on-lending. The estimated current expenditure for the FY 2019-20 was Nu.34,652.765 million which was an increase of about 19% from the previous financial year. The increase was mainly on account of provision for pay revisions. Current expenditure also included interest payment of Nu.2,011.232 million and Nu.5,375.582 million for subsidies and grants.

The capital expenditure for FY 2019-20 was estimated at Nu.26,544.542 million, out of which Nu.4,521.614 million had been transferred. Gewogs would receive capital budget of Nu.2,400 million, and Nu.1,001.75 million for Phuentsholing Township Development.

For the FY 2019-20, Nu.323.085 million had been provisioned for on-lending to BPC and rural electrification and DHI for Phuentsholing Township Development. Nu.3,360.333 million for repayments, of which Nu.3,294.929 million was for external borrowings and Nu.11.404 million for domestic borrowings.

For the FY 2019-20, the total resources was estimated at Nu.54,619.197 million, which was an increase by 27% compared to the previous year, and domestic revenue was estimated at Nu.43,299, an increase by 26% compared to the previous year. It was submitted that the budget appropriation for Health, Education and other agencies,

Judiciary and Constitutional Bodies had been clearly reflected in respective sector allocation included in the Budget Report. The Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2019-20 had been submitted along with the Budget Report for consideration.

### **3.6 Public Debt**

Public debt stock as on 31st March 2019 was Nu. 182,236.25 million, accounting for about 94 % of GDP. Of the total public debt, the external debt was Nu.174,627.530 million, constituting about 95.8 % of the total public debt and 90.1 % of GDP. The domestic debt at Nu.7,608.720 million accounted for 3.9 % of the total public debt and 4.2 % of GDP. Hydropower debt accounted for 77 % of the external debt and non-hydro debt accounted for 23 percent.

### **3.7 Total fiscal deficit**

For the FY 2019-20, the estimated fiscal deficit of Nu.6,578.110 million would be financed through borrowings from multilateral financial institutions at highly concessionary terms and the balance would be raised from the domestic markets through issuance of Treasury Bills and Government Bonds. The external budgetary borrowing for the FY 2019-20 was estimated at Nu.4,769.457 million, and domestic borrowings was estimated at Nu.3,020.211 million.

### **3.8 Condition of State Owned Enterprises and Investment**

Currently, the Government portfolio of SoEs consisted of 38 companies, of which 19 were under the Ministry of Finance through Druk Holding and Investments (DHI). SoEs under the Ministry of Finance (including DHI) posted a net profit of Nu.696 million and contributed Nu.277 million in the form of tax and dividends, an increase of 6% from the previous year. In 2018, DHI posted revenue

growth from Nu.7,923 million in 2017 to Nu.8,779 million. The growth was mainly on account of increase in dividend income from subsidiaries by 11.30 %.

In 2018, DHI subsidiaries earned combined gross revenue of Nu.46,718.900 million which was a decrease of 6% from Nu.49,301.140 million in 2017. The overall long-term borrowings of SoEs and linked companies increased by 6% from Nu.25,087 million in 2017 to Nu.26,667 million in 2018.

### **3.9 National Pension and Provident Fund**

In FY 2017-18, there were 55,102 NPPF Members compared to previous year recording a 2.04 % increase in the total membership. The growth was mainly because of the inclusion of local government officials from 205 Gewogs under the provident fund scheme. The NPPF realized revenue of Nu.2,566 million in 2018 compared with Nu.2,828 million in 2017, a decrease of 9.27%.

### **3.10 Energy: primary economy driver**

Hydropower being the main driver of the economy constituted about 30 % of the GDP. In the FY 2019-20, the Government would apply necessary measures for the establishment of 2,585 MW Sunkosh Hydroelectric Project. However, the huge hydropower project debts were due to the delay in Punatsangchhu Hydropower Project I and II. The Government was in the process of reviewing the policies for the establishment of new hydropower projects.

### **3.11 Royal Monetary Authority**

The total assets and liabilities of the RMA for the year 2018 was Nu.77.76 billion, which increased by 4.8 percent from Nu.74.18

billion in 2017. The total operating income of the RMA in 2018 was Nu.2.10 billion, which improved by 7.3 % from Nu.1.95 billion in 2017. The surplus generated during the year was Nu.1,763 million recording growth of 12.5 %. After accounting for the cost of monetary policy operation of Nu.519.71 million, there was a net surplus of Nu.1,585.24 million.

### **3.12 Trust fund**

For support to the relevant activities in the FY 2018-19, Nu. 270.985 million from the Bhutan Health Trust Fund (BHTF) and Nu. 52.460 million from Bhutan Trust Fund for Environment Conservation (BT FEC) were kept as internal grants. Bhutan Economic Stabilization Fund (BESF) had been established with a seed capital of Nu.100 million for FY 2017-18. In addition, in the FY 2018-19, Nu. 135 million was transferred to BESF. Thus, the fund balance as of July 2019 was estimated to be Nu.242.290 million, and therefore, Nu.200 million provisioned for BESF.

### **3.13 Foreign Direct Investment**

The Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) in 2018 was about Nu.218.92 million. The number of projects approved during the same year increased significantly with a record number of 16 projects. Majority of the investments came from Asia, followed by Europe, North America and Oceania. Hotel industry continued to dominate the FDI followed by the IT industry. Therefore, initiatives were being taken up by the Government to attract more FDI into the economy, including revision of the FDI policy.

### **3.14 Conclusion**

The Minister for Finance submitted that the Budget for 2019-20 had been formulated to enable and accelerate implementation of priority

programs and activities of the 12 FYP. The Budget also reflected the commitment of the Government in ‘narrowing the gap’ and fulfilling the aspirations of the people. The revision of pay, allowances and benefits of the public servants had been considered by the Government after incorporating views and comments received from various stakeholders, and were expected to benefit the lower level public servants in keeping with the pledge of narrowing the gap.

In order to derive maximum benefits from the budget, the Government urged all budgetary agencies to achieve the Annual Performance Targets and realize the overarching national goal of Gross National Happiness.

Following the report presentation, the Opposition Leader and some members submitted that it was very imperative to consider the objectives of equitable regional development while formulating the Budget, and therefore, the Finance Committee should be mindful of those provisions during the Budget Review.

Furthermore, it was submitted that despite keeping Budget Appropriation for the special programs, there were no mention of implementing agencies, and thus, it was imperative for the committee to look into the matter during the budget review.

Following that, the House directed that the Budget Report for the FY 2019-20 and the Reports of the previous financial years to be considered as a Money Bill. Accordingly, the bills were forwarded to the Finance Committee for review, and thereby concluded the deliberation on the Budget Report for the FY 2019-20.

**21<sup>st</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 24<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.**

#### **4. Implementation of Resolution of the First Session and Status Report**

##### **4.1 Resolution on the Review Report of Chamkharchhu Hydropower Project**

The Minister for Economic Affairs reported that hydropower projects immensely benefited economic development in the country and also strengthened the bilateral ties between India and Bhutan. However, the expenditure for the hydropower not only increased from the estimated cost, but also surfaced numerous environmental challenges and issues. As per the Report of the Hydropower Committee which was constituted by the Government in 2017, it was found imperative to first study and then deal accordingly as per the situation, rather than committing to establish hydropower projects one after the other.

It was submitted that as per the research report of the Chamkharchhu Hydropower Project, it was reported that the project involved huge environmental impacts, had low potential for hydro energy generation, lesser scope and competition for electricity export, involved higher expenditure, and was mandated to be carried out as a joint venture project. It was reported that the present ongoing Kholongchhu hydropower project which was carried under joint venture project did not have clear shared cost/expenditure, and therefore, considering those factors, Chamkharchhu Hydropower Project could not be prioritized during the 12 FYP.

Whereas, it was reported that Sunkosh Hydropower project had higher potential for hydro energy generation, and the project was to be established by the two governments. Therefore, it was reported that Sunkosh Hydropower Project would be a top priority in the

12 FYP, and the necessary works would also be commenced at the earliest.

During the deliberation, the Member from Panbang Constituency submitted that regarding the Chamkharchhu Hydropower Project, the Government of India and the Royal Government of Bhutan had already signed a Treaty and set priority on the project in 2006. Accordingly, the project was identified as a flagship programme and necessary works like extension of roads and preparatory works had already been completed. However, since the project was not included as a top priority, the Member shared concerns that such a decision would be a matter of deep concern and displeasure for the people in that area. Moreover, it was imperative for the Government to be mindful since the Chamkharchhu Hydropower Project had been delayed upper Kheng region such as construction of hospitals and schools in the vicinity.

Furthermore, it was submitted that although the procedure of the House mandated any report to be circulated to the Members prior to 48 hours, there was not a single report distributed in the House. And therefore, it was reminded that Government should distribute such reports prior to the discussion thereafter, as there were risks of alteration within the planned activities.

Likewise, few members led by the Opposition Leader asked whether the Chamkharchhu Hydropower Project was dropped in the 12 FYP, or the project had been deferred for another time. It was also submitted that Government must set other priorities to ensure rural development in Zhemgang Dzongkhag if Chamkharchhu Hydropower Project had not been included in the prioritized program. Other submission



was made that it was time that Government decide wisely and work thoughtfully regarding the Punatshangchhu Hydropower Project I. It was also suggested that the Ministry of Economic Affairs should also submit a status report on the Hydropower Projects Master Plan to the House in the same session for the information of the public.

Moreover, it was reported that during Chamkharchhu Hydropower Project's initial estimated cost, transporting construction materials through Gelephu and Tingtibi was found to be expensive, and thus, it was recommended that transporting materials through Nganglam would be shorter route incurring lesser expenditure as well. Therefore, it would be suitable if Government could be more mindful and act wisely. Reminder was made that establishment of Darla and Chukha Hydropower Projects incurred huge expenditure, and consequently, those projects had been one of the highest revenue generators in the country today. It was also recommended that Government should work towards formulating measures regarding the environmental issues and challenges.

On that, the Minister for Finance and the Minister for Economic Affairs submitted that the expenditure for Punatshangchhu Hydropower Project had increased by 68 % from the initial estimated cost. Therefore, it was very crucial for the Government to act wisely while establishing hydropower projects, as there lay huge concerns of high debts for the country. The Government must also look into the possibilities of solar and wind energy and not be limited to hydropower energy. It was reported that although the Report on the Punatshangchhu Hydropower Project I could be presented in the same session, Report on the Hydropower Projects Master Plan could be presented during the winter session only.

In addition, the Prime Minister submitted that hydropower projects needed to be established only as and when required. It was also submitted that since the revenue generated through hydropower projects were incurred on national planned activities, recommendations made by few members on the need to allocate additional budget for Dzongkhags deprived of hydropower projects was perceived inappropriate.

Following that, the House directed that Report on the Punatshangchhu Hydropower Project I be presented prior to the Third Session, whereas, Report on the Hydropower Projects Master Plan should be submitted in the winter session. It was also directed that as per the procedure of the House, any report must be submitted or circulated prior to the deliberation, and therefore, concluded the deliberation on Chamkharchhu Hydropower Project.

#### **4.2 Resolution on the Status Report of creating qualification criteria for Gaydrung, and possibility of placing under Royal Civil Service Commission**

The Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs submitted that the Ministry had extended the tenure for Gaydrungs to three years. It was also submitted that although the qualification of present Gaydrungs differ from each other, the Terms of Reference formulated by the Ministry stated that all Gaydrungs require to be functionally literate to read and write, and must be aged between 18 to 40 years. Submission was also made that with other criteria set in the ToR, the tenure for the Gaydrungs would be amended in due course of time despite retaining the tenure for 3 years for present Gaydrungs as of now.

During the deliberation, Members submitted that since there were provisions in the Constitution to provide adequate civil servants in the Local Government for the national interest, the need for the post of Gaydrungs had been passed during the First Session, and therefore, there was no need for further deliberation. However, it was submitted that it was imperative to deliberate regarding the placing of Gaydrungs under the civil service, and to set qualification level and skills required for Gaydrungs, if Gaydrungs were to be placed under the civil service.

Furthermore, few Members made a reminder that the resolution of the previous session was on the need for Gaydrung's post, while the present resolution was to retain the post of present serving Gaydrungs as well. Also, if the possibility of placing Gaydrungs under the civil service was finalized, one of the solutions would be to amend the sections in the Local Government Act which the Good Governance Committee was currently working on. Moreover, as the Local Government had been provisioned with 50 % of the budget allocation in the 12 FYP, there would be challenges to implement the planned activities on time if there were no adequate. It was also mentioned that considering the nature of works, Gaydrungs were perceived to be dire need in carrying out works involved in the Gewog Administration.

Nevertheless, it was suggested that those Gaydrungs whose tenure had been extended for 3 years should be placed under civil service once their tenure extension gets over, with specification of required qualification as well. It was also reported that the decision passed by the House must be respected by other institutions as well.

In addition, the Minister for Finance and Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs submitted that there was no need for further deliberation as the need for Gaydrung's post had been passed during the First Session. It was also found convenient for the Ministry to decide on the matter since the jurisdiction fell directly under the Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs. However, if the present Gaydrungs were to be placed under the civil service, it was suggested that they should be regularized as well. It was also found important that Gaydrungs should be well familiarized with the people and community. Regarding the age criteria, it was suggested that any decision passed by the House would be convenient.

In order to fulfill entire planned activities aligned with the budget in the 12 FYP, it was submitted that present serving Gaydrungs' tenure had been extended to three years; it was mentioned that those Gaydrungs would continue to serve as per the directives of the House as required.

On that, the House decided that although there was no need for further deliberation regarding the Gaydrung's post since the resolution had already been passed during the First Session, the main issue at the present was regarding the possibility of placing Gaydrungs as Para-Regular. Therefore, the House directed the Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs to carry out comprehensive study on the matter, and thereby concluded the deliberation.

**23<sup>rd</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 27<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.**

**4.3 Resolution on Status Report to Open Entry for Tourists from Border Towns like Samdrup Jongkhar, Gelephu, Samtse, Nganglam and Panbang.**

The Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs submitted that as per the resolution of the First Session, the works regarding the opening of entry for tourists from border towns like Samdrup Jongkhar, Gelephu, Samtse, Nganglam, and Panbang had been studied. However, the Minister reported that consultation works with the related stakeholders and research works pertaining to the policies on security and culture of the country were pending. Therefore, the Minister sought consideration from the House for not being able to present a status report in the session.

During the deliberation, Members led by the Member from Gangzur\_Minjey Constituency stated that although the tourism in general did not hamper the culture in the country, the main challenge at the present was the arrival of regional tourists who come their own vehicles with no proper guide, and then travelling freely across the country, thereby causing problems to the environment and to the foreign tourists in the county. Thus, it was suggested that there was a need to formulate similar measures for the regional tourists alike the foreign tourists, which require regional tourists to travel in Bhutanese vehicles with Bhutanese guides.

Submission was also made that there was a need to spread the number of tourists coming into the country with the opening of one to two open entry points in the south. It was also seen important to establish flight services if there were inconveniences in opening numerous entry points altogether at a time. It was suggested that the House should direct the Ministry to submit comprehensive status report thereof in one of the upcoming sessions, if the Ministry was not able to submit a status report in the Second Session.

Furthermore, it was submitted that as per the resolution passed by the First Session regarding the need of entry points in the south, the Government should work towards enforcing the system. It was suggested that the entry points must also be used for international tourists apart from regional tourists. For instance, Zhemgang Dzongkhag could be used for bird watching and studying species of golden fish. Therefore, it was recommended that opening few entry points would be immensely beneficial to the eastern Dzongkhags.

It was reported that at present, the majority of the tourists visiting Bhutan were coming from State of West Bengal and western states of India. It was suggested that if entry points the east were opened, tourists from State of Assam could also visit eastern parts of the country. Since tourism was one of the highest revenue generators of the country, it was vital that Government set an exact duration to carry out proper study and submit a report to the House.

On that, the Prime Minister and Minister clarified that the Government had already started the formulation of a Tourism Policy, and the Tourism Council would ensure equitable regional development of the country. However, studying those numerous challenges and difficulties faced with two existing entry points at Paro and Phuentsholing, it was perceived wise to first carry out thorough study and preparatory works prior to the opening of other entry points. It was reported that although foreign tourists coming in their own vehicles in the country was a matter of concern, there had been a practice that Bhutanese travelers travel in our own vehicles in foreign countries as well, and therefore, the matter should be looked wisely and thoughtfully.

In addition, it was submitted that there were lots of research and study to be carried out, and thus the government could not confirmed the exact date of the completion of detailed studies. It would also be wise for the House to accept the suggestion with a consideration that the establishment of entry points would be completed within five years of time, and a report thereof would also be submitted to the House.

On that, the House directed the Government to submit a status report on the establishment of the open entry for tourists from border towns like Samdrup Jongkhar, Gelephu, Samtse, Nganglam and Panbang within the tenure of five years, and thereby concluded the deliberation.  
**23<sup>rd</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 27<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.**

**5. Question Hour: Group B- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Works and Human Settlement, Ministry of Agriculture and Forests, and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.**

The Speaker informed the House that for day's Question Hour, there were six questions for oral responses and one question for written response. The Speaker also informed that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be followed as done in the past proceeding and commenced the Question Hour Session.

**5.1 Oral Questions**

- 5.1.1 The Member from Bartsham\_Shongphu Constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement as to when the Government would complete the East-West highway.
- 5.1.2 The Member from Jomotshangkha\_Martshala Constituency submitted that DNT had pledged to buy agricultural products from

farmers at a price announced a year ahead and our farmers were assured that their local farm products would be sold. It was reported that the FCBs started to buy cardamom at varying prices, and farmers were facing issues with different prices offered and the operation of the procurement system. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Agriculture and Forests on how, when, and at what price would the Government buy agricultural products such as vegetables, cereals, fruits, and areca nut.

5.1.3 The Member from Dewathang\_Gomdar Constituency submitted that the southern East-West Highway had been touted as one of the important projects by successive governments. The completion of the highway would bring immeasurable benefits to the people of Bhutan. In view of the national importance of the highway, political party (including the current government) pledged to accord high importance to the completion of this highway. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement to update the House on the status of the southern East-West Highway in terms of work progress, and also the status of road construction between Dewathang and Nganglam in particular. The Member also reported that the national highway between Dewathang and Samdrupcholing Dungkhag (Bangtar) had deteriorated beyond the quality of farm road in the last 5 years. Therefore, the Member further questioned the Minister regarding the government's plan to improve this highway, which was the lifeline to the people of 4 gewogs.

5.1.4 The Member from Nanong\_Shumar Constituency submitted that during the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP, the Government had pledged to establish diplomatic relations with five more countries. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Foreign Affairs regarding the criteria, for selection of the country was the Ministry considering.



5.1.5 The Member from Bardo\_Trong Constituency reported that roads were keys to Bhutan's growth, socio-economic development and poverty reduction. Roads were vital for enhancing businesses and creating jobs for all and to narrow the gap between rich and poor. Therefore, it was very important to resume and complete the construction of roads connecting Dzongkhag to Dzongkhag, and alternate route such as:

- Shingkar-Gorgan,                      Kengkar-Shumar
- Wama- Khomshar                      Khandupang-Shingkar
- Getena- Dorona                      Sombaykha- Tashichoeling
- Singye- Lhamoidzingkha              Merak- Lauri
- Nahi-Chamgang                      Soe- Gunitsawa
- Tseza-Kamichu                      Kuri-Gongri Junction- Sherichu

The Member also reported that Khomshar-Wama Road construction with an investment of Nu 2.0 million was initiated towards the end of 11<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan from Khomshar, Zhemgang and similar work initiated from Wama, Monggar. That inter-Dzongkhag or alternate road construction for traveling east-west through most convenient central part of the country had been spilled over to 12<sup>th</sup> FYP. However, the road was not reflected in the plan and budget of 12<sup>th</sup> FYP. It was submitted that people of Phumchung community sacrificed their prime farm lands for the road without any compensation. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement to inform the House whether the present Government would prioritize to continue and complete Khomshar-Wama and other roads.

5.1.6 The Member from Khar\_Yurung Constituency submitted that the human settlement and urban settlement had been faced with numerous challenges such as sewerage, parking spaces, recreational

facilities, traffic flow, footpaths and many more. Considering the importance of ensuring conducive environment for dwellers, the Member questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement whether the government had a comprehensive urban master plan to address the above issues; and if not, what was the government doing about it.

**24<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 28<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.**

## **5.2 Written Questions**

5.2.1 Written answer question submitted by the Member from Bumdeling-Jamkhar Constituency to the Minister for Works and Human Settlement (MoWHS).

One of the main causes of corruption, especially in the construction sector was submitted to be major loophole in the existing procurement system. In view of this, the need for enactment of Procurement Act had been discussed extensively. However, no such bill was submitted to the Parliament yet. Zhabtog Lyonpo was to explain about the status of the Bill and when it would be tabled in the parliament?

***Note:** Detailed answers and deliberations on the above mentioned oral questions and written question submitted by Member from Bumdeling\_Jamkhar Constituency to Minister for Works and Human Settlement provided separately in the verbatim book published for reference*

## **6. Resolution on the Continuation of the Implementation of Resolutions**

### **6.1 Review Report of the Good Governance Committee on the Petition to Avail Permits for Forest Related Services from the Gewog Forest Extension Office**

The Chairperson of the Good Governance Committee (the Member from Drametse-Ngatshang Constituency) submitted that the people

of Wangdue Phodrang Dzongkhag had submitted a petition to avail permits for forest related services from the Gewog Forest Extension Office during the First Session. Accordingly, the Chairperson reported that as per the mandates of the Committee and the resolution of the First Session, the Committee held consultation and met with the people of eight Dzongkhags, leaders of the Local Government, Dzongkhag Forest Officers and staff of the Gewog Forest Office, staff of Jigme Khesar Strict Nature Reserve in Haa, and staff of Jigme Dorji Wangchuck National Park in Gasa. It was also reported that the Committee extensively reviewed the sections pertaining to subsidized timber for rural areas prescribed in the Rules and Regulations of the Forest and Nature Conservation 2017. The Chairperson submitted 11 recommendations as follows:

**Recommendations:**

1. The Dzongkhag Forestry Office to designate a forest officer to Gewogs where there was no staff to facilitate in providing forest related services and to authorize the officiating Chief Forestry Officer to grant timber approval in the Rules.
2. G2C to allow applicants to re-apply with the same identification number, when the applications' got rejected.
3. To amend Rules with a clause penalizing both the parties (buyers and sellers) involved in illegal transaction of subsidized timber.
4. To repeal Section 295 (1&5) of the Forest and Nature Conservation Rule and Regulations (FNCR) 2017 which required subsidized timber applicant to be the native and inherited land holders of the area.
5. To amend the Rules to allow native household falling within 2 KM radial distance from the declared boundary of Thromdes entitled to rural subsidized timber.

6. To provide Standing trees in log volume (Drashing) for replacement of Tsim, Dangchung, and construction of cowshed, kitchen, etc.
7. NRDCCL to ensure that commercial timbers were available from Dzongkhag instead of regional offices and streamline its operation.
8. Currently, public rely on nearby offices and Dzongkhags to avail all the forestry services except for rural timber allotment. Hence, online services was to be made available for all forestry related services.
9. To develop a system of submitting forest products application through online from any place or by using 'Mobile Apps' besides the CIC and the application status should be notified through SMS or email to the applicant.
10. To digitalized the payment of royalties to forest officer, CIC and generation of receipt so that the applicants avail the services by themselves.
11. To consider forestry service application period from June to September, as timeline of August to September month was rigid.

Deliberating on the recommendation, it was found that the majority of the recommendations were perceived beneficial for the people as those pertained to sustaining the livelihood of the people, challenges of rural-urban migration, and for reducing the high import of goods in the country. Therefore, considering the above benefits, majority of the Members supported in favour of the recommendations.

However, it was suggested that the most important aspect was to allow every individual who wished to build houses in rural areas to have the right to acquire timber, and not to limit it only to the head of household. Another suggestion was made that the timing for the submission of application must also be kept flexible.

On that, the Minister for Agriculture and Forests submitted that all recommendations submitted by the Committee could be accepted. However, the Minister stated that the 7<sup>th</sup> Recommendation pertained on timber business executed by the Natural Resources Development Corporation Limited (NRDCL) which was under Druk Holding and Investment (DHI), and the Ministry had no authority over it. Therefore, it was suggested that the House direct the DHI for necessary actions. It was reported that as a measure to solve the rural timber related issues, the Ministry was currently reviewing the Forest and Nature Conservation Act 1995, and a report thereof would be submitted during the Third Session of the Third Parliament for amendment. Moreover, as the rules and regulations of the Act could not be amended until the Act was amended, it was reported that the Ministry would continue to implement as per the directives of the management regarding the problem and challenges related to the matter.

While ascertaining the support on the recommendations submitted by the Committee, the majority of the Members unanimously adopted the recommendation with a show of hands. Accordingly, the House forwarded the recommendations to the Ministry for Agriculture and Forests for enforcement and necessary actions.

Regarding the 7<sup>th</sup> Recommendation submitted by the Committee, it was decided that the Government could directly forward it to the Office of Natural Resources Development Corporation Limited for implementation, and thus concluded the deliberation.

**24<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 28<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.**

**6.2 Resolution on the Status Report of the Establishment of Flight Services from Guwahati to Yonphula, Bumthang and Gelephu.**

The Minister for Information and Communications reported that in order to provide flight services from Guwahati to Yonphula, Bumthang, and Gelephu, the most important aspect would be to extend the domestic airports to international airport as per the international civil aviation standards. As per the requirement rules of the Bhutan Civil Aviation Authority, the airport required basic facilities and sufficient human resources. Moreover, as the rules and requirement must meet the standard of international aviation and align to regional agreement, the establishment of flight services from Guwahati to Yonphula, Bumthang, and Gelephu was not appropriate, and there was also a need to consider business appropriateness in it.

Deliberating on the matter, Members led by the Member from Drametse\_Ngatshang Constituency submitted that although it would be difficult to extend domestic airports to international standard, Paro International Airport had been providing flight services and receiving foreigners from outside. Furthermore, it was perceived that there was no need for international standard to fly between Guwahati and Yonphula or Bumthang. It was suggested that since there was no international standard airport in the country, establishing flight service from Guwahati to Yonphula and Bumthang would not be a difficult matter.

Likewise, some Members submitted that although the main deliberation of the report should have been the outcomes and status of work completed with regard to the flight services, there were no reports on the matter. It was opined that if the Government provided necessary flight service facilities, the private companies would be

willing to take up the opportunities. Considering the bilateral ties between Bhutan and India, it was suggested that the Government should seek measures to resolve such matter and ensure no requirement for the international standard. Additionally, Government should hold consultations with international aviation institutes and carry out necessary study. Recommendation was made that if there were no possibilities of establishing flight services from Guwahati to Yonphula and Bumthang, the Government should explore for separate measure to fly from Paro.

Besides that, some Members submitted that although the previous resolution mentioned that there should have been measures to establish flight services to Guwahati, Sikkim, and Bagdogra, the report had no mention of possibilities other than that of Guwahati. It was recommended that Government should also see the possibility of establishing international airport in the eastern Dzongkhags as it would benefit in ensuring equitable regional development in the country.

The Cabinet Ministers led by the Prime Minister clarified that although establishing international airport in the eastern Dzongkhags, and establishing flight services from Guwahati to Yonphula and Bumthang were definitely a need, it would be wise to establish as per the international standard requirements. It was also reported that there were differences in the requirements between the domestic and international flight services as per the international aviation rules. It was submitted that since the private companies were the ones providing the flight services, it would be challenging for the Government to immediately invest budget and carry out works on it. Clarification was also made that in case of Paro International Airport

becoming un-operational, the Government would see the possibilities of operating flight services from other airports. It was also reported that proposals to establish private helicopter services had also been received, and therefore, it was hopeful to benefit travelers through domestic flights in the country.

In conclusion, the House reminded that it was hopeful that the government would fulfill any incomplete issues during its remaining tenure of four and half years, should any Member was not satisfied with regard to the deliberation on the Implementation of Resolutions of the First Session, and concluded the deliberation.

**24<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 28<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.**

## **7. Introduction of Bill**

### **7.1 Motion for the Introduction of Mines and Minerals Bill of Bhutan 2019 for the First and Second Reading**

The Member In-Charge of the Bill (Minister for Economic Affairs) moved the Motion for the Introduction and Adoption of the Mines and Minerals Bill of Bhutan 2019. Accordingly, the House unanimously adopted the motion through show of hands.

Following that, the Member In-Charge in his Motion for the Second Reading of the Bill submitted that the Mines and Minerals Bill of Bhutan 1995 was adopted prior to the adoption of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan, and therefore, needed to be harmonized with existing laws in line with the provisions of the Constitution. Furthermore, although the Act had been in place for several years, it was reported that the Act had not benefited the economy and the people at large. Hence, the Minister stated that considering the



challenges faced with regard to mining management and mining related corruption cases, the Bill was submitted to address those.

Besides that, the Minister submitted that considering the merits and demerits of the mines and minerals, and to ensure sustainability of both the environment and community as a whole, there were numerous sections included in the Bill; and therefore, the House should be mindful during the deliberation for the beneficial of the country and the people.

During the deliberation, few members made submissions that keeping the sole authority for mines and minerals with private entity only generates 2% of the country's revenue, and therefore, suggested that the provisions of retaining administrative power to government should also be included in the Act. It was opined that minerals being one of the five jewels of the country had the potential to generate more. Moreover, it was submitted that Article 1(12) of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan stated that minerals were the properties of the state and must be regulated by law.

In addition, it was submitted that both government and privates had separate mandates, and it was important that private entities should also take part in the procedure. The Member from Drametse\_Ngatshang Constituency recommended that although the Bill was a significant one, it would take two years to adopt, and therefore, it would be wise to declare and adopt the Bill in the winter session as an urgent bill. Accordingly, the Government submitted support in favour of the Member's recommendation.

On this, a few members submitted that since mining management tasks involved corrupt practices, mines and minerals management

responsibilities should be clearly delineated among the relevant agencies for effective regulation and safeguarding the nation's wealth. For effective harmonization and implementation of the laws, it was suggested that numerous laws should be harmonized together. Recommendation was made that considering the limited resources in the country, and for the sustainability of the resources, laws must be strengthened. It was further suggested that mines and minerals tax should be increased for the benefit of both the country and the people at large.

While reviewing the Bill, it was recommended that there was a need for a system to provide security and compensate for the people involved in mining; need to seek measures to prevent disturbance in the mining vicinity especially to the local deities and guardians; and the need to involve Ministry of Home and Culture Affairs for monitoring the management tasks.

The Speaker directed that as per the recommendations submitted by the Members, the Speaker would hold consultation with the Chairperson of the National Council and look into the possibility of declaring the Bill as an urgent Bill.

Although the House directed the Environment and Climate Change Committee to review the Mines and Minerals Bill of Bhutan 2019, the Chairperson of the Environment and Climate Change Committee (Opposition Leader) submitted that considering the financial aspects included in the bill, it would be convenient if the Bill could be referred to the Economic and Finance Committee. Accordingly, after the submission of acceptance from the Chairperson of the Economic and Finance Committee (Member from Athang\_Thedtsho Constituency), the House directed the Economic and Finance Committee to carry

out thorough review of the Bill and submit a report thereof during the Third Session for the Third Reading, and thereby concluded the deliberation on the First and Second Reading of the Bill.

**25<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 29<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.**

## **7.2 Motion for the Introduction of Civil and Criminal Procedure Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 for the First and Second Reading**

The Member In-Charge of the Bill (Member from Bongo\_Chapcha Constituency) moved the Motion for the Introduction and Adoption of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019. Accordingly, the House adopted the motion through a show of hands.

Following that, the Member In-Charge while moving the Motion for the Second Reading of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019, submitted that the procedure code was daily implemented by the Judiciary. Therefore, it was submitted that keeping up with His Majesty's concerns about proliferation and duplication of Laws in the country and the need to harmonize and consolidate these laws expressed in 2014, the previous Government constituted the National Law Review Task Force in 2015.

Following the recommendation of the taskforce to harmonize existing laws in line with Constitution and consolidation of several laws, the Legislative Committee carried out thorough review of the report, prioritized few laws and presented before the plenary stressing on its urgent need for amendment. Accordingly, the Legislative Committee had reviewed the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan

2001 and its Amendment 2011, and submitted its report with 10 amendments for deliberation in the House.

On that, some members submitted that for the larger interest and welfare of the society, there was a need to review the whole Bill rather than reviewing only the amendment sections submitted by the National Law Review Task Force. It was further suggested that the Third Reading of the Bill be held during the winter session for deliberation. On that, the Member In-Charge of the Bill submitted that thorough consultation with the Judiciary and relevant agencies had been held, and therefore, there was no need for extending the time period for the Bill. However, it was suggested that any decision made by the House would be acceptable.

On that, the House while ascertaining the support for the deferment of the Third Reading of the Bill through a show of hands, majority of the members did not support in favour of the motion and therefore, the House decided that the Third Reading of the Bill would be deliberated during the Second Session only.

**25<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 29<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.**

### **7.3 Motion for the Introduction of Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 for the First and Second Reading**

The Member In-Charge of the Bill (Member from Bongo\_Chapcha Constituency) moved the Motion for the Introduction and Adoption of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019. Accordingly, the House adopted the motion through a show of hands.

Following that, the Member In-Charge moved the Motion for the Second Reading of Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019.

Following the recommendation of the taskforce to harmonize existing laws in line with Constitution and consolidation of several laws, the Legislative Committee after a thorough review of the report, prioritized few laws and presented before the plenary stressing on its urgent need for amendment. Accordingly, the Legislative Committee reviewed the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004 and its Amendment 2011 and submitted its report with 12 Amendments for deliberation in the House.

On that, some Members shared concerns and opinions stating that amending few sections of the Bill might compromise the basic principle of the bill. It was also submitted that since the Penal Code needed to be enforced in day to day business, it would be very beneficial if the Penal Code could be amended and adopted at the earliest possible. However, it was submitted that Section 213 and 214 of the Penal Code regarding the unnatural sex had not been enforced till now. Moreover, it was submitted that there were concerns of not getting foreign health grants due to such provisions, and therefore the section needed to be repealed. It was further recommended that the Committee should keep in mind regarding such sections and carry out tasks properly.

Nevertheless, some Members made a submission that the Members of the National Law Review Task Force were not able to carry out extensive review of the Penal Code due to the nature of their works. Therefore, there was a need to carry out extensive review once again for the betterment of the society as a whole. Accordingly, it was suggested that the Third Reading of the Bill be deferred to the winter session.

On that, the Member In-Charge of the Bill submitted that inconsistent sections on the provisions of rape of child below 18 years and youth imprisonment, and numerous fronting related cases must be addressed at the earliest. It was also submitted that since necessary review and consultation with the relevant agencies were held, it was seen imperative to carry out the Third Reading of the Bill in the second session only.

On that motion, some of the Members stated that there would arise more inconveniences if the laws were formulated against the human rights. It was mentioned that since the international rules allow rights to the child to have consensual marriage, it was also important for Bhutan being the member to the United Nations Organizations to fully understand the international laws. Some Members further reminded that the primary intention of the deliberation was only to discuss the objectives and principles of the Bill and not the entire sections of the Bill, and therefore, it was not in accordance with the procedure of House.

However, majority of the Members submitted that considering the larger interest of individuals who were denied of justice, the Amendment Bill should be adopted at the earliest. Accordingly, the House while ascertaining the support regarding the support for the deferment of Third Reading through a show of hands, the majority of the members supported the motion to deliberate the Amendment Bill at the earliest. Therefore, the House decided that the Third Reading of the Amendment Bill would be deliberated in the Second Session only.

**25<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 29<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.**

## **8. Motion**

### **8.1 Motion on the Need to Review and Implement Bhutan National Human-Wildlife Conflict Management Strategy as a National Flagship Program.**

The Member from Bardo-Trong Constituency submitted that 60 percent of the population lived in rural areas, and 66% of the total households depended on agriculture, livestock and forestry for their livelihood. However, due to human-wildlife conflict, the growth in agriculture remained sluggish hovering around 2 to 3% in the last many years. Due to the income gap between the urban and rural people, ever increasing imports of agriculture and livestock products, fallow lands in the villages, increasing number of Gungtongs due to rural-urban migration, shortage of labour, danger to lives, crops, and livestock, there was a risk to security and sovereignty of the country. Therefore, there was a need to Review and Implement Bhutan National Human- Wildlife Conflict Management Strategy as a National Flagship Program.

It was submitted that the inclusion of Bhutan National Human-Wildlife Conflict Management Strategy as a National Flagship Program would help in reducing poverty. Moreover, the Government could minimize the expenditure for each financial year due to which the rural economic development would be hampered; thereby increasing rural-urban migration and unemployment problems rising in that way. Therefore, considering the above challenges, the Member submitted the following motions:

1. The multi-prong national strategy to manage human-wildlife be reviewed comprehensively and implemented as a National Flagship Program.

2. Government should on priority basis provide barbed wire fencing materials on cost sharing model (50:50) as a subsidy to all the affected rural households.

During the deliberation on the motion, Members submitted that there were only about 3% of the cultivable land area in the country, and shared concerns that about 70 % of the total rural agricultural produce were damaged by wild animals in 2017. It was stated that if effective measures to contain such problems were not taken care of, there would be huge challenges of self sufficiency in food, *Gungtong*, and shortage of employment would rise thereby posing huge risks to security and sovereignty of the nation.

Similarly, few Members submitted that since the primary pledge of the Government was ‘narrowing the gap’, it was imperative for the Government to solve such problems. Moreover, for the people of southern Dzongkhags who had been facing the challenges of wild elephants damaging their crop, it was suggested that Government should implement different measures apart from providing electric fencing. As per the GNHC Survey Report, the lowest happiness index was found in the rural areas and therefore, suggested that the Government support on the motion for implementation. However, some members opined that setting priority on the human-wildlife problems would compromise the prioritized plans and activities, and therefore, lead to insufficiency of budget for such planned activities; and thus, could not second the support to the first motion.

Furthermore, it was submitted that the Government’s earlier plans to solve the problems had not been implemented effectively, and also reported that the budget would not be sufficient should the activity be included in the flagship program.



On that, the Minister for Agriculture and Forests clarified that although it was imperative to solve such challenges, Bhutan National Human-Wildlife Conflict Management Strategy had already been formulated in 2008. Moreover, electric fencing, electric bells, other measures and sufficient budget provisioned separately. It was submitted that repeated deliberating and reporting on wildlife conflicts might compromise in receiving international funds granted for preserving wild animals in the future as well. It was reported that Government had developed various plans and activities to curb such issues, and accordingly working on it. Therefore, it was recommended that there was no need for such motion to be implemented as a priority Program.

Following an extensive deliberation, the House while ascertaining the support on the First recommendation, 16 Members voted “Yes”, 24 Members voted “No” and 1 Member Abstained out of 41 members present and voting, and therefore, could not adopt the motion. **The voting list is provided separately in Annexure 2.**

Similarly, the House while ascertaining the support on the Second recommendation, 22 Members voted “Yes”, 15 Members voted “No” and 5 Members Abstained out of 42 members present and voting, and therefore, adopted the motion regarding the Government to provide barbed wire fencing materials on cost sharing model (50:50) on priority basis as a subsidy to all affected rural households. The House directed the Ministry of Agriculture and Forests to carry out implementation thereof, and concluded the deliberation. **The voting list is provided separately in Annexure 3.**

**26<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 30<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.**

**8.2 Motion on the Government to Review the RSTA Act to Increase the Load Carrying Capacity for the Trucks.**

The Member from Dewathang\_Gomdar Constituency while moving the motion submitted that combined total strength of medium and heavy trucks of 11,792 in the country greatly contributed to our economy and benefitted the livelihood of drivers' families. However, the Section 68 of the RSTA Act prohibited the government from increasing the load carrying capacity of trucks beyond what was prescribed by the manufacturer. Therefore, such provision created huge problems to both drivers and truck owners. In order to solve such problems, the following motions were submitted:

1. Government to amend the RSTA Act to address the issue.
2. Government to formulate measures to immediately curb the existing problems (during the amendment process of the RSTA Act).

Deliberating on the motion, Members submitted that with technological advances in the world, improved road conditions, it was imperative to review the limitation for the benefit of business owners. It was also high time to holistically review the RSTA Act, and provide authority to Road Safety and Transportation Authority for monitoring the Act.

Furthermore, submission was made that Government must come up with immediate measures to solve the existing emerging problems, and problems faced by Bhutanese truckers working and traveling through India. There was also a need for establishing huge projects, and to amend the Act.

On that, the Minister for Information and Communications submitted that although the load carrying capacity for the trucks had been amended in India, Bhutan was yet to amend the load carrying capacity and therefore, the problems aroused due to that. It was submitted that there was no need for amending Section 68 of the RSTA Act since the section was very flexible. It was reported that a relevant committee had been formed and meetings were held with relevant agencies and business owners. The issue was discussed twice in the cabinet and was decided that as per the Gross Vehicle Weight (GVW) in India, Bhutan would also enforce the same. Therefore, the Minister reported that Government would report to the House at the earliest should the Government come up with immediate measures for such issues.

After an extensive deliberation, the House while ascertaining the support on the First recommendation, 29 Members voted “Yes”, 12 Members voted “No” and 1 Member Abstained out of 42 members present and voting, and therefore adopted the recommendation through majority votes. **The voting list is provided separately in Annexure 4.**

Likewise, the House while ascertaining the support on the second recommendation, all members present unanimously supported the recommendation through a show of hands and therefore adopted the recommendation. Accordingly, the House directed the Ministry of Information and Communications to carry out implementation thereof, and concluded the deliberation.

**26<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 30<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.**

**9. Question Hour: Group C- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Economic Affairs, Ministry of Finance, and Ministry of Labour and Human Resources.**

The Speaker informed the House that for day's Question Hour, there were nine questions for oral responses and one question for written response. The Speaker also informed that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be provided once all questions were answered and commenced the Question Hour Session.

**9.1 Oral Questions**

9.1.1 The Member from Sombaykha Constituency submitted that as per Bhutan Living Standard Survey Report 2017, it was reported that electricity coverage in the country was 99%. The electricity coverage in urban areas was 100 % whereas electricity coverage in rural areas was 98 %. In spite of that, it was reported that there had been massive power fluctuation in Sombaykha and Gakiling Gewogs in Haa, which resulted in numerous problems for the people in these gewogs. During summer, there was massive power fluctuation due to which works relying on electricity were hampered badly. Moreover, it created inconveniences to carry out official tasks in the offices. It was also found that frequently, those two gewogs remained without electricity as long as ten days. At present, the electricity was transmitted through Dorokha substation in Samtse. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs to provide measures on how to overcome these challenges.

9.1.2 The Member from Khar\_Yurung Constituency questioned the Minister for Labour and Human Resources regarding the Ministry's plan to minimize the impact of pay rise of the civil servants on the private employees, since the private sector was under the jurisdiction

of Labour and Employment Act. The Member further questioned the Minister on how were the working conditions of private employees being protected under the Labour Act.

9.1.3 The Member from Nganglam Constituency reported that one of the important pledges of Druk Nyamrup Tshogpa was to do away with the 5 % voucher tax. Although it was more than six months since the inception of the Government, the pledge was not implemented till then. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Finance could clarify the House on when the pledge would be implemented, and also whether the Government would never implement that pledge.

9.1.4 The Member from Jomotshangkha\_Martshala Constituency reported that there had been constant power blackout in Samdrupcholing and Jomotshangkha Drungkhags. The Member submitted as to why the problem had been occurring time and again, and how it would be solved. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs to inform the House regarding the issue.

9.1.5 The Member from Khamdang\_Ramjar Constituency submitted that recently, a group led by the Labour Minister visited Japan to find out and study the real concerns and problems faced by our youths studying and working in Japan. Although the outcome of the visit had been heard through media, no report was submitted by the Government. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Labour and Human Resources to clarify the House on the status of the report in solving those problems.

9.1.6 The Member from Chhumig\_Ura Constituency questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs to explain or clarify to the House

regarding the issue of having no uniformity of night timing (closing time) for the entertainment places across 20 Dzongkhags in the country.

9.1.7 The Member from Khamed\_Lunana Constituency reported that according to the Labor Force Survey Report, released on May 25 by the National Statistics Bureau, the national unemployment rate stood at 15.7% which was increased by 3.4% from 2017. It was reported that the issue was of national concern and for that, the Member questioned the Minister for Labour and Human Resources on what the Government and Ministry were doing to address the issue, and what plans and strategies were put in place.

Following that, the Member from Panbang Constituency submitted that the Speaker could not manage the time properly and submitted concern from the opposition party on the important questions left unanswered. On that, the Speaker reiterated that as per the National Assembly Rules of Procedure, the Question Hour timing was only for one and a half hours, and in spite of following the strict timing, the Questions 8 and 9 could not be asked due to numerous questions. Therefore, the Speaker reminded the Members for consideration and concluded the session.

**27<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 31<sup>st</sup> May, 2019.**

## **9.2 Written Question**

### **Written answer question submitted by Member from Panbang Constituency to the Minister for Finance**

Ngultrum 247 Million had been budgeted for scholarship of Class X passed students in various private schools. The Minister for Finance was asked to furnish to the House the following details: names of

schools, number of students by break-up of boarders and day scholars, and total grant for each school.

*Note: Detailed answers and deliberations on the above mentioned oral questions and written question submitted by Member from Panbang Constituency to Minister for Finance are provided separately in the verbatim book published for reference.*

## **10. Introduction of Bill**

### **10.1 Motion for the withdrawal of Royal Bhutan Police (Amendment)**

#### **Bill of Bhutan 2019**

The Chairperson of Human Rights and Foreign Relations Committee (Member from Drujeygang\_Tseza Constituency) in his Motion for Withdrawal of the Royal Bhutan Police (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019, submitted that as per the recommendation of the National Law Review Task Force Report, the Human Rights and Foreign Relations Committee was directed to review and hold consultation on two sections, and submit an Amendment Report thereof in the Third Session during the Plenary. As per the directives, the Committee held review and consultative meetings with the relevant stakeholders and agencies. During its meetings, the representatives of the relevant agencies presented numerous inconsistent sections apart from two sections; and also reported that there would not be any problem should the two sections were not amended immediately. Therefore, for the comprehensive review and amendment, and fruitful recommendations on the bill, the Committee submitted its recommendation on the need to have longer time for holistic review of the RBP Act.

Considering the above aspects, the Committee submitted its motion for the withdrawal of the Royal Bhutan Police (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 from the Order of Business of the Second Session.

It was submitted that the motion was moved since the Act needed extensive review, and moreover, since the Royal Bhutan Police under the Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs, it was recommended that it would be appropriate for the Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs to carry out a review and submit to the House. The House support while ascertaining the support on the recommendation, received majority of the Members through show of hands. The Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs submitted that as per the directives of the House, the Ministry would form a committee comprising of legal experts from relevant agencies and private legal firms for the review of Royal Bhutan Police (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 and submit a report to the House. Further submission was made that due to numerous laws in place, it was also imperative to review other acts in due course of time.

On that, the House directed the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs to lead in carrying out a comprehensive review of the Bill and submit it to the House during the Fourth Session of the Third parliament, and therefore, concluded the deliberation.

**27<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 31<sup>st</sup> May, 2019.**

## **10.2 Motion for the Introduction of Local Government (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 for the First and Second Reading**

The Member In-Charge of the Bill Chairperson of the Good Governance Committee (Member from Drametse\_Ngatshang Constituency) moved the Motion for the Introduction and Adoption of Local Government (Amendment) Bill 2019, and accordingly the House adopted unanimously through show of hands.



Following that, the Member In-Charge of the Bill in his motion for the Second Reading of the Local Government (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 submitted that National Law Review Task Force reported on the need to harmonize existing laws in line with Constitution and consolidation of several laws. As per the recommendation of the National Law Review Task Force, submission was made that the Good Governance Committee had extensively reviewed the Local Government Act 2009 and Local Government (Amendment) Act of Bhutan 2014, and submitted the Committee's (Amendment) Bill Report to the House.

The Member expressed that the main rationale and objective for amending the Act were considering the approach of Local Government elections, and Thromde Members elections, and also considering the welfare of the people to understand that the Gups, Mangmis and Thromde Representatives require a minimum qualification of class X. Therefore, there was a need to enforce such recommendations in the section of the Bill.

On that, some Members submitted that although there was a need to amend the Act at the earliest considering the approach of Local Government elections in 2021, there would be challenges of not getting qualified candidates in some of the rural areas, should the provisions of required qualification was amended in the Bill. Therefore, it was imperative to be mindful to consider the remote areas while reviewing the Bill. Moreover, submission was made that Section 21 of the Act states that a person shall be qualified to be elected as a Mangmi/ Gup/ Thromde representative if he/she is functionally literate and possesses skills adequate to discharge his/her responsibilities as certified by the Election Commission of Bhutan.

Hence, it was suggested that it would be better to retain the section for the time being.

Furthermore, submission was made that there was a need to review the entire Act rather than reviewing only the amendment sections submitted by the National Law Review Task Force. It was also recommended that there was a need to hold extensive consultation with Local Government leaders and relevant agencies, and submit the Bill for the Third Reading during the winter session for deliberation.

On that, the Committee Members submitted that since the local government Members were the ones who submitted recommendations for required qualification for the leaders, thorough consultation with the Election Commission of Bhutan and relevant agencies had been held. And therefore, it was found convenient to deliberate on the Third Reading of the Bill in the Second Session only.

On that, the Member In-Charge of the Bill submitted that the Committee would respect if the House decides to defer the Amendment Bill. However, submission was also made that if the House was unsatisfied by the review report submitted by the Committee, it would be wise if the Act could be forwarded to the Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs for extensive review. Following the acceptance of recommendation by the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs, the House adopted the recommendation through the majority show of hands.

On that, the House directed the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs to lead in carrying out a comprehensive review of the Act

and submit it as an Amendment Bill to the House during the Third Session, and concluded the deliberation.

**27<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 31<sup>st</sup> May, 2019.**

**11. Resolution on the Review Report by Good Governance Committee (GGC) on the Annual Anti-Corruption Commission Report 2018.**

The Chairperson of the Good Governance Committee (GGC) (Member from Dramedtse\_Ngatshang Constituency) presented the Review Report of the Anti-Corruption Commission (ACC) Report 2018.

The Chairperson submitted that with significant achievement made in strengthening democratic values and the government institutions, Bhutan improved its Transparency International's Corruption Perception Index (TI-CPI 2018) ranking to 25<sup>th</sup> out of 180 countries with a score of 68. The Chairperson also submitted that Bhutan ranked 6<sup>th</sup> position in the Asia Pacific region and that Bhutan was considered the cleanest country in the SAARC region.

The Chairperson reported that during the comprehensive in-house annual review of its annual performance target (APT) for the year 2017-18, ACC scored 87 out of 100 for its financial year performance which fell under "very good" category of the Government Performance Management System's (GPMS) forced ranking.

The Chairperson also reported on the ACC's new recruitment, human capital development trainings and the manifestation of ACC's "zero tolerance" policy by prosecuting its officer on suspected false claim and convicted by the Court. The report also included the establishment

of 10 Integrity Clubs by ACC in schools towards behavioral change, reducing disciplinary issues and enhancing transparency and accountability in the management system. It was also reported that a total of 6,412 civil servants were benefited from the ACC's sensitization on various ethics and integrity management tools as part of Annual Performance Agreement (APA) implementation.

It was also reported that from the 333 complaints received during the reporting year, majority of the allegation on abuse of functions were in the areas of resources against Local Governments, Dzongkhag Administration and Ministry of Education. ACC having completed investigation of 27 cases out of 39 cases during the reporting year achieved the overall turnover of 69.2%. The challenges of understaffing owing to difficulties in recruiting professionals with appropriate skills and retaining the existing staff and the probability of aggravating rising corruption trend in Local Government due to the decentralization process in the country which gave more authority and resources to the LG functionaries were also reported.

The Committee submitted following nine recommendations for the House to deliberate and endorse:

1. To provide adequate financial incentives and budgetary support to attract and retain professional staff.
2. Most of complaints received (54.7%) were abuse of functions hence, NKRA 'Corruption Reduced' of the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP be made mandatory in all APA and APT agencies.
3. With the decentralization process, Local Government Authorities were seen as more vulnerable to corruption. Therefore, ethical competence of leaders to create enabling environment for promoting ethics, integrity and professionalism should be improved.

4. Similarly, greater transparency and accountability mechanisms in the LG to safeguard from corruption vulnerabilities and capacitate LG functionaries with relevant skills/Knowledge should be enhanced.
5. Section 167 of the Anti-Corruption Act regarding suspension of an accused from the public office on the grounds of corruption charges be applied uniformly.
6. To ensure uninterrupted court proceedings, a separate Bench viz. 'Corruption Bench' be designated in a court to register and adjudicate corruption cases.
7. The ACC expedite the establishment of the Ombudsman office as recommended by the 11th Session of the Second Parliament to handle the administrative nature of complaints.
8. The ACC to review the Tripartite MoU signed amongst RBP, OAG and ACC to ensure that investigation of corruption cases in the private sector by RBP did not contradict with its mandate.
9. Around Nu. 187.96 m was still pending to be restituted as per the verdict of the Court. Government's scarce resources lying with the accused was a concern. Therefore, the ACC was urged to follow up with the Office of the Attorney General to expedite the restitution.

The majority of the Members supporting the committee's recommendations mentioned the need for strengthening governance systems and building capacity of the Local Government since the corruption cases of abuse of function, misuse of budget and the corruption in the form of favoritism and nepotism were mostly prevalent in the Local Government. The Members reminded the Government to work towards promoting integrity and professionalism in the Local Government.

The need for ACC to expedite the establishment of the Ombudsman office to handle the administrative nature of complaints and the need for independence in Human Resources recruitment for the effective and efficient working of the ACC were also discussed. Some of the Members proposed adequate financial incentives and budgetary support to be provided to attract and retain professional staff. To that, several other Members mentioned that instead of the financial incentives, a sustainable plan which mandated the Commission to motivate and encourage the staff by always supporting them while performing their duties would bear better results.

The House while deliberating on the recommendations, endorsed recommendations 2,3,7,8 and 9 through show of hands while recommendations 1, 5, and 6 were not supported. The 4<sup>th</sup> recommendation was also endorsed after reformulating it as “Similarly, greater transparency and accountability mechanisms in the LG to safeguard from corruption vulnerabilities and capacitate LG functionaries with increased human resource and relevant skills/ Knowledge should be enhanced.”

The House then voted on the recommendations with 40 Yes Votes, 1 No Vote and 3 Abstain out of 44 Members present and voting, thereby passing the 6 out of 9 recommendations of the Good Governance Committee. The deliberation on the Review Report of Annual Anti-corruption Commission Report 2018 concluded with the House reminding the relevant agencies and organizations to consider the recommendations. **The voting list provided in Annexure 5.**

**30<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of the Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 3<sup>rd</sup> June, 2019.**

**12. Question Hour: Group D: Questions relevant to the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Health.**

The Speaker informed the House that for the Group D, there were five questions for oral responses and two questions for written responses. The Speaker informed that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be given only after all the oral questions had been answered, and commenced the session.

**12.1 Oral Questions**

12.1.1 The Member from Gangzur\_Minjey constituency submitted that the building structures of the Minjey Middle Secondary School had been constructed up to the mark that there were sufficient established facilities should the school be upgraded to Higher Secondary School as well. However, due to the landslides occurring above one of the school buildings, the school was kept for observation. Accordingly, the Government has deployed officials from the Department of Geology and Mines to further study on the issue. Therefore, the Member questioned the Education Minister to provide a clear report on the total number of detailed studies that had been carried out by the officials of the DGM; and also requested to carry out study on the condition of land, to see the possibility of upgrading the school into Higher Secondary School. Furthermore, the Member requested the Minister to provide the status of the investigation carried out pertaining to corruption on that issue.

12.1.2 The Member from Chhumig-Ura Constituency questioned the Health Minister on the Government's plan to upgrade Mongar Regional Hospital and Gelephu Regional Hospital to autonomous hospitals like that of JDW National Referral Hospital in Thimphu and operated under the same administration and management. The Member asked the Minister for clarification regarding the motive and

objective behind this plan, and also the benefits of combining those hospitals.

12.1.3 The Member from Panbang Constituency submitted that from this year, the Government had been providing scholarship grant of Nu.50,000 for the Boarders students and Nu. 30,000 to Day scholar students, who qualified from Class X in the private schools. The Member reported that the private schools had been incurring loss and moreover, it was reported that it was affecting the quality of education since the amount was very minimal. The Member mentioned that if it was true, it was a matter of great concern. In that regard, the Member requested the Education Minister to clarify the House on the matter.

12.1.4 The Member from Kengkhar\_Weringla Constituency submitted that among many pledges, one most important pledge which the present Government promised to fulfill was to provide special medical services to the people. However, the medical services were facing numerous challenges rather than improving. The Member cited the example of JDWNRH which had been without an MRI machine for almost six months now. Similarly, the two regional hospitals have shortage of specialists, as well as constant shortage of equipment. Mongar Hospital did not have child medical expert, and Gelephu Hospital did not have Endoscopy machine. The Member also mentioned that the other medical equipment like blood machine was out of function, and many numerous issues still being faced. The Member requested the Minister to clarify the House regarding the Ministry and Government's preparedness of plans and Programs to solve the above-mentioned issues.

12.1.5 The Member from Maenbi\_Tshenkhar Constituency submitted that the Government promised to increase the stipend for general



students to Nu. 1500 starting from July this year but it did not include the students in colleges and training institutes. The Member reported that at present, students in colleges and training institutes did not get more than Nu. 1500. Therefore, the Member requested the Education Minister to highlight on the plans and Programs of the Government to increase the stipend for those students in order to improve the living standard and ensure fruitful education of the students.

## **12. 2 Written Questions**

12.2.1 Written answer question submitted by Membr from Panbang Constituency to the Minister for Education

Could the Hon'ble Minister provide a detailed list of private schools who received scholarship grant for class X qualified Program, along with the list of entire private school owners, list of managers, administrators, and board members?

12.2.2 Written answer question submitted by the Member from Sombaykha Constituency to the Minister for Health

Baychi Village under Sombaykha Gewog in Haa had been facing the shortage of health workers in their BHU II, and thus, the health services reaching the people badly hampered and compromised. Although there were about 60 households in the village, there was only one Health Assistant in the present BHU. Therefore, in order to solve such problems hereafter, could the Minister highlight the plans and activities of the Health Ministry to provide sufficient health workers in the BHU?

**1<sup>st</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 4<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

*Note: Detailed answers and deliberations on the oral questions as well as the answers for the written answer questions from the Member*

*from Panbang Constituency and the Member from Sombaykha Constituency to the Education Minister and the Health Minister respectively provided separately in the verbatim booklet published for reference.*

**13. Resolution of the Motion to review all the existing and New Subordinate Legislations by the Parliament before it is endorsed to ensure that it is framed in line with the provisions of the parent Act**

- 13.1 The Member from Gangzur\_Minjey Constituency submitted that Section 1 and 2 of Article 10 of the Constitution of Bhutan and Section 1.2.1 of Legislative Manual 2016 mandated that all the policies and issues, Bills and other legislations should be reviewed by the Parliament. However, nowadays only the Acts were being reviewed in the Parliament. The rules and regulations were made by the concerned agencies and organizations, and implemented without the Parliament reviewing it. The Member reported that some of the rules and regulations were even stricter than legal provisions, challenging the people variously. The Member mentioned that the rules and regulations in place till now were the ones approved by the cabinet only upon the request of the ministries.

It was reported that many of the international countries follow the process. The Member submitted that either the draft rules or regulations of the parent law should be submitted to the Parliament by the concerned ministry while parent law was being reviewed, or the Parliament should come up with the rules and regulations inline to the parent law. The Member requested the House to deliberate well and support the two recommendations in order to be beneficial for the people facing the challenges.

To that, the Member from Athang\_Thedtso constituency submitted that even though the basis for the motion was very good, there was no one till date who reported challenges faced due to the rules and regulations. The Member denied his support mentioning that all the committees were tasked heavily, and if all the rules and regulations from the ministries and the agencies would have to be reviewed by the Parliament, it would be a challenge.

Adding on to it, the Prime Minister and the Minister for Foreign Affairs mentioned that if all the rules and regulations were to be reviewed by the Parliament, there could be problems of time constraints. They mentioned that Parliament would not be as effective and efficient as those experienced experts in the civil servants in reviewing the rules and regulations. They stated that it would be better if the reviewing of the rules and regulations were kept as it was, nevertheless, if bigger issues arise due to the rules and regulations in the future, it could be deliberated and reviewed by the Parliament then.

On that, some of the Members including the Opposition Leader stated that even though it was expected that all the three branches of the government and the agencies should have the same interpretation of the Acts, at times the interpretation varies, resulting in various problems. They mentioned that it was because of the rules and regulations not being reviewed by the Parliament that varying interpretation of an Act occurs. Thus, they supported the motion and even mentioned that this issue had been deliberated in the previous sessions also. They also stated that the Article 10, Section 1 and 25 of the Constitution of Bhutan stated that Parliament of Bhutan was vested with all legislative powers under the Constitution and that all International Conventions, Covenants, Treaties, Protocols and

Agreements duly acceded to by the Government, shall be deemed to be the law of the Kingdom only upon ratification by Parliament.

Furthermore, it was also reported that there were lots of difficulties faced due to the rules and regulations not being framed in line with the provisions of the parent law. They proposed forming a committee of experts to review the rules and regulations, if it cannot be reviewed in the Parliament. It was reported that the National Council started to review and ratify the rules and regulations. It was also stated that the reason for many cases of abuse of functions reported in the Annual Anti-corruption Reports every year were the un-reviewed rules and regulations. The Members supporting the motion reminded the House of the responsibility of the ratifications and review of the laws as mandated in the Constitution.

The House after an intense deliberation, voted on the motion with 18 Yes votes, 25 No votes and 1 Abstain out of 44 Members present and voting, thereby failing to pass the motion to review the subordinate legislation by the parliament before it is implemented by the agency.  
**The voting list provided in Annexure 6.**

### **13.2 Motion for an Immediate Policy and Guidelines for the Right of Way (ROW) of Transmission Lines.**

The Member from Draagteng-Langthil Constituency moving the motion submitted that as of 2017 there were more than 1102.074 kms of high voltage transmission line constructed. The transmission lines were constructed as far as possible close to motorable road and through the valleys overcrossing settlements and private registered land due to economic reasons.

The Member reported that the National Land Commission Secretariat issued a notification stating that Bhutan Power Corporation had been authorized to acquire private land falling under the transmission tower (Pylon) in rural areas with the payment of compensation to the landowner and either transfer the land registration to the BPC or get it on lease. It was also reported that compensation or land substitution was only for the construction of pylon tower, which was approximately 10 decimals.

The Member also reported that according to Clause 9 (minimum approachable distance) of Safety Code, Bhutan Electricity Authority, 2008 stated that the Minimum Approach Distance for 400 kV was 27 feet, for 220kV was 18 feet, for 132kV was 13 feet, for 66kV was 9 feet, for 33kV was 7 feet, for 11kV was 5 feet and for 0.4kV was 1.6 feet.

The Member mentioned that there was no specific mention of the right of way of the transmission line in any of the documents available till date. During the execution of the transmission line, the compensation and private land substitution was based on the notification issued by the National Land Commission and could not ascertain any policy or guidelines for proper and uniform implementation. The Member reported that rural people were now facing challenges in getting clearances for residential constructions in their registered land as the transmission lines transverse above or near their land. It was also reported that people in fact were unaware of the consequences of their consensus during public consultations. Therefore, it was proposed that:

1. Bhutan Power Corporation or the relevant agencies should frame a policy, guidelines, rules and regulations on the transmission line.

2. As far as possible to avoid private registered land in the rural areas, if inevitable, land must be substituted or compensated for the ROW.
3. The landscape beauty of the locality should not be compromised by the construction of pylon tower.

Deliberating on the motion, the Members reported that even during their constituency visit, people raised various concerns about not being able to construct house or plant trees in their own land for which they were still paying the land tax. It was also reported that those affected people had requested the Government either to shift the transmission lines away from their land or give land substitution.

Besides that, the motion to review the rules and regulations by the Parliament, which if approved had the chances of solving the problems with this kind of nature. However, the motion not being supported by the Parliament, the Members submitted it was a dilemma of whether to offer support or not to the motion.

To that, the Minister for Economic Affairs and the Agriculture Minister clarified that the main reasons for the problems were that the transmission line with 400 kV and 200 kV were destructive to the forest in the protected areas, while the transmission line with 33 kV and 11 kV came with thick wires during distribution of the electricity in the remote places, affecting the areas through which the transmission lines had been constructed.

It was also mentioned that one of the reasons for that issue was when the people were consulted during the public consultations before constructing the transmission line, they were eager to get the electricity connectivity, whereby people did not think much about the consequences of their consensus. It was also mentioned that the

people were now complaining because when activities for economic development and revenue were being planned along those areas, people did not get the clearance to use their land for their benefit.

It was submitted that to prevent such problems in the future, the House should provide rooms to enforce the Environmental Assessment Act of Bhutan 2000 and related rules and regulations were also mentioned in the laws. Therefore, it was submitted that if the recommendations were all passed with support from the House, there was greater opportunity for the related agencies to enforce the law as well.

Additionally, the House also proposed that the concerned agencies should be careful not to cause any damage while constructing the transmission line thereafter.

After that, the House deliberated on each of the recommendations and voted on them separately. The first recommendation was endorsed with 35 voting “Yes”, 6 voting “No” and 3 voting Abstain out of 44 Members present and voting. **The voting list provided in Annexure 7.**

The second recommendation was passed with 36 voting “Yes”, 4 voting “No” and 4 Abstaining out of 44 Members present and voting. **The voting list provided in Annexure 8.**

The Third Motion was also endorsed with 33 voting “Yes”, 4 Voted “No” and 7 Abstaining out of 44 Members present and voting. Following that, the House directed the Government and the relevant ministries to work accordingly and concluded the deliberation. **The voting list provided in Annexure 9.**

**26<sup>th</sup> Day of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 4<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

**14. Report on the Pay Revision Bill of Bhutan 2019.**

The Member in-charge of the Bill (the Minister for Finance) presented the Pay Revision Bill of Bhutan 2019 inclusive of the following:

As per the Section 30 of the Constitution of Bhutan, the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission was formed and was tasked to revise the pay, allowances, benefits and other emoluments of the public and civil servants and to submit recommendations to the Government. The Minister reported that it was as per the pledges of the present Government in narrowing the gap and additionally to revise the pay, allowances and other benefits of the support level employees so that they could upgrade their quality of livelihood.

The Minister reported that after the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission presented the Pay Commission Report to the Cabinet on 5<sup>th</sup> April, 2019, the Government released the Pay Commission Report through media in order to get opinions from the people. He reported that besides ratifying the report in consideration of the various opinions of people, the Government did not interfere much as the Pay Commission was an independent institute.

The Minister also stated that the revised pay, allowances and benefits would be around Nu. 4,530 million which would be withdrawn from consolidated fund. It was also reported that after the Pay Revision Bill was being adopted, all the laws, announcements, notifications, rules and regulations which were not in line with the provisions of the Bill would be null and void.

After that, the Minister reported that the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission recommended revising the pay scale for the Prime Minister, Cabinet



Ministers and the equal positions by 14% but the Government revised it to 6% on the existing basic pay as shown in the table below:

Position Level	Existing Pay Scale			Revised Pay Scale			% change
	Min.	Incr.	Max.	Min.	Incr.	Max.	
Prime Minister	180,000	3,600	198,000	190,800	3,815	209,875	6%
Speaker of NA	130,000	2,600	143,000	137,800	2,755	151,575	6%
Chief Justice of SC	130,000	2,600	143,000	137,800	2,755	151,575	6%
Cabinet Ministers	130,000	2,600	143,000	137,800	2,755	151,575	6%
Opposition Leader	130,000	2,600	143,000	137,800	2,755	151,575	6%

Furthermore, it was reported that the Pay Commission recommended an increase of 14% revised pay scale for Dy. Speaker of the National Assembly, Dy. Chairperson of the National Council and the Members of Parliament from which the Government revised it to 12% on the existing basic pay as shown in the table below:

Position Level	Existing Pay Scale			Revised Pay Scale			% change
	Min.	Incr.	Max.	Min.	Incr.	Max.	
Dy. Speaker/ Dy. Chairperson	75,160	1,505	82,685	84,180	1,685	92,605	12%
Members	65,930	1,320	72,530	73,845	1,475	81,220	12%

Similarly, for the positions in the Judiciary and the Constitutional Bodies, the Minister reported that the government revised the pay scale by 12% on the existing basic pay upon the recommendations of the Pay Commission as shown below:

Resolution of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Session of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Parliament

Position Level	Existing Pay Scale			Revised Pay Scale			% change
	Min.	Incr.	Max.	Min.	Incr.	Max.	
Heads of ACC/ECB/RAA/RCSC	75,160	1,505	82,685	84,180	1,685	92,605	12%
Drangpons of Supreme Court	75,160	1,505	90,210	84,180	1,685	101,030	12%
Chief Justice of High Court	69,225	1,385	83,075	77,535	1,555	93,085	12%
Drangpons of High Court	65,930	1,320	79,130	73,845	1,480	88,645	12%
Commissioners/ Members	60,030	1,200	72,030	67,235	1,345	73,960	12%

After that, it was reported that the revised pay for chairman and the members of the Privy Council at 6% and 12% respectively on the existing basic pay as shown in the table below:

Position Level	Existing Pay Scale			Revised Pay Scale			% change
	Min.	Incr.	Max.	Min.	Incr.	Max.	
Chairman	130,000	2,600	143,000	137,800	2,755	151,575	6%
Member	60,030	1,200	72,030	67,235	1,345	87,410	12%

The Minister then reported the pay scale of the Attorney General was revised by 12% on the existing basic pay as follows:

Position Level	Existing Pay Scale			Revised Pay Scale			% change
	Min.	Incr.	Max.	Min.	Incr.	Max.	
Attorney General	75,160	1,505	82,685	84,180	1,685	92,605	12%

With regards to Local Government, the Minister reported that during the second government's time in the year 2017, the 3<sup>rd</sup> Pay

Commission was formed and the pay scale for the local government leaders increased by 40%. Due to that, the 4<sup>th</sup> Pay Commission did not submit any recommendations to revise the existing pay scale for the local leaders' apart from Thrompons. It was reported that the Government acknowledging the importance of Local Government, revised the pay scale of the Local Government Functionaries between 14%-24% on the existing basic pay as follows:

Position Level	Existing Pay Scale			Revised Pay Scale			% change
	Min.	Incr.	Max.	Min.	Incr.	Max.	
Thrompons	45,785	915	50,360	52,195	1,045	57,420	14%
Gups	28,000	560	30,800	33,040	660	36,340	18%
Mangmi	21,000	420	23,100	24,780	495	27,255	18%
Dzongkhag Thromde-Thuemi	21,000	420	23,100	24,780	500	27,280	18%
Thromde-Thuemi	9,800	195	10,775	12,155	245	13,380	24%
Tshogpa	9,800	195	10,775	12,155	245	13,380	24%

Elementary Service Personnel (ESP) were the lowest level in case of position as well as in the pay scale. The Minister reported that the Government found out that the present pay for the ESP were not enough to support a family or to sustain the day to day expenditure. It was submitted that the Pay Commission recommended revising the pay scale for ESP by 29% on which the Government decided to revise it by 35% on the existing basic pay as shown in the table below:

Position Level	Existing Consolidated Pay	Revised Pay Scale			% change
		Min.	Incr.	Max.	
ESP	7,000	9,450	190	12,300	35%

The Minister reported that even the General Service Personnel (GSP) were also paid low like the Elementary Service Personnel (ESP). Based on that, it was reported that the Government decided revising the pay scale of the GSP by 30% on the existing basic pay following the Pay Commission's recommendation of 23%. It was also submitted that the pay scale of GSP should be merged into one single pay scale as below:

Position Level	Existing Pay Scale			Revised Pay Scale			% change
	Min.	Incr.	Max.	Min.	Incr.	Max.	
GSP I	8,080	160	10,480	10,505	210	13,655	30%
GSP II	7,695	155	10,020				

Furthermore, it was reported that the Pay Scale of the RAPA and Para Regular staff was mapped with the equivalent positions in the civil service and that it was revised by 185 -24% on the existing basic pay.

Similarly, the Pay Commission recommended revising the pay scale of the Non-Formal Educational (NFE) instructor by 29% which the Government reportedly revised to 30% on the existing basic pay mapping with the equivalent positions in the public servant as shown in the table below. The pay scale for Gaydrung was recommended by the Pay Commission to be revised by 18%, on which the Government decided to revise it by 24% on the existing basic pay as below:

Position Level	Existing Pay Scale			Revised Pay Scale			% change
	Min.	Incr.	Max.	Min.	Incr.	Max.	
NFE Instructor	8,400			10,920	220	14,220	30%
Gaydrung	13,000			16,120	320	20,920	24%

The Minister reported that the pay scale revision for the civil servants were revised by the Government based on the recommendations of

the Pay Commission with a minimum raise for the levels higher including Executives and above and maximum raises for the levels below executive positions. The revised pay scale for the civil servant was reported to be ranging from 12% - 24 % on the existing basic pay as shown below.

Sl. No	Position Level	Existing Pay Scale			Revised Pay Scale			% change from Existing
		Min.	Incr.	Max.	Min.	Incr.	Max.	
1	Cabinet Secretary	75,160	1,505	82,685	84,180	1,685	92,605	12%
2	Government Secretary	65,930	1,320	72,530	73,845	1,480	81,245	12%
3	EX/ES-1	54,575	1,090	70,925	62,220	1,245	80,895	14%
4	EX/ES-2	45,785	915	59,510	52,195	1,045	67,870	14%
5	EX/ES-3	38,700	775	50,325	44,120	885	57,395	14%
6	P1	30,990	620	40,290	36,570	735	47,595	18%
7	P2/SS1	27,370	545	35,545	32,300	650	42,050	18%
8	P3/SS2	23,995	480	31,195	28,315	570	36,865	18%
9	P4/SS3	21,370	425	27,745	25,220	505	32,795	18%
10	P5/SS4	17,495	350	22,745	20,645	415	26,870	18%
11	S1	16,365	325	21,240	19,970	400	25,970	22%
12	S2	14,830	295	19,255	18,095	365	23,570	22%
13	S3	13,550	270	17,600	16,535	335	21,560	22%
14	S4	12,025	240	15,625	14,675	295	19,100	22%
15	S5	11,125	225	14,500	13,575	275	17,700	22%
16	O1	10,725	215	13,950	13,300	270	17,350	24%
17	O2	10,075	200	13,075	12,495	250	16,245	24%
18	O3	9,155	185	11,930	11,355	230	14,805	24%
19	O4	8,505	170	11,055	10,550	215	13,775	24%

Furthermore, it was reported that the Pay Commission recommended to revise the Red Kabney (Nyie-kel-ma) allowance to Nu.10,000 from

the existing Nu. 100 per month. On that, the Government decided to maintain the existing rate of Nu.100 per month allowance for the serving Nyi-kel-mas.

The Minister reported that the allowances for General Doctor with MBBS/Dentists with BDS however less than Master Degree and Practicing Drungtshos was being revised by 45% of the minimum revised basic pay; whereas the Nurses and Clinical Staff allowance was revised ranging from 35% to 55% of the minimum revised basic pay based on number of years served. The Specialist allowance was also reported to be revised by 55% of the minimum revised basic pay and that the new category of Sub-specialist allowance is introduced at 60% of the minimum revised basic pay. It was reported that the radiation allowance of Nu.1,500 per month was revised to Nu.3,000 per month which could be extended to the veterinary technicians exposed to radiation by nature of their profession. It was also reported that the uniform allowance for health workers was revised from Nu.4,500 per annum to Nu.5,000 per annum and that the night duty allowance was introduced at Nu.500 per night for health professionals attending night duty for 12 hours as routine schedule requiring continuous patient care.

Similarly, the Minister also reported that the Government acknowledging the importance of the Teachers and in order to enhance the capacity of the teachers and the quality of the education, the teaching allowance was revised ranging from 35%-55% on the minimum revised basic pay based on number of years served. It was also reported that an additional allowance was introduced based on Government approved Bhutan Professional Standards for Teachers (BPST) as follows: Proficient Teacher: 10%, Accomplished Teacher: 15% and Distinguished Teacher: 20%. The Minister clarified that the

additional allowance based on BPST would be effective only after the BPST was implemented.

Additionally, it was also reported that the existing 20% professional allowance for Aviation/ACC/RAA/Internal Audit was revised on the minimum revised basic pay and that the Prosecutor allowance for the Prosecutors stationed in the Office of the Attorney General (OAG) was also introduced at a lump sum 20% of the minimum revised basic pay.

It was also reported that the present government introduced the Special Responsibility Allowance (SRA) for the Heads of the four Constitutional Offices of ACC, ECB, RAA and RCSC as lump sum of Nu. 13,000 per month whereas for the Members/ Commissioners of the Constitutional Offices of ACC, ECB, RAA and RCSC, an allowance of SRA was introduced as a lump sum of Nu.7000 per month. The stipend of the BCSE selected graduates undergoing pre-service training was also reported to be revised from Nu.1,500 per month to a trainee allowance of Nu.5,000 per month.

Recognizing the House Rent Allowance (HRA) as important, the Minister reported that the existing 20% HRA for civil servants and others and 30% HRA for Members of Parliament was revised as lump sum of the revised basic pay. The HRA for positions S3 and below was also reported to be revised as lump sum of Nu.3,500 per month and extended to ESP employees. Coming to the Communication Allowance, it was reported that the existing communication allowance of Nu.1,000 per month for Holders/Members/Commissioners of the Constitutional Offices, the Government Secretaries, Attorney General and the members of the Privy Council was revised to Nu.2,000 per month. The communication allowance for heads of the Department/

Autonomous Agencies were also reported to be revised from Nu.500 per month to Nu.1,000 per month.

Additionally, the introduction of the communication allowance of Nu.1,000 per month to Personal Secretary & Personal Assistant to the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court, the Speaker of the National Assembly, Chairperson of the National Council, Leader of the Opposition, Cabinet Ministers & Equivalent positions; and Nu.1,500 per month to Principal Secretary, Communication Specialist/PS/PA to the Prime Minister was also reported. The Minister submitted that the communication allowance for other public servants was maintained at the existing rate and the allowance for one-time purchase of mobile purchase was being discontinued for the time being.

Regarding the discretionary allowance, it was reported that the MPs' allowance was revised from Nu.0.100 m to Nu.0.150 m per annum. The discretionary allowance for Dzongdas was reported to be revised from Nu.0.050 m to Nu.0.075 m per annum whereas the discretionary allowance for other public servants was maintained at the existing level. The existing driver allowance for the MPs was revised from Nu.6,000 to Nu.10,000 per month while the Fuel and Maintenance Allowance for MPs was revised to Nu.10,000 per month from Nu.7,000 per month.

After that, the Minister reported that an Officiating Allowance of Nu.5,000 per month was introduced for managerial position of P1 and above and for Thrompons and Gups for officiating for a continuous period exceeding minimum of three months and up to a maximum of six months. It was also reported that the regular contract allowance was maintained at 30% of the revised basic pay and other allowances and benefits would be as per the pay scale. The Minister submitted



that the revision of salary, allowances and benefits of the Royal University of Bhutan University should be formalized through the provision of capitation fees.

Furthermore, it was reported that the entitlement of Water and Electricity expenses on actual basis for the Prime Minister, Chief Justice of the Supreme Court, the Speaker of the National Assembly, Chairperson of the National Council, Leader of the Opposition, Cabinet Ministers and Equivalent position's entitlement would be continued. The Minister also reported that the Heads of the Constitutional Offices (ACC, ECB, RAA and RCSC) and Attorney General provided with designated residence at Lhengye Densa were entitled for water and electricity expenses up to a maximum ceiling of Nu.3,000 per month. It was also reported that the Prime Minister, Cabinet Ministers and other Equivalent positions, Heads of the Constitutional Offices (ACC, ECB, RAA and RCSC) and Attorney General provided with designated residence at Lhengye Densa were entitled for a Domestic Help.

After that, the Minister reported that the salary and benefits of Domestic Helper was revised at par with ESP. The introduction of designated duty vehicle to the Heads of Departments and Autonomous Agencies with Position level EX3 and above in addition to the existing position levels was also reported.

The Minister submitted that the allowances maintained unchanged at the existing level were Patang/Gentag Allowance of Nu.50,000, Leave Travel Concession (LTC) of Nu.15,000, High Altitude Allowance of Nu.2,000 per month for 10,000-12,000 feet and Nu.3,000 per month for above 12,000 feet, Cash Handling Allowance of Nu.400 per month, Overtime Allowance, Vehicle purchase allowance of

lump sum Nu.1.000 million per term for Member of Parliament, allowances for the Special Responsibilities and Sitting fees of the Local Government, Carriage charges for Personal Effects during Transfer and Retirement and Ex-country Travel Daily Subsistence Allowance.

After that, the revised Daily Allowance (DA) for In-country Travel for Prime Minister, Chief Justice of the Supreme Court, the Speaker of the National Assembly, Chairperson of the National Council, Leader of the Opposition, Cabinet Ministers and Equivalent Position, Holders & Commissioners/Members of the Constitutional Offices, Government Secretaries, Attorney General, Members of the Privy Council, Thrompons and EX/ES-1 to EX/ES-3, P 1 to P 5 and for the S1 level and below were reported as shown in the table below.

After that the Minister reported that the Minimum travel distance was maintained at 10 km radius for the purpose of Daily Allowances (DA) and that the mileage rate for all the levels was Nu.16 per km uniformly with a minimum travel distance of 10 km radius for the purpose of Travel Allowance (TA). It was also reported that the porter and pony charges was revised to lump sum Nu.1,200 per dholam for the places with no motorable road connectivity and that DA rates revised from 20% to 50% when both food and lodge was being provided for all public servants across board.

Additionally, it was also reported that the DA rates had been revised for public servants accompanying the Prime Minister, Chief Justice of the Supreme Court, the Speaker of the National Assembly, Chairperson of the National Council, Leader of the Opposition, Cabinet Ministers and Equivalent Positions to 100% within the

Country and to 50% while accompanying the Prime Minister, Chief Justice of the Supreme Court, the Speaker of the National Assembly, Chairperson of the National Council, Leader of the Opposition, Cabinet Ministers and Equivalent Positions travelling outside the Country.

Sl. No.	Position level	Existing	Revised DA Rates
1	Prime Minister, Chief Justice of Supreme Court, Speaker of the National Assembly, Chairperson of the National Council, Leader of the Opposition, Cabinet Ministers and Equivalent Position	Actual	Actual
2	Holders & Commissioners/Members of the Constitutional Offices, Government Secretaries, Attorney General, Members of Privy Council, Thrompons and EX/ES-1 to EX/ES-3	Actual lodging in one room (maximum ceiling Nu.3,000) plus Nu.800 or lump sum DA of Nu.1,500	Actual lodging in one room (maximum ceiling Nu.3,000) plus Nu.1,000 or lump sum DA of Nu.2,000 per day
3	P 1 to P 5	Lump sum Nu.1,000	Lump sum Nu.1,500 per day
4	S1 level and below	Lump sum Nu.750 /500	Lump sum Nu.1000 per day

Similarly, the revised Travel Allowances (TA) and Daily Allowances (DA) for the Local Government functionaries were reported as below:

Positions	Revised TA/DA (Nu)			
	TA on non-motorable route outside the Gewog	TA outside Gewog/Thromde on motorable route traveling beyond 10km (mileage)	Annual lump sum TA/DA for traveling within Gewog (both non-motorable & motorable road)	DA outside Gewog/Thromde (Nu. per day)
Thrompon	NA	Nu.16/km	NA	2000
Gup	250	Nu.16/km	18,000	1,500
Mangmi	250	Nu.16/km	13,500	1,000
Dzongkhag Thromde-Thuemi	NA	Nu.16/km	NA	1,000
Thromde-Thuemi	NA	Nu.16/km	NA	1,000
Tshogpa	250	Nu.16/km	6,000	1,000

After that, the revised allowances for the Dzongkhag Mask & Folk Dancers allowance which extends to Pazaaps, Zheps and Equivalents under daily allowance were reported as shown in the table below:

Allowance	Existing	Revised
Monthly Allowance	Mask and Folk Dancers: Nu. 1,500	Mask and Folk Dancers: Nu.2,500
	Dhodhams/Champones/Chamjubs/Tsipoen: Nu.2,000	Dhodhams/Champones/Chamjubs/Tsipoen: Nu. 3,000
Daily Allowance	Mask and Folk Dancers: Nu.300	Mask and Folk Dancers: Nu.700
	Dhodhams/Champones/Chamjubs/Tsipoen: Nu.500	Dhodhams/Champones/Chamjubs/Tsipoen/Pazaaps/Zheps and Equivalents: Nu.1,000

Regarding the Vehicle import quota, the Minister reported that a Vehicle Import Quota free of Customs duty & Sales tax of 3000 cc or an option of monetized amount of Nu.1.500 m per term would be provided to the Prime Minister, Cabinet Ministers, Speaker, Chairperson of the National Council, Opposition Leader, Members of the Parliament and the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court. It was also reported that for all public servants eligible for vehicle import quota as per existing rules, Vehicle Import Quota of ceiling Nu.0.800 m or an option of monetized amount of Nu.0.250 m or an option of monetized amount of Nu.0.350 m on purchase of electric vehicle would be provided and this revised Vehicle import quota would be extended to the Thrompons and Gups.

Regarding the Pension and Provident Fund Scheme, it was reported that the Pension and Provident Fund (PF) contribution from the Government has been revised from 11% to 15% where the additional Government contribution of the 4% would be contributed to the PF scheme and the total Government contribution shall be 15%, whereas the employee would continue to contribute 11%, taking the total contribution to 26%. The Minister also submitted that the PF scheme was also extended to the ESP and GSP in the form of Provident Fund.

Moreover, the Minister reported that the pension payout was revised to 40% of the maximum pay scale of the Cabinet Secretary and the minimum pension payout to be linked to 40% of revised maximum pay scale of the lowest position in civil service (O4 level). However, it was submitted that an individual had to serve a minimum of 20 years to claim pension and that the existing gratuity ceiling of Nu.1,500,000 had been removed and revised with no ceiling. It was also reported that Group Insurance Scheme (GIS) had been maintained at the existing level.

The Foreign allowance and the Representational grant for Foreign Service Entitlement were reported to be shown in the table below. The Minister also reported that the Representational grant for the Head and Deputy Head of Liaison and Transit Office (LTO), Kolkata, India had also been introduced.

Country	Foreign Allowance	Representational Grant
Geneva	No change	15%
Brussels	10%	10%
New York	30%	20%
Kuwait	30%	20%
Bangkok	40%	40%
Dhaka	40%	40%
Consulates	40%	40%
New Delhi	100%	100%

The Minister stated that Children Education Allowance (CEA) was provided to cover the cost of education during foreign posting to compensate for rising cost of education in the respective country. The CEA was reported to be as per the table shown below and it was also reported that CEA would be applicable only if the children study in the same country as the parents were posted and that CEA would be covering for a maximum of three children only.

Country	Geneva	Brussels	New York	Kuwait	Bangkok	South Asia
Existing Allowance (per child)	CHF 198	EUR 125	USD 75	USD 120	USD 120	USD 75
Revised Allowance (per child)	CHF 490	EUR 410	USD 250	USD 450	USD 450	USD 250

When reporting about the rental ceiling, the Minister mentioned that the rental ceiling had been revised by 10% for Embassies/Missions/Consulates in all locations except for the Royal Bhutan Embassy, Dhaka where it was increased by 47%. The revision was reported to be subjected to the conditions provided. It was also reported that the local recruits in the Embassies/Missions/Consulates were entitled to overtime allowance which should be maintained at status quo for all locations except for Bangkok which was revised as tabled below:

<b>Mis-sions</b>	<b>New York</b>	<b>Brus-sels</b>	<b>Ge-neva</b>	<b>Ku-wait</b>	<b>Bang-kok</b>	<b>Dhaka</b>	<b>New Delhi</b>	<b>Kol-kata/ Guwa-hati</b>
Exist-ing rate/ hour (2002)	USD 10	EUR 6.6	CHF 10	USD 5	Baht 65 (300 hrs / month)	At RGoB rate		
Revised rate/ hour	USD 10	EUR 6.6	CHF 10	USD 5	Baht 100 (300 hrs / month)	At RGoB rate		

The Minister reported that the pay scale of the local recruits in Embassies/Missions/Consulates was revised by 20% in Bangkok and 10% in other places to compensate for increase in living cost while the local recruit's pay scale in Delhi and Kolkata had been decided to continue at the Royal Government of Bhutan (RGoB) pay scale. As for the local recruits upon non-renewal of their contract, it was reported that as a form of recognition for the contribution of their service, up to three months basic salary local recruits was introduced. The other Foreign Services Allowance reported to have

been maintained unchanged were mileage, medical coverage and Insurance, lump sum allowance for Carriage of Personal Effects, leave Travel Passage from and to headquarter, furnishing Grant, domestic Help and the utility Expenses.

Lastly, the Minister reported to the House that the pay allowances, benefits and other emoluments of Royal Bhutan Police would be revised by the Government at par with the Royal Bhutan Army (RBA) and Royal Body Guard (RBG) to maintain parity amongst the nation's security forces.

After that, the House declared the Pay Revision Bill of Bhutan 2019 as a Money Bill and as per Section 240 of the National Assembly (Amendment) Act of Bhutan 2014, the Pay Revision Bill of Bhutan 2019 was referred to the Economics and Finance Committee for further review. Although the duration for the committee to review the Pay Revision Bill of Bhutan 2019 was limited, the committee was directed to manage time to review the bill. The report on the Pay Revision Bill of Bhutan 2019 concluded with the House reminding the committee to review the Bill according to the provisions of the constitution of Bhutan and the Public Finance Act, and submit its recommendations to the House on 10<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.

**2<sup>nd</sup> Day of the 4th Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 5th June, 2019.**

**15. Resolution on the Third Reading of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019**

During the Third Reading of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019, regarding the section 6.1 which stated that a Drangpon may recuse from adjudication of a case of any conflict of interest, Members submitted that it might be possible in the Supreme Court, High Court and the District Court in Thimphu Dzongkhag due the numerous Benches. The Members mentioned



that it would be problematic in other Dzongkhags and Dungkhags Court with single Bench and stated that this kind of problem was emerging from time to time in those Dzongkhags and Dungkhags. Based on those reasons, the Members requested the Committee to review the section once again and report during the second day of deliberation.

To that, the Member of the Committee clarified that since the Bill was concerning the proceedings of the court, the Judiciary was well aware of it. They also mentioned that there was one representative from Judiciary in the National Law Review Taskforce where the discussion on the issue took place intensely before their recommendations were submitted to the Committee. It was also added that the recommendation could help people get justice, and assured the Members not to worry as there were histories of the Drangpon of another Dzongkhag doing the adjudication of the case; if it happened, then that the sole Drangpon of that particular court had to be recused from adjudication of the due to any conflict of interest.

Even after the clarification, some of the Members submitted that it could give a feeling that there was no trust in the Drangpons and also submitted the chances compromising justice if a litigant was allowed to move the motion for recusal of a Drangpon from court proceedings. The need for a provision for a requirement of an observer if the Drangpon was seen as being in conflict of interest during the adjudication of a case were also discussed before the House directed the Committee to review the section once more and report to the House.

Similarly, in the case of section 107.1, it was discussed that there were chances of complication in future due to the inclusion of criminal cases

under the civil contempt clause, and thus, the Members recommended for civil cases and criminal cases to be put under different section. The Members also submitted that there was lots of imprisonment due to the monetary cases where the borrowers were not able to pay the personal loan and Business loan and other related civil cases. Thus, the Members requested for another extensive review of the section, following which the House directed the Committee to review it and report it to the House.

Additionally, with regard to the Section 153.1, Section 199.8 and Section 201, the Members submitted that due to the full power entrusted to the Drangpons, there could be chances of conflict of interest and other complications arising and recommended providing limited power to the Drangpons to ensure and help in providing justice. Regarding the insertion of a definition of Police Officer to include the forest officers, immigration officials, customs officials and other law enforcement officers who exercise the power of a police by virtue of their work nature, the Members submitted that it would be more appropriate. The Members during the course of intensive deliberation recommended replacing the term “Police Officer” by “Law Enforcement Officer”.

On that, the Committee Members recommended the House to amend the definition of Police Officers to include abovementioned Law Enforcement Officers, as it would create inconveniences if the definition of Police Officers was not clearly defined in the CCPC. Therefore, the House directed the Committee to once again review Sections 6.1 and 107.1, and Definition 199.8 and submit a report thereof to the House, and concluded the deliberation on the Third

Reading of the Civil and Criminal Procedural Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019.

**2<sup>nd</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 5<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

On the 3<sup>rd</sup> Day of the Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to June 6, 2019, the Chairperson of the Legislative submitted the review report on the amendments made with regard to Sections 6.1 and 107.1, and Definition 199.8 as per the directives of the House. Following an extensive deliberation, the House unanimously passed the recommendation as submitted by the Committee.

Following that, the Chairperson of the Legislative Committee (Member from Bongo\_Chapcha Constituency) moved the motion for the adoption of the Civil and Criminal Procedural Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 as per the procedure of the House. While ascertaining the support on the motion, 43 Members voted “Yes”, and 1 Member voted “No” out of 44 Members present and voting, and therefore adopted the Civil and Criminal Procedural Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019.

On that, the Member from Panbang in his dissenting opinion submitted that apart from the (Amendment) procedure code, the definition of Police Officers had been included in other laws as well. It was submitted that since the responsibilities of police officers and other officers were different, it was imperative for the House to carry out extensive deliberation while formulating laws to prevent inconveniences during the implementation. Submission was also made that the Member could not support the recommendation due to such provisions, after which the deliberation on the Third Reading of the Civil and Criminal Procedural Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 concluded. **The voting list provided in Annexure 10. The Amendment Bill provided in the Annexure 11.**

**16. Resolution on the Sustainable Development Goal 3 - Good Health and Well-Being report.**

The Chairperson of the Social and Cultural Committee (Member from Maenbi\_Tsaenkhar Constituency) presented the report on the Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 3 - Good Health and Well-Being.

The Chairperson, while reporting, submitted that the 17 National Key Result Areas (NKRAs) of the 12 FYP shared almost the same interface and constituents with the SDGs. The Member also submitted that in the Parliament's context, monitoring and implementation of the SDGs and ensuring that the policies on SDGs synergize to Bhutan's needs would be a key factor, not only in creating better understanding of SDGs in the Parliament but also in expediting the implementation of the SDGs. It was reported that Parliament as a key legislative authority could complement the nation's collective efforts in fulfillment of global SDGs.

The Chairperson submitted that recognizing the immutable linkage between the Gross National Happiness and the Sustainable Development Goals with the Parliament, the Social and Cultural Committee of the National Assembly was given the task to report on SDG, Goal 3; Good Health and Wellbeing in the Second Session of the Third Parliament. According to which, the Social and Cultural Committee submitted the report with 9 recommendations as follows:

1. The Health Bill to be tabled during 4th Session of second Parliament to ensure efficient and effective free Health services as mandated by the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan.
2. The government to increase the ex-country seat for professional courses to address the shortage of specialists, doctors and other specialized health care providers.

3. KGUMS to start the MBBS program as groundwork was completed including faculties and module.
4. Explore the possibility of de-linking Clinical Services from Civil Service or incentivize to professionalize their services.
5. Encourage private sectors to provide health facilities. However, the livelihood of the low-income citizens should not be affected.
6. Review the superannuation age limit of Specialist to address shortage and retired or superannuated doctors could be taken up based on their area of specialization and need of the nation.
7. The grade of paramedical health workers was not uniform, especially, the diploma holders. Therefore, all diploma holders of same duration with same entry requirement should be placed in the same grade.
8. Government to build a city hospital or district hospital for Thimphu District to improve efficiency of service delivery and decongest in JDWNRH.
9. Regularize Assistance to Privately Enrolled Medical Students (APEMS) to full scholarship to address an acute shortage of doctors and make scholarship uniform.

While deliberating on the report, the Opposition Leader and some Members mentioned that even though there were lots of provisions of the SDG 3, the report from the committee included only the health services and medications. Members recommended focusing on solving the problems of harmful use of alcohol and tobacco, unhealthy diet and unemployment in order to create a better community.

On that, other Members raised concern over the Non-Communicable Diseases (NCD) mentioning that the allowances for patients travelling outside for treatment should be increased. They also submitted that while sending the patient for treatment in other countries, they

should be sent as early as possible depending on the seriousness of the patient. The Members also stated that if the present Government with doctors as their Members did not take the initiative to develop/strengthen the healthcare services, there was no guarantee that there would be Government in the future who would take the initiative. Hence, the Members urged the Government to take the initiative of further strengthening the health sector of the country.

Besides that, the need to include provisions to establish BHUs so that the hospital services as well as the healthcare services in the remote places are strengthened, the need to review the medical procurement system and the need to encourage private sectors to participate in providing health facilities were also discussed.

To that, on behalf of the Government, the Prime Minister and the Ministers replied that in line with the recommendations of the Committee, the Health Ministry was considering and working on the need to increase the ex-country seats for professional courses, the possibility of de-linking Clinical Services from Civil Service or incentivizing to professionalize their services, reviewing the superannuation age limit of Specialist and solving the problem of decongestion in JDWNRH.

Additionally, it was agreed that the Health Bill was a must in order to ensure efficient and effective free Health services as mandated by the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan; however, it was requested for more time to present it after the 4th Session, so that it could be framed in a way to avoid any problems while implementing it in the future. It was also mentioned that the opportunity for the private sector to participate in providing health services would be provided after the adoption of the Health Bill.

Similarly, it was mentioned that the problem of the grade of the diploma holder paramedical health workers not being uniform was being discussed with Royal Civil Service Commission and was hopeful to get resolved. It was stated that while supporting the majority of the recommendations of the Committee, recommendation to start the MBBS program at Khesar Gyalpo University of Medical Sciences of Bhutan (KGUMS) could not be seconded. It was reasoned that Bhutan did not have the Specialist as well as the facilities required to start the MBBS program. Additionally, it was mentioned that since Bhutan did not lack MBBS doctors other than the specialists, the program even if started would be of no benefit to the country.

Besides that, since Regularize Assistance to Privately Enrolled Medical Students (APEMS) was reported to be under the Department of Adult and Higher Education, Education Ministry, the Health Ministry was reported to have no authority over it. To that, the Education Minister announced that the ministry has plans to review the signing with the foreign donors for scholarship at the earliest and to hold discussion with them.

On that, the Speaker reminded that such kind of important topics like the Sustainable Development Goals were being discussed in the House in order to let the public know about its importance. After that, the session on the Sustainable Development Goal 3 - Good Health and Well-Being report concluded with the House directing the Government and the relevant agencies to consider the recommendations of the Committee and work accordingly.

**3<sup>rd</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 6<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

**17. Question Hour: Group A: Questions relevant to the Prime Minister, Ministry for Home and Cultural Affairs and Ministry for Information and Communications.**

The Speaker informed the House that for the Group A, there were five questions for oral responses and two questions for written responses. The Speaker informed that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be given only after all the oral questions had been answered and commenced the session.

**17.1 Oral Questions**

17.1.1 The Member from the Jomotshangkha\_Martshala reported that one of the most important pledges of the present Government was to regularize those civil servants who were on contract basis. The Member also reported that during the First Session, the Education Minister informed the House that in addition to the regularization of contract civil servants in the Ministry of Education, all other Civil Servants on contract would also be regularized. The Member requested the Hon'ble Prime Minister to clarify the House on that matter since there was nothing done till date.

17.1.2 The Member from Bartsham\_Shongphu questioned the Minister for Information and Communication regarding the Government's plan to promote green and inclusive transport in the country, requesting the Minister to inform the House and the nation regarding the details of the Project.

17.1.3 The Member from Panbang Constituency stated that Freedom of Press was fundamental to a vibrant democracy and good governance. Hence, it was considered as the fourth arm of state. The Member reported that a Press Secretary had been appointed in PMO recently and tasked to monitor the media and journalists. The Member also



mentioned receiving information of the PMO harassing the media. Thus, the Member requested the Prime Minister to explain the basis of appointment of Press Secretary and how the generously pay and allowances were fixed. The Member also sought clarification from the Prime Minister about the harassment issue.

17.1.4 The Member from Nanong-Shumar Constituency requested the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs to update on the status of the Government's pledge to review the office condition and pay, and ensure proper working environment for the Royal Bhutan Police (RBP).

17.1.5 The Member from Khar\_Yurung Constituency reported that during the election campaign in 2018, Prime Minister told that developmental activities would start from Pema Gatsel Dzongkhag, if their party fulfilled to form the Government. Therefore, the Member requested the Prime Minister to inform the House regarding the plans and activities that were coming up as per the pledge.

## **17.2 Written Questions**

17.2.1 Written answer question submitted by Member from Panbang Constituency to the Prime Minister

We have been given to understand that the present Government has a plan to promote electric cars in a big way. Can the Hon'ble Prime Minister provide the details to the House as to how many, and who are the electric car dealers in the country?

17.2.2 Written answer question submitted by Member from Khamdang\_Ramjar Constituency to the Prime Minister

One of the factors that largely benefits to the growth of economic and community development is motorable roads. However, some of the communities who reside along the international boundaries and

within the protected areas, are still sacrificing their basic livelihood; due to which, such factors have been creating huge challenges in these communities. For instance, there is deprivation of health and education facilities in such communities. Similarly, there are challenges of increasing number of gungtong due to rural-urban migration, and increasing number of students dropping out of schools. Therefore, considering these factors, could the Hon'ble Prime Minister clarify on the following question?

- 1) Yarphi, Namthi and Rollam villages under Yalang Gewog; Ombha, Cholaptsa, and Serphu villages under Toetsho Geowg; and Manlha village under Khamdang Gewog in Trashi Yangste Dzongkhag have better prospects of connecting with motorable roads, without any hindrance from policy. Hence, what are the plans and activities regarding the construction of motorable roads in these villages? Similarly, are there any plans to construct motorable roads in Manam, Chemkhar and Jangphu villages under Toetsho Gewog, and Dukti village under Yalang Gewog in Trashi Yangtse? If not, what are the measures taken up on areas like health and education, and other facilities to retain the people in those villages?

**4<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 7<sup>th</sup> June 2019.**

*Note: Detailed answers and deliberations on the oral questions as well as the answers for both the written answer questions from the Member from Panbang Constituency and the Member from Khamdang-Ramjar Constituency to the Prime Minister provided separately in the verbatim booklet published for reference.*

### **18. Third Reading of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019**

The House deliberated on the Third Reading of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019. During the deliberation on

each section of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill, the Legislative Committee submitted that although Section 183 stated that consensual sex between children of age between 16-18 shall not be deemed as rape, the committee shared concern that a child after crossing the age of 18 would then be deemed rape, and therefore, many of the youths who belonged to the working age would be in prisons.

Moreover, it was submitted that since the section had been creating inconveniences in the society during the enforcement, two recommendations were submitted in the House for consideration.

The first recommendation stated that: A defendant shall be guilty of the offence of a rape of a child above 12 years if the defendant commits any act of sexual intercourse against the child between ages of 12 to 16 years; whereas the second recommendation stated that consensual sex between person of above 16 years shall not be deemed to a rape provided that their age difference is not more than 3 years.

During the deliberation in the House, few members submitted that definition of child included the child below 18 years of age, and moreover, any person must be above 18 years regarding the involvement in any activity. Therefore, submission was made that such provision was against the laws of the country and international laws, and recommended to retain the provision as it was.

It was suggested that the any penalty related to sexual intercourse for youth between 16-18 years of age was too high, and for the welfare of both young boys and girls, the House needed to be mindful and to decide an appropriate penalty during the formulation of laws.

It was submitted that such amendments would lead to an increase of early pregnancies, and risks of cancers due to multiple sexual activities. It was suggested that amending laws for the convenience of the present situation would risk the lives of numerous young girls, and amending laws based on few sections would also compromise the basis of law itself. Therefore, it was suggested that it would be wise if the House could refer the Bill to the Committee to review once again prior to the adoption, and direct the Committee to submit a report thereof in the second day of deliberation. Accordingly, the House directed the bill to be reviewed once again and report it to the House.

Regarding the new section on Fronting, Members submitted that with the changing time, it was seen imperative to recommend the insertion of such section in the Penal Code; however, it was found that the fourth degree felony was inappropriate. Therefore, it was recommended that based on the business sizes and cost, the penalty should also be formulated according to the felony, as it could be one of the best measures to prevent such problems.

Furthermore, it was reported that one of the biggest problems in the country was foreign nationals setting up businesses on Bhutanese people's licenses solely for the exemption of tax; whereby such practices affected the economy, revenue and sovereignty of the country. Thus, it was recommended that there should be separate degree of penalty, and also that the definition of Fronting should be clearly defined. Hence, it was suggested that the House should direct the Committee to once again review the section. On that, the House directed the Committee to once again review Section 183, New Sub Section after Section 134 (B), and Section on Fronting and

submit the report during the second day, and therefore concluded the deliberation.

**4th Day of the 4th Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 7th June 2019.**

On the second day of deliberation, as per the directives of the House, the Committee reported the amendment Section 183, New Sub Section after Section 134 (B), and Section on Fronting of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019. During the deliberation, the House accepted Section 134 as recommended by the Committee.

However, regarding Section 183, majority of the members submitted that since the law of the country required a minimum of 18 years for any person to be involved in any activity, it was perceived like granting the consent for right to have sex from 16 years. Moreover, it was suggested that based on the Penal Code 2004, ages between 12 to 16 should be considered rape and be considered as the second degree felony, while it should be third degree felony for ages between 16-18 years for the convenience. Thus, it was also suggested that the degree of penalty should be kept under the jurisdiction of Drangpon.

On that, some members submitted that age of child should be considered between the age of 12-18 and the penalty should be kept less severe. Following an extensive deliberation on the recommendation, the House while ascertaining the support through the show of hands could not pass the recommendation as submitted by the Committee. Therefore, the House decided to retain the Section as per the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2011.

It was submitted that the Section 184 which states that the offence of a rape of a child above the age of 12 years shall be a felony of the second degree has been amended into two categories of felony:

whereby age between 12 to 16 shall be the felony of the second degree, and age between 16 to 18 shall be the felony of the third degree. On that, other members submitted that laws formulated in a hasty decision could only destroy the lives of our youths, and therefore, there was no substantial benefit as such in that.

Furthermore, it was submitted that since there might arise various inconveniences in the future, it was wise to hold various consultations with relevant stakeholders and carry out public hearings for extensive review of Penal Code, and thereby submit a report thereof in the winter session for fruitful deliberation. Nevertheless, while ascertaining the support through the show of hands, the House decided to retain the section as before.

Regarding the new section on Fronting, it was suggested that if there could be separate penalty for the foreign people running business and Bhutanese people running business. On that, few members suggested that it would be appropriate if penalty could be charged based on the size of business, and if provision of bail system could be introduced.

Similarly, it was recommended that since the main reason of fronting was found with regard to bar licenses, there was a need to formulate separate policy for bar licenses, as well as need to clearly define the definition of Fronting in the penal code. Following an extensive deliberation on the recommendation, the House decided to repeal the section on fronting.

Following that, the Chairperson of Legislative Committee (Member from Bongo\_Chapcha Constituency) moved the motion for the adoption of the 15 Amended Sections of the (Amendment) Bill of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019.

The House while ascertaining the support on the motion, 38 members voted “Yes”, 1 member voted “No” and 5 Abstained out of 44 members present and voting, and therefore, adopted the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019.

The Member from Panbang Constituency in his dissenting opinion submitted that since few sections of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill had been deferred, the Bill as a whole should be deferred as well, and shared concern that he could not support for adoption; after which the deliberation of the Third Reading of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 concluded. **The voting list provided in Annexure 12. The Amendment Bill provided in Annexure 13.**

**8<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 10<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

**19. Resolutions on the Review Report of the Pay Revision Bill 2019 by Economic and Finance Committee**

After the presentation of the Pay Revision Bill by the Minister for Finance on June 6, 2019, as per Section 240 of National Assembly Amendment Act 2014, it was referred to the Economic and Finance Committee to review the Bill and present it to the House. On June 10, 2019 the Chairperson for the Committee (Member from Athang-Thedtsho Constituency) presented the following report.

In the 4<sup>th</sup> Section of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Chapter, considering the differences of the position and responsibilities of the Heads of the three branches of Government and Ministers and other equivalent position holders, the Committee proposed an additional raise of 7% on the existing 6%, a total of 13% monthly salary increment for the Chief Justice and the Speaker of the National Assembly.

Similarly, in Sections 26, A and B of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Chapter, for the monthly special responsibility allowance of Nu. 13,000/- to the Chairman and Nu.7000/- to the Members of the Constitutional Bodies, the committee reported that there were many agencies who perform special responsibilities and such allowances would be a huge loss to the Government and proposed those Sections to be removed from the Bill.

After that, under Section 26, a new section for Professional Service Allowance was proposed, considering the general services to the parliament and the professional services provided during the session by the Legislative and Procedural Division and the Research and Hansard Division of both Houses. The allowance was an additional 20% on their revised pay scale which was to be paid in lump sum monthly.

In terms of Section 42 of the 4<sup>th</sup> Chapter, as per the proposal of Nu.3000/- ceiling for a room for the Members of Parliament, it was proposed to retain the same as per the Acts and existing practices.

After that, while expressing general opinions, the Opposition Leader reminded that the Objective and Vision and the Principle of the Government was narrowing the gap. It was submitted that in order to narrow the gap, apart from Civil Servants, the private sector needed to be included as well. It was also suggested that the source of income for the increment was not clearly reflected in the Bill.

Moreover, the provision of teaching allowances to the teachers would result in the demand of increment by the private school teachers which would highly affect the proprietors of the schools. The country was already in a huge debt which was of major concern and also the



allowances were largely introduced to the Civil Servants which gave a feeling that the bill was for allowance revision rather than a pay revision.

Following that, while deliberating on the individual sections, in terms of Section 4 for the revision of salary for the Prime Minister, Cabinet Ministers, Cabinet Minister and equivalent posts, the Members of the Opposition expressed concerns and submitted that there was no increment during the First Parliament, however, as the Second Parliament took increment of more than 100%, the 6% increment proposal in the new bill might only widen the gap.

In order to narrow the gap and to retain the faith of people, it was suggested that the Prime Minister along with Cabinet Ministers and those equivalent positions to the Ministers could forego the increment. It was also proposed that 12 % increment for the Members could be brought down to 10 %, or to completely do away from taking the pay increment.

On that, the Prime Minister and the Ministers expressed that even if salary and allowance was not given to the Prime Minister, the Cabinet Ministers and the Members were from humble background and requested to obtain the allowances and increment as per the bill. As for the faith and appreciation of the people, it was promised that Ministers could work well and bring out fruitful outcomes and great results while still taking the salary increment.

With regard to Section 9 for the pay revision of the Local Governments, the Members expressed that the Local Government was also eligible for the Leave Encashment which has not been given until now nor has been reflected in the bill, and proposed such provision to be included

in the bill. The recommendation was unanimously endorsed by the House and directed it to the Economic and Finance Committee to review and report to the House.

Similarly, on Section 16 regarding the salary and allowance revision for other public servants, the Members submitted that those on consolidated contract, especially the teachers were not given housing allowances and proposed a revision to provide them with housing allowances. Clarifying on that, the Minister for Finance stated that as per the RCSC Act and Rules, those that are eligible were provided and there was no way to provide for those who were not eligible. However, the House directed the Economic and Finance Committee to review and report again on the matter.

With regard to Section 19 B for the allowance of Medical Specialists, the existing Service Allowance of 40% increment to 55% as per the proposal was only 15% and the Members expressed views to raise the increment. It was also stated that the Medical services would not improve with the increment, rather there should be meaningful policy and plans in place, and working environment should be improved by providing comfortable office and work spaces. On that, the House directed the Economic and Finance Committee to review and report again.

Similarly, on Section 23 for the allowances of teachers, some members expressed views that there should be differences in the salary and allowances of the boarding schools teachers and day-scholar teachers as the teachers in boarding schools needs to stay in school from 5:00am to 10:00pm or 11:00 pm with students and sometimes have to spend sleepless nights and it was unfair for all teachers to receive the same salary and allowance.

Moreover, the boarding teachers should be provided with 10% allowance and if allowance was not provided, they should be provided overtime allowances when they work overtime. Clarifying on that, the Minister submitted that although it was relevant as per the responsibilities they take, the resources of the Government was only limited and the teaching allowance increment from the existing 20% to 35% to 50% as per years of service and the specialty allowance of 10% to 20% had been provided which would make their allowance and salary the highest and it was clarified that teachers given the relevant increment.

However, the House directed the Economic and Finance Committee to review and report again on the matter.

Following that, the Committee proposed the professional services allowance of 20% lump sum on basic pay for the Legislative and Procedural Division and Research and Hansard Division of both the Houses.

Deliberating on that, the Minister for Finance along with other Ministers submitted that although the workload was heavy for both the Houses, the work was only during the session, and thereby proposed a provision of overtime allowance instead of lump sum amount. On top of that, if selected staff from Secretariats were provided with allowances, there would be possibilities of such demands from other agencies as well. While some Members were of the view that allowance should be provided like Difficulty Allowance which could be provided as Overtime Allowance, which was unanimously endorsed. The House therefore forwarded to the Economic and Finance Committee for review and report.

On Section 30 and 31 for the Driver Allowance, Fuel and Vehicle Management Allowance for the Members of the Parliament, it was reported that the Government's Vehicle Procurement Amount of Nu.1000,000/- was not enough to procure a car relevant to changing times and the Driver allowance was not enough to hire a Driver for which chauffeur driven car was proposed for the elected members.

Similarly, on Section 54 under the Foreign Services Entitlement for Children's Education Allowances, it was suggested that the proposal with regard to the allowances to be given if parents work in the same country where children get education was found irrelevant, since it was the right of parents to educate their children wherever they wished. And considering the government allowance being not enough in some of the countries, it was found that it would cause many problems.

On that, it was submitted that no matter where the children get education, the allowances should be provided as per the provision of their country. Clarifying on that, the Prime Minister submitted that there was a mistake and the same old provision was reflected in the bill and there were changes such as parents working in New York having children at New Delhi, the children would get the allowance as per New Delhi provision, and parents from Dhaka with children at Geneva would get as per Dhaka provision. It was clarified that in countries where there was no such provision, the allowance would be equal to that of the country where parents were working. The House then directed the matter to the Economic and Finance Committee to be discussed with the Ministry of Finance and to present again.

After that, the Speaker reminded the House that the matters forwarded to the Economic and Finance Committee should be discussed

with the Ministry of Finance and then reviewed and reported. The deliberation on the Pay Revision Bill 2019 concluded after the Speaker reminded the House that all individual sections had been deliberated and endorsed, and should be endorsed with formal voting in the next sitting.

**8<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 10<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

On the 9<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to June 11, 2019, the Chairman of the Economic and Finance Committee, (Member of Athang-Thedtsho Constituency) presented the following report as per the directive of the House:

The Sections 9, 16, 19(C), 23 and 45 were to be presented individually. For Section 9 with regard to the provision of Leave Encashment to the Local Government, the Ministry upon discussion with the Committee found that the issue had been discussed thoroughly during the revision and that there was no provision. However, the Committee reported that as per the Local Government Entitlement Act 2015, Chapter 3 Section 15, there should be a provision, however, it was suggested that it was up to the House to decide.

On that, the Opposition Leader and the Members stated that the Leave Encashment to Local Government should be provided as per the provision in the Act, and since Mangmi and Thromde Thuemi had the same DSA and pay scale, the Thromde Thuemi deserved equal daily allowance of Nu.1500/- as the Mangmi.

Moreover, as the Local Government was the closest government to the people, it was reported that the proposal of the Committee should be endorsed in order to make their entitlements similar to that of other public servants. Another member highlighted that they should

be entitled as per the Act and expressed gratitude for the porter pony increment of Nu. 1200/- from the existing Nu.250/-

After that, the House endorsed Section 9 proposal of the Committee by the majority show of hands.

On Section 16 with regard to the provision of allowances and benefits, especially on housing allowance for consolidated contract employees, the Committee submitted that the agencies were found to be providing housing allowances wherever eligible. Following the deliberation, the Section was endorsed as it was.

On Section 19 with regard to the specialty allowance of 55% which was viewed as a meager raise, the Committee submitted that the internal specialty allowance was raised to only 60% and if the specialty allowance was to be raised to more than 55%, there would be a need to raise all other allowances and the Committee proposed to retain the Section as it was. However, Member from Panbang Constituency reported that the Pharmacist was not included for the specialty allowance. Upon clarifying, the Minister for Finance submitted that the response was already given by the Prime Minister in the previous sitting and there was no need to be discussed again. With no other submission on the Committee's recommendation on Section 9 C, it was endorsed with no amendment as well.

Similarly, on Section 23 regarding the different allowance for the boarding school teachers and the day scholar school teachers, the Committee reported that the teaching allowance of 35% to 55% as per the year of service and the specialty allowance of 10% to 20% has been of great benefit and proposed no changes on the section. However, some Members were of the view that, as boarding teachers have to work extra hours, especially after classes, giving

all teachers the same allowance was not acceptable. Since boarding school teachers should be provided with overtime allowance, it was submitted that members could not support the section.

Clarifying on that, the Education Minister stated that the allowances were mainly based on specialty and special services and if the allowances were to be given to all the civil servants, it would be inconvenient and even expressed the support to provide more for the boarding teachers, however, reminding the House that the resources were limited. The Section was endorsed with a majority show of hands with no changes made to the Section.

Similarly, on Section 54 regarding the foreign services under the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Minister for Foreign Affairs reported that a clause stating that the children studying in another country getting the minimum fixed allowance was missing. He also reported that although children studying in a foreign country are covered, the report needed to mention about the children studying in Bhutan.

On that, the Member from Panbang Constituency stated that the Education Allowance should be equal to that country where the parents were working rather than the minimum fixed allowance, and even if the children study in private schools in Bhutan, there should be a provision of Education Allowance. Supporting the cause, the Prime Minister and the Minister for Foreign Affairs also stated that it would be more convenient to implement if the allowance was fixed to a certain amount irrespective of where the parents were working and also if the number of children getting allowance could be fixed.

On that, the House endorsed Section 54 with a majority show of hands with no changes made to the section.

After that, the Chairperson of the Committee submitted that the Legislative and Procedural Division under Secretariats should be given Nu.15000/- allowance along with the employees of the Department of National Budget, and Ministry of Finance who prepares the Annual Budget. The other staff of the Secretariat should be provided Nu.5000/- as Overtime Allowance. Minister also reported that as there were only 115 employees, it was convenient to provide the allowances. On that, the Opposition Leader suggested on doing away with the Section as the provision was new and expressed doubts on how accounts were managed on it.

On that, the Chairperson stated that a total of 115 employees would only raise the expenditure by Nu.22,00,000/- annually, and the proposal was made therefore as it was found relevant. On that, the Member from Dramedtse\_Ngatshang submitted that there was a need to rectify phrases whereby the word 'during session' should be included, after which it was then endorsed by the House and directed the Committee to carry out the changes.

After endorsing the 6 Sections of the Committee with the show of hands, the deliberation on Annexures were also deliberated. On that, the member from Panbang Constituency proposed the provision of special responsibility allowance for the Heads of Constitutional Bodies and Commissions as it was found relevant.

Following that, the Minister for Finance moved a motion to endorse the Pay Revision Bill 2019 with a total of Nu.4,350 Million. While ascertaining the support, out of 44 members present and voting, 37 voted 'Yes', 2 voted 'No' and 5 abstained and therefore, the Pay Revision Bill 2019 was endorsed. **The voting list provided in Annexure 14.**



After that, the Member from Panbang Constituency in his dissenting opinion submitted that regarding the raise of salary for the Doctors and the Teachers, it could be concluded that since there was a raise in salary along with huge allowance, the Member questioned whether the principle of equity was not lost. The member also shared concerns whether the list of demand for allowance and the disparity in allowance could be stopped thereafter, as it might bring differences between those benefitted from allowances being happy and those who would be demotivated after being deprived of allowances, leading to widening of gap. The Member also expressed concerns regarding the distribution of the resources of the Government.

**20. Question Hour: Group B- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Works and Human Settlement, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and Ministry of Agriculture and Forests**

The Speaker informed the House that for day's Question Hour, there were seven questions for oral responses. The Speaker also informed that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be given only after all the oral questions had been answered by respective ministries, and therefore commenced the Question Hour Session.

**20.1 Oral Questions**

20.1.1 The Member from Gangzur\_Minjey Constituency questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement regarding the clarification of Construction of road connectivity in Lhuntse Dzongkhag in the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP:

- A) The National Environment Commission found out that there were some false data in the Environment Impact Assessment Report (EIA) presented by the Ministry. The Ministry was therefore asked to rewrite the Report. Thus, why was the Ministry not able

to present the new report, and to clarify if the Report was written by the Ministry or done by a private consultancy.

- B) Similarly, if the Minister could present to the House on the status of the secondary road construction from Minjey via Dongla, Yangtse (Dzongkhag connecting road) after the formation of the present government.

20.1.2 The Member from Phuntshogpelri\_Samtse Constituency questioned the Minister for Agriculture and Forests regarding the plans and strategies of the Ministry of Agriculture and Forests to mitigate the following problems due to the activities of boulder collection, sand collection and making of aggregate in Samtse:

- A) Damage to public roads by heavy trucks;
- B) Blowing off dust due to plying of vehicle affecting the health of people;
- C) Course of river changing due to collection of river boulders and sand that may lead to damage of people's land and property;
- D) Noise disturbing people from several activities such as boulder dumping and aggregate making.

20.1.3 The Member from Lhamoi\_Dzingkha\_Tashiding Constituency submitted that the Highway connecting Dagapela and Lhamoidzingkha has been the wish of every person of Dagana. Their wish of getting the road connection during the First Parliament was approved by the Government and a comprehensive report was made with a Project and Funding for the construction of road from Geyserling to Lhamoizingkha. The Road Construction began by 2013-2014, and the road should have been completed by 2016-2017. However, the Member reported that as the road was still in poor condition, it has been causing a lot of inconvenience to the people. It was also not

known when the road construction would be complete. Therefore, for the welfare of people of Dagana Dzongkhag, the Member questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement to clarify on the following questions:

- A) What plans were put in place for early completion of the road;
- B) How much time would it take to complete the road construction;
- C) Evaluation of the Quality of road;
- D) What were the reasons for the delay of completion; and
- E) The precise number of bridges needed between Lhamoizingkha and Dalbhari.

20.1.4 The Member from Nganglam Constituency reported that as announced by the Government, the Fourteenth Round Table Meeting was held and the Meeting was one of the many means to seek Grants and Loans from international sources for the 12th Plan. The Member submitted that since the Government was now proceeding towards the second year of the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan, the Member questioned the Minister for Foreign Affairs to report the House regarding the amount of Grants and Loans promised during the Meeting

20.1.5 The Member from Sombaykha Constituency submitted that although the Secondary Highway connecting Samtse and Haa has been started since five years ago, the highway works still remained incomplete even today. As per Haa Dzongkhag Administration and Local Government Leaders, it has been reported that the works could be completed by June 2019. However, the Member reported that it was found that the progress and pace of the works were not very good. Therefore, the member questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement to clarify the House regarding the status of the highway works completed as of now, and also the exact time of completion of the highway.

20.1.6 The Member from Khar\_Yurung Constituency submitted that there were destructions to the land of many households during road construction. Moreover, there has not been any replacement for the land or any sort of compensation paid to the people, whereby it has been causing a great loss, especially to the humble citizens. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Agriculture and Forests whether the Government had any plans to provide land replacement or compensation.

20.1.7 The Member from Tashichhoeling Constituency submitted that as there were different types of contractors, it was obvious that Class A contractors who have lots of money and resources tend to get many projects at a time. Such practice might deprive other contractors and corruption may become a common practice. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Works and Human Settlement whether the ministry could introduce a system of not rewarding more than two projects at a time.

**9<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 11<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

*Note: Detailed answers and deliberations on the above mentioned oral questions provided separately in the verbatim booklet published for reference.*

## **21. Motion**

### **21.1 Resolutions on the Motion to increase the Stipend of the Students of the Colleges under the Royal University of Bhutan.**

The Member from Tashichholing Constituency reported the House that despite requesting the Education Board in 2013 to increase the stipend of Government colleges and institute, nothing has been done until now. Moreover, today the market cost was high and also during public consultancies, it has been found that it was now high time to increase the stipend.

Moreover, the provision of Government to the RUB students a stipend of Nu.1500/- was only sufficient for a 300 Calories diet. Therefore, for the health and mental wellness of students, the stipend should be increased to Nu.2500/- from the existing Nu.1500/-. Also as there were no enough hostels and infrastructures, students had to stay outside the campus and for that, there should be a provision of Nu.1500/- as housing allowance. The following motions were moved by the Member:

**Motions:**

1. To revise the existing stipend of Nu.1500/- to Nu.2500/-
2. To provide a housing allowance of Nu.1500/- per month for those who live away from college premises
3. The Government to come up with a policy which allows 70% of the students to stay in hostels and keeping 30% students away from the campus

While deliberating, the Member from Athang-Thedtsho along with other Members stated that while they fully support regarding the increase of stipend, as the issue had been covered in the Pay Revision Bill 2019, and the Budget of Nu.208 Million being already appropriated for RUB, there was no need for separate deliberation on the issue.

On that, the Member from Panbang Constituency submitted that the motion was very important and seconded with full support on the matter. However, the Member added that other vocational institutes and technical training institutes should also be considered for the increment. The Member also submitted that the stipends were usually fixed by the Department of Adult and Higher Education until date; nevertheless, as the Motion was moved in the Parliament, it was perceived as that of having a change in a system for which the Education Minister was requested ask to provide clarification.

On that, the Education Minister clarified that even if the motion was moved in the Parliament, the Department of Adult and Higher Education system was the same. The Minister informed that the Department would be meeting soon and the appropriated budget of Nu.208 million would not suffice for the increment for which the Minister suggested taking another opportunity to study and report to the House.

On that, the Speaker reminded that the Parliament was only supporting the Department of Adult and Higher Education with its provision of revised stipend from the Pay Revision and proper allocation of Nu.208 Million of RUB and that the Parliament was not intervening in its function.

Following that, although the first and the second motion were unanimously endorsed, the House decided that the third motion to be repealed after it was found no need for deliberation.

After that, the House while ascertain the support on the motion, 24 voted “Yes”, 5 voted “No” and 11 Members Abstained out of 40 Members present and voting, and therefore passed the motion. **The voting list provided in Annexure 15.**

On that, the Member from Athang-Thedtsho Constituency in his dissenting opinion submitted that despite the support on fundamental of the motion, endorsing the Motions before deliberations on the Budget was found inconvenient, and after which the deliberations on the Motion concluded.

**9<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 11<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

**22. Resolutions on the Review Report of the Budget for Financial Year 2019-20 by the Economic and Finance Committee**

In accordance with Section 240 of the National Assembly (Amendment) Act 2014, the Chairperson of the Economic and Finance Committee (Member from Athang-Thedtsho, Constituency) presented the Review Report of the Budget for the Financial Year 2019-2020.

It was submitted that as per the Rules of Procedure of the National Assembly and following the presentation of the budget by the Minister for Finance, the Committee was directed to revise and report to the House within 8 days. The Committee conducted consultative meetings with Finance Secretary and Officials where the Committee also got clarifications for various issues.

Moreover, it was reported that in future, it was also important to hold meetings with Ministries, Departments, Local Governments, and other agencies. On top of that, the Committee reported that in order to fulfill the vision of the review and to produce accurate review, committee should be given enough time to hold public hearings with stakeholder agencies, make site visits and to carry out primary revision on some Sections as required.

With that, the Committee proposed following 18 recommendations for the House to endorse:

**Recommendations:**

1. The Committee recommended to the Government to review and revise the Economic Development Policy, Foreign Direct Investment Policy and National Employment Policy.
2. The Government to overhaul, restructure, and re-engineer its fiscal principles and policy to ensure productive, prudent and

sustainable expenditures that will control excessive burden of recurrent expenditure and promote strong trajectory of investment and economic growth.

3. The Government to take the people on board in the exercise of formulation of GST. Comprehensive consultations should be carried out with all stakeholders both in the private and public sectors.
4. To allocate budget for construction, blacktopping and maintenance of GC and farm roads for the CMI grant.
5. Ministry of Education to develop a proper admission and scholarship guidelines in private schools and also that the Ministry should share its sustainability program. The disbursement of budget shall be made upon presentation of a guideline to the Parliament.
6. REDCL to be converted to CSI bank and its mandate should be to cover the agriculture and livestock credit.
7. Dealership of electric vehicles to be liberalized so that State Owned as well as private dealers can compete.
8. To reinstate recurrent budget of Nu.11.64 million and capital budget of Nu.0.648 million from the total slashed amount of Nu.17.43 million of the National Assembly of Bhutan.
9. To slash the budget proposals of the three budgetary bodies Judiciary, Royal Audit Authority and Anti-Corruption Commission to the tune of Nu. 22.40 million. The Ministry of Finance was thereby advised to uniformly apply budgeting norms and policies to all budgetary bodies in future.
10. The Minister for Finance should henceforth in his budget report and statement to the Parliament submit reports on monetary system and situation, such as monetary stability, health of



financial system, credit operations, foreign currency reserves by different currencies, supply of money, external value of money, money laundering, etc.

11. The budget should be aligned with the main theme of the 12th Plan and principles of budget allocations approved by the Parliament. More so, budget allocations to 205 Gewogs should be drastically enhanced to achieve comparable socio-economic development among the people and gewogs across the nation.
- 12.1 The Ministry of Finance to utilize the budget exclusively for the intended purpose in Pay Revision,.
- 12.2 For Capitation Fee, Stipends and Others, The Committee called for more clarification as to whether a revision of stipends for RUB Scholars is factored or not. It is high time now that the previous stipends of only Nu.1500 (Ngultrum fifteen hundred only) per child per month be revised to consider inflation and food price and adequate allocations.
- 12.3 For procurement and replacement of vehicles, the Committee recommended that the Government Vehicle Purchases needs to be seriously reviewed from the sustainability point of view given the resource constraints.
13. The grant to be allocated as per RAF with the maximum ceiling of Nu.10 million and activities to be prioritized and endorsed by the Dzongkhag Tshogde.
14. The Tourism Council of Bhutan to focus on equitable investment and promotion of tourism across the country and submit a comprehensive tourism strategy and plan to the Parliament.
15. Regarding Digital Drukyl, Ministry of Information and Communication to submit a detailed report of activities to the Parliament.

16. SOEs to submit through the Ministry of Finance their annual budget proposals for review by Economic and Finance Committee of the Parliament. The review of their Accounts shall continue to be done by the Public Accounts Committee (PAC).
17. The SOE Review Committee formed for the review of the SOEs under the Ministry of Finance should also review the 19 SOEs under DHI for uniformity. The Committee also strongly recommends reviewing and strengthening the Corporate Governance of all SOEs.
18. Regarding BCCI, the Committee recommended given its huge membership and in the interest of promoting self-sustenance, the proposed budget should be slashed. Further, to obtain the legal status, it should be registered as Mutual Benefit Organization under the CSO Act.

Considering the sufficient time prior to the deliberations in the House, the Members expressed their concerns on the unavailability of proper channel for investments for both State Owned and Private Enterprises. Moreover, as most of the investments were on Hotels and Service Industry, it was suggested that the Policy needs thorough review whereby other enterprises could also be benefitted as well.

Moreover, it was submitted that as the Annual National Budget projected a yearly growth in Recurrent Expenditure and yearly decline in Capital Expenditure, it would hamper the Economic Growth of the nation in the future and may cause problems in creating employments. Moreover, as mandated by the Constitution to generate the Recurrent Expenditure from the Gross Domestic Products, concerns were raised as to whether the GDP would suffice for the recurrent expenses if it kept on growing.

Similarly, concerns were raised regarding the lack of planning for export as export was one of the main sources of income for the Economic Growth. It was also reported that the Recurrent Expenditure was likely to grow as the Government was funding Education expenses which could rather be borne by their parents. It was reported that that might hamper our goal of self-reliance. Moreover, the Farm Machinery Enterprises could be run by private entities instead of the Government doing it. Since the main objective of Farm Shops was to sell farm products rather than selling groceries, it has been affecting other micro-businesses in the locality.

The Prime Minister and the Ministers as a clarification on the matter submitted that the main reason for the growth of recurrent expenditure was because of the previous government's major activities on capital expenses which had been now managed by the Government from the Recurrent Expenditure. It was also reported that the growth in recurrent expenditure was also because of the growth in Civil Servants, construction of roads in every corner of the nation and building office infrastructures like Dzongs.

Moreover, it was stated that it was natural for the Recurrent Expenditure to grow and the Capital Expenditure to decline with the development of the nation. And, it was clarified that even if the expenditure for the Hydro Power Projects were from Capital Expenses, the additional expenses taken as loan were always paid back from the Recurrent Expenditure.

On the First Recommendation, the Minister for Finance stated that as it was imperative to review the Foreign Direct Investment Policy, the Ministry has already reviewed the Policy which was yet to be implemented. Regarding the Economic Development Policy, it was

learnt that the Policy was reviewed only in 2017 and there seems to be a lapse in implementation. Although, it need not be reviewed immediately, the main objective of the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan being economic development, the Ministry extended support the recommendation of the Committee. The House then voted and endorsed the Recommendation with the majority show of hands.

Following an extensive deliberation on the Second Recommendation, the Government extended support to the Committee's Recommendation. The House endorsed the recommendation with a majority show of hands.

On the Third Recommendation to introduce Goods and Service Tax, the Ministers expressed concerns regarding the consultative meetings with State Owned and Private Stakeholders as it would be time consuming. Regarding initiation of tax, it was submitted that since the Government should work and the Parliament should endorse, there was no need for public consultations , however, it was proposed that the Recommendation could be considered with some changes to 'create awareness' rather than 'consulting' the public.

For that reason, the Recommendation was changed that the Government should thoroughly carry out research and promote understanding of the public in order to introduce the GST. The Recommendation was accordingly endorsed through majority show of hands.

On the Fourth Recommendation, the Prime Minister stated that only Gewog Roads should be blacktopped and not the Farm Roads, and proposed a minor change in the recommendation, which the Government would extend support accordingly.

On that, the House suggested a change stating that the fund under Common Minimum Infrastructure Grants as suggested by the Committee should be divided into two: for the blacktopping of the Gewog Roads and for the construction and maintenance of farm roads. The changed Recommendation was then endorsed with a majority show of hands.

On the Fifth Recommendation, the Member from Panbang Constituency stated that the provision of scholarship for classes 11 and 12 was not endorsed by the Parliament and was not in accordance with legal procedure. It was proposed that the Government should come up with a proper guideline for the use of budget in future.

Clarifying on that, the Government stated that the expenditure was made from the budget already endorsed by the parliament and that there were no illegalities in the matter. With regard to the Guideline, it was already prepared by the Ministry of education which could be availed at any time. The recommendation of the Committee to provide fund endorsed by the Parliament could not be supported.

Following extensive deliberation, the House could not secure majority votes and the recommendation of the Committee was removed. With that, the first day of budget deliberation concluded.

During the Second Day of Deliberation on the Review Report of the Budget for FY 2019-2020 by the Economic and Finance Committee, while deliberating on the Sixth Recommendation, the Opposition Leader and some Members stated that the REDCL did not provide loans for the establishment of Cottage and Small Industries and suggested that the agency be changed to Agriculture Bank and mandated to provide loans for agriculture, livestock and forestry continuing with the existing interest of 4%.

However, the Government extended support to the recommendation made by the Committee and the recommendation was endorsed with majority support.

On the Seventh Recommendation, the Minister for Information and Communications submitted that in the country, there were 28 dealers of automobiles and for the purchase of electric cars, the ministry was working to give equal opportunity to all the dealers and expressed hope that all dealers would participate accordingly.

The recommendation was acknowledged by the Government and thereby, endorsed by the House with maximum support.

On the Eighth Recommendation, the Member from Maenbi-Tsaenkhar Constituency and few other members expressed doubts regarding the acceptance and value towards the work of the Committee by the Government since most of the annual plan of activities and budget proposed by the National Assembly Secretariat were removed by the Government.

On that, the Minister for Finance clarified that for budget appropriation, apart from money the policy and system was also taken into account. With regard to removal of budget, it was clarified that not only for the National Assembly, the budget for other agencies were also removed as per the system.

Moreover, Section 44 of the Public Finance Act mandates that the budget appropriation should be done in accordance to the Financial Policy and for that, the Government could not gather support on the recommendation of the Committee.

After that, since the House could not gather support on the recommendation through the show of hands, the recommendation was repealed.

On the Ninth recommendation, the Minister for Finance with regard to the budget appropriation for the Human Resource Development for the Judiciary stated that the main reason was the Agreement signed between a University in Washington D.C and the Judiciary because of which Tuition fee was not required and explained that the budget was only for airfare and food allowance for those pursuing Masters. The budget for the Anti-Corruption Commission was also for air fare and DSA for the staff going to Singapore.

Moreover, the budget for the Royal Audit Authority was also for the same reason and for that matter, it was submitted that the Government could not support the recommendation of the Committee.

After that, since the House could not gather support on the recommendation through the show of hands, the recommendation was not endorsed.

On the Tenth Recommendation, the Minister for Finance reported to the House that in the Budget Report, they presented the Summary of the Economy, the Finance Policy, the National Revenue, Expenditures and Estimates, Public Debt and risks and the economic conditions of the public organizations and Investments, and therefore, thanked the Committee for the reminder and extended support to the Recommendation. The House therefore endorsed the recommendation with a majority show of hands.

On the Eleventh Recommendation, the Member from Panbang Constituency and other Members reported to the House that in the 12<sup>th</sup>

Plan, the budget was allocated on 50-50 basis to the Central Agency and the Local Governments. However, in the budget appropriation, there seemed to be a huge difference and requested the Government to clarify on the matter and also to allocate as per the Plan.

On that, the Minister for Finance and the Prime Minister submitted from that the budget appropriation for the capital Expenditure of Nu.30, 173.960 million, Nu. 1, 761.765 Million was for the general reserve, and Nu.1,761.765 Million was for account transfer, supplementary and appropriation. Nu. 3, 306.333 for debt management and Nu. 150 Million for repayment of loan were kept under the Ministry of Finance and excluding that, the Local Government has been allocated with more than 50% of the budget for that Plan.

Moreover, the allocation of 50-50 budget for the 12th Plan was not an annual allocation, but the allocation of Capital expenditure within an amount of Nu.100 Million which has been kept equally to the Central Agency and the Local Governments by the end of the 12th Plan.

Similarly, in the Recommendation of the Committee, a change was proposed as per the objective of the 12th Plan and as endorsed by the Parliament: By the end of 12th Plan to allocate 50-50 budget to Central Agency and LGs and for the 205 Gewogs to widely distribute the resources and bring about equitable socio-economic development, which the Government would then acknowledge the recommendation. The House therefore endorsed the recommendation by the majority show of hands.



On Recommendation 12.1, the Chairperson of the Committee submitted that the matter was already covered in the deliberation of Pay Revision and there was no need for deliberation.

However, the Minister for Finance submitted that the amount of Nu. 4530 Million for the Pay Revision and Allowances and other benefits have been included under the Capital Reserve and extended support to only use the budget for intended purposes.

The House endorsed the recommendation with majority show of hands.

On Recommendation 12.2, the Chairperson of the Committee reported that the matter has been deliberated in earlier day for Motion and the increment for stipend of Royal University of Bhutan was endorsed by the House and there is no need for deliberation.

On Recommendation 12.3, the Chairperson of the Committee proposed that the matter was deliberated and endorsed in the Pay Revision and there is no need for deliberation.

However, the Minister for Finance submitted that as per the proposal to the Government to provide vehicles to EX3 level and above, the Government kept Nu.208 Million in Capital Reserve and stated that the Government supported the Committee's recommendation to review.

On Thirteenth Recommendation, the Member from Khatoed-Laya Constituency and other Members submitted that if the Dzongkhag Development Grant was given in accordance to the Resource Allocation Formula, the smaller Dzongkhags would never develop and would be left behind. The Dzongkhag Grant should be given in accordance to the Plan and if the budget was allocated out of the

activities in the Plan, there arises a need to look for separate budget, and the usage of budget being decided by the Dzongkhag Finance Committee would not be not in line with the Law and should be done by the Dzongkhag Tshogdu.

Clarifying on that, the Prime Minister submitted that the Dzongkhag Development Grant and the usage given by the previous government was different and in the 12<sup>th</sup> plan, the LGs were given the sole authority and as per developmental plans, they could utilize up to Nu. 10 Million. However, the Prime Minister submitted that the Committee's Recommendation to allocate as per the Resource Allocated Formula has been supported by the Government.

Following thorough deliberation on the matter, the House endorsed the recommendation with majority show of hands.

On the Fourteenth Recommendation, the Member from Panbang Constituency submitted that keeping adequate budget for the tourism sector in order to conduct meetings and create advocacies were a waste of funds and submitted that there was no apparent result of such activities. The Member proposed that while formulating policies, equal regional tourism development should be taken into account.

On that, the Minister for Foreign Affairs submitted that the adequate allocation of budget for tourism was because National Flagship Programs were included in the sector and for the policy, it could be availed at any time. The House then endorsed the recommendation with majority show of hands.

On Fifteenth recommendation, the Information and Communication Minister stated that under the Digital Drukyul, the Digital activities

included making of digital identity and regulations, skill development for information and industries, develop Dzongkha, making digital school, registering patients electronically, electronic commerce, and for details as proposed by the Committee, the ministry was ready to provide information and the House endorsed the recommendation with majority show of hands.

On Sixteenth Recommendation, the Member from Panbang Constituency submitted that from among the 38 SOEs, only few made profits and most were dependent on the Government. Generally, the Economic related Committees in Parliaments were divided into three with separate responsibilities and proposed thereafter that the budget proposal for SOEs should come through the Ministry of Finance and reviewed by the Economic and Finance Committee.

On that, the Minister for Finance and other Ministers submitted that the formation of new SOEs was under the authority of the Minister for Finance and the Ministry of Finance has been reviewing the SOEs and the report would be ready soon. On budget proposal, it has been submitted that the budget was kept under capital reserve and endorsed by parliament and thus, it would not require separate review by the Committee.

Moreover, as SOEs work as per mandates of individual regulations and guidelines, the Committee review was questionable and extended support to the recommendation if it was for the Government to report rather than the Committee to review.

On that, the House endorsed that the Government should report with the maximum show of hands.

On the Seventeenth Recommendation, the Minister for Finance expressed his support on the recommendation of the Committee to review the implementation of the SOEs under the Ministry of Finance and also asked to review other 19 SOEs which were under Druk Holding and Investment. The House endorsed the recommendation with majority show of hands.

On the Eighteenth Recommendation, the Economic Affairs Minister and other Members submitted that BCCI was imperative for the development of private sector and if the Government do not support them, they would not have enough funds to even pay their employees and that might lead to the agency to close, and requested that the budget appropriated in the Plan should not be discontinued. Although the Committee's opinion of the agency's need to work independently was good for the future, it was still better to keep the budget in the Plan and make regulations, policies and systems to enhance their productivity.

On that, some Members submitted that it was imperative for BCCI to have an Act. After thorough deliberations with Members expressing lack of support to the recommendation, the House commanded the Committee to further review and consult, and then to revise the recommendation and present a report to the House.

After that, deliberating on the Supplementary Budget, the Opposition Leader expressed his support to the Government for having to spend on capital expenditures through lending as 2019-2020 was the first financial year of the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan. However, the Government was reminded of the extra expenditures in the future which were not compulsorily required leading to loss of Government resources and submitted that if irregularities are there from Audit and ACC, it may be difficult for the Parliament to endorse.

Moreover, it needs to be clarified whether the budget for Supplementary Budget 2019-2020 was from the Government or was provided as Grant. The question regarding the legality of funding scholarships in Education was also asked.

On that, the Minister for Finance clarified that the budget for the Supplementary Budget came as Grants from the World Bank and other developmental partners. The funding for the scholarship was also submitted to be Legal as the money was drawn from the Budget which was approved by the Parliament.

After deliberating on all the sections of the Supplementary Budget Appropriation FY 2019-2020 and Budget Appropriation FY 2019-2020, the House, as per the legal procedure was reminded that the Bills should be endorsed through voting the next day.

**11<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 13<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

On the 12<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to June 14, 2019, the Speaker commanded the Chairperson of the Committee to present to the House- the revised recommendation on the BCCI. The Chairperson reported that the retention budget was approved in previous sitting and as the discussion was about Policy and Regulations, it was proposed that the agency to be registered as an Organization or a Non-Government Organization as per the Civil Society Organization Act 2007.

On that, the Minister for Finance and the Minister for Foreign Affairs submitted that the agency's responsibility was different and the registration as an NGO would be inconvenient. Moreover, as the agency took the role of teaching about management, it would be best if an Act was made for BCCI.

On that, the Opposition Leader and few members also submitted that the BCCI was different as it was profit based agency unlike NGOs that provide services to the society. It was also highlighted that BCCI needed a separate Act. Moreover, after democracy as per Article 10 of the Constitution, the agency was not reviewed and officially registered. The agency therefore, came under Section 12, Article 7 of the Constitution as NGOs and CSOs which was covered by the CSO Act 2007 and that it needed to be registered under the Section.

Moreover, as the recommendation of the Committee was more of an inconvenience to the functioning of the agency, there were other options for the agency to have a separate act or be mandated under other similar Acts, and thus proposed the House for guidance on which some Members proposed keeping the Recommendation and asking the Government to report on the matter in the winter session.

On that, the Prime Minister submitted that BCCI was like a bridge between the Government and Private Sector and reported that the Government was always working to enhance private sector. The Prime Minister then proposed that instead of making Acts or registering as an NGO, the Government could study on the matter and present in the winter session.

On that, the Chairperson proposed the recommendation to be removed and the matter to be discussed in the Winter Session. The Speaker then reminded that the matter has been well deliberated and the Recommendation should be changed.

On that, the House changed the Eighteenth Recommendation as the Government required to present a report about the status and responsibilities of BCCI to the House in the Winter Session. The recommendation was then endorsed by the House.

Then, the Minister for Finance proposed the House to endorse the Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2019-2020 with Nu. 30, 173.960 Million Capital Expenditure and Nu. 34,652.765 Million Recurrent Expenditure, a total Outlay of Nu. 64, 826.725 Million.

On that, the House unanimously endorsed the Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2019-2020 with full support from all 43 Members present and voting. **The voting list provided in Annexure 16.**

Following that, the Minister for Finance proposed the House to approve the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2018-2019 with Nu. 1, 627.410 Million in addition to the previously approved Grant Budget of Nu. 47, 698.129 Million, totaling a sum of Nu. 49, 325.439 Million.

On that, the House unanimously endorsed the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2018-2019 with full support from all 43 Members present and voting. **The voting list provided in Annexure 17.**

**23. Question Hour: Group C- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Economic Affairs, Ministry of Finance, and Ministry of Labour and Human Resources.**

The Speaker informed the House that for day's Question Hour, there were nine questions for oral responses and 1 question for written response. The Speaker also informed that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be given only after all the oral questions had been answered by respective ministries, and therefore commenced the Question Hour Session.

**23.1.1 The Member from Panbang Constituency reported that lots of people across the nation had been facing numerous problems with**

regard to LPG (cooking gas). The Member questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs to explain the causes of the problem.

23.1.2 The Member from Athang\_Thedtsho Constituency reported that surprisingly, unlike any other businesses, banks in Bhutan endure no risk of failing. The Member submitted that they were well fortified by high interest rates between 9-12 % and our banks' interest rates stand one of the highest in the world. While the people appreciate the stability of our banks, their interest rates have burdened hundreds and thousands of Bhutanese (clients) and as such, there was a growing trend of assets being seized from defaulters. In this regard, the Member questioned the Minister for Finance whether the Government had any plans in the pipeline to communicate with the Royal Monetary Authority to regulate the interest rates among our banks.

23.1.3 The Member from Phuntshogpelri\_Samtse Constituency reported that after the grand celebration of 111<sup>th</sup> National day of Bhutan in Samtse, the Government wanted to leave behind the footprint to commemorate the special and important event. Since Minister for Economic Affairs is from Samtse and also a member of Cabinet, the Member questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs to update and share the House regarding the plans and proposals, and way forward of the Government to achieve the noble idea.

23.1.4 The Member from Tashichhoeling Constituency submitted that on the Business Income Taxes, it was observed that big business companies who invest in millions and billions were given tax holidays/incentives. Such tax holidays often resulted in big losses to the country's economy. During the campaign days, it was found that the Bhutan was losing about 10 million on taxes annually. Therefore,



the Member questioned the Minister for Finance whether there were any plans to reduce such losses and doing away with the tax holidays/incentives in the future.

23.1.5 The Member from Wamrong Constituency reported that there was a dire need of technically skilled human resources in the country. Thus, there was a need for the establishment of new Technical Training Institutes and Zorig Chuzum Institutes. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Labour and Human Resources to clarify the House regarding the plans that the Government would come up for these solutions.

23.1.6 The Member from Khamed\_Lunana Constituency submitted that unlike the past, rural people had to procure electric poles and wires to trap power from nearby transformer. Since rural people could not afford such connectivity on their own expenses owing to poor income, the Member questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs to explain the rationale behind such taxing idea from the Bhutan Power Corporation (BPC); and since free power was more of a right than a privilege, the Member requested if Bhutan Power Corporation to provide poles, wires and technical support as before.

23.1.7 The Member from Dewathang\_Gomdar Constituency reported that the current system of allocating budget for farm roads construction was dismal Nu.2.1 million per which was woefully insufficient and inadequate. The process of floating tender and calling quotation was followed after the exhaustion of this Nu. 2.1 million, which was cumbersome and counterproductive. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Finance to inform the House whether the current Government had a plan to allocate sufficient budget as a single package for the entire length of farm road.

23.1.8 The Member from Maenbi\_Tsaenkhar Constituency submitted that most of the villages were currently connected with single faced power line, and thus the people have submitted for the need of three faced power line. Thus, the Member questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs to clarify the House regarding the plans and activities of the present government to increase the power energy in these villages.

23.1.9 The Member from Bartsham\_Shongphu Constituency reported that as per the Budget Report 2019-2020, it was reported that all the pledges had been fulfilled within the 120 days. However, it was submitted that as per the findings, only one pledge had been completely fulfilled whereas four pledges partly fulfilled which totaled up to only 12%. The Member questioned the Minister for Finance to clarify on that matter.

**12<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 14<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

## **23.2 Written Questions**

23.2.1 Written answer question submitted by Member from Khamed\_Lunana Constituency to the Minister for Finance.

The questions pertain to the Consolidated Contract employees under the Royal Civil Service Commission. The employees who have been recruited on Consolidated Contract are appointed in P5B by the RCSC which is equivalent to S1 in terms of entitlements. The recent Bhutan Civil Service Regulations 2018, Chapter 5, Section 5.12.1.6 clearly states: “Allowances and benefits pegged to the position and not the salary such as TA/DA, mileage, transportation charge of personal effects, house rent allowances and professional allowance shall also be paid to contract employee recruited at sub-levels, as per the position.”

However, the Ministry of Finance did not agree with the section and thereby, it did not come into effect in many of the organizations. Therefore, it would be beneficial if Hon'ble Minister would clarify why it was withheld firstly, and secondly, was there any consultation within two agencies before and after the regulation was passed?

*Note: Detailed answers and deliberations on the above mentioned oral questions and written question submitted by Member from Khamed-Lunana Constituency to the Minister for Finance provided separately in the verbatim book published for reference.*

**24. Resolutions on the Report on Sustainable Development Goal 4-  
Quality of Education by Social and Cultural Committee**

Recognizing the immutable linkage between Gross National Happiness and the Sustainable Development Goals with the Parliament, the Chairperson of the Social and Cultural Committee (Member from Maenbi-Tsaenkhar Constituency) as directed by the House to present on SDG 4 reported that the NKRA of 12th Plan is Quality of Education and Skill Development in a way that Bhutanese students were acquired international competency in terms of education, students were well equipped with national values and cultural heritage and by enhancing technical and vocational skills at international standards. The key strategies were as mentioned below:

**The Key Strategies to achieve the NKRA were :**

1. Making teaching a profession of choice
2. Strengthening ECCD and Primary Education
3. Shifting from examination based to holistic assessment system
4. Creating pathways between mainstream and vocational education
5. Strengthening value education in schools and institute

**Key Performance Indicators:**

1. Increase the proportion of students who score at least 60 percent each in math, science, English and Dzongkha in BCSE from 13% to 20%
2. Increase the mean score in core subjects in program for international student assessment
3. Increase proportion of TVET graduates employed within 6 months to one year graduation from 80% to 90%
4. Maintain or increase proportion of in-country TEI graduates employed within one year of graduation.

**Recommendations:**

1. Review and determine the PP Admission Age Limit
2. Maintain Class Size as per Education Policy Guideline and 12 FYP
3. The NKRA of TVET course is included under the Ministry of Labour and Human Resources. Therefore, NKRA shall be aligned with the Program.
4. Review and implement the system of shifting from examination based on holistic assessment in few schools as a pilot project which is key result of Education.
5. The new Early Child Care and Development Centre shall be established even for 10 Children aged between 3-5 and the programs has to be promoted nationwide as a priority.
6. Committee observed that education bill shall be in place necessarily since education is a key sector of the nation. Therefore, it shall be submitted to Parliament within the period of 12 FYP.
7. During the recruitment of new teachers, both experienced and inexperienced teachers are being recruited. Therefore, the new recruitment policy of the teachers need to be reviewed and determined.

8. The policy of Central School needs to be reviewed and determined for its sustainability and Schools with Class PP to 12 has to be reviewed.

While deliberating on that, the Speaker submitted that from among many NKRAs, the Government was prioritizing Health and Education. And as our country being a supporter of SDGs, we should fulfill the SDGs and reminded that such recommendations need not be deliberated for endorsement.

On that, some members expressed concern that if deliberations done in the House did not come up with a resolution according to the parliamentary system and the National Assembly Act, it would be a failure on the side of Parliament, and it would be a waste of time. Also, it was very important for the Parliament to evaluate SDGs, and the related ministries should report implementation glitches to the House. Some Members submitted that the Report aided familiarization to the SDGs and the discussion was done for the same. Therefore, it was submitted that as the Report was only initiated, there was no need to pass as resolutions.

After the House failed to endorse the support on the need for coming up as resolution, some members suggested that the House not passing as the resolution would rather go to waste, and suggested that should resolutions were not produced, the House should direct the relevant ministries to carry out necessary actions and review. Accordingly, the House directed the Ministry of Education for necessary implementation and therefore, endorsed all the recommendations.

**16<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 16<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

**25. Question Hour: Group D- Questions relevant to the Ministry of Health and Ministry of Education**

The Speaker informed the House that for day's Question Hour, there were two questions for oral responses. The Speaker also informed that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be given only after the oral questions had been answered by respective ministries, and therefore commenced the Question Hour Session.

**25.1. Oral Questions**

25.1.1 The Member from Sombaykha Constituency reported that there was one BHU II in Sombaykha Gewog and two BHU IIs in Gakiling Gewog under Haa Dzongkhag. However, there was only one Ambulance service for these two Gewogs. As per the Ambulance Service Guidelines 2018, it stated that allocation of ambulance to BHU IIs shall be decided by the Ministry of Health on a case by case basis and situation. The Member submitted that at present, there were about 70 kms between the two gewogs and thus, there were numerous challenges while availing the ambulance services. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Health to clarify on what basis, cases and situation was the Ministry deciding the allocation of ambulance; and also, if there was any possibility of providing the ambulance to these two gewogs at the earliest.

25.1.2 The Member from Phuntshogpelri-Samtse Constituency questioned the Minister for Education on what were the Plans and Strategies of the Ministry of Education to resolve the problems of long distance between home and schools and shortage of teachers in Samtse.

**16<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month, Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 18<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

*Note: Detailed answers and deliberations on the above mentioned questions provided separately in the verbatim book published for reference.*

**26. Resolutions of the Re-deliberation on the Pay Revision Bill of Bhutan 2019**

The Minister for Finance presented the Pay Revision Bill 2019 to the National Council after being endorsed by the National Assembly according to the Constitution and the Public Finance Act. National Council deliberated on the Bill and presented 19 Recommendations which were again presented to the National Assembly for re-deliberation and endorsement. The Minister for Finance reminded the Members to look into each section and discuss mindfully.

Deliberating on the Recommendation regarding the removal of Recommendation 5 by the National Council, it was submitted that if the recommendation was not considered, it would cause implementation issues due to lack of proper understanding of the Act and if that happened, the Parliament would have to write to Supreme Court for interpretation which would undermine the status of Parliament as the highest law making body. For that reason, it was clarified that the Recommendation could be supported.

On that, some Members expressed despite the support on the Recommendation, proposed minor changes in the sentence. The speaker reminded that the agenda for the day was to approve the previous recommendation or to approve the recommendation given by the National Council and therefore there was no provision for any amendment on the clauses.

Moreover, it was submitted that regarding the ordinary bills if not endorsed by both Houses could go into joint Committees,

however being a money bill, there was no such provision and the recommendation of national Council needed to be properly studied and revised in order to avoid inconveniences in future. The Speaker then asked the House to vote regarding the need to change Recommendation 5 which was then endorsed with majority of votes. The Speaker then reminded that the other sections which followed could not be changed.

On that, the Minister for Finance proposed a change in Recommendation 5: “The Act nullifies the Pay Revision Act 2014 and 2017 and notifications, announcements, Bills and Regulations related to pay revision”. Other Members submitted that the above Acts should not be fully nullified, however, there was a need to mention that sections in pay revision related acts and notifications, announcements which were not related to Pay Revision 2019 should be nullified which was supported by the majority of the Members.

However, some Members were of the view that the Section has been deliberated thoroughly and endorsed and the discussion gave a feeling of a new Section being deliberated. In fact, as per the trends, when new Acts were endorsed, the old Acts provisions that do not go in line with the new ones were always removed and amending a section in a Recommendation also called for changes in other sections. The Speaker then reminded that the removal of Recommendation 5 was a very important matter and that the decision would be done as per the support of the House.

On that, one Member reminded that the recommendation of the House of Revision should be accepted. If Recommendation 5 Removal as proposed by National Council was not done, there would be implementation issues in RCSC Act and related Acts.



Following that, the Speaker submitted that Recommendations 6, 7 and 8 could be deliberated at once. The pay increment for the Speaker and Chief Justice from 6% with additional 7%, total 13% as endorsed by the National Assembly needed to be changed and recommended the increment to be retained at 6% and allocated otherwise. On that, the Speaker reminded the Members to have open discussion without hesitation while discussing the matter on the post of Speaker rather than considering on personal aspect.

The Members submitted that due to change in Recommendation 5, it became inconvenient to discuss about other sections. However, it was highlighted that the Committee while reviewing the Bill should think properly and analyze the reasons for the provision of different pay to heads of the branches of Government since their responsibilities were different. In the revised report, the Government's provision of additional 13% to Speaker and Chief Justice on top of minister level provision should have taken into consideration the Parliamentary Entitlement Act. It was reminded that although there was support to the Recommendation of the National Council, the endorsement should go as per the rules for adoption of money Bill.

Also, it was clarified that the Committee submitted the Recommendation according to Section 48 of the Pay Revision Bill which reflected the Chief Justice along with the elected posts and keeping Chief Justice as the head of the Judiciary, referring to the clause that Ministers and Speaker could not be covered in the Parliamentary Entitlement Act, the Committee felt that the Speaker was the Head of Legislature and made the recommendation to increase the pay for Chief Justice and the Speaker.

Following that, the House endorsed Sections 6, 7 and 8 and with the majority of votes as submitted by the National Council.

Similarly, following the deliberation on the Section 13 on GSP, the recommendation was endorsed as per the National Council's proposal.

Similarly, on Recommendation 15, the Minister for Finance submitted that some ECCD Facilitators had been left out of registration, however, that the budget had been included. There was no discussion and the recommendation, following which the House endorsed the recommendation with majority show of hands.

After that, regarding the Recommendation 21, the Member from Panbang Constituency enquired about the teachers in Dratshang and religious institutes as to whether they would be permanently employed or made as regular contracts. The Labor Minister submitted that although they might not be employed, they would still be merged as National Youth Volunteers, and clarified that the authority regarding their permanent employment or regularizing as contracts was not with the Ministry.

On that, the Minister for Finance submitted that in the column, the word "nurse" should be replaced with 'health staff', however, the Speaker denied on the recommendation. Therefore, the House endorsed Recommendation 21 as submitted by the National Council.

Similarly, the Chairperson of the Committee presented Recommendation 29 submitted by the National Council that stated that all staff of the two secretariats had to be provided with Service Allowance of Nu.10000/- and expressed support for the same.

However, since the matter was about budget, the member asked for clarification from the Minister for Finance.

On that, the Minister for Finance proposed only the Committee Secretaries should be provided with Nu.10000/- Session overtime allowance and all other staff with Nu.5000/- during the sessions. The Speaker then reminded that the Recommendations could not be amended and the decision should be made based on previous recommendations. On seeking support, the Recommendation could not garner enough support and could not be endorsed.

On Recommendation 30, the Labor Minister expressed that for Zorig Chusum and Technical and Vocational Training Institutes, the reviewed stipends for the trainees could not be included since the Ministry was still working on it and submitted that the report would be presented through Cabinet which was unanimously supported by some Ministers.

However, the Members from Panbang Constituency and Member from Khamdang-Ramjar Constituency submitted that as Zorig Chusum and TVET trainees carry out 80% of works with physical strength. And as per the requirement of skilled workers, the trainees should be given stipends not less than NU.3000/- and that the Report should be presented in this Pay Revision with no further delay.

On that, the Speaker reminded that the Recommendation was for endorsement and that there could not be any amendment made on the recommendation. The House, after failing to secure enough support on the Recommendation, could not endorse the recommendation.

Similarly, on Recommendation 32 the Chairperson of the Committee submitted that as Tshogpas were getting an increment of Communication Allowance from Nu.100/- to Nu.200/-, the responsibility to inform people of villages regarding zomdus should also be carried out by Tshogpas as it would not be fair on the part of Chiboeds who usually carry out the responsibility. Some members also supported the same, and some members submitted that since Tshogpas now get increased communication allowance, the Thromde Thuemis should also be given the same and submitted it was not required for the House to discuss on Tshogpas and Chiboeds. The House following the majority support through the show of hands endorsed the recommendation from National Council.

On Recommendation 40 B regarding the provision of water and electricity bills to the Heads of Constitutional Bodies residing in the Lhengey Densa, the Member from Panbang Constituency also extended support; however, as the recommendation could not garner majority support from the House, the recommendation could not be endorsed.

Similarly, on Recommendation 41 for domestic helper, the Member from Panbang Constituency expressed support on the recommendation; however, as the Recommendation could not gather majority support, the House could not endorse the recommendation as well.

On Section 42, the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs submitted that although Gaydrungs were eligible for Leave Encashment, the provision was not in the Local Government Act and expressed concerns on the possibility on which the Member from Dramedtse\_Ngatshang Constituency and some Members submitted that the

repetitive interrogation on the matter might be inconvenient, however, the Local Government officials should be supported.

On that, some Members submitted that the Gaydrungs despite not being included in Civil Service or Local Government Acts had been provided salary until now and keeping that as a basis, it would be possible to provide Leave encashment as well. As Gaydrungs were the direct service providers for the people, they should be given Leave Encashment as per the leave days they have accumulated.

However, since the Recommendation could not garner enough support, the recommendation could not be endorsed by the House.

On Recommendation 43, the recommendation was endorsed with the majority support from the House.

Similarly, since there was no deliberations with regard to Recommendations 45 A and C and D, the Member from Khatoed\_Laya Constituency and few other Members submitted that the S-level staff should be given daily allowance of Nu.1250/- and their promotion period should also be as per the recommendation of the National Council. The Minister for Finance submitted that the mileage has been made the same and it would suffice for the daily allowance.

The Recommendation from National Council was then endorsed with full support from the 45 Members present and voting in the House.

On Section 45 in the 17th Column, the Minister for Finance clarified that the Gaydrungs were in ESP level and that they should be provided DSA of Nu.1000/- instead of Nu.1500/-. The House then ascertained

the support on the change of recommendation and endorsed the recommendation with Nu.1000/- DSA for Gaydrungs.

Similarly on Recommendation 51.1, Section 1, the Minister for Finance and the Ministers and Members submitted that the provision of vehicle quota for Chairperson of the Royal Privy Council was not inconvenient now, however, in future if the Chairperson was not given the status of Minister, it would be inconvenient. The House could not garner enough support for the proposal and the recommendation of National Council was then endorsed.

Following that, the House endorsed Recommendation 51.1, Section 2. The House also endorsed Recommendation 51.3 as per the recommendation submitted by National Council.

Similarly, on Recommendation 53, the Member from Panbang Constituency asked regarding the plans of the Government to increase the pension of retired employees. The Speaker after reminding the House on the limited availability of time informed that the question was not related to the section. The House then endorsed the recommendation with majority support through the show of hands.

On Recommendation 54, the Minister for Finance and the Member from Khatoed\_Laya Constituency expressed that there was no need to set a ceiling on the Gratuity on which the Member from Athang\_Thedtsho Constituency submitted that if possible, it would be best to fix Gratuity at Nu.200,0000/-. However, on voting, the recommendation could not be endorsed.

The Speaker reminded the House that from 19 Recommendations of National Council, 12 Recommendations had been endorsed

after thorough deliberations. It was also reminded that the National Assembly has already endorsed the Pay Revision Bill 2019 by voting in previous sitting and that the voting was not required again.

After that, the Opposition Leader submitted that the system of the House should be upheld and the revised and amended sections should be understood by all for which voting should be decided. Adding on that, the Member from Panbang Constituency asked whether the 5 General Recommendations of the National Council should be discussed and if not discussed, requested the Minister for Finance on what considerations and plans the Government had for the Recommendations.

On that, the Speaker submitted that the General recommendations were reminder for the Government and submitted that the Minister for Finance need not respond to the query. It was also reminded that the discussion was a re-deliberation and did not require separate voting. Moreover, it was highlighted that the Pay Revision was mostly concentrated on Allowances and reminded the officials to work as per their allowances. The discussion on pay revision concluded with the Speaker reminding the Private sectors to support private employees as well.

**17<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month, Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 19<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

## **27. Motion**

### **27.1 Motion to provide separate health facilities and to create separate employment opportunities for disabled people and include these programmes in Health Policy and Employment Policy**

The Member from Khatoed\_Laya Constituency informed the House that as per Population and Housing Census Survey conducted in

2017, Bhutan has 15,567 disabled people which when converted to percentage came to 2.1 % out of total population of Bhutan. The Member on behalf of the Parliament thanked the monarchs and CSOs for providing continued support to the disabled people. However, as per the research report, almost 12000 disabled people lived in the rural areas and about 1400 were working under somebody else without any charges or fees and furthermore, the Member informed that due to lack of adequate amenities for disabled people, they were facing challenges in receiving health facilities on time.

Further, the Member added that youths suffering from body growth were not able to find jobs even after their studies which were violation of fundamental rights under the constitution and also the principles of GNH. Therefore, accordingly the Member made two recommendations:

1. To provide health facilities to disabled people, and
2. To include in the health and employment policies on creation of separate opportunity of employment for disabled people.

While deliberating on the issue, the Members submitted that apart from providing health facilities and job opportunities to disabled people, the government should also provide separate facilities like freedom to access to various services like toilet, parking space, wheelchair facilities, hearing aid, sports facilities and basic amenities. Moreover, the government should institute mechanisms whereby disabled people could meet directly with doctors and need not wait in long queue to avail the health facilities. Further, the government should also start to initiate mechanisms to provide door to door health facilities at their residences and schools to those who could not avail the health facilities and should initiate ways and means to design their house as per their needs.



Similarly, some Members stated that disabled people do better than normal people if opportunities were given to them and in order to provide full support to them, it was important from the government's side to either formulate a comprehensive policy on disabled people or come up with a separate Act such as Services for Disabled People Act. They also requested the government to identify separate employment opportunities for disabled people.

To that, the Health Minister, Agriculture Minister and Minister for Foreign Affairs clarified that while reviewing the cases of 60 disabled new births out of 1000, it was found out that nutritious food for mothers and delivery at hospitals were important factors and accordingly the government had been working hard to create awareness. They also informed that starting from January, 2019, the ministry with the help of UNICEF had started to give food mixed with vitamins to children in three Dzongkhags who could not get nutritious food and if the Program became successful then it would be started in other Dzongkhags. Further, the health officials were trained to identify the children with deformities when they come for their regular vaccines and such Programs had already been started.

The Government also informed that most of the disabled people were those who could not see and government plan need to distribute the spectacles worth Nu. 400,000 that had been received as a donation to the schools for free of cost. The Government also informed that it would be better if the convention on disabled person could be ratified first and then Act could be formed later in line with the convention. Accordingly, the government informed the House that it had a plan to put up convention on disabled person in parliament for its ratification. The government also stated that it was important to come up with

Programs to observe the Senior Citizen's Day like disabled person's day observed by the health ministry.

While some Members stated that if the government really wanted to provide support to disabled people then it was not necessary to wait for ratification of convention to come up with Services for Disabled People Act.

To that, the Speaker reminded the relevant agencies to keep those issues in mind and work hard. The members then endorsed the first recommendation by a show of hands.

While deliberating on the second recommendation, the Opposition Leader and some members stated that disabled people should not be differentiated and instead the government should provide equal support in terms of employment to those skilled disabled people. Moreover, adequate facilities should be instituted in their workplace and like in other countries, it was imperative to institute sign language means to convey news to deaf people.

The Member from Panbang Constituency recommended the government formulate and circulate a comprehensive policy for disabled people to MPs at the earliest to which all the members supported through show of hands. Accordingly, while asking the government on possible deadline to submit the policy, the Health Minister and Minister for Finance stated that although GNHC had formulated a National Policy 2017, they could not find definite reasons to submit the policy in the parliament, and since Health Ministry did not have authority to state the deadline, the ministry was not able to exactly give the deadline. The Minister for Finance supplemented by stating that Health Ministry was not mandated to

report in the House and further he stated that it was important to keep the final authority with the cabinet to decide the policy, however, if the House really wanted the decisions of the Cabinet to be reported in the House, the Minister agreed to report in the winter session.

After deliberating at length, the House endorsed three recommendations as follows:

1. Recommendation 1: “Need of separate health facilities ‘to disabled people and include the Program in Health Policy’” was endorsed through majority votes with 35 members voted ‘Yes’ and 6 abstained from voting out of 41 members present in the House. **The voting list provided in Annexure 18.**
2. Recommendation 2: “To create separate employment opportunities to disabled people who suffered body growth and include the Program in employment policy” was endorsed through majority votes with 29 members voted ‘Yes’, 2 members voted ‘No’ and 10 abstained from voting out of 41 members present in the House. **The voting list provided in Annexure 19.**
3. Recommendation 3 (new recommendation): “The Government to formulate a comprehensive policy on disabled person and report to the House in winter session” was endorsed through majority votes with 21 members voted ‘Yes’, 9 members voted ‘No’ and 11 remained abstained from voting out of 41 members present in the House. **The voting list provided in Annexure 20.**

#### **27.2 Resolution on Motion to Reduce Import of LPG through Alternative Use of Electric Ovens**

The Member from Bardo\_Trong Constituency stated that in the year 2008-09, the import of subsidized LPG was increased from 500 tons

to 700 tons, and at present, 700 tons of subsidized LPG and 1000 tons of non-subsidized LPG were imported monthly. Moreover, to prevent the shortage of LPG, the government initiated various measures, however, due to constant increase in population and housing, the shortage of LPG in the country had become a pertinent issue.

Besides greatly affecting the economy of country, such imports of LPG had also negative impact on lives and environment, therefore, if the government could change the policy to encourage the usage of clean energy such as electricity and electric ovens by waiving off 20% tax on electric ovens and 5 % tax on related electronic equipment, and also recommended if the subsidized electricity in the rural areas could be improved thereby making two recommendations.

While deliberating at length on that issue, some Members stated that on top of shortage of LPG cylinders, the location for supply of non-subsidized LPG from one place had caused inconvenience to the public and had led to less availability; therefore it was important to make the supply of LPG from a more convenient place. Moreover, the use of electric ovens seemed to be more appropriate with electricity reaching in most of the places in Bhutan. Although our country had been generating an income of Nu. 10.5 billion from export of electricity every year, the country was spending around Nu. 295 million for import of electricity in the winter season and Nu. 9 billion in the import of LPG cylinders and fuel which then left only a profit of Nu. 1.283 million. Therefore, if the government could come up with a policy on usage of electric ovens within country, it would largely benefit our economy and security of the country.

While some members stated that resolution from this deliberation would be of no use since the objective of the motion was to reduce the tax, nevertheless, the reduction of taxes had to be done in accordance with its own tax procedure.

Therefore, some Members urged the House to carefully understand the issue as to why tax reduction was needed, whether it was because people were not able to buy electric ovens or was it the problem of electricity after buying electric ovens.

Some Members stated their concerns on adequate supply of green LPG cylinders, since the policy from the Ministry of Economic Affairs stated the people residing in the town had to use green LPG cylinders. Moreover, there was a need to see the possibility of supplying electricity at lower rates in the towns like they were supplied in the rural areas. Further, be it green or blue LPG cylinders, the country would have to import both and therefore, it was important for the government to institute measures to reduce the import of LPG cylinders.

On that issue, the Minister for Foreign Affairs, Minister for Agriculture and Forests and some Members stated that irrespective of having advantage or disadvantage of using electric ovens, the biogas and firewood had direct benefit to the people in rural areas. Some Members stated that there was no point debating on tax reduction in the House since the tax can be waived only through law by Parliament and further, the load capacity of electricity in rural areas was questionable. Therefore, the members also requested the government to see on the possibility of opening of industries which could refill the LPG cylinders within the country.

The Minister for Economic Affairs submitted that the Policy on Hydroelectric, 2008 was under process of reviewing and it was hopeful that the endorsement of Energy usage and preservation policy might also help to resolve the problems. In addition, as per the study conducted, the usage of electricity was found to have more advantage than LPG and for the past 3 months, the ministry had distributed around 7000 non-subsidized LPG cylinders and suggested the possibility of solving most of the problems if MPs could also use non-subsidized LPG. After requesting the government to increase the load capacity of electricity in rural areas to encourage people to use electric ovens, the lengthy discussion on the motion concluded.

1. Recommendation 1: “Government should change the policy to encourage the use of clean energy such as electricity and waive off or reduce the existing 20% tax on electric ovens and 5 % tax on related electric appliances in order to encourage the use of electric ovens” was endorsed through majority votes with 34 members voted ‘Yes’, 5 members voted ‘No’ and 3 abstained from voting out of 42 members present in the House. **The voting list provided in Annexure 21.**
2. Recommendation 2: “ Government should improve the subsidized electricity in rural areas” was endorsed through majority votes with 36 members voted ‘Yes’, 4 members voted ‘No’ and 2 abstained from voting out of 42 members present in the House. **The voting list provided in Annexure 22.**

**18<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 20<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

## **28. Resolution of Report of PAC on Review of Performance Audit Reports**

Before the presentation of the report by the Chairperson of Public Accounts Committee (PAC), the Secretary General read out the

Royal Kasho of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo to convene a Joint Sitting of the House as directed by the Speaker. Following that, the Speaker declared Annual Audit Report 2018, IT Audit Report on the Efficiency and Effectiveness in Public Service Delivery through G2C Platform, IT Audit Report on Core Banking System in BDBL, performance audit report on food self-sufficiency & security and Report on ‘Review of Government Vehicles and Foreign Vehicle tabled in English as public documents which were presented before Parliament by the Royal Audit Authority (RAA) as per Article 25.1 of the Constitution. **The Royal Kasho provided in Annexure 23.**

Subsequently, the Chairperson of the Public Accounts Committee (Eminent Member of National Council) presented the report which was divided into two parts as follows:

Part I: Review report on five Performance Audit Reports

Part II: Follow up on Implementation Status of 10<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> Session Resolution and Committee’s observations and recommendations.

While deliberating on the review report of collection and management of revenues in Thromdes, some Members stated that problems in fixing the accountability were encountered because it was not clear under which ministry or central agency the Thromdes fell under. Further, some Members stated that it was important to institute strong measures so that thereafter, agencies would take seriousness in implementing the recommendations of RAA. Moreover, due to unclear rules on imposition and collection of taxes in Thromdes, lots of problems and lapses occurred in the Thromdes and therefore, if the taxes collected from Thromdes could be deposited in the consolidated fund and distributed later as per the need and necessity of Thromdes.

Some Members stated that problems occurred in implementing the Programs by Thromdes because as per LG Act, Thromdes were under Local Government and with regard to management, they were under MoHCA and for the technical experts, Thromdes were under MoWHS. Therefore, the issues and problems related to Thromdes could be reviewed together while reviewing the amendment of Local Government Acts in winter session.

Some members stated that main problem in Thromdes was mismanagement in the revenue collection and therefore, there was need of strong procedure with regard to collection of revenues in Thromdes.

With regard to the Committee's observation 1: "There is fluctuation in the revenue collection by Thromdes and most concerning is that Thimphu and Gelephu Thromde's revenue collection decreased in the FY 2016-2017 as compared to the previous fiscal year" was endorsed by House through majority by show of hands.

The Committee's observation 2: "The committee noted that Thromdes have collected vacant land tax at a rate of 25% of the land tax. However, in E4 zones, Thimphu Thromde exempted payment of 25% vacant land tax. While the Thromdes were empowered by the relevant laws to levy taxes, the appropriation and exemption of taxes had to be as per the law passed by parliament" and Committee's recommendation 3: "Huge amount of revenues have been lost due to inadequate administration and management of government land by Thromdes. The committee recommends the Thromdes to recover and deposit the forgone revenue from the concerned entities latest by March 2020" was also endorsed by House through majority by show of hands.



With regard to the Committee's recommendation 4: "The PAC seriously noted that Thromdes lacked financial sustainability as they were continuously depending on grants from the government. There was a huge deficit between total expenditure and revenue collection in Thromdes. While the Thromdes and Minister for Finance were supposed to discuss on the timeline to prepare grant phase out plan, they had not been able to meet so far. As provided in the Thromde Finance Policy 2012, the committee strongly recommended the Ministry for Finance and Thromdes to formulate a grant phase out plan by September, 2019", some members suggested for slight change in the committee's recommendation, while some members stated that as per Article 22(18) (e) of the Constitution of Bhutan, the Thromdes were entitled for grant from the government and after lengthy deliberation, the House through majority show of hands endorsed the recommendation.

Similarly on committee's recommendation 5: "Despite the deadline set by RAA, Phuntsholing and Gelephu Thromdes did not submit their MAP and ATR even after 10 months. The PAC also sent reminder letters to them. The committee was deeply concerned of such non-compliance to the RAA's report by Phuntsholing and Gelephu Thromdes. On the other hand, the committee also noted that RAA also did not take any measures such as fixing of accountability. Therefore, the Committee recommends RAA to come up with clear procedures of fixing accountability even on the lapses pertaining to the performance auditing reports latest by September 2019", some members shared their concerns on lack of action from Thromdes's side to RAA's recommendation and therefore, requested the committee to conduct a public hearing right after summer session, and some suggested the Ministry of Finance to withhold their grant for the time being.

On that concern, the Chairperson submitted that although there was clear procedure on fixation of accountability in the Audit Act with regard to financial audits but for performance audits, the procedure was not clear and informed the House that the RAA was in the process of framing their rules and regulations which would take care of the problem of fixing accountability in performance audits, and thereby the House endorsed recommendation 5 through majority show of hands.

While deliberating on committee's recommendation 1 in chapter 2 which dealt with review of In-country travel, some members suggested the Ministry of Finance and RCSC discuss and clarify procedures with regard to in-country travel because financial authority lies with the Minister for Finance and human resource authority lies with RCSC. To that, the Chairperson of PAC clarified by stating that rules pertaining to in-country travel were clear, however, the problem was in the implementation of these rules and with that, the House through majority by show of hands endorsed the recommendation 1 "The PAC during the consultative meeting with the Ministry of Finance observed that accountability was inappropriately fixed to the Ministry of Finance. The PAC noted that rules and regulations pertaining to travels were well in place; however, there was non-compliance of rules at the time of implementation by the agencies. The PAC therefore, recommends RAA to fix accountability directly to the agencies concerned".

On committee's recommendation 2: "The committee observed that the RAA's recommendation to RCSC to reinstate the requirement of production of vehicle registration document for mileage claim was inappropriate. The RCSC empowered by its parent Act (Civil

Service Act) to formulate rules and regulations with regard to civil servants. While the committee respects the concern of RAA, PAC reiterates that the existing rule must prevail to uphold independent functioning of the constitutional body”, some members stated that if civil servants were to submit vehicle registration documents to claim mileage then it would be contradictory to recently endorsed Pay Revision Act, 2019.

Moreover, the RCSC after thoroughly reviewing the issues had decided to repeal the provision on requirement to submit vehicle registration documents to claim mileage in the BCSR 2018. Thereafter, the House endorsed recommendation 2 with majority show of hands.

Similarly on recommendation 3: “The PAC also noted inconsistency in dholam claim. The MoHCA and Minister for Finance framed rules on dholam due to increase road connectivity and public transport availability whereas the local government approved dholam entitlement which was inconsistent with the rules framed by the Ministries. Therefore, the PAC reiterated the RAA’s recommendation to Ministry for Finance and MoHCA to rationalize the dholam and porter pony system”, the Chairperson of PAC clarified that the recently endorsed Pay Revision Act, 2019 clearly mentioned about dholam which would take care of issues regarding dholam and thereby House endorsed the recommendation though majority show of hands.

With regard to recommendations made by RAA on IT Audit Report on core Banking Solution (TCS-BaNCs) in Bank of Bhutan Limited, Bank of Bhutan had fully implemented all the recommendations to which House endorsed through majority show of hands.

With regard to performance audit on operations of Bhutan Chamber of Commerce and Industry (BCCI) in chapter 4, some members stated that although BCCI had been established for many years, it had not been able to perform well and on top of it, the Chamber also lacked financial sustainability. Therefore, to improve the Chamber further, there was a need to amend the terms of reference of its President and management system. The Parliament in 2006 suggested the Chamber to get registered under CSO and plus current situation showed that, most of the expenses were incurred for hospitality and entertainment.

Moreover, some members submitted that all problems in BCCI occurred due to lack of legal framework and therefore, suggested for need to sign Annual Performance Agreement (APA) while giving the grant by government. To that suggestion, some members stated that until the terms of reference of President were made clear, there would be no change even if APA was signed and therefore, it was emphasized for a need of legal framework for BCCI. Thereafter, the House endorsed the recommendation “BCCI sustains its operations from annual membership fees of the business entities (50.4 percent of its revenue generation), rental income of events and trade fairs (45 percent), voluntary fees and so forth. It also receives grants from the government. However, the current expenditure trends (mostly driven by pay and allowances and hospitality and entertainment expenses) show that BCCI’s operations were financially not sustainable, which was a cause of concern” through majority show of hands. With that, the deliberation on PAC report for day one concluded.

**19<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 21<sup>st</sup> June, 2019.**

While continuing the deliberation on performance audit on preparedness for implementation of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) of PAC report on the second day, the Speaker reminded the House that National Key Result Areas (NKRAs) had been integrated with SDGs and with this House endorsed the Committee's recommendation "GNHC as a central planning and coordinating body for the overall development plan was also responsible for leading and coordinating SDGs activities in the country. GNHC as the High level SDG Committee in itself is a positive institutional arrangement chaired by the Prime Minister that provides national ownership and policy direction towards achieving SDGs" through majority show of hands.

While deliberating on committee's observation 2: "Bhutan has significantly integrated SDGs into its national development plans through NKRAS/AKRAs/LGKRAs and corresponding KPIs at various levels of government. Besides, the Government Performance Management System (GPMS) and periodic plan review provide mechanism for timely monitoring of the progress", some members shared concerns on making error in choosing SDGs which were not in line with the country's situation and some Members stated that although all SDGs were appropriate to be incorporated by all the countries, it was important to prioritize amongst these SDGs as per the needs of the country.

Moreover, some Members stated that the SDGs had become widespread in general and with a focus to have a smooth implementation of these SDGs in the national development goals were prioritized and with that, House endorsed the committee's observation through majority show of hands.

With regard to the committee's observation 3: "However, there is a need for a dedicated unit/division within the GNHC Secretariat along with competent personnel to ensure timely and effective coordination of SDG implementation. A separate dashboard to monitor implementation of SDG activities is equally important", some members suggested whether there was really need to institute separate office when GNHC itself was an office with the objective to coordinate and implement SDGs.

To that, the Chairperson clarified by stating that it was not about establishing separate office, however, to create a separate unit within the office itself to carry out extra responsibility related to SDGs. With that, the observation was endorsed through majority by show of hands.

Similarly, while deliberating on committee's observation 4: "As the resources are generally limited in implementing plans, it is appropriate to assess within our own context the requirement of resources towards effective implementation of SDGs", some members stated that it was important to have some procedure established between private sectors, CSOs and government to ensure continuous implementation of SDGs. With that, the observation was endorsed by House through majority show of hands.

While discussing on committee's recommendation 5: "The PAC observed that GNHC did not submit the MAP and ATR within the deadline (31 January 2019) of RAA. The committee was deeply concerned of such non- compliance to the RAA's report by GNHC. Therefore, the Committee recommends RAA to come up with clear procedures of fixing accountability even on the lapses pertaining to the performance auditing reports latest by September 2019", some

members stated that GNHC was working hard to implement SDGs with other prioritized developmental activities and therefore, some problems would be faced if the accountability was to be fixed.

On the committee's recommendation 6: "As it was observed the Parliament had an important oversight function, the Committee strongly recommends to form SDG Committee at the parliament level to oversee progress and challenges in the implementation of SDGs", some members stated that there was no need of a separate committee to oversee progress and challenges in the implementation of SDGs and proposed that as per the objective, even the parliamentary committees could carry out the task. With that, the recommendation was endorsed by House through majority by show of hands.

Furthermore, some members submitted that while appointing the committee, the parliament should clarify whether to institute it as a joint committee or not and proposed if clear procedure could be formulated to enable the committee to report annually to the Parliament. Following that, as per the recommendation, the House through majority show of hands endorsed that committee would be joint committee and the committee would report in the joint sitting.

With regard to implementation status of resolutions of 11th Session in part II, chapter I, some members stated that there was a need to specify the issues related to resolution 3 which stated about patients not having to wait in long queue, patients coming from different Dzongkhags and provision of health services to chronic patients and establishing separate agency to solve problems related to supply of drinking water in resolution 6 and 7. To that, the Chairperson and Minister for Health clarified by stating that patients' waiting time

reduced and also informed that in order to solve the problems related to waiting in long queue, off-hour services started in the hospitals.

In addition, the Minister for Health informed that due to shortage of specialists in the hospitals, shift system could not be started and in order to reduce patients in JDWNRH, the Ministry made plans to institute the same services and facilities in the Dzongkhag hospitals like JDWNRH. Likewise, the government informed that they were studying whether there was need to establish separate agency for distribution of water or not, and also informed that currently MoWHS was looking after water related issues. With that, the House endorsed the issue through majority by show of hands.

While deliberating on resolution 10 in chapter 2 of part II which stated on appointment of adequate Dieticians in health facilities, the Minister for Health informed that it was important to study and appoint Dieticians as per the number of patients rather than appointing dieticians equally in all the health facilities, and further it was assured that the Ministry was in the process of reviewing the need to appoint Dieticians in BHUs and would accordingly submit a report to the parliament.

While voting on the 15 recommendations and observations, out of total 58 Members present and voting, all members voted 'Yes' thereby endorsing all the recommendations and observations of the committee. With that, the deliberation on PAC report concluded. **The voting list provided in Annexure 24.**

**20<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 24<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**



**29. Resolution on re-deliberation Of Budget Appropriation Bill for Financial Year 2019-20**

The Member In-charge of the Bill (Minister for Finance) informed the House that National Council (NC) had deliberated and passed the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill, 2018-19 without any amendments after being endorsed by the National Assembly. However, Minister suggested for deliberation of 6 recommendations made on Budget Appropriation Bill, 2019-20 which were forwarded to NA by NC for re-deliberation.

While deliberating on each recommendation and with regard to recommendation 1, NC recommended that in order to provide curriculum related orientation Program to teachers on time, it was important for the government to provide adequate budget to RUB. To that, Minister for Finance clarified by stating that RUB was allocated with total of Nu. 300 million in 12<sup>th</sup> FYP and Nu. 56 million as capital budget in FY 2019-20. It was also informed the House that from Nu.19.2 million proposed by RUB, Ministry of Finance has allocated RUB with general fund of Nu. 17.6 million which NA also endorsed (around 90% ) was allocated.

This recommendation was unanimously endorsed by all the members through show of hands.

While deliberating on recommendation 2 proposed by NC on requirement of allocating separate funds for tangible and intangible culture, the Minister for Finance informed that separate fund was not allocated, however, it was included in the total fund for FY 2019-20. Nevertheless, thereafter, as recommended by the NC, the Minister for Finance agreed to provide separate funds for tangible and intangible culture.

The Member from Bumdelling\_Jamkhar Constituency and some other Members stated that Bhutan had lots of intangible cultures such as old proverbs, folk tales and different languages and till now government had not allocated separate funds for those intangible cultures. Because of that, people did not take interest in our intangible cultures which might lead to the disappearance of culture and therefore, it was important for the government to take extra measures to preserve the intangible cultures.

Some members shared that since LG had been provided with sufficient funds, it would benefit if the government could formulate a policy to ensure the LG prioritize and preserve intangible cultures. Further, some members stated that in future, it was important for the government to allocate separate funds for the preservation of intangible culture to which Minister for Home and Culture Affairs also informed that in the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP, sufficient fund has been allocated to promote and preserve culture and tradition and therefore kindly reminded the House not to worry about it.

On the other hand, some members stated that it was not necessary to allocate different funds for tangible and intangible culture but again some members submitted that as recommended by NC, it would have great advantage if separate funds were kept for tangible and intangible culture. With that, the recommendation made by NC was endorsed by House through majority by show of hands.

With regard to recommendation 3, NC recommended that in order to develop high altitude, allocation of funds in different agencies had to be specified. The Member from Lamgong-Wangchang Constituency asked reasons for removing development of high altitude from the

planned activities, although the plan for development was recognized as important, and to be included in 12<sup>th</sup> FYP as special plan. To that, Minister for Finance clarified by stating that while consulting with the relevant ministries and agencies, it was found out that such Program be implemented by all the agencies together and because of that, stated that there would not be no problem in implementing the Program of development of high altitudes by setting deadlines within 5 years.

To that, some Members stated that setting deadlines in implementing the development of high altitude Program would not be inconvenient and requested the government to provide basic amenities, health and education services and agriculture and forest services to the people in high altitude at all times. The Minister for Finance stated that for FY 2019-20, Nu. 21 million was kept for improvement of livelihoods of people living in high altitude and further added that although the Program was not included in flagship Programs, the government was providing them with sufficient fund and therefore, every minute details about all the plans and Programs was not required to be included in the budget report and accordingly requested the House not to worry about it.

The Opposition Leader and some Members shared that since the main objective to include high altitude development Program in flagship Program was not only to improve the economy and livelihoods of high altitude people, it was with the hope to protect the country's boundary and also to collectively develop the health and education services in high altitude which unfortunately was not included in the 12 FYP.

Tourism as one of the flag ship Programs, 4 Dzongkhags; Zhemgang in the central, Lhuentse in the east, Dagana in the south and Gasa in the north were prioritized and endorsed by NA and forwarded to NC. However, during the Question Hour Session in National Council, the Chairperson of Tourism Council (Minister for Foreign Affairs) had stated that Zhemgang would be replaced by Sarpang and if that was true, then it would hinder equal development of regional tourism and moreover, endorsement made by the parliament would become invalid and therefore, sought clarification from the government.

To that, Minister for Foreign Affairs clarified by stating that while reviewing the issue, the government had to make some changes in the Dzongkhag while there were no changes in the financial part. Minister also added that opening of entry points from Gelephu and Samdrup Jongkhar were reviewed and found that there would be some problems while implementing the Program and therefore, the change was based on that review. Moreover, it was done within government's purview because the government had the authority to select the Dzongkhags for that flagship Program. With that, the majority of the House endorsed the recommendation by show of hands.

With regard to recommendation 4, NC recommended that scrutiny of budget of Stated Owned Enterprises by Economic and Finance Committee submitted by Minister for Finance was against the law to which the Minister for Finance stated that NC had concerns and reviewed the issue thoroughly to which the Minister fully supported. Following that, the majority of the House fully supported and endorsed the recommendation made by NC with show of hands.

With regard to recommendation 5, NC recommended the government to conduct a comprehensive study on delay in the completion of PHPA-I and submit a report to NC before next session. To that, Minister for Economic Affairs submitted that although PHPA-I had become a major concern in the country, however, the Minister submitted that thereafter, it was expected that a great outcome would come out from that project. That was also because a study had been conducted with regard to the project's sustainability and its benefits to the nation and with objective to successful completion of the project, His Holiness the Je Khenpo had laid a foundation to build a chorten near the project site and hoped it would be a successful project and agreed that the government would be able to furnish a report to NC on that project.

The Member from Bji\_Kartshog\_Uesu Constituency recommended that all the general public deserved to know about the situation of PHPA-I project and therefore, it was important for the government to present the report before the two Houses of Parliament and deliberate on the issue.

The House made slight amendments to the recommendation of the National Council, which was to share the report on PHPA-I with both Houses for its deliberation and the recommendation was endorsed through majority show of hands.

With regard to recommendation 6, NC recommended that culture trust fund was first started in 1999 with fund of Nu. 31 million as of March, 2019, the fund has accumulated to Nu. 68 million which when converted into US Dollar came to US\$ 1 million and that fund would be managed by the Department of Culture themselves.

Furthermore, it was added that as per Royal Charter, this trust fund could not be used until the amount reached US\$ 5 million and therefore, to benefit in future, it was important to come with initiatives to use Nu. 68 million to make profits.

To that, the Member from Panbang Constituency suggested that instead of allocating funds from annual budget for culture trust fund, it would be better if the government could look for donors from outside the country for the fund. The Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs reminded the House that as per the Royal Charter of Fourth Druk Gyalpo, the fund could not be used until it reached Nu. 300 million after initially starting with Nu. 60 million. The Minister also informed the House that the fund was deposited in the fixed account in BNB, however, the bank has not been able to pay interest for one year due to amount being too high and therefore, the government was looking for ways and means to transfer the amount to some other banks.

It was also informed that the interest generated (Nu. 8 million) from initial fund of Nu. 60 million could not be used as per the Royal Charter and Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs was in the process of discussing with TCB to deposit at least one fourth of revenue earned from regional and international tourist to culture trust fund.

The House endorsed the recommendation through majority show of hands.

In conclusion, the Speaker informed that out of 6 recommendations made by National Council, recommendation 1 which was related to education could not be adopted, however, all other 5 recommendations were adopted by the National Assembly, and moreover the recommendations made by National Council were

all general in nature and there was nothing to be amended in the Budget Appropriation Bill, 2019-20, and thus, the voting was not required. With that, the re-deliberation on Budget Appropriation Bill concluded.

**23<sup>rd</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 25<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

**30. Resolution on Re-deliberation of the Amendment to Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer**

The Member In-Charge of the Bill, Chairperson of the Environment Commission (Minister for Agriculture and Forests) submitted an Amendment to Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer stating that the protocol was discussed thoroughly and adopted by the National Assembly in the First Session of the Third Parliament and referred to the National Council as per Article 13 (5) of the Constitution of Bhutan. The National Council during its 23<sup>rd</sup> Session had deliberated on the Protocol and forwarded to the National Assembly for re-deliberation on 6 provisions with clerical errors. The Member In-Charge submitted that since those changes were just clerical errors, the Minister requested the House to adopt the recommendations made by the National Council.

During the deliberation, the House adopted 4 recommendations after deliberating on each amendment submitted by National Council. Moreover, 2 recommendations were accepted with slight changes in words with no alteration in the meaning. Therefore, House adopted the recommendations- 5<sup>th</sup> paragraph under section 2 of Article 5; from Article 2 (a) to Article 2 (f), and amended as “Article 2 (h)”. Besides that, an additional paragraph 8 under Article 5 with section (d) as inserted in the annexure (e) were adopted by the House.

The Speaker reminded the House that after ratification by the Parliament, the protocol would become law of the country and therefore, it was to be adopted through voting. Thereafter, the amendment to Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer was endorsed by all 34 members present in the House through majority votes. With that, the deliberation on Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer concluded. **The voting list provided in Annexure 25.**

**23<sup>rd</sup> Day of 4<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 25<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

**31. Presentation of Annual Report on the State of the Nation, including Legislative Plans and Annual Plans and Priorities of the Government, by the Prime Minister of Bhutan.**

In the Presentation of Annual Report on the State of the Nation, including Legislative Plans, Annual Plans and Priorities of the Government by the Prime Minister as mandated by Article 10 (10) of the Constitution of Bhutan, the Prime Minister stated that from ancient times, Bhutan was blessed by Guru Padmasambhava and Zhabdrung Ngawang Namgyal making it a sacred country and protected by sacrifices of our great monarchs who would never allow it to collapse. However, it was informed that it was important to share the future plans and Programs and accordingly report was presented based on three different times.

**Past**

The Prime Minister submitted that people of Bhutan offered deepest gratitude to our monarchs for their indefinite endeavours and were more fortunate to have Her Majesty as our Gyaltsuen and were thankful for blessing the people with His Royal Highness the Gyalsey as a gift to the nation, which brought immense joy and happiness. For



that, the Prime Minister offered gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen.

The Prime Minister also stated that all developmental activities had been successful due to His Holiness the Je Khenpo, Dratshang and Monastic Body for administering continuous prayers and activities to seek the support of local deities and for that, the Prime Minister on behalf people of Bhutan offered his deepest gratitude.

Furthermore, the Prime Minister also thanked civil servants, constitutional offices, NGOs, private sectors and three armed forces for working in close coordination and cooperation for successful implementation of developmental activities irrespective of change in government after every 5 years.

### **Present**

The Prime Minister informed that Bhutan would graduate from least developed country by 2023 which was good news. However, at the same time Prime Minister stated that Bhutan would have to face lots of challenges. However, it was informed the House that the government had policy and plans to continue the investment works and trade relations with countries that had supported Bhutan till now.

### **Health**

One of the most concerning was in health sectors and for that, Prime Minister informed that the government was working hard to provide good health facilities by keeping it as a top priority.

### **Education**

The Prime Minister also informed that one of the community services were provided through education, and quality of education still

needed to be improved. The number of graduates who had been able to stand on their own feet and graduates with the right job with the right skills were few and therefore, it was also important to improve the quality of education.

### **Economy**

Prime Minister informed that there was no specific driver for the economy of the country and as per research reports, the economy of the country was not stable and although hydro power projects had been considered as the main income generator, that had to be reviewed in order to avoid risks in the future and therefore, it was informed that such concern has to be kept in mind while working towards hydro power projects.

### **Employment**

Prime Minister reported that any government that comes into power had to consider employment as a top priority and work according to that. However, at present, the rate of youth unemployment had been increased; nevertheless, the overall rate of unemployment had reduced and therefore, Prime Minister informed that one need not worry about that. It was further informed that skills were necessary to get a job and therefore, government had various plans and Programs ready to provide quality trainings to youths.

### **Debt and Hydro power**

At present, the total public debt stood at Nu.210 billion of which Nu. 154 billion pertained to hydro power projects. Thereafter, policies would be reviewed and hydro power projects would be constructed only as per need. Accordingly, the plan to construct 10,000 megawatt hydro power projects by 2020 had been cancelled. Prime Minister stated that it was important to review the plans properly for

construction of appropriate projects after the completion of PHPA projects.

### **Agriculture**

The Prime Minister informed that although 60% population depended on agriculture, around 50% food items were imported and government was spending annually Nu. 5 billion in importing rice which was a bit concerning. Therefore, to reduce such imports, governments had made plans and already assigned the Ministry of Agriculture and Forests to implement it accordingly.

### **Tourism**

Tourism was the second highest revenue generator of country and it was generating almost US\$ 70 million revenue annually; nevertheless, there was no tourism policy and therefore, government was drafting one tourism policy at present. Prime Minister reminded that if one solely worked just to make a profit then it would be against the philosophy of GNH as well as against the visions of our monarch.

### **Mines and Minerals**

Currently, there were 26 active mines and 40 active quarries in the country; however, at the time of filing tax, not even three and a half percent filed taxes. Therefore, in order to improve the system, Mines and Minerals Bill which had already been submitted to the National Assembly would be deliberated in the winter session and requested for support from Members of Parliament while deliberating on the Bill.

### **Poverty**

Prime Minister reported that according to international poverty rate, Bhutan did not need to worry about its poverty situation. However,

the present poverty rate of 8% had to be resolved by bringing equal development all across the country. Considering the need to eradicate poverty, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo provided land kidus to 140,000 people, medical treatment abroad for 100 people, 2000 students as Gyalpoi Tozep, scholarships abroad to 700 students and citizenship kidu to 1000 people, therefore, it was reiterated that one need not worry about the eradication of poverty.

### **Culture**

Our culture helped in maintaining the country's security and moreover, under His Majesty's order, several Dzongs and lhakhangs had been either renovated or newly constructed. Bhutan was considered as the capital of culture in regional level and for that, it was stated that we should take pride in our culture and traditions.

### **Environment**

With regard to environment, no country was better than Bhutan and our Monarchs had always reminded us to take care of the environment and its produces for all times and, Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen took the lead and participated in the environment related works and for that, it was stated that Bhutanese should take pride and gratitude towards our His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen.

### **Good Governance**

Prime Minister informed that Committee of Secretaries had been re-instituted and so far they have conducted around 7 meetings and submitted recommendations which facilitated government in carrying out its functions. Moreover, the Lhengye Zhungtshog had conducted 29 meetings and passed almost 89 resolutions that were important for the country. The government also started meeting

known as “Densa Zomdu” which would be held one week prior to every Lhengye Zhungtshog meeting.

Further it was informed that Prime Minister started a meeting known as “AM with PM” from 8:30 am to 9:30 am with agencies, private sectors and individuals and till date, around 25 meetings had been conducted, and that helped to collect opinions and information with regard to government policies and plans.

With regard to legislative plan, Prime Minister informed that there were good deliberations in the House on Bills. Similarly, it was urged for further cooperation and support from Ruling, Opposition Party and National Council for successful completion of country’s developmental activities.

### **12<sup>th</sup> FYP**

With the objective to avoid interference of political interest and wastage of funds in 12th FYP, Prime Minister informed that plans and Programs had been made to ensure that 15% of budget would be used in FY 2018-19, 20% in FY 2019-20, 22% in FY 2021-22 and 20% in 2022-23.

### **Media**

Prime Minister informed that media had been facing challenges in human resource autonomy and shortage of funds, and therefore, the government discussed issues with media agencies.

### **Foreign relations**

With regard to foreign relations, it was stated that if people continue to work based on policies and guidance set by our hereditary monarchs, then it would have a great advantage on our country. Prime Minister

further stated that people should be proud of getting the opportunity to serve in the UN peacekeeping operations.

### **Future**

Prime Minister informed the House that important activities would be implemented in first and second year to implement the 12th FYP properly which had a total outlay of Nu. 310 billion.

### **Objectives of first financial year**

1. In order to provide quality health services to people, a group of health officials would visit every household to do checkups and through technology (EPI), people's identity would be put in the system to diagnose diseases. The government also has made plans to take care of both mother and children from the day of conception until the child learns to go to early childhood care centre.
2. In order to eliminate cervical cancer in Bhutan, within one year, government would make sure all women requiring pap-smear test to undergo the screening procedure, as part of their routine checkup. Moreover, every Bhutanese seeking endoscopy and Ultrasound services would not have to travel beyond their Dzongkhag/ gewog, as the government would strengthen primary health facilities in Dzongkhags as well. The government also planned to build a national hospital so that patients do not have to go abroad for treatments.
3. In order to improve the quality of education, the government increased the salary of teachers and moreover, the government planned to increase the stipend for the trainees in the two colleges of Paro and Samtse and also to provide extra opportunities to these trainees.

4. Prime Minister also informed that the government planned to provide extra training to teachers of ECCD and would also improve the centers so that students after graduating from these centers would not face problems in getting employment.
5. With the objective to achieve self reliance to improve the economy of the country, the government planned to focus on agriculture so that our local produce would be distributed in all the institutes and schools thereby reducing the import of food items from neighboring country.
6. In order to attract more tourists, the government was in the process of drafting tourism policy which would be submitted in the House and therefore, requested the House for their support during the deliberation.
7. Hon. Prime Minister informed that it was the government's priority to solve unemployment problem and therefore, the government was working in accordance with revised CSI and FDI policy to solve at least more than half of the unemployment problems in the country.
8. Prime Minister informed that it was important to carefully review the Mines and Minerals Bill while deliberating in the House and moreover, it was submitted it was important to draft Taxation legislation to ensure uniform and standard procedure in collection of taxes throughout the country.
9. As of now, one agency did not know what other agency had been doing and therefore, the government planned to harmonize that and moreover, with GNH as coordinating agency, one master plan was in the process of being drafted by GNHC.

10. There would practical problem in implementing 12<sup>th</sup> FYP by one government when it was drafted by another government which ultimately had a negative impact on our economy. Therefore, it was important that thereafter, whichever government came to power that government would draft the plan and for that, policy was already drafted and would soon submit to the House for endorsement.
11. It was also informed that three different types of dustbins with different colors and sizes would be distributed and moreover, government would provide support to LGs in executing the grant. Furthermore, separate toilets for men and women would be constructed in all the 20 Dzongkhags.
12. With regard to foreign relations, it was informed that Bhutan was aiming to make new foreign relations with two countries and to open one consulate office or embassy in at least one country within one year.
13. With regard to legislative plans, government would review the bills that have already been reviewed by committees and moreover, government would draft National Commission for Women and Children Bill to support our women and children, review and amend Narcotic Drugs, Psychotropic Substances and draft Limitation Bill and submit to the parliament within one year.

In conclusion, with the blessings of the Triple gem and Monastic Body and under the wise guidance of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, all the developmental activities have been successfully carried out with good outcome, and were hopeful to achieve better results in the future as well. In the five year term, the Government assured to work hard to fulfill the visions of our His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and



expectations of our people without tilting towards political interest or involving in corruption, after which the Annual Report on the State of the Nation, including Legislative Plans and Annual Plans and Priorities of the Government concluded.

**24<sup>th</sup> Day of 4<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Female Pig Year corresponding to 26<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.**

### **32. Closing Ceremony**

On 27<sup>th</sup> June corresponding to the 25<sup>th</sup> Day of the 4<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Female Pig Year, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo was received by the Speaker of the National Assembly, Chairperson of the National Council and Secretaries General of the two Houses from Entrance I of the National Assembly and ushered to the Golden Throne.

#### **32.1 Motion of Thanks**

##### **32.1.1 Motion of Thanks by the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs on behalf of the Ruling party**

The Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs offered gratitude for an opportunity to offer gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and expressed that it was one of the wishes of his lifetime. Further, the Minister submitted that he considered himself fortunate to have been born in a Buddhist country protected by local deities and ruled by compassionate monarchs.

Furthermore, the Minister stated that Bhutan was extraordinarily different as compared to many other countries because it had been blessed by Triple Gem with full of sacred sites.

Moreover, the Minister stated his gratitude to His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo for providing his constant support and guidance until now. The Minister also thanked Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen for gifting us with His Royal Highness the Gyalsey, and also for extending her support to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo in carrying out noble duties.

Additionally, the Minister submitted that our monarchs had always looked after the welfare of Their citizens and also initiated renovations of several Lhakhangs and Dzongs. One amongst many of the noble achievements was the transcription of Kanjur in golden script. The Minister also expressed gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for initiating Dessung which benefitted the community in many ways.

The Minister also expressed gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for extending his concern to the damage caused by floods and landslides. The Minister offered gratitude to His Majesty for showing an excellent example to others by working hard for the country, even in the times of death of a family member.

Lastly, the Minister submitted that the security of the country was always endured due to the wise and farsighted leader as His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo. For that, the Minister reminded the people to serve Tsa-Wa-Sum with utmost dedication and offered his prayers for long life of His Majesty and Members of the Royal Family.

#### 32.1.2 Motion of Thanks by the Chairperson of the National Council on behalf of National Council

The Chairperson of the National Council offered his deepest gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo on behalf of Members of the National Council for gracing the Closing Ceremony of Second Session of Third Parliament keeping aside numerous royal engagements.

The Chairperson stated that Bhutanese people were enjoying everlasting peace and happiness because of noble achievements of Wangchuck Dynasty and in particular, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo's immense farsightedness and to which Bhutanese people would always remain grateful.

The Chairperson submitted that His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo worked tirelessly for the fulfillment of the nation's objectives and on top of that, worked tirelessly to enhance the foreign relations with other countries. His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo always cared for the welfare of every individual to which even the outsiders appreciated and honored His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo with medals, and congratulated for such noble achievement.

The Chairperson thanked His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo for constantly looking after the citizens like a parent, and for that, the Chairperson offered prayers of long life of His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo.

Furthermore, The Chairperson thanked His Holiness the Je Khenpo for conducting various religious activities for the benefit of country and people, and offered prayers for the long life of His Holiness. The Chairperson also offered words of condolence on the sudden demise of Yab Dasho Ugyen Dorji and offered prayers for quick rebirth in Bhutan and to continue with the Dharma activities.

The Chairperson reported that the National Council reviewed six legislative related issues, three policy related issues, annual reports and conducted question-hour sessions. With that, the Chairperson pledged to work towards fulfillment of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo's vision and pledged commitment to work under His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo's wise advice and guidance.

Lastly, the Chairperson offered prayers for the long life of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, long lives of the Members of the Royal Family, and long life of His Holiness the Je Khenpo for all times to come.

32.1.3 Motion of Thanks by the Opposition Leader on behalf of the Opposition Party

The Opposition Leader offered gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for always gracing the Opening and Closing Session of Parliament and considered fortunate of having the opportunity to offer his deepest gratitude on behalf of two Houses.

Furthermore, the Opposition Leader thanked His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for always reminding the people to work hard towards Tsa-Wa-Sum with integrity and honesty for the sake of the country's present and future. For that, on behalf of parliament and Opposition party the Opposition Leader expressed gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for golden words.

The Opposition Leader also conveyed his heartfelt condolences to the Royal family on the sudden demise of Yab Dasho Ugyen Dorji.

The Opposition Leader submitted that commencing from the Day of coronation of His Majesty as the Fifth Druk Gyalpo, His Majesty worked tirelessly for the welfare of the country and people and due to which, Bhutanese people always enjoyed peace and happiness. The Opposition Leader thanked His Majesty's initiative of Dessung which benefitted the people and community at large.

The Opposition Leader submitted that our monarchs had always provided assistance and morale support in times of disasters and therefore, expressed gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for travelling into every nook and corners to understand people's difficulties and challenges.

Additionally, the Opposition Leader thanked the DNT and its members for forming the government and working hard to fulfill developmental

activities. More importantly, the Opposition Leader stated that it was important for the government to keep the sovereignty, security, and people's happiness in mind while carrying out its functions. The Opposition Leader also reminded the government to consider people's objectives and priorities while implementing the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP for the present and future times.

The Opposition Leader stated that one of the main problems at present was youth unemployment and its challenges faced by youths, leading the youths seek employment abroad. Therefore, the Opposition Leader requested the government to solve the youth unemployment and to come up with measures so that our youths do not have to go abroad to look for jobs. The Opposition Leader also urged the government to consider and give importance issues like alleviating poverty, equal development in regions and increase of non-communicable diseases. Furthermore, the Opposition Leader submitted that opposition was ready to provide full support and assistance in successful completion of 12<sup>th</sup> FYP.

The Opposition Leader also congratulated Shri Narendra Modi and the party for being re-elected for the second term, and stated that the two countries would strive towards further strengthening the bilateral cooperation. The Opposition Leader also thanked Government of India for agreeing to continue the financial support, and expressed similar support to be extended from other countries as well.

The Opposition Leader also stated that till now, Druk Phuensum Tshogpa served Tsa-Wa-Sum with utmost dedication and sincerity and expressed gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for appointing him with ministerial Dakyen which further encouraged

him to serve Tsa-Wa-Sum. The Opposition Leader assured to work under the advice of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, and keeping in mind the provisions of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan.

In conclusion, the Opposition Leader offered his prayers for the long life of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, long life of His Royal Highness the Gyalsey, long lives of the Members of the Royal Family and for the continued prosperity and harmony of the Bhutanese people.

### **32.2 Concluding Address by Speaker**

On behalf of the Members of Parliament, the Speaker welcomed His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo with immense gratitude for gracing the Concluding Ceremony of the Second Session of the Third Parliament of Bhutan.

The Speaker also welcomed senior government officials, foreign dignitaries, and the public who have come to witness the occasion.

The Speaker also congratulated Shri Narendra Modi and the party for being re-elected for the second term and stated that he was hopeful that the leaders of the two countries would strive toward further strengthening the existing ties of bilateral cooperation between the two countries.

With regard to the business of the House, the Speaker informed that Parliament ratified the Air Service Agreement between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of the United Arab Emirates, and accordingly the Agreement has been granted Royal Assent for enforcement. Therefore, he reminded the relevant authorities to enforce the Agreement accordingly.

Similarly, the Speaker informed that the National Assembly of Bhutan has extensively deliberated on the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019, and the Civil and Criminal Procedural Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019, and accordingly forwarded to the National Council of Bhutan. The Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer has been ratified as well. Furthermore, the Mines and Minerals Bill of Bhutan 2019 had been introduced and forwarded to the relevant committee for review. It is also hopeful that the bill would be adopted in the next session of the parliament.

The Speaker also informed the House that for Annual Budget 2019-2020, the Parliament had approved a total budget of Nu.64,826.725 million, out of which recurrent expenditure was Nu.34,652.765 million, and the capital expenditure Nu.30,173.960 million. In line with that, considering the similar problems with the employees under the private sector, the Speaker stated that it was hopeful that the private firms and civil society organizations would also support in increasing the pay for those employees of the private sector as well.

The Speaker also informed that Members of Parliament visited Wangdue Dzong Reconstruction Project and the Punatsangchhu Hydroelectric Projects in between the session time.

Furthermore, the Speaker reported that the Prime Minister has visited Brussels, Belgium, from June 18-19 to participate in the 13th edition of the European Development Days (EDD). The visit has further strengthened the development cooperation between the EU, and the EU has agreed to provide an additional funding of 7.3 million Euros to Bhutan.

With the blessings of the Triple Gem, wise leadership and guidance of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, prayers from the Monastic Body led by His Holiness the Je Khenpo, collective merits of the Bhutanese people, support and cooperation from Members of Parliament, the Speaker expressed deep gratitude for the successful conclusion of the Second Session of the Third Parliament.

In conclusion, the Members of Parliament led by the Speaker offered prayers for the long life of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, Members of the Royal Family, His Holiness the Je Khenpo, and for the continued prosperity and harmony of the Bhutanese people. **Full Address is provided in Annexure 26.**



On 27<sup>th</sup> June, 2019.

(Wangchuk Namgyel)  
**SPEAKER**



**Annexure 1**

**Annexure 1: Inaugural Address by Tshogpon Wangchuk Namgyel at the Opening Ceremony of the Second Session of Third Parliament of Bhutan.**

1. The Second Session of the Third Parliament of Bhutan commences with effect from today on the most auspicious day graced by the presence of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

On behalf of the Parliament, it is my honour to welcome His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo with immense gratitude for gracing the opening ceremony of the Second Session, leaving aside numerous royal engagements for the welfare of the people and the country.

2. I would also like to welcome Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen, Members of the Royal Family, Members of Parliament, representatives from the Monastic Body, foreign dignitaries, senior government officials, and the public who have come to witness the occasion.
3. On March 13, 2019, the United Nations Development Programme presented a Special Award of Recognition to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo to honour His Majesty's wise leadership in advancing human development, well-being and happiness of the people of Bhutan. Therefore, the Parliament would like to express our heartfelt Tashi Delek and deep admiration to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, and for accepting the award.
4. To ensure equitable community development and harmonious living, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo graced the Fifth Royal Flower Exhibition held in Samdrup Jongkhar this year.

This year's flower exhibition was indeed a joyous occasion for the people of Bhutan and the local community to dedicate the event to

**Annexure 1**

commemorate the His Majesty's 39<sup>th</sup> Birth Anniversary, before the presence of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, His Majesty the Fourth Druk Gyalpo, His Royal Highness the Gyalsey, Her Majesty the Gyaltshen, and the Members of the Royal Family. The Parliament is hopeful that the people would have been very blessed and happy, and therefore, would like to express gratitude and deep respect to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

5. Similarly, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo has always shown deep compassion for the people, and granted citizenship to 359 people on 13th March. His Majesty has also granted numerous benevolent support to the victims affected by the natural disasters across the nation. Furthermore, His Majesty has personally been to the site and met with the victims of recent Thimphu-Tsirang bus accident. The bereaved families remain deeply grateful for having received the most compassionate love and support from His Majesty. Therefore, the Parliament would like to offer our deepest respect to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

Likewise, His Majesty has granted undergraduate scholarships to 144 students, who have completed class 12 in various fields of future national human resource requirements. The Parliament would like to express immense gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

6. The Parliament would also like to offer gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for appointing new Chairperson and the Commissioners of the Royal Civil Service Commission.

We are hopeful that the Chairperson and the Commissioners would serve with full dedication and loyalty keeping in mind the wise aspirations of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, provisions of the

**Annexure 1**

Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan, Civil Service Act and seek judicious measures for strengthening the civil servants as well.

7. His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo also has offered prayers and offered a thousand butter lamps, in memory of those who lost their lives in a series of recent bomb attacks in Sri Lanka. Therefore, the Parliament would like to offer our deepest gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.
8. Under His Majesty's profound vision, dynamism and leadership, His Majesty has granted opportunity for Parliamentarians to attend Leadership Program at the Royal Institute for Governance and Strategic Studies, and also granted opportunity to undergo Dessung programme at Tencholing. Hence, the Parliament would like to offer immense gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

Similarly, under the wise guidance and benevolent leadership of His Majesty, the first batch of graduates from Khesar Gyalpo University of Medical Sciences of Bhutan graduated successfully. Therefore, the Parliament offers its deep gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

9. The Parliament also would like to offer our deepest gratitude to His Holiness the Je Khenpo for presiding over numerous religious initiatives for the benefit of the world and the nation, and for presiding over prayers for the victims in Sri Lanka as well.
10. Upon the invitation of Bangladesh, Lyonchen Dr. Lotey Tshering paid a State Visit to Bangladesh and strengthened the existing bilateral ties and cooperation, trade, investment and health services between the two countries. Furthermore, Bangladesh has agreed to send about 23 specialists to Bhutan and has also increased the quota for Bhutanese

**Annexure 1**

students from 10 to 15 every year. Thus, the Parliament would like to thank Lyonchen for the successful outcomes.

11. I would like to inform the people that I have led a group of delegation to the 140<sup>th</sup> Inter Parliamentary Union (IPU) Assembly at Doha, Qatar and attended the General Assembly; and came up with numerous successful parliamentary exchanges. I would like to further inform that Bhutan being the member to the IPU is also preparing to implement the resolutions of the IPU.

12. May I now inform the House that following agendas will be discussed during the Second Session:

The National Assembly will discuss on the following:

1. Mines and Minerals Bill of Bhutan 2019 and adoption of harmonizing and amendment of four bills.
2. Deliberation and Adoption of the Annual Budget (2019-2020);
3. Deliberation on Government's Pay Revision Report;
4. Anti-Corruption Report 2018;
5. Deliberation on Two Priority National Key Result Areas on Health and Education towards achieving Sustainable Development Goals in 12th FYP. Deliberation on SDGs will continue to receive importance in the National Assembly.
6. Deliberation of the Report on the Status of Implementation of Resolutions of the First Session;
7. Conduct Motions and Question Hour Sessions as per the procedures;

13. Likewise, the Joint Sitting of the Parliament will discuss the following:

1. Performance Audit Report of the Royal Audit Authority (RAA);  
and

**Annexure 1**

2. Presentation of Annual Report on the State of the Nation, including Legislative Plans and Annual Plans and Priorities of the Government, by the Prime Minister of Bhutan.

14. Before I end my speech, I would like to reiterate one most significant area. It has been 11 years of parliamentary democracy system of government ever since His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo gifted the responsibility to our people. It has been going on successfully with the blessings of the Triple gem, noble guidance of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and prayers of our beloved people.

However, I feel that we need to continue working hard to fulfill the aspirations of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and hopes of the people. And it is possible as we have experience from the previous two parliaments and if we continue building and adding values. Towards this, I am hopeful that the Members of Parliament would continue serving with full dedication.

15. In conclusion, with the blessings of the Triple Gem, wise leadership and guidance of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and the Members of the Royal Family, prayers from the Monastic Body, collective merits of the Bhutanese people, support and cooperation from Members of Parliament, I would like to offer prayers for the successful conclusion of the Second Session of the Third Parliament.

THANK YOU

**Annexure 2**

**Annexure 2: Voting on the Need to Review and Implement Bhutan National Human- Wildlife Conflict Management Strategy as a National Flagship Program.**

**Not Passed: Yes: 16 Abstain: 1 No: 24 Total present: 41**

1. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
2. Duntsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
3. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
4. Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
5. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
6. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Yes
7. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
8. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
9. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Yes
10. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
11. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung-Udзорong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
12. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	Yes
13. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
14. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
15. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
16. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
17. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Abstain
18. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	No
19. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	No
20. Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	No
21. Loknath Sharma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	No
22. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 2**

23. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	No
24. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	No
25. Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	No
26. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	No
27. Jurmi Wangchuk (Drujeygang-Tseza)	Delegate	No
28. Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	No
29. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	No
30. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	No
31. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	No
32. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	No
33. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	No
34. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	No
35. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	No
36. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	No
37. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	No
38. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	No
39. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	No
40. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	No
41. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 3**

**Annexure 3: Voting on the Motion Regarding the Government to Provide Barbed Wires Fencing Materials on Cost Sharing Model (50:50) on Priority Basis as a Subsidy to all the Affected Rural Households.**

**Passed: Yes: 22 Abstain: 5 No: 15 Total present: 42**

1. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Yes
2. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
3. Dungtsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
4. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
5. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
6. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
7. Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
8. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
9. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Yes
10. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
11. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
12. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Yes
13. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
14. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
15. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung- Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
16. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	Yes
17. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
18. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
19. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
20. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
21. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
22. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
23. Loknath Sharma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Abstain



**Annexure 3**

24. Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Abstain
25. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Abstain
26. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Abstain
27. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Abstain
28. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	No
29. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	No
30. Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	No
31. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	No
32. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	No
33. Jurmi Wangchuk (Drujeygang-Tseza)	Delegate	No
34. Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	No
35. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	No
36. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	No
37. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	No
38. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	No
39. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	No
40. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	No
41. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	No
42. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 4**

**Annexure 4: Voting on the Motion for the Government to review the RSTA Act and refer the relevant section of the Act for Amendment**

**Passed: Yes: 29 Abstain: 1 No: 12 Total present: 42**

1. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
2. Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
3. Duntsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
4. Jurmi Wangchuk (Drujeygang-Tseza)	Delegate	Yes
5. Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
6. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
7. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
8. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
9. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
10. Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
11. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
12. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
13. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Yes
14. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
15. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
16. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Yes
17. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
18. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
19. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
20. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung-Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
21. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	Yes
22. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
23. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
24. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 4**

25. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
26. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
27. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
28. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
29. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
30. Loknath Sharma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Abstain
31. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	No
32. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	No
33. Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	No
34. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	No
35. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	No
36. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	No
37. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	No
38. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	No
39. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	No
40. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	No
41. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	No
42. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 5**

**Annexure 5: Voting on the Review Report by Good Governance Committee (GGC) on the Annual Anti-Corruption Commission Report 2018.**

**Passed: Yes: 40 Abstain: 3 No: 1 Total present: 44**

1. Dr. Lotey Tshering (Prime Minister)	Delegate	Yes
2. Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
3. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
4. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
5. Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
6. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Yes
7. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Yes
8. Jai Bir Rai (Minister for Education)	Delegate	Yes
9. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
10. Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
11. Dungtsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
12. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
13. Jurmi Wangchuk (Drujeygang-Tseza)	Delegate	Yes
14. Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
15. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
16. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
17. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
18. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
19. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
20. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
21. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
22. Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
23. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
24. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 5**

25. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
26. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
27. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Yes
28. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
29. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
30. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
31. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
32. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
33. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	Yes
34. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
35. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
36. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
37. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
38. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
39. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
40. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
41. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Abstain
42. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung-Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Abstain
43. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Abstain
44. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 6**

**Annexure 6: Voting on the Motion to Review All the Existing As Well As New Subordinate Legislations by the Parliament Before it is Implemented by the Agencies**

**Not Passed: Yes: 18 Abstain: 1 No: 25 Total present: 44**

1. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	Yes
2. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
3. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
4. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
5. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	No
6. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	No
7. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	No
8. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
9. Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	No
10. Dr. Lotey Tshering (Prime Minister)	Delegate	No
11. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	No
12. Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	No
13. Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	No
14. Loknath Sharma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	No
15. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	No
16. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	No
17. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	No
18. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
19. Duntsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	No
20. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
21. Jurmi Wangchuk (Drujeygang-Tseza)	Delegate	No
22. Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	No
23. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	No
24. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 6**

25. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	No
26. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	No
27. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
28. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
29. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Abstain
30. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	No
31. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
32. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Yes
33. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
34. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
35. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Yes
36. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	No
37. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	No
38. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	No
39. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
40. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	No
41. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	No
42. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
43. Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
44. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung-Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 7**

**Annexure 7: Voting on the Bhutan Power Corporation or the Relevant Agencies Should Frame Policy, Guidelines, Rules and Regulations on the Transmission Line.**

**Passed: Yes: 35 Abstain: 3 No: 6 Total present: 44**

1. Dr. Lotey Tshering (Prime Minister)	Delegate	Yes
2. Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
3. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
4. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
5. Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Yes
6. Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
7. Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
8. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Yes
9. Jai Bir Rai (Minister for Education)	Delegate	Yes
10. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
11. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
12. Jurmi Wangchuk (Drujeygang-Tseza)	Delegate	Yes
13. Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
14. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
15. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
16. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
17. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
18. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minje)	Delegate	Yes
19. Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
20. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
21. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
22. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
23. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
24. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
25. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes



**Annexure 7**

26. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
27. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
28. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
29. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
30. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
31. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
32. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
33. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
34. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
35. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
36. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Abstain
37. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Abstain
38. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Abstain
39. Duntsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	No
40. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	No
41. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	No
42. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	No
43. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung- Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	No
44. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 8**

**Annexure 8: Voting on the possibility to avoid private registered land in the rural areas, and if inevitable for the need to substitute or compensate land for the ROW.**

**Passed: Yes: 35 Abstain: 3 No: 6 Total present: 44**

1.	Dr. Lotey Tshering (Prime Minister)	Delegate	Yes
2.	Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
3.	Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
4.	Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
5.	Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Yes
6.	Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
7.	Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
8.	Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Yes
9.	Jai Bir Rai (Minister for Education)	Delegate	Yes
10.	Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
11.	Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
12.	Jurmi Wangchuk (Drujeygang-Tseza)	Delegate	Yes
13.	Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
14.	Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
15.	Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
16.	Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
17.	Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
18.	Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minje)	Delegate	Yes
19.	Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
20.	Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
21.	Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
22.	Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
23.	Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
24.	Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 8**

25. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
26. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
27. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
28. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
29. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
30. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
31. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
32. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
33. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
34. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
35. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
36. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Abstain
37. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Abstain
38. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Abstain
39. Duntsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	No
40. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	No
41. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	No
42. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	No
43. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung- Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	No
44. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 9**

**Annexure 9: Voting On The Landscape Beauty Of The Locality Not To Be Compromised By The Construction Of Pylon Tower.**

**Passed: Yes: 33 Abstain: 7 No: 4 Total present: 44**

1.	Dr. Lotey Tshering (Prime Minister)	Delegate	Yes
2.	Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
3.	Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
4.	Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
5.	Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
6.	Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
7.	Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Yes
8.	Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Yes
9.	Jai Bir Rai (Minister for Education)	Delegate	Yes
10.	Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
11.	Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
12.	Jurmi Wangchuk (Drujeygang-Tseza)	Delegate	Yes
13.	Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
14.	Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
15.	Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
16.	Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
17.	Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
18.	Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
19.	Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
20.	Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
21.	Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
22.	Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
23.	Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
24.	Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
25.	Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 9**

26. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
27. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
28. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
29. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
30. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
31. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
32. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
33. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
34. Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Abstain
35. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Abstain
36. Duntsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Abstain
37. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Abstain
38. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Abstain
39. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Abstain
40. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Abstain
41. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	No
42. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung- Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	No
43. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	No
44. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 10**

**Annexure 10: Voting on the Adoption of Third Reading of the Civil and Criminal Procedural Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019**

**Passed: Yes: 43 Abstain: 0 No: 1 Total present: 44**

1.	Dr. Lotey Tshering (Prime Minister)	Delegate	Yes
2.	Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
3.	Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
4.	Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
5.	Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Yes
6.	Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
7.	Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
8.	Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Yes
9.	Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Yes
10.	Jai Bir Rai (Minister for Education)	Delegate	Yes
11.	Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
12.	Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
13.	Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
14.	Dungtsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
15.	Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
16.	Jurmi Wangchuk (Drujeygang-Tseza)	Delegate	Yes
17.	Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
18.	Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
19.	Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
20.	Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
21.	Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
22.	Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
23.	Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
24.	Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
25.	Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 10**

26. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
27. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
28. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
29. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
30. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Yes
31. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
32. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
33. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
34. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
35. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung- Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
36. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	Yes
37. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
38. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
39. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
40. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
41. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
42. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
43. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
44. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 11**

**Annexure 11: Amendment Bill of the Third Reading of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019**

The National Assembly deliberated on the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 on second day of the fourth month of Earth Female Pig year corresponding to 5<sup>th</sup> day of the June, 2019 and adopted on Third Day of the Fourth Month of Earth Female Pig year corresponding to 6<sup>th</sup> day of the June, 2019 as follows:

**Section 6.1 of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan 2001**  
**Impartiality**

~~A Drangpon/Rabjam shall disqualify himself/herself or be disqualified from presiding or dealing with a case where:-~~

- ~~(a) he/she is related to any party to the case;—~~
- ~~(b) circumstances exist which affects or could be construed to affect his/her impartiality; or~~
- ~~(c) his/her act contravenes the Code of Conduct.~~

**Section 6.1 of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan 2001 may be substituted in whole by the following new amendments:**

- (1) A Drangpon may recuse from adjudication of a case on any of the following grounds:**
  - (a) Conflict of interest by cognate, agnate or by matrimonial relation to litigant or litigants; or**
  - (b) By investment or pecuniary interest.**
- (2) A litigant may motion for recusal of a Drangpon from court proceedings on the following grounds:**
  - (a) Litigant is of the knowledge that the Drangpon has a conflict of interest by way of investment, personal or pecuniary interest, or cognate, agnate or by matrimonial relation to a litigant;**



**Annexure 11**

- (b) Litigant with reasonable grounds is of the view that the Drangpon is biased or prejudiced; or**
- (c) Litigant is of the knowledge that the Drangpon's act contravenes the Code of conduct.**

**New sub-section after sub-section 90.3 of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan 2001 as 90.4**

**Besides written deposition by the witness and parties, the court shall maintain electronic record and transcribe the court proceedings.**

**Section 107.1 of Civil and Criminal Procedure Code (Amendment) Act of Bhutan 2011**

**Civil Contempt**

Finding of civil contempt shall result in fine or imprisonment until the civil order has been complied with. However, ~~for the monetary case the person shall be imprisoned for a number of years calculated based on value based sentencing.~~

- (a) For the monetary cases the person shall be imprisoned for a number of years calculated based on value based sentencing.**
- (b) For restitution in criminal cases, the person shall be imprisoned for a number of years calculated based on the minimum wage rate.**

**Section 152 of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan 2001**

**Default Judgment**

The court may pronounce a default judgment **on merits of the case**, if one of the parties: ~~fails to appear at the trial or in his or her answer:~~

- (a) Fails to appear at the trial;**

**Annexure 11**

- (b) Fails to answer;
- (c) Gives an evasive reply; or
- (d) Otherwise fails to follow a Court's order thereby, severely prejudicing the Court's capacity to hear the case.

**Section 153 of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan 2001**

**Withdrawal and Adjustment of Suits**

At any time after the institution of a suit, a plaintiff may, **if agreed by the defendant**, as against all or any of the defendants abandon his/her suit or a part of his/her claim.

**Section 153.1 of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan 2001**

~~The party may be liable for such costs as the Court may award calculated in accordance with the Minimum Wage Rate.~~

**The party withdrawing the case shall be liable to pay costs and compensation as determined by the court.**

**Section 201 of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan 2001**

**Bond amount**

~~The amount of bond shall be fixed at ten to thirty percent of the income of the surety.~~

**The amount of the bond shall be fixed based on the offence for which the accused has been charged or anticipated to be charged.**

**Annexure 11**

**Section 205 of the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan  
2001**

**Motion for new Trials**

~~The prosecution may motion the Courts for new trials based on newly  
discovered evidence or on other grounds.~~

*Repeal*

**New Definition after Section 216.19**

**“Police Officer” includes the forest officer, immigration official,  
custom official and other law enforcement officers who exercise the  
power of a police by virtue of their work nature.**

**Annexure 12**

**Annexure 12: Voting on the Adoption of the Third Reading of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019**

**Passed: Yes: 38 Abstain: 5 No: 1 Total present: 44**

1. Dr. Lotey Tshering (Prime Minister)	Delegate	Yes
2. Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
3. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
4. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
5. Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Yes
6. Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
7. Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
8. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Yes
9. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Yes
10. Jai Bir Rai (Minister for Education)	Delegate	Yes
11. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
12. Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
13. Dungtsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
14. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
15. Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
16. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
17. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
18. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
19. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
20. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
21. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
22. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
23. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
24. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
25. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 12**

26. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
27. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
28. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
29. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
30. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung-Udзорong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
31. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	Yes
32. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
33. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
34. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
35. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
36. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
37. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
38. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
39. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Abstain
40. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Abstain
41. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong Wangchang)	Delegate	Abstain
42. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Abstain
43. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Abstain
44. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 13**

**Annexure 13: Amendment of the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019**

The National Assembly deliberated the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan 2019 on fourth day of the fourth month of Earth Female Pig year corresponding to 7<sup>th</sup> day of the June, 2019 and adopted on 8<sup>th</sup> day of the fourth month of Earth Female Pig year corresponding to 10<sup>th</sup> day of the June, 2019 as follows:

**Section 28 of the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004**

**Thrimthue**

Except for the recidivist and accustomed or habitual offender, the Court may make an order to pay fine in lieu of imprisonment, if the offence is not a felony. **Habitual offender means a person who has been convicted of a crime for more than twice.**

**Section 39 of the Penal Code (Amendment) Act of Bhutan 2011**

**Compensatory damages**

If the Court determines that compensatory damages are appropriate, then a defendant convicted of a crime shall pay appropriate compensatory damages at the rate of the minimum wage at the time of the crime for:

- (a) **Maximum of** ten years to the surviving spouse or next of kin of the victim and the cost for forty-nine days for seven people towards the expenses incurred in the funeral rites of the deceased victim, when the crime has resulted in the death of the victim;
- (b) **Maximum of** ten years, if the crime causes permanent ~~total~~ disability to the victim;
- (c) **Maximum of** seven years, if the crime causes ~~permanent~~ partial disability to the victim;

**Annexure 13**

- (d) **Maximum of five years, if the crime causes temporary total disability to endangers the victim's life or causes serious bodily injury to the victim; or**
- (e) The wage lost to the victim, when the crime has resulted in temporary loss of wage.

**New sub-section after 135 (b) of the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004**

**No Thrimthue shall be payable, if the defendant is convicted of an offence of aiding and abetting that is felony of fourth degree and above.**

**Section 154 of the Penal Code (Amendment) Act of Bhutan 2011**

**Trafficking a person**

A defendant shall be guilty of the offence of trafficking a person if the defendant recruits, transports, sells or buys, harbours or receives a person through the use of threat or force or deception within, into or outside of Bhutan for any illegal purpose or exploitation.

**Section 203 of the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004**

**Child molestation**

A defendant shall be guilty of the offence of child molestation, if the defendant ~~molests a child~~ **commits any of the following acts against a child with or without consent:**

- a) **Touching of private parts;**
- b) **Exposure of genitalia;**
- c) **Inducement of sexual acts with the defendant or with other children; or Conduct of any other sexual acts.**

**Annexure 13**

**Section 204 of the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004**

**Grading of Child molestation**

The offence of child molestation shall be:

- a) Felony of the fourth degree; **and**
- b) Pay compensatory damages as determined by the Court.**

**Section 213 of the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004**

**~~Unnatural Sex~~**

~~A defendant shall be guilty of the offence of unnatural sex, if the defendant engages in sodomy or any other sexual conduct that is against the order of nature. (Repealed)~~

**Section 214 of the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004**

**~~Grading of Unnatural sex~~**

~~The offence of unnatural sex shall be a petty misdemeanour. (Repealed)~~

**Section 215 of the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004**

**Abandonment of an infant or a child**

A defendant shall be guilty of the offence of abandonment of an infant or a child, if a defendant is a parent, guardian, or other person legally charged with the care or custody of an infant or a child and the defendant leaves the infant or child in any place **negligently or** with the intent to abandon the infant or child.

**Section 412 of the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004**

**Entrapment**

A defendant shall be guilty of the offence of entrapment, if the defendant being a law enforcement official or a person acting in cooperation with law enforcement officials or any other person for the purpose of obtaining evidence of the commission of an offence induces or encourages another



**Annexure 13**

person to commit a crime by making a false representation designed to induce the belief that the conduct is not prohibited by law.

**Title of the Section 476 of the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004**

**~~Computer~~Electronic Pornography**

**New sub-section after section 476 (b) of the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004 as Section 476(c)**

**Records an obscene video without the consent of the person video is being taken.**

**Section 492 of the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004**

**~~Illegal hunting or fishing~~**

~~A defendant shall be guilty of the offence of illegal hunting or fishing if the defendant kills, injures, destroys, captures, collects or otherwise takes any wild animals or fishes except in accordance with law. (Repealed)~~

**Section 493 of the Penal Code of Bhutan 2004**

**~~Grading of Illegal Hunting or fishing~~**

~~The offence of Illegal hunting or fishing shall be a petty misdemeanour. (Repealed)~~

**Annexure 14**

**Annexure 14: Voting on the Motion for the Adoption of the Pay Revision Bill 2019**

**Passed: Yes: 37 Abstain: 5 No: 2 Total present: 44**

1.	Dr. Lotey Tshering (Prime Minister)	Delegate	Yes
2.	Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
3.	Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
4.	Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
5.	Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Yes
6.	Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
7.	Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
8.	Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Yes
9.	Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Yes
10.	Jai Bir Rai (Minister for Education)	Delegate	Yes
11.	Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
12.	Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
13.	Dungtsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
14.	Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
15.	Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
16.	Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
17.	Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
18.	Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
19.	Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
20.	Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
21.	Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
22.	Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
23.	Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Yes
24.	Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
25.	Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 14**

26. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Yes
27. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
28. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
29. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
30. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
31. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung- Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
32. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	Yes
33. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
34. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
35. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
36. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
37. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
38. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
39. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
40. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
41. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
42. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
43. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	No
44. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 15**

**Annexure 15: Voting on the Motion to increase the Stipend of the Students of the Colleges under the Royal University of Bhutan**

**Passed: Yes: 24 Abstain: 11 No: 5 Total present: 40**

1. Jai Bir Rai (Minister for Education)	Delegate	Yes
2. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
3. Duntsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
4. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
5. Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
6. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
7. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
8. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
9. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
10. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
11. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
12. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
13. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
14. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
15. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Yes
16. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
17. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
18. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
19. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
20. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung-Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
21. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	Yes
22. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
23. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
24. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 15**

25. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen(Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Abstain
26. Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Abstain
27. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Abstain
28. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Abstain
29. Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Abstain
30. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong Wangchang)	Delegate	Abstain
31. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Abstain
32. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Abstain
33. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Abstain
34. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Abstain
35. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Abstain
36. Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	No
37. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	No
38. Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	No
39. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	No
40. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 16**

**Annexure 16: Voting on the Motion for the adoption of Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2019-2020**

**Passed: Yes: 43 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 43**

1.	Dr. Lotey Tshering (Prime Minister)	Delegate	Yes
2.	Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
3.	Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
4.	Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
5.	Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Yes
6.	Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
7.	Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
8.	Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Yes
9.	Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Yes
10.	Jai Bir Rai (Minister for Education)	Delegate	Yes
11.	Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
12.	Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
13.	Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
14.	Dungtsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
15.	Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
16.	Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
17.	Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
18.	Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
19.	Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
20.	Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
21.	Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
22.	Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
23.	Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
24.	Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
25.	Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 16**

26. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Yes
27. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
28. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
29. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
30. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
31. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
32. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
33. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
34. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung- Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
35. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	Yes
36. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
37. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
38. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
39. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
40. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
41. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
42. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
43. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 17**

**Annexure 17: Voting on the Adoption of the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2018-2019**

**Passed: Yes: 43 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 43**

1. Dr. Lotey Tshering (Prime Minister)	Delegate	Yes
2. Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
3. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
4. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
5. Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Yes
6. Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
7. Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
8. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Yes
9. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Yes
10. Jai Bir Rai (Minister for Education)	Delegate	Yes
11. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
12. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
13. Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
14. Dungtsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
15. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
16. Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
17. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
18. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
19. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
20. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
21. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
22. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
23. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
24. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
25. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes



**Annexure 17**

26. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Yes
27. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
28. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
29. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
30. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
31. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
32. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
33. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
34. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung-Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
35. Karma Thinley (Wamrong)	Delegate	Yes
36. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
37. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
38. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
39. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
40. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
41. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
42. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
43. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 18**

**Annexure 18: Voting on the Need of separate health facilities ‘to disabled people and include the Program in Health Policy**

**Passed: Yes: 35 Abstain: 6 No: 0 Total present: 43**

1. Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
2. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
3. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
4. Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Yes
5. Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
6. Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
7. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
8. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
9. Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
10. Dungtsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
11. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
12. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
13. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
14. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
15. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
16. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
17. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
18. Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
19. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
20. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
21. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
22. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
23. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
24. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
25. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 18**

26. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
27. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
28. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
29. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
30. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
31. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
32. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
33. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
34. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
35. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
36. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Abstain
37. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Abstain
38. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Abstain
39. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Abstain
40. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Abstain
41. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung- Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Abstain

**Annexure 19**

**Annexure 19: Voting on the Need to Create Separate Employment Opportunities to Disabled People Who Suffered Body Growth and Include the Program in Employment Policy**

**Passed: Yes: 29 Abstain: 10 No: 2 Total present: 41**

1. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
2. Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
3. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
4. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
5. Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
6. Duntsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
7. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
8. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
9. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
10. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
11. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
12. Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
13. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
14. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
15. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
16. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
17. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Abstain
18. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
19. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
20. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
21. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
22. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
23. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
24. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 19**

25. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
26. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
27. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
28. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
29. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
30. Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Abstain
31. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Abstain
32. Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Abstain
33. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Abstain
34. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Abstain
35. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Abstain
36. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Abstain
37. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Abstain
38. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Abstain
39. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung-Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Abstain
40. Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	No
41. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 20**

**Annexure 20: Voting on the Need for the Government to formulate a comprehensive policy on disabled person and report to the House in winter session.**

**Passed: Yes: 29 Abstain: 10 No: 2 Total present: 41**

1. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
2. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
3. Dungtsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
4. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
5. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
6. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
7. Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
8. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
9. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
10. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Yes
11. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
12. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
13. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
14. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
15. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
16. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
17. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung-Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
18. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
19. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
20. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
21. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
22. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Abstain
23. Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Abstain

**Annexure 20**

24. Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Abstain
25. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Abstain
26. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Abstain
27. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Abstain
28. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Abstain
29. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Abstain
30. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Abstain
31. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Abstain
32. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Abstain
33. Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	No
34. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	No
35. Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	No
36. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	No
37. Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	No
38. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	No
39. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	No
40. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	No
41. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 21**

**Annexure 21: Voting on the Need for the Government to change the policy to encourage the use of clean energy such as electricity and waive off or reduce the existing 20% tax on electric ovens and 5 % tax on related electric appliances in order to encourage the use of electric ovens**

**Passed: Yes: 34 Abstain: 3 No: 5 Total present: 42**

1.	Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
2.	Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
3.	Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
4.	Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Yes
5.	Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
6.	Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
7.	Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Yes
8.	Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
9.	Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
10.	Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
11.	Dungtsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
12.	Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
13.	Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha- Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
14.	Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
15.	Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
16.	Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
17.	Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
18.	Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
19.	Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
20.	Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
21.	Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
22.	Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Yes
23.	Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes



**Annexure 21**

24. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
25. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
26. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
27. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung-Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
28. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
29. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
30. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
31. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
32. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
33. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
34. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
35. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Abstain
36. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Abstain
37. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Abstain
38. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	No
39. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minje)	Delegate	No
40. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	No
41. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	No
42. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 22**

**Annexure 22: Voting on the Need for the Government should improve the subsidized electricity in rural areas**

**Passed: Yes: 36 Abstain: 2 No: 4 Total present: 42**

1. Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
2. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
3. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
4. Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Yes
5. Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
6. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Yes
7. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Yes
8. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
9. Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
10. Dungtsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
11. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
12. Hemant Gurung (Lhamoidzingkha- Tashiding)	Delegate	Yes
13. Yeshey Dem (Khamed-Lunana)	Delegate	Yes
14. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
15. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
16. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
17. Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
18. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
19. Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
20. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
21. Tshering Chhoden (Khar-Yurung)	Delegate	Yes
22. Lungten Namgyel (Nanong-Shumar)	Delegate	Yes
23. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
24. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
25. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 22**

26. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
27. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
28. Dr. Passang Dorji (Bartsham-Shongphu)	Delegate	Yes
29. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung-Udzorong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
30. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
31. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
32. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
33. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
34. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
35. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
36. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
37. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Abstain
38. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Abstain
39. Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	No
40. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	No
41. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	No
42. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	No

**Annexure 23**

**Annexure 23: Royal Kasho Granted for Joint Sitting**

The Royal Assent is hereby granted on the submission for the Deliberation on the Royal Audit Authority's Performance Audit Review Reports as reported by the Public Accounts Committee on June 21 and 24, 2019; and also on the Presentation of Annual Report on the State of the Nation, including Legislative Plans and Annual Plans and Priorities of the Government by the Prime Minister of Bhutan June 25, 2019 in the Joint Sitting of the Parliament during the Second Session of the Third Parliament of Bhutan.

**On 8th Day of the 4th Month of the Earth Female Pig Year.**

DRUK GYALPO

**Annexure 24**

**Annexure 24: Voting on the Recommendations on the Performance Audit Reports by the Public Accounts Committee (PAC).**

**Passed: Yes: 58 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 58**

1.	Dr. Lotey Tshering (Prime Minister)	Delegate	Yes
2.	Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
3.	Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
4.	Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
5.	Karma Donnen Wangdi (Minister for MoIC)	Delegate	Yes
6.	Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
7.	Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
8.	Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Yes
9.	Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Yes
10.	Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
11.	Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
12.	Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
13.	Dungtsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
14.	Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
15.	Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
16.	Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
17.	Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
18.	Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
19.	Choki Gyeltshen (Maenbi-Tsenkhar)	Delegate	Yes
20.	Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
21.	Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
22.	Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
23.	Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
24.	Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
25.	Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 24**

26. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
27. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
28. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes
29. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
30. Dr. Samdrup R Wangchuk (Kanglung-Udзорong-Samkhar)	Delegate	Yes
31. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
32. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
33. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
34. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
35. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
36. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
37. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
38. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes
39. Tashi Dorji (Chairperson, NC)	Delegate	Yes
40. Tashi Wangmo (Eminent Member, NC)	Delegate	Yes
41. Karma Tshering (Eminent Member, NC)	Delegate	Yes
42. Kesang Chuki Dorji (Eminent Member, NC)	Delegate	Yes
43. Phuntsho Raptan (Eminent Member, NC)	Delegate	Yes
44. Nima (NC Member, Bumthang Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
45. Sangay Dorji (NC Member, Chhukha Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
46. Surja Man Thapa (NC Member, Dagana Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
47. Ugyen Namgyel (NC Member, Haa Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
48. Tempa Dorji (NC Member, Lhuentse Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
49. Ugyen Tshering (NC Member Paro Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 24**

50. Choney Dorji(NC Member, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
51. Lhaki Dolma (NC Member, Punakha Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
52. Tirtha Man Thapa (NC Member, Samtse Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
53. Anand Rai (NC Member, Sarpang Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
54. Tshewang Rinzin (NC Member, Thimphu Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
55. Lhatu (NC Member Tashigang, Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
56. Karma Gyeltshen (NC Member, Tashiyangtse Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
57. Tashi Samdrup (NC Member, Trongsa Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes
58. Dhan Kumar Sunwar (NC Member, Tsirang Dzongkhag)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 25**

**Annexure 25: Voting on the Adoption of the Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer**

**Passed: Yes: 34 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 34**

1. Dr. Tandi Dorji (Minister for MoFA)	Delegate	Yes
2. Dasho Sherab Gyeltshen (Minister for MoHCA)	Delegate	Yes
3. Yeshey Penjor (Minister for MoAF)	Delegate	Yes
4. Dechen Wangmo (Minister for MoH)	Delegate	Yes
5. Loknath Sahrma (Minister for MoEA)	Delegate	Yes
6. Namgay Tshering (Minister for MoF)	Delegate	Yes
7. Ugyen Dorji (Minister for MoLHR)	Delegate	Yes
8. Dorji Tshering (Minister for MoWHS)	Delegate	Yes
9. Dr. Pema Gyamtsho (Opposition Leader)	Delegate	Yes
10. Tshencho Wangdi (Deputy Speaker)	Delegate	Yes
11. Duntsho Karma Wangchuk (Chumig-Ura)	Delegate	Yes
12. Tshewang Lhamo (Bongo- Chapcha)	Delegate	Yes
13. Tenzin (Khatoed-Laya)	Delegate	Yes
14. Ugyen Tenzin (Bji-Kartsho-Uesu)	Delegate	Yes
15. Dorjee Wangmo (Sombaykha)	Delegate	Yes
16. Kuenga Penjor (Gangzur Minjey)	Delegate	Yes
17. Ugyen Wangdi (Dramedtse-Ngatshang)	Delegate	Yes
18. Rinzin Jamtsho (Kengkhar-Werringla)	Delegate	Yes
19. Ugyen Tshering (Lamgong-Wangchang)	Delegate	Yes
20. Choida Jamtsho (Nganglam)	Delegate	Yes
21. Ugyen Dorji (Dewathang-Gomdar)	Delegate	Yes
22. Norbu Wangzom (Jomotshangkha- Martshala)	Delegate	Yes
23. Ganesh Ghimerey (Phuntshopelri-Samtse)	Delegate	Yes
24. Dil Maya Rai (Tashichhoeling)	Delegate	Yes
25. Dinesh Kumar Pradhan (Ugyentse-Yoeseltse)	Delegate	Yes



**Annexure 25**

26. Tek Bahadur Rai (Shompangkha)	Delegate	Yes
27. Dupthob (Bumdeling- Jamkhar)	Delegate	Yes
28. Kuenga Loday (Khamdang-Ramjar)	Delegate	Yes
29. Gyem Dorji (Dragteng-Langthil)	Delegate	Yes
30. Bimal Thapa (Khilkhorthang-Mendrelgang)	Delegate	Yes
31. Garja Man Rai (Sergithang-Tsirangtoe)	Delegate	Yes
32. Kinley Wangchuk (Athang-Thedtsho)	Delegate	Yes
33. Gyembo Tshering (Bardo-Trong)	Delegate	Yes
34. Dorji Wangdi (Panbang)	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 26**

**Annexure 26: Concluding Address of Tshogpon Wangchuk Namgyel at the Closing Ceremony of the Second Session of the Third Parliament**

1. On behalf of the Members of Parliament, it is my honour to welcome His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo with immense gratitude for gracing the Concluding Ceremony of the Second Session of the Third Parliament of Bhutan.
2. I would also like to welcome Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen, Members of the Royal Family, senior government officials, foreign dignitaries, and the public who have come to witness the occasion.
3. From the summit of the Golden Throne, may I take the opportunity to inform that in the recent Lok Sabha election, Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP) has been elected as the new government. Furthermore, Shri Narendra Modi has been reelected as the Prime Minister of India for the second term. Therefore, the Parliament would like to congratulate Shri Narendra Modi and his party. We are hopeful that the leaders of the two countries will strive toward further strengthening the existing ties of bilateral cooperation between the two countries.
4. If I may now inform the public regarding the proceedings of the House:
  - 4.1 During the First Session of the Third Parliament, we ratified the Air Service Agreement between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of the United Arab Emirates, and accordingly the Agreement has been granted Royal Assent for enforcement. It is therefore imperative that the relevant authority enforce the Agreement accordingly.

**Annexure 26**

- 4.2 Similarly, the National Assembly of Bhutan has extensively deliberated on the Penal Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan, and the Civil and Criminal Procedural Code (Amendment) Bill of Bhutan, and accordingly forwarded to the National Council of Bhutan. The Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer has been ratified as well. Furthermore, the Mines and Minerals Bill of Bhutan has been introduced and forwarded to the relevant committee for review. It is also hopeful that the bill would be adopted in the next session of the parliament.
- 4.3 During the deliberation on the Annual Budget 2019-2020, the Parliament had approved a total budget of Nu.64,826.725 million, out of which recurrent expenditure is Nu.34,652.765 million, and the capital expenditure Nu.30,173.960 million. The Parliament had also allocated 50% of the budget to the central government and 50% of the budget to the local government. Hence, it is imperative that the ministries, agencies and the local government to implement the planned activities to the benefit of the nation and the people. We are also hopeful that the civil service leaders will work in accordance with the laws of the country to prevent any corruption and vice practices during the implementation of the planned activities.
5. Moreover, in addition to the approved budget of Nu.47,698.129 million for the FY 2018-19, an additional Supplementary Budget of Nu.1,627.410 million was also passed by Parliament, and thus a revised budget of Nu.49,325.539 million has been adopted as per the Supplementary Budget Appropriation Bill.
6. For the benefit of civil servants, public servants and people serving under the local government, the Government submitted a pay revision

**Annexure 26**

bill of Nu.4,530 million. The Parliament deliberated and approved an increase in pay and allowances, and it is therefore imperative that civil servants, public servants and people under the local government to be mindful, responsible and accountable always, and serve with full dedication and loyalty to the Tsa-Wa-Sum.

In line with that, considering the similar problems with the employees under the private sector, we are hopeful that the private firms and civil society organizations would also support in increasing the pay for those employees of the private sector as well.

7. The National Assembly also deliberated on Achieving the Vision of Sustainable Development Goals in the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP with priorities set on Health and Education as submitted by the Social and Cultural Committee. It is optimistic that the Government would comply and implement the recommendations accordingly as per the international standard.
8. The Public Accounts Committee while reviewing the findings of the Performance Audits of the Royal Audit Authority found that the relevant agencies have effectively implemented the observations and produced fruitful results. Such fruitful outcomes were possible due to effective auditors, and fruitful services by the agencies and ministries, and holistic review by the Public Accounts Committee. For that, the Parliament would like to extend appreciation to all.
9. As per the Anti-Corruption Report 2018, it was reported that Bhutan has been ranked the 25<sup>th</sup> least corrupt nation out of 180 countries, according to Transparency International's 2018 Corruption Perception Index (TI-CPI). Bhutan ranked 6th in the Asia-Pacific Region and one among the cleanest country in the SAARC region.

**Annexure 26**

10. The Prime Minister presented the first Annual Report on the State of the Nation, including the Legislative Plans and Annual Plans and Priorities of the Government to the Joint Sitting of the Parliament.
11. If I am to report to the gathering here, I have led the Members of Parliament to Wangdue Dzong Reconstruction Project and the Punatsangchhu Hydroelectric Projects from 14-15 June, 2019. During the visit to Wangdue Dzong Reconstruction Project, it was found that the estimated cost of project in 2014 was Nu.1,323,828 million and the project is expected to be completed by 2022.

Regarding Punatsangchhu Hydroelectric Project-I, the estimated cost of project in 2008 was Nu.35.148 billion and it was expected to be completed by 2016. However, due to the landslides, the dam construction was delayed. With additional revised budget of Nu.93.756 billion, the project is expected to be completed by 2023-24, and about 85 % of the project has been completed as of today. On Punatsangchhu Hydroelectric Project-II, the estimated cost of project in 2010 was Nu.37.778 billion and it was expected to be completed by 2017. However, due to collapse of wall in the powerhouse, the walls had to be rebuilt. With additional revised budget of Nu.72.906 billion, the project is expected to be completed by 2022, and the status of completion of project is 83 % as of today.

12. Prime Minister visited Brussels, Belgium, from June 18-19 to participate in the 13th edition of the European Development Days (EDD). The visit further strengthened the development cooperation between the EU and Bhutan. During the visit, the EU approved an additional funding of 7.3 million Euro to Bhutan for the establishment of the National Training Centre for Search and Rescue and the Water

**Annexure 26**

Flagship Programme. The EU also assured its continued support to Bhutan through the next EU Multi-annual Indicative Programme 2021-2027. Since all these fruitful outcomes have been possible due to Lyonchen's strategic capability, the Legislative Body would like to thank Lyonchen for making a successful visit.

13. With the blessings of the Triple Gem, wise leadership and guidance of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, prayers from the Monastic Body led by His Holiness the Je Khenpo, collective merits of the Bhutanese people, support and cooperation from Members of Parliament, I would like to express deep gratitude for the successful conclusion of the Second Session of the Third Parliament.
14. In conclusion, we would like to offer prayers for the long life of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, Members of the Royal Family, His Holiness the Je Khenpo, and for the continued prosperity and harmony of the Bhutanese people.

THANK YOU

**Annexure 27**

**Annexure 27: List of Members present during the Second Session of the Third Parliament**

1. Hon'ble Speaker Wangchuk Namgyel, Nyishog- Saephu constituency, Wangdiphodrang Dzongkhag
2. Hon'ble Prime Minister, Lotay Tshering, South Thimphu constituency, Thimphu
3. Hon'ble Leader of the Opposition Dr. Pema Gyamtsho, Chhoeckhor-Tang constituency, Bumthang Dzongkhag
4. Hon'ble Minister for Home & Cultural Affairs, Lyonpo Sherb Gyeltshen, Monggar Constituency, Monggar Dzongkhag
5. Hon'ble Minister for Agriculture and Forests, Lyonpo Yeshey Penjor, Nubi-Tangsibji constituency, Trongsa Dzongkhag
6. Hon'ble Minister for MoFA Lyonpo Tandi Dorji, Lingmukha-Toedwang Constituency, Punakha Dzongkhag
7. Hon'ble Minister for Information and Communication, Lyonpo Karma Donnen Wangdi, Gelegphu Constituency, Sarpang Dzongkhag
8. Hon'ble Minister for Economic Affairs Lyonpo Loknath Sharma, Dophuchen- Tading Constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
9. Hon'ble Minister for Education, Lyonpo Jai Bir Rai, Phuentsholing Constituency, Chukha Dzongkhag
10. Hon'ble Minister for MoH, Lyonpo Dechen Wangmo, North Thimphu Constituency, Thimphu Dzongkhag
11. Hon'ble Minister for Works and Human Settlement, Lyonpo Dorji Tshering, Radhi- Saketeng Constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag
12. Hon'ble Minister for MoF, Lyonpo Namgay Tshering, Dokar- Sharpa Constituency, Paro Dzongkhag
13. Hon'ble Minister for Labour and Human Resources, Lyonpo Ugyen Dorji, Thrimshing Constituency, Tashigang Dzongkhag
14. Hon'ble Deputy Speaker Tshencho Wangdi, Kabisa-Talog Constituency, Punakha Dzongkhag
15. Hon'ble Member Bimal Thapa, Kilkhorthang-Mendrelgang constituency, Tsirang Dzongkhag

**Annexure 27**

16. Hon'ble Member Choida Jamtsho, Nganglam constituency, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag
17. Hon'ble Member Choki Gyeltsehn, Maenbi-Tsenkhar constituency, Lhuentse Dzongkhag
18. Hon'ble Member Dil Maya Rai, Tashichhoeling constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
19. Hon'ble Member Dinesh Kumar Pradhan, Ugyentse-Yoeseltse constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
20. Hon'ble Member Dorjee Wangmo, Sombaykha constituency, Haa Dzongkhag
21. Hon'ble Member Dorji Wangdi, Panbang constituency, Zhemgang Dzongkhag
22. Hon'ble Member Dupthob, Boomdeling-Jamkhar constituency, Trashiyangtse Dzongkhag
23. Hon'ble Member Ganesh Ghimiray, Phuentshopelri constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
24. Hon'ble Member Garja Man Rai, Sergithang-Tsirang Toed constituency, Tsirang Dzongkhag
25. Hon'ble Member Gyambo Tshering, Bardo-Trong constituency, Zhemgang Dzongkhag
26. Hon'ble Member Gyem Dorji, Dragteng-Langthil constituency, Trongsa Dzongkhag
27. Hon'ble Member Hemant Gurung, Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding constituency, Dagana Dzongkhag
28. Hon'ble Member Jurmi Wangchuk, Drukjeygang-Tseza constituency, Dagana Dzongkhag
29. Hon'ble Member Karma Thinley, Wamrong constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag
30. Hon'ble Member Karma Wangchuk, Chhumig-Ura constituency, Bumthang Dzongkhag
31. Hon'ble Member Kinga Penjor, Gangzur-Minjey constituency, Lhuentse Dzongkhag



**Annexure 27**

32. Hon'ble Member Kinley Wangchuk, Athang-Thedtsho Constituency, Wangdiphodrang Dzongkhag
33. Hon'ble Member Kuenga Loday, Khamdang-Ramjar constituency, Trashiyangtse Dzongkhag
34. Hon'ble Member Lungten Namgyel, Nanong-Shumar constituency, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag
35. Hon'ble Member Norbu Wangzom, Jomotshangkha-Martshala constituency, Samdrup Jongkhar Dzongkhag
36. Hon'ble Member Passang Dorji, Bartsham-Shongphu constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag
37. Hon'ble Member Rinzin Jamtsho, Kengkhar-Weringla constituency, Mongar Dzongkhag
38. Hon'ble Member Samdrup R Wangchuk, Kanglung-Udzorong-Shompangkha constituency, Tashigang Dzongkhag
39. Hon'ble Member Tek Bahadur Rai, Shompangkha constituency, Sarpang Dzongkhag
40. Hon'ble Member Tenzin, Khatoed-Laya constituency, Gasa Dzongkhag
41. Hon'ble Member Tshering Chhoden, Khar-Yurung constituency, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag
42. Hon'ble Tshewang Lhamo, Bongo- Chhapcha, constituency, Chhukha Dzongkhag
43. Hon'ble Ugen Tenzin, Bji-Kar-Tshog-Uesu constituency, Haa Dzongkhag
44. Hon'ble Member Ugyen Dorji, Dewathang Gomdar constituency, Samdrup Jongkhar Dzongkhag
45. Hon'ble Member Ugyen Tshering, Lamgong-Wangchang constituency, Paro Dzongkhag
46. Hon'ble Member Ugyen Wangdi, Dramedtse-Ngatshang constituency, Mongar
47. Hon'ble Member Yeshey Dem, Khamaed-Lunana constituency, Gasa Dzongkhag