

**THIRD PARLIAMENT OF BHUTAN  
FIRST SESSION**



Resolution No. 01

**PROCEEDINGS AND RESOLUTION OF  
THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF  
BHUTAN**

(January 2 - 24, 2019)

Speaker: Wangchuk Namgyel



## **Table of Content**

1. Opening Ceremony.....	1
2. Question Hour: Group A- Questions to the Prime Minister, Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs, and Ministry of Information and Communication.....	3
3. Endorsement of Committees and appointment of Committee Members.....	5
4. Report on the National Budget for the FY 2018-19.....	5
5. Report on the 12 <sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan.....	14
6. Question Hour: Group B- Questions to the Ministry of Works and Human Settlement, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Agriculture and Forests.....	21
7. Resolutions of the Deliberation on 12 <sup>th</sup> Plan Report.....	21
8. Resolutions of the Local Government Petitions.....	28
9. Question Hour: Group C: Questions to the Ministry of Economic Affairs, Ministry of Finance, and Ministry of Labour and Human Resources.....	33
10. Resolutions on the Review Report by Economic and Finance Committee on the Budget of Financial Year 2018-2019.....	36
11. Question Hour: Group D: Questions to the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Health.....	43
12. Resolution on Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that deplete the Ozone Layer.....	45
13. Resolution of the Motion to move the community centres under Gewog Administration.....	47

14. Motion to retain the post of Gaydrungs under Gewog Administration.....	51
15. Resolutions of the Air Service Agreement between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of the United Arab Emirates.....	53
16. Question Hour: Group A: Questions to the Prime Minister, Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs, and Ministry of Information and Communications.....	56
17. Resolution on Motion to institute special and targeted measures to promote tourism for balanced regional development.....	58
18. Resolution on Report of Public Accounts Committee on review of Financial Audits.....	63
19. Resolution of re-deliberation on 2018-19 Budget and Budget Appropriation Bill.....	70
20. Rectification of Resolution.....	73
21. Concluding Ceremony.....	73

## **Annexure**

<b>Annexure 1:</b> Inaugural Address by Tshogpon at the Opening Ceremony of the First Session of Third Parliament of Bhutan.....	76
<b>Annexure 2:</b> Formation of Standing Committees of National Assembly, appointment of Members and its Terms of Reference.....	81
<b>Annexure 3:</b> Procedures for Calling Parliamentary Committee Meetings.....	96
<b>Annexure 4:</b> Economic and Finance Committee's Review Report on National Budget for Financial Year 2018-19.....	98
<b>Annexure 5:</b> Voting result on Budget for the FY 2018-19 and Budget Appropriation Bill 2018-19.....	105
<b>Annexure 6:</b> Voting result on the Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete Ozone Layer.....	107
<b>Annexure 7:</b> Voting result for the Motion on the Community Centres to be brought under Gewog Administration.....	109
<b>Annexure 8:</b> Voting result on the Motion to Retain the Posts of Gaydrung.....	111
<b>Annexure 9:</b> Voting result on the Motion to recruit Gaydrungs under the Royal Civil Service Commission.....	113
<b>Annexure 10:</b> Voting result on the Air Service Agreement between the Royal Government of Bhutan and Government of United Arab Emirates.....	115
<b>Annexure 11:</b> Voting result on the Motion to Establish Flight Service from Gawahati to Yonphula, Bumthang, and Gelephu.....	117
<b>Annexure 12:</b> Voting result on the Motion to promote tourism for Regional Development (East, Central and South regions).....	119

**Annexure 13:** Royal Kasho.....121

**Annexure 14:** Voting result on the Recommendation submitted  
by the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) on the Annual  
Audit Report 2017.....122

**Annexure 15:** Address by Tshogpon at the Closing Ceremony  
of the First Session of Third Parliament.....125

**Annexure 16:** List of Members present during the First Session  
of the Third Parliament.....128

**Annexure 17:** Addendum - Proceedings and the Resolutions of  
the First Sitting of the Third Parliament of Bhutan.....131

## **Resolution and Proceedings of the 1<sup>st</sup> Session of the Third Parliament**

### **1. Opening Ceremony**

The First Session of the Third Parliament of Bhutan commenced on the auspicious 27<sup>th</sup> Day of the 11<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to 2<sup>nd</sup> January, 2019. His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo was received in an elaborate Serdrang and Chibdrel Ceremony by the Speaker and the Members of the Parliament followed by Zhugdrel-Phunsum Tshog-Pai Ten-Drel ceremony.

#### **1.1 Opening Address by the Speaker**

The Speaker welcomed and expressed gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for gracing the Opening Ceremony of the First Session. The Speaker also welcomed Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen, Members of the Royal Family, representatives from the Monastic Bodies, senior government officials, foreign dignitaries and the public who have come to witness the occasion.

The Speaker on behalf of the third Parliament offered gratitude to the second Parliament's; Government for the achievements of the 11<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan, the presiding officers of the Houses for the successful conduct of proceedings, and to the Opposition party for shouldering great responsibilities and accountability with utmost dedication.

The Speaker expressed that the people of Bhutan has entrusted Druk Nyamrup Tshogpa (DNT) with the huge responsibility to form the government, and reminded that it is imperative for the government to fulfill its vision through eradication rural poverty, minimizing youth unemployment, solving public debt, combating corruption, and ensuring equal development for the beneficial of the people.

The Speaker reported that His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo has resonated most profound words of wisdom during the 111<sup>th</sup> National Day, and the civil servants and public servants would forever keep those profound words of wisdom and serve with full dedication. It was also reminded that Bhutanese people should always keep in mind the sacrifices that our successive monarchs have made for the country and the people.

The Speaker informed that Prime Minister Dr. Lotay Tshering had recently made a maiden state visit to India, which further strengthened the existing close ties of friendship and cooperation between the two countries. Therefore, the Speaker on behalf of the Parliament thanked Prime Minister for his most successful visit.

The Speaker expressed gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for personally meeting with the people of remote communities, and granting kidu graciously to our people in needs. The Parliament further expressed gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for having conferred the Highest Civilian Decoration in the country- the Order of The Druk Gyalpo (Ngadag Pelgi Khorlo) to His Holiness the 70<sup>th</sup> Je Khenpo.

The Speaker submitted that under the patronage of His Holiness the Je Khenpo, Zhung Dratshangs, Rabdeys, Goendeys and Religious Institutions has performed numerous initiatives for sustaining peace and harmony in the country. Thus, the Parliament expressed gratitude to His Holiness the Je Khenpo. With the blessings of the Triple Gem, Mighty Grace of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and the Members of the Royal Family, collective merits of the people of Bhutan, the Speaker offered prayers for the successful conclusion of the First



Session of Third Parliament, and concluded the Opening Ceremony.  
**(Full Address is provided in Annexure 1)**

**2. Question Hour: Group A- Questions to the Prime Minister, Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs, and Ministry of Information and Communication.**

The Speaker informed the House that, there were six questions for oral responses. The Speaker also informed that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be given only after all the oral questions had been answered by respective ministries. In accordance with the Section 88 of the National Assembly Rules of Procedure 2014, the Speaker commenced the Question Hour Session.

- 2.1 The Member from Panbang Constituency stated that as the country starts with another cycle of Five Year Plan, it was extremely important to get the plan priorities correct. Therefore, the Member questioned the Prime Minister to inform the nation on the seven top priorities of the new Ruling Party in the 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan.
- 2.2 The Member from Drametse- Ngatshang Constituency reported that Mongar Dzong was about sixty years old, and needed immediate renovation, especially for the safety of resident lams and monks. However, it was reported that the government has declared not to construct any government office buildings and structures in the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP. The Member questioned the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs to clarify whether the Mongar Dzong would be left without renovation in the current plan.
- 2.3 The Member from Bomdeling-Jamkhar Constituency reported that there were lots of confusion and concerns among the general public regarding digitization of television, i.e., switching from Analog

to Digital system, and consumers being affected by the sudden change. The Member questioned the Minister for Information and Communication to explain the policies and regulations, and the way forward on that issue.

2.4 The Member from Dewathang-Gomdar Constituency informed that about 700 of youths studying and working in Japan reportedly were going through several problems which resulted for some youths to return home. The Member reported that the Media reports has indicated that the problems were deeper and more serious than what is understood. Thus, the Member questioned the Prime Minister regarding the government's plans and measures to help the children.

2.5 The Member from Bardo-Trong Constituency reported that Zhemgang Dzong needed major renovation and it was long overdue. It was informed that the Local government had repeatedly requested, and had submitted the proposal to the Government through the Dzongkhag Tshogdu (DT) seeking the government support to prioritize its construction in the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP. The Member questioned the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs to inform the House whether the government would start the reconstruction of Zhemgang Dzong.

2.6 The Member from Bartsham-Shongphu Constituency stated that the mainstream news organizations were facing challenges that included financial, human resource and market. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Information and Communications on what were the possible interventions the government was planning of to address the problem.

**29<sup>th</sup> Day of the 11<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 4, 2019.**

**Note:** *Detailed answers and deliberations on the above mentioned oral*

*questions are provided separately in the verbatim booklet published for reference.*

### **3. Endorsement of Committees and appointment of Committee Members.**

In accordance with the Article 10.11 of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan, and the provision of appointment of standing committees as provided in Section 293 of the National Assembly Act of Bhutan 2008, the National Assembly endorsed 9 Standing Committees. Therefore, the House through the majority show of hands adopted the Committees and its Members, Terms of Reference of Committees, and the procedure for Committee meetings as provided in Annexure 2 and 3..

**29<sup>th</sup> Day of the 11<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 4, 2019.**

### **4. Report on the National Budget for the FY 2018-19.**

#### **4.1 Introduction**

The Minister for Finance presented the following Report on the National Budget for the FY 2018-19:

The Finance Minister reported that the elected Government of the Third Parliament would be presenting the House for the first time and reported the importance of the Budget Report to the House. The Minister reported that after the entire review of the Draft 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan document for two months, a total outlay of Nu. 310 billion has been endorsed. Moreover, the Minister stated that the Objective of the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP is “Just, Harmonious and Sustainable Society through enhanced Decentralization.”, and narrowing the gap for fulfilling the hopes and needs of the people.

The Minister reported that during the 111<sup>th</sup> National Day, His Majesty

the Druk Gyalpo said, “As a developing country, we have limited resources. We must manage our available resources wisely, minimize waste, and ensure that all our resources are directed at improving the wellbeing of the people, and in fulfilling the national vision”. Therefore, it was imperative that the Government should shoulder great responsibility by keeping this reminder and work accordingly.

It was reported that as per the pledges of Druk Nyamrup Tshogpa (DNT) to review the pay and allowance of the public servants, a 9 Member Fourth Pay Commission was also formed. Furthermore, one of the pledges was to remove 5% voucher tax, and on that, the Government would decide to review the possible measures on voucher tax as a component with revision of Goods and Services Tax (GST). Moreover, during Prime Minister’s official visit to New Delhi, the Government of India has committed to provide Nu. 45 billion for Bhutan’s 12<sup>th</sup> FYP and 4 billion for strengthen bilateral trade and economic linkages. In addition, it was reported that Mangdechhu Hydropower Project would be completed soon and the two governments have also agreed on tariff rates for the electricity

On the Budget Appropriation for the FY 2018-2019, it was reported that the 11<sup>th</sup> Session endorsed the recurrent budget for one financial year and a capital budget for six months (July-December, 2018) as the interim budget. The capital budget was solely allocated for the spillover works and immediate works, whereas only the recurrent budget has been endorsed. The capital budget for next six months (January- June 2019) only would be presented in the House for adoption. The new capital budget appropriation after having endorsed in the House, would repeal the budget approved for 2018-19 Budget Appropriation Act which was endorsed during the 11<sup>th</sup> Session. The

top new priorities in the new budget appropriation were One Product One Gewog, and special programme on 24/7 Safe Drinking Water.

It was reported that Financial outcome for the FY 2016-2017, Budget Review 2017-2018, State Owned Enterprises Outcome Report, Status of the Trust Fund, Reserve Fund for hydroelectricity development, and Foreign Reserves in the which were included in the Interim Budget Report, and reported during 11<sup>th</sup> session were considered validate. It was also reported that only the Macroeconomic Performance and Outlook, and Capital Budget from January to June 2019 were the only included in the new budget.

## **4.2 Macroeconomic Performance and Outlook**

### **4.2.1 Growth under specific sectors**

The Minister reported that that over the past decade in the country, the economy grew at an average growth rate of 7% which was supported by high investments in hydropower sector, increased electricity export earnings, expansion in service industry particularly in tourism sector and the public sector. In terms of sector contribution to overall GDP, industry sector contributed 40 %, followed by service sector at 36%, and agriculture sector with 19%. These developments could affect Bhutanese economy through the external sector and service sector. Current assessment of the baseline growth forecast indicated modest growth of 5.4% in the medium term and 5.1 % on an average for the 12 FYP. Slowdown in growth was projected mainly on account of shifting of commercial operation date of Punatsang Chhu I and Punatshang Chhu II to the next plan besides the delay in commissioning of Mangde Chhu Hydropower and Nikachu Hydropower.

Regarding the inflation, it was reported that over the last two years,

prices had remained stable. The overall CPI inflation in FY 2017-18 was 3.6% lower by 0.7 percentage points compared to the previous fiscal year. Increase in food prices by 6.5% and non-food prices by 1.8% contributed to the inflation in FY 2017-18. Import inflation remained higher than domestic inflation at 3.9% contributed by higher import food prices than non-food prices.

On the employment, it was reported that agriculture sector continued to be the major employment provider in the economy employing about 57.2% of the labour force followed by service sector with 34.2% and industry sector employing only 8.7%. Unemployment rate in 2016 was 2.1% which was an improvement of 0.4% from 2015. However, youth unemployment increased to 13.2 % in 2016.

#### **4.2.2 External sector**

It was reported that the overall balance of payments in FY 2017-18 was more favourable as both trade balance and current account balance improved compared to the previous fiscal year. The current account deficit decreased from 23% of GDP in FY2016-17 to 18.3% of GDP in FY 2017-18.

Gross international reserves at the end of October was US\$ 1,127.35 million, of which Convertible Currency reserves comprised of US\$ 832.55 million and INR 21,431.00 million. The total reserves were adequate to cover around 15 months of merchandise imports or 23.6 months of essential imports.

#### **4.2.3 Monetary Sector**

It was reported that growth in monetary sector slowed down in FY 2017-18 as the increase in broad money (M2) was 8.6% compared to previous year's growth of 31.5%. Net foreign assets (NFA)

contributed around 60% to M2 while net domestic assets (NDA) share was 40%. Moreover, the domestic credit was projected to increase as private sector credit remained elevated and would capture additional financing requirement to meet the fiscal deficit.

#### **4.2.4 Fiscal Sector**

It was reported that the total resources for the 12 FYP was estimated at Nu. 280,772.640 million which was an increase of 31% from the previous Plan. Of the total estimated resource for the 12FYP, 85% was domestic revenue and balance was grants from development partners. The domestic revenue for the 12 FYP was projected at Nu. 217,728.299 million, which was an increase of 52% from the previous Plan. Revenue was estimated to grow at an average of 6% during the Plan, contributing to around 18.4% to the GDP.

Regarding the Grants, it was reported that the total grants estimated for the 12 FYP was Nu. 63,044.34 million, which was about 22% of total resources. Grants from GoI accounted for 71 % of the total and balance was expected from GCF, JICA and other bilateral and multilateral development partners.

Regarding the public expenditure, it was reported that the outlay for the 12 FYP was estimated at Nu. 310,016.072 million, an increase of 38% from the previous Plan. Current expenditure was estimated at 193,895.344 million, and Capital expenditure was estimated at Nu. 116,120.728 million. Regarding the fiscal balance, the fiscal deficit in the 12FYP was estimated at an average of 2.4% of GDP which was within the fiscal target of 3% of GDP.

It was reported that the fiscal deficit should be financed through external borrowings at highly concessional loans from ADB, World

Bank and IFAD. The estimated fiscal deficit in the 12 FYP was Nu. 29,243.43 million, which would be financed through net external borrowing of Nu. 4,074.207 million and net domestic borrowing of Nu. 25,059.43 million.

It was reported that the total public debt as of 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2018 was Nu. 182, 674.920 million which comprised of external debt of Nu. 175, 127.470 million and domestic debt of Nu. 7,547.450 million. Based on the loan agreement signed for on-going projects and requirement for financing the estimated fiscal deficit, public debt was projected to be Nu. 249,232.38 million by the end of the 12 FYP, accounting for 87.6% of GDP. That would be an increase of 33% from the last year of 11 FYP.

#### **4.3 Budget estimate for the FY 2018-19**

It was reported that as per the Budget Appropriation Act for the FY 2018-19, the total approved budget was Nu. 36,317.937 million, of which Nu. 29,075.167 million was for current expenditure, Nu. 5,386.162 million for capital expenditure, Nu. 1,842,168 million for repayment of loans and Nu. 14.440 million for lending. The budget appropriation for the period January-June 2019 was Nu. 11,380.192 million. And of the total allocation, Nu. 10,666.848 million was for capital expenditure and Nu. 713.334 million for loan repayment and lending. Furthermore, based on the 12 FYP priorities, Ministries would receive the highest allocation followed by the Local Governments and the Autonomous Bodies.

It was reported that the total resource estimated for the FY 2018-19 was Nu. 39,893.853 million, an increase by Nu. 1,293.462 million as compared to its initial estimate mainly on account of external grant receipt of Nu. 3,194.492 million.



The total domestic revenue for the fiscal year was estimated to be Nu. 33,943.967 million, and of the total domestic revenue, Nu. 25,037.460 million was tax revenue and Nu. 8,906 million was non-tax revenue. The domestic revenue has been revised downward by Nu. 1,911.031 million. That was mainly due to the fall in tax revenue by Nu. 1,113.501 million, and non-tax revenue by Nu. 797.530 million on the account of decrease in electricity production due to poor hydrology and delay in the commissioning of Mangde Chhu Hydropower.

The total estimated grants during the FY was Nu. 5,929.886 million. Of the total, major portion was expected from GoI as bridge financing (Nu. 1,550.900 million) and for spill-over activities (Nu. 1,473.214 million). The balance was expected from the EU, World Bank, ADB, and other UN agencies for on-going projects. The total expenditure for FY was estimated at Nu. 45, 128.177 million of which Nu. 29,075.167 million was current expenditure and Nu. 16,053.010 million was capital expenditure.

The capital budget for the FY 2018-19 for the 10 Ministries would be Nu.6,905.450 million, and Judiciary, Constitutional Bodies and Autonomous Bodies would be 821.785 million. Capital budget of Nu. 2,939.613 million was allocated for the Local Governments. Total allocation of Nu. 606,560 million was earmarked as subsidies, equities and transfers to be provided to State-Owned Enterprises. Of the total, 36,290 million was provided as subsidies, Nu. 448.651 million as equities and Nu. 121.619 million as transfers. Under the General Reserves, Nu.974.500 million has been provisioned to meet unforeseen expenditure during the year. The transfer to the agencies from the General Reserves should be made on the actual basis

subjected to the fulfillment of established criteria and formalities.

It was reported that during the 12 FYP, flagship programme would be high priority multi-sector interventions to address national issues. The programmes would undertake end-to-end interventions and multiple agencies or Dzongkhags would work together under one programme to address the issue. Additionally, for the FY 2018-19, budget has been provisioned to start the implementation of OGOP (One Gewog One Product) and water (for ensuring 24/7 safe drinking water) under the flagship programmes.

The fiscal deficit for the FY 2018-19 was estimated at Nu. 5,234.324 million which would be financed through borrowings from external and domestic sources. The Government would continue to mobilize concessional loans from multilateral development banks and bilateral development partners besides resorting to domestic borrowings for financing the fiscal deficit. For the FY, the domestic borrowing was estimated at Nu. 2,850.532 million for financing the residual fiscal deficit. During the FY, Nu. 3,425.554 million was estimated to be borrowed from external sources. That consists of interest free programme borrowing of Nu. 2,143.865 million as development policy credit (DPC) and from the World Bank and Nu. 1,281.689 million as project-tied borrowing from World Bank, ADB, IFAD and JICA.

Regarding the net lending, it was reported that during the FY, based on the loan agreements signed, the on-lending was estimated to be Nu.95.027 million. Of the total, Nu. 28.880 million would be borrowed from JICA and Nu.66.147 million from ADB which would be on-lent to BPC for RE works and to DHI for Phuentsholing Township Development project respectively. Based on the planned

disbursements for the on-going projects and new projects, the external debt stock was estimated to be Nu. 204,009.306 million by the end of FY 2018-19. Of the total external debt stock, 76% was on account of the hydropower projects and 24% was non-hydropower debt. Since hydropower projects were considered self-liquidating and the non-hydro debt were borrowed from multilateral and bilateral development partners at highly concessional rate, the level of debt stock did not pose any risk of debt default.

It was reported that by the end of FY 2018-19, the domestic debt stock was estimated to be Nu. 10,999.557 million, mainly on account of loan availed from NPPF for construction of staff quarters at Phuentsholing hospital and for redeeming and rolling over of outstanding T-bills, besides meeting cash flow shortfall. During the FY 2018-19, the total debt service estimated through the budget was Nu. 4,042.921 million of which Nu.2,474.924 million was for principal repayment and Nu. 1,567.997 for interest payment.

#### **4.4 Conclusion**

It was reported that the FY 2018-19 is a special year as two Budget Reports were presented in the same fiscal year by two different Governments. Despite the unique situation, the Government has been committed to serve the Tsa-wa-sum with utmost dedication and humility and ensure uninterrupted public service delivery. It was expressed that the House would pass the Budget Appropriation Bill for the FY 2018-19 expeditiously. For consolidation, the current budget and the capital budget passed by the 11<sup>th</sup> Session of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Parliament were also included in the new Appropriation Bill.

Submission was made that the Government would keep in mind of the limited resources in the country, and would strive to ensure that all public expenditure are used efficiently and effectively. It was also

submitted that Government would come up with proper guidelines to ensure proper usage of public expenditure and cut down expenditure for non-developmental activities.

Following that, in accordance with Section 240 of the National Assembly (Amendment) Act of Bhutan 2014, the Economic and Finance Committee was directed to carry out thorough review of the Budget Report. The House directed the committee to work on the budget appropriation, and then submit a report thereof to the House on 11.01.2019, therefore concluded the deliberation.

**29<sup>th</sup> Day of the 11<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 4, 2019.**

## **5. Report on the 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan**

The Finance Minister while presenting the report submitted that the Draft 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan formulated by the previous government has been reviewed by the present Government and aligned with the manifesto of the party. The plan adhered to the key principles of the party to create stronger Bhutan, united, self-reliant and thriving developed country by 2045. The Government has also reviewed and incorporated pledges of other political parties which were in national interest into the 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan.

### **5.1 Objective of the 12th Five Year Plan**

The objective of the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP is “Just, Harmonious and Sustainable Society through enhanced Decentralization.” The objective has been inspired by the Royal Addresses and is anchored on the provisions of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan. It was also underpinned by the principle of narrowing the gap between the rich and poor, and through extensive consultation with the ministries and agencies, Dzongkhags and Local Governments, Civil Society Organizations

(CSOs) and relevant stakeholders.

## **5.2 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan Priorities**

- 5.2.1 Addressing the last mile challenges such as reaching the unreached; improving the quality of health and education services; poverty reduction; narrowing the gap between the rich and the poor; and addressing needs of vulnerable group (senior citizens, disabled persons, orphans etc).
- 5.2.2 Strengthening our economy and employment generation.
- 5.2.3 Mainstreaming preservation and promotion of culture and traditions; conservation and sustainable utilization of environment and strengthening good governance.
- 5.2.4 Consolidation and maintenance of existing infrastructure, and investing more on softer aspects of development such as human resources (particularly doctors, nurses, teachers, technicians etc.) and systems.

## **5.3 National Key Result Areas:**

In order to address the key priorities, seventeen NKRA's had been identified as following:

- 5.3.1 Macroeconomic Stability: This NKRA aims to create a strong macroeconomic environment by ensuring stable growth, sustainable fiscal deficit, price stability, full employment and sound financial system.
- 5.3.2 Economic Diversity and Productive Capacity: This NKRA aims to diversify the economy through accelerated investment in agriculture, tourism, Cottage & Small Industries, mining and allied hydropower industries.
- 5.3.3 Poverty Eradication and Reducing Inequality: This NKRA aims to improve health, education and living standard, and narrow the gap between the rich and the poor.

- 5.3.4 Vibrant Culture and Tradition: This NKRA aims to reinforce efforts in preserving and promoting culture and tradition to strengthen our identity and sovereignty.
- 5.3.5 Healthy Ecosystem Services: This NKRA aims to maintain efforts to conserve our natural environment and ensure sustainable ecosystem services. Ecosystem services include land, clean water, clean air, and ambient climate that are essential for sustaining life on the planet.
- 5.3.6 Carbon Neutral, Climate and Disaster Resilient Development: This NKRA aims to ensure carbon neutral development path and enhance capacity to respond, mitigate and adapt to climate change. It also aims to build resilience and preparedness to respond to disasters.
- 5.3.7 Quality of Education and Skills: This NKRA aims to achieve excellence in student learning outcomes comparable to leading international standards while also reflecting the country's rich culture and traditions. The NKRA would also focus on strengthening the technical and vocational education and training (TVET) systems so that TVET graduates are globally competitive.
- 5.3.8 Food and Nutrition Security Ensured: This NKRA aims to increase food production and achieve food self-sufficiency and nutrition security. Nutrition security would specifically address nutritional needs of women and children in order to reduce prevalence of nutrition.
- 5.3.9 Infrastructure, Communication and Public Service Delivery: This NKRA aims to improve road network leading to better public transport, boost connectivity and deliver effective and efficient public services.
- 5.3.10 Gender Equality: This NKRA aims to promote gender equality by creating adequate support and enabling environment for women and girls. This NKRA would also address the needs of girls and remove

barriers that limit their potential.

5.3.11 Productive and Gainful Employment: This NKRA aims to create better opportunities for assured employment. This would be achieved by creating jobs in agriculture, tourism, mining, IT, hydropower and trading sectors. Supply side constraints should be addressed by providing relevant skills and trainings to meet the labour market needs.

5.3.12 Reduce Corruption: This NKRA aims to strengthen good governance and contribute towards building a corruption free society.

5.3.13 Democracy and Decentralization: This NKRA aims to enhance decentralization of decision-making, administrative and financial authority with greater accountability to the LGs. Further the NKRA would also ensure free and fair elections with increased participation.

5.3.14 Healthy and Caring Society: This NKRA aims to create a healthier nation by taking free, equitable and quality health care to every Bhutanese including care need of vulnerable groups.

5.3.15 Livability, Safety and Sustainability of Human Settlements: This NKRA aims to improve livability, safety and sustainability of human settlements through access to adequate affordable housing, efficient and effective municipal services, and clean and green public spaces for social engagement.

5.3.16 Justice Services and Institutions: This NKRA aims to strengthen justice services and institutions through harmonization of conflicting laws, enhanced coordination within justice sector agencies, improving efficiency of judicial services, and ensuring citizens' awareness on laws and procedures.

5.3.17 Sustainable Water: This NKRA aims to ensure availability of adequate water for drinking, irrigation, ecosystem services and other economic purposes.

## 5.4 Local Government Key Result Areas

It was reported that there were 10 LGKRAs for ten Dzongkhags and Four Thromdes (Category-A) and 11 LGKRAs for 10 Dzongkhags with additional LGKRA, “Improved and Sustained Livelihood of highlanders.”

## 5.5 Flagship Programme

It was reported that a notable feature of the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP was the Flagship Programmes. The Flagship Programmes were interventions to address high priority national issues such as economic diversification, employment generation, drinking water, healthcare, and public services through clear plan of action and dedicated resources.

## 5.6 Budget for the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP

It was reported that the total expenditure for the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP was estimated at **Nu.310,016 million** an increase of 35 percent over 11<sup>th</sup> FYP. The resource envelope for the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP was estimated at **Nu. 280,773 million** of which domestic revenue was **Nu. 217,728 million** and external grant of **Nu. 61,651 million** and internal grant from trust funds was **Nu. 1,393 million**.

### 5.6.1 Recurrent and Capital Expenditure for the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP

It was reported that in the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP, the recurrent expenditure was estimated at Nu. 193,895 million and capital expenditure at Nu.116,121 million. Current expenditure accounted for 63%. About 54 percent of the total capital expenditure would be met through grants and 21 percent through domestic revenue surplus resulting in a gap of 25 percent.

### 5.6.2 Fiscal Deficit

It was reported that the fiscal deficit was estimated to be Nu.29,243 million, which was 2.4 percent of GDP, well within the target of



maintaining fiscal deficit within 3% of GDP. The fiscal deficit should be financed through external borrowing mainly from ADB and World Bank on highly concessional terms. The estimated net external borrowing during the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP was Nu. 4,074 million. The remaining deficit would be financed from the domestic market through issuance of government bond and treasury bills.

#### **5.6.3 Public Debt**

It was reported that the total public debt by end of 12<sup>th</sup> FYP was projected to touch Nu. 249,232 million, which was about 88 percent of estimated GDP. Of the total debt, external debt was projected at Nu. 215,867 million which was about 76% of GDP. Hydropower debt would constitute about 68% of the total public debt and 80 percent of external debt. With the expected commissioning of Mangdechhu and Nikachhu Hydropower Projects in the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP, the external debt stock was projected to decline.

### **5.7 Resource Allocation Framework**

It was reported that the indicative capital outlay in the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP was projected at Nu.116 billion, of which about Nu. 1 billion was for Bhutan Economic Stabilization Fund. Out of Capital outlay of Nu.115 billion, Nu. 15 billion was allocated for Flagship Programmes; Nu. 50 billion for Local Governments; and Nu. 50 billion for Central Agencies (Ministries, Autonomous Agencies, Constitutional Bodies and Judiciary).

### **5.8 Capital Grants Allocation for Local Governments**

It was reported that the Capital Grants allocation to the LGs in the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP has been increased by 100 percent to Nu. 50 billion from Nu. 25 billion in the 11<sup>th</sup> FYP to meet the increasing demand of public services from the Local governments.

#### **5.8.1 Resource Allocation Formula**

It was reported that the RAF was a formula for allocating capital resources among LGs based on the set of key criteria that were representative of important developmental issues and needs of the LGs. The RAF ensures equitable distribution of resources among LGs. RAF was introduced in the 10<sup>th</sup> FYP and continued in the 11<sup>th</sup> FYP. The RAF for budget allocation Dzongkhags and Gewogs was based on four criteria i) population; ii) geographical area; iii) poverty; and iv) transport cost index . However, based on priority of the Government, the RAF for the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP has been revised. Additionally, 12<sup>th</sup> FYP resources to Thromde ‘A’s were also being allocated using RAF.

## **5.9 Concluding Statement**

The Minister expressed that the formulation of the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP has taken into consideration the present socio-economic challenges and overriding priority of ensuring “the future independence, sovereignty and security of our nation state.” It was submitted that under the noble guidance of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, the Gross National Happiness Commission (GNHC) in collaboration with the Ministry of Finance (MoF) has come up with the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP and therefore submit the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP Report in the Third Parliament. With the blessing of the Triple Gem and guardian deities, under the wise and visionary leadership of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, the Minister offered prayers for the successful achievement of the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP, and also expressed prosperity and in harmony for the Bhutanese people, and then presented the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP Report.

**2<sup>nd</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 7, 2019.**

**6. Question Hour: Group B- Questions to the Ministry of Works and Human Settlement, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of Agriculture and Forests**

The Speaker informed the House that, there was only one question for oral response. The Speaker also informed that with the available time of one and half hour, the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be given after the oral question has been answered.

- 6.1 The Member from Lhamoizingkha- Tashiding Constituency submitted that the primary source of livelihood for the people of Southern Dzongkhags was oranges. However, the Member reported that orange trees were dying due to pests and other diseases nowadays. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Agriculture and Forests to inform the House regarding the Government's plans and priorities, and also the measures taken to provide support or assistance on that matter.

**2<sup>nd</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 8, 2019.**

*Note: Detailed answers and deliberations on the above mentioned oral questions are provided separately in the verbatim book published for reference.*

**7. Resolutions of the Deliberation on 12<sup>th</sup> Plan Report**

While deliberating on the first and the second NKRA's of the report, the Opposition Members led by the Opposition Leader expressed a reminder that henceforth, before planning the FYPs, the Government should make consultations with the people. And that the target real GDP at only 6% for the plan was not that significant as in the 10<sup>th</sup> Plan, only 7.2% was fulfilled of the targeted 10% and the 11<sup>th</sup> Plan saw only 5% growth. They expressed their concerns that setting the target at 5-6% in the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan might result to an insignificant growth of real GDP.

It was submitted that despite Government coming up with great policies, it may harm the economy of the nation if the NKRA were not good, and moreover, the Economic Development Policy 2016 needed thorough revision before implementation. It was reported that the pledges of the Government during election that were not in the Plan needs to be included in the NKRA. The questions regarding Tax Revision were raised and the Opposition extended their full support for the revision. In order to reduce Poverty, roads are very important, and it was proposed that not only Gewog roads, but also the local roads need to be blacktopped. As pledged, the government should continue the construction of Shingkar- Gorgan Highway. They also reminded that the government should look into the Gewogs that are still inaccessible to motor roads.

On that, the Prime Minister, along with the Cabinet and other members stated that the Local Government was also elected entity and the intervention of the Central Government on local issues might lead to inconveniences. The 12<sup>th</sup> Plan is based on the visions of Gross National Happiness and Sustainable Development. The target real GDP growth at 6% was the lowest and there was possibility that the Government could do more. It was also assured that the Opposition need not had to worry as there are developed nations who set the target as low as 1%.

It was also submitted that even if the real GDP growth was high and people not happy, it would not be helpful, and thus, both GDP and GNH should be taken into consideration. The Government expressed hopes to revise tax policy in the Second Session or latest by the Third Session, since it was seen imperative as the tax has not been revised for a very long time.

It was reported that at present, there was only 75-80% Tax Payers, and the Government was preparing to revise and start the Good and Service Tax (GST). The road was imperative for the eradication of poverty and to narrow the gap in the society. For that, the government has the policy to blacktop all the roads at Gewog Centre. The leftover blacktopping and construction of roads from the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan would be continued as blacktopping was among the important policies. The Government also shared plans to make the local farm roads and other roads accessible throughout all seasons by building gravel roads.

It was reported that Shingkhari-Gorgan Highway would be completed as there was sufficient budget, construction experts in the Ministry and skilled labors. After obtaining the Clearance from NEC, the works would be completed so as to prevent other party making pledges on the roads in future. The Ministry of Works and Human Settlement and the Ministry of Agriculture and Forests would only provide scientific and construction support while the whole duty has been directed to the Local Government. With these clarifications, the first day of the Deliberation on 12<sup>th</sup> Plan concluded.

**2<sup>nd</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Male Dog Year corresponding January 7, 2019.**

### **Second Day of Deliberation on the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan**

While deliberating on the 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> NKRAs, the Members expressed that in order to eradicate poverty, there was need to promote Agriculture based projects and also improve health service, education quality and motor roads. The need to establish agriculture resource based micro industries in rural areas was also emphasized. It was also stated that Dzongkha language and our culture are unique and important. It has been observed that Dzongkha is being unheeded by

the youth and suggestions were that the Government should promote Dzongkha by introducing more Dzongkha subjects in schools, and also create Dzongkha Sufficiency Rate at national level. From the 23 national dialects, the popular ones like Khengkha could be sustained through radio broadcasting (using as a medium for broadcast).

To preserve the culture, it was proposed that the local Dancers and Mask Dance Performers could be provided with incentives while the Lhakhang Koenyers should be provided with monthly salary. Some Members expressed that the Dzongkha promoting programmes on Television was rare, as it indicated low collaboration among the Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs, the Ministry of Education, and the Dzongkha Development Commission, and thus needed consideration.

On this, the Cabinet Ministers led by Prime Minister stated that for the eradication of poverty, road was vital and the Government has granted enough budget to the Local Government. Technological resources and Cottage and Small Industries would be promoted for the interest and employment of the youth. The Government would implement plans to provide quality health services and buy the surplus agriculture produce of rural farmers and a possibility to establish small wood and bamboo based industries. There were programs to levy minimal taxes on home produced goods and also to export the goods which would gradually lead to narrowing of gap in the society.

Moreover, it was reported that Bhutanese not taking interest in Dzongkha language was because, after qualifying with Dzongkha courses, the chances of employment was less. In addition, there was only one Dzongkha subject in schools, and hence, it was imperative

for the sovereignty of the nation to promote Dzongkha. It was reported that the Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs was currently studying the possibility of monthly salary to Koenyers. The gap between rich and poor was mostly prevalent in the Health services, and the Government would work hard to provide health services that are accessible to all the people. The Second Day Deliberation on the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan concluded on 2<sup>nd</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 8, 2019.

### **Third Day of Deliberation on the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan**

While deliberating on the 5<sup>th</sup>-17<sup>th</sup> NKRA, the Members stressed on the need to revise the policies on Sustainable Development and Preservation of Natural Environment. It was also proposed that the Government should explore on generation of electricity from other sources such as wind and energy, and in order to prevent pollution by planes, Green Tax should be levied. Tax for the management of wastes should be levied. It was stated that in order to provide equitable opportunities to education, the Government should change the Education system and the curriculum. The concerns on marking system without exams were also raised.

Moreover, some Members submitted that it was very important to make public transportation more effective. Questions were raised on the methods to reduce Human-Wildlife Conflict and the plans and status of Maternity Allowance as promised by the Government. To solve the unemployment issues, a suggestion for the formation of a committee for revision of employment policies was forwarded. A proposition was made for a relevant official or an Internal Auditor to be appointed for biannual or annual auditing to curb corruption which is prevalent in Ministries, financial agencies and Contract Section.

To ensure participation in election, it was forwarded that a fining system or non-exemption system be introduced for qualified voters who do not vote. To ensure free and fair election, a suggestion was to amend the Election Act of Bhutan and ascertain accountability so that corruption was not only reduced but annulled. It was submitted that the people should participate as much as possible and also if community radios could be established, there was opportunity and possibility to reduce election related corruptions.

It was submitted that with changing times, the judicial services had to be changed and there was a need for trustworthy and quality methods of investigation. On clean and safe drinking water, the Government was asked to study on the feasibility of 24/7 safe drinking water provision in both rural and urban areas, while it was also stated that the water should be treated and maintained in a way that could be directly consumable from the taps. It was also reminded that the conveniences of family should be looked in to while sending Civil Servants on transfer.

On that, the Prime Minister and the Cabinet Ministers stated that the Human-Wildlife Conflict and the Maternity Allowance was clearly reflected in the plans, while the inconsistency in execution was not to be blamed on the Acts and Policies but on the method of execution. The Government was planning to support waste management related agencies and also studying on the pollution by air transport as the Green Tax is already being collected.

It was reported that for quality education of rural students, Central Schools were effective and for those walking hours to reach schools, the government was planning to provide transportation service.



Moreover, in the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan, the Schools would be categorized in two: Pre-primary to Sixth Grade and Seventh Grade to Twelfth Grade. For the professional development and support of Teachers, enough budget has been allocated. The formative marking of students from Grades Pre-Primary to Sixth should start from 2020 academic year. Various skill building plans would be initiated from expatriate professionals to reduce mismatch of skills and job.

Similarly, for the effective delivery of public services, internet based project called “Digital Drukyl” would be initiated in the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan. Consequently, this service would use e-money which would reduce corruption. Also, to ensure voting, Election Commission of Bhutan has come up with various strategies and the Government hopes to amend the Election Act. The Government has plans to make public transportation more effective and to construct 1200 kilometers of farm roads.

Likewise, deliberating on the LGKRAs, the members emphasized on the need to deliver the rights of evaluation to the people while deploying the authority of budget management to the Local Leaders. Skill development, Human Resource Management and trainings were imperative for good governance. The Prime Minister and the Cabinet stated that, in terms of Civil Servants transfer, the Government would place priority on family and for technological and hand-skills, 75% budget has already been allotted. It was stated that for employment opportunities, a committee should be established. Furthermore it was submitted that in order to improve health services, timely health infrastructure and services would be provided. The difficulty allowance provision for the health workers would be thoroughly explored and the treatment service has been outsourced to private

entities. Special expatriates would be invited to provide quality health services. Income based housings would be made possible and Building Acts must be revised and amended.

It was reported that His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo has graced the 111<sup>th</sup> National Day at Samtse for which Samtse would now be established as a Dzongkhag Thromde. The Prime Minister also informed the House that adequate budget has been allocated for Flagship Programmes. The 12<sup>th</sup> Plan was based on the four pillars and the Nine Domains of GNH and also, the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan was the last FYP before Bhutan graduate from the Least Developed Countries (LDCs).

Following that, the Minister of Finance presented a detailed report on the Flagship Programmes and Budget, Resources, Expenditure, Fiscal Balance, Public Debt, Budget Allocation and the strategies for the 12th Plan. After the deliberation, the motion to endorse the budget was moved by the Finance Minister and the House unanimously endorsed the budget of 310.016 Billion through the show of hands.

**3<sup>rd</sup> Day 12<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 9, 2019.**

## **8. Resolutions of the Local Government Petitions**

### **8.1 Resolution on the Petition to avail permits for forest related services from the Gewog Forest Extension Office**

On behalf of Wangduephodrang Local Government, the Member from Athang-Thedtsho Constituency reported that the established Forestry Extension Office at the Gewog Centre has no authority because of which people had to travel all the way to Lobesa to avail any services provided by the Department of Forestry. In doing so, people had to travel far through Gewogs and Chiwogs and the Member put forward

the agenda with the hope to make the services available to people from the nearest Forestry Extension Centre. The proposal was to amend policies and regulations and decentralize the authority to Gewog Centre for the provision of timber passes.

Deliberating on that, the Members stated that while acquiring Forestry services is easier at present, the main issue was with obtaining the permit. The online service was also not reliable as the structure of Community Centre itself was not distinguishable between commercial purpose and service purpose. Therefore, it was submitted that the policies needed thorough amendment, and likewise, there were other issues related to Sokshing and Tsamdro (grazing land) that needed to be addressed.

Moreover, the procedure of timber pass was primarily done in Ministry which led to the delay. It was submitted that the Forest and Nature Conservation Act of Bhutan, 1995 needed immediate amendment. The authority to permit should be given to Gewogs and the evaluation could be done by the Ministry and other related agencies and make it easier for people to avail services.

It was submitted that there has been recurrent petitions from the LG to the parliament and it may be forwarded again if not addressed at the earliest. The Government and the related Ministry should consider the issue and form a Committee to address the issue by thoroughly reviewing the policy and regulations.

On that issue, on behalf of Government, the Minister of Agriculture and Forest clarified that the gap between the rich and poor was easily bridged as per the Chapter IX, Forests and Nature Conservation Rules

and Regulations of Bhutan, 2017 where the allotment and procedures were clearly reflected.

Moreover, it was submitted that the issue was of direct benefit to people and with changing times, there was a requirement for amendment of Acts and Rules and needed comprehensive amendment.

After the thorough deliberation, the House directed the Good Governance Committee to study and hold consultations with the relevant agencies and to present a Report in the Second Session.

**4<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 10, 2019.**

## **8.2 Resolutions on the Petition to establish Chamkhar Chhu Hydropower Project**

On behalf of Zhemgang Dzongkhag, the Member from Bardo-Trong Constituency presented that Chamkhar Chhu Hydropower Project was to be initiated in the 10th Plan and preliminary examinations were carried out. However, until now, it has not been initiated and the petition was put forward with a vision for equitable regional development.

During deliberation, the Members reported that it was as per the Vision of His Majesty to generate 10,000 MW Hydropower in 2006. Accordingly, in 2008, the first Government made policies referring to the Article 9.2, 9.7, and 9.8 to ensure equitable regional development and planned the allotment of the projects. Chamkhar Chhu Hydropower Project was recognized as the project of Central Regions and detailed Project Report was presented in the 10th plan, whereby widening of roads and construction of bridges were completed in the 11<sup>th</sup> Plan.

However, since the project was not initiated in the 11th Plan, the Members enquired during the Question Hour and the Government responded that after completing the process for Khulong Chhu HYP, the Chamkhar Chuu Hydropower Project would start. Nevertheless, there was no report on the Project. Despite numerous requests from Zhemgang Dzongkhag to relocate Dzongkhag Administration and also to renovate the Dzong, the issues were not being considered. It was submitted that it would be grateful if Government could initiate Chamkhar Chuu Hydro-power Project at the earliest in the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan.

Moreover, submission was made that one of the jewels of the nation is Hydropower. In order to achieve the Government's Vision of producing 10,000 MW electricity, through 10 Hudropower projects, it was submitted that, there would be opportunities for employment and generation of adequate revenue for both recurrent and capital budget of the nation.

Similarly, as per Vision 2020 of Bhutan, the Project would fulfill the target of 10,000 MW Electricity and it would not only benefit Zhemgang Dzongkhag but Bhutan as a whole would also be highly benefited. The Project has already been signed as Indo-Bhutan Joint Venture and it would not be inconvenient to initiate construction. It was submitted that since one of the main revenue generations in the country was from hydropower, it was imperative to remind ourselves of the drying water sources by Climate Change, it was important to initiate as soon as possible.

On that, some Members were of view that despite Hydropower Projects being important, environment aspect must be also taken into account. For Revenue, the government should not only focus on Hydropower Projects but also pursue Diversification of Economy.

Examples such as tourism being a sustainable revenue generator, and also about the negative impacts of Hydropower Projects to the people in the locality of Project site were also submitted.

On behalf of the Government, the Minister for Economic Affairs reported that having planned in 2009, and its Report being endorsed in 2015, the Chamkhar Chhu Hydropower Project was a Public-Private-Partnership project which had issues. It was also reported that it should be studied in terms of environmental impacts and the estimated cost of project at Nu. 64 billion has been now increased to Nu.8 billion due to inflation of Prices of construction materials.

Moreover, it was reported that in the Public-Private-Partnership projects like Kholong Chhu, there were disputes between Private partners. Before initiating any more Public-Private-Partnership projects, it was very important to solve the existing issues. The Hydropower generates huge revenue, but there was also a need to study well before proceeding, as well as Report of Electricity Committee should also be considered. In the end, national interest should be taken into account before interest of the self.

It was submitted that, the Fiscal Balance of our country indicates that about 71% of our debts was from Hydropower Project Debt. On top of that, construction of another project would lead to more borrowing with interest from the GoI. The Debt which was already very high might increase up to Nu. 249 billion by the end of 12<sup>th</sup> Plan. Also, after the production, it is only exported to India and as countries are innovating various methods of producing electricity from other sources, there might be challenges in exporting electricity. Therefore, before initiating Chamkhar Chhu Hydropower project, it was seen imperative to solve issues of Kholong Chhu Partnership Project and

make perpetual regulations for partnership projects. If IG Model is to be followed, Sunkosh has been already forwarded and after proper initiation of Sunkosh, other projects should be explored as per the requirement of the economy.

After thorough deliberation, the motion was moved for the Hydropower Specialist Committee under the Ministry of Economic Affairs to thoroughly study and present a report in the Second Session. The Motion was passed by the House with the majority support of show of hands, and concluded the deliberation on the local government petitions.

**4<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 10, 2019.**

## **9. Question Hour: Group C: Questions to the Ministry of Economic Affairs, Ministry of Finance, and Ministry of Labour and Human Resources**

The Speaker informed the House that, there were 10 questions; eight questions for oral responses and two questions for written answers. The Speaker informed that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be given only after all the oral questions had been answered. As per the National Assembly Rules of Procedure 2014, the Speaker commenced the session.

### **9.1 Oral Answer Questions:**

- 9.1.1 The Member from Tashichhoeling\_Constituency submitted that Government's assurance of buying back Cardamom at the rate of Nu.550/- kg remained only in the paper and nothing has happened on the ground. The Member reported that the Farmers were facing financial problems leading to endless trap of borrowing and lending,

and loan defaults in the banks. The Member questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs to clarify on the status of the buy-back policy and the export regulation of cardamom.

- 9.1.2 The Member from Naganglam\_Constituency submitted that the main hurdle that the country has been facing was youth unemployment. It was submitted that creating 100% employment in the country and limiting overseas employment has been the government's prime responsibility. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Labour and Human Resources to inform the House on the Government's measure and job opportunities created to solve the problems.
- 9.1.3 The Member from Bartsham\_Shongphu Constituency questioned the Minister for Labour and Human Resources to inform the House about the Government's plans and programmes to enhance rural employment opportunities.
- 9.1.4 The Member from Kengkhar\_Werringla Constituency questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs on whether the Government would start Kuri- Gongri Hydropower Plant Construction in the 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan.
- 9.1.5 The Member from Bardo\_Trong Constituency questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs to inform the House about the plans and progress to develop tourism in the Central and Eastern regions.
- 9.1.6 The Member from Nanong\_Shumar Constituency submitted that under the Economic Stimulus Plan, the previous government has initiated Business Opportunity and Information Centre (BOIC), which was later replaced by the Rural Enterprise Development Corporation Limited (REDCL). The Member questioned the Minister for Finance whether the present Government would continue with that or not.
- 9.1.7 The Member from Jomotshangkha\_Martshala Constituency reported that the problem faced by Bhutanese students studying in Japan was



critical and thus, the government needed to take action urgently. The Member also reported that the Government has discussed to defer the loan repayment until the students complete their studies. It was submitted that since the issue was urgent and critical, Government should consider waiving off the loan. Therefore, the Member questioned the Minister for Labour and Human Resources on what was the Government's position on the issue.

9.1.8 The Member from Dewathang\_Gomdar Constituency stated that promoting regional balanced development has been widely promulgated by all political parties as one of the central themes of their action plans for development. It was reported that the first democratically elected government has identified and developed a number of industrial areas in the east, south and central Bhutan. Despite the noble initiative, due to minimal interests from entrepreneurs, those industrial areas remained largely unused and unoccupied. It was also reported that the recent enquiry to set up an industry at Motanga has been met with the answer that the area has already been filled up, which was quite surprising. The Member questioned the Minister for Economic Affairs to clarify the House as to how and when the area has been filled up, when in reality there were just two factories in that area.

**5<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 11, 2019.**

*Note: Detailed answers and deliberations on the above mentioned oral questions and written questions submitted by the Member of Wamrong Constituency to the Ministry of Economic Affairs, and the Member of Dramegtse-Ngatshang Constituency to the Ministry of Finances are provided separately in the verbatim book published for reference.*

## **9.2 Written Answer Questions:**

### **9.2.1 Written answer question submitted by the Member from Wamrong Constituency to the Minister for Economic Affairs (MoEA)**

It is understood that licenses issued for surface collection is used for dredging and mining causing a huge environmental impact and leading to the loss of revenue to the government because of difference in the royalty levied on surface collection and mining.

What is the government doing to address the problem? Kindly provide the following details?

1. Criteria to issue licenses for surface collection and mining.
2. Royal collected
3. Places where surface collection and mining operations has been allotted.

### **9.2.2 Written answer question submitted by the Member from Dramedtse\_Ngatshang Constituency to the Minister for Finance (MoF)**

We are made to understand that the former ministers of People's Democratic Party Government has availed tax free vehicle import license and Nu. 2 Million each at the time of vacation of office. Could the Minister provide us the detailed information regarding the benefits availed by them?

## **10. Resolutions on the Review Report by Economic and Finance Committee on the Budget of Financial Year 2018-2019**

As per Section 240 of the National Assembly (Amendment) Act of Bhutan 2014, the Chairperson of the Economic and Finance Committee, Member from Athang\_Thedtsho Constituency presented Review Report of the Budget for the Financial Year 2018-2019.

Chairperson submitted that, as per the Rules of Procedure of the

National Assembly of Bhutan, after the presentation of the Report by the Minister of Finance, the Committee should have been given ten days for review. However, since only capital budget of Nu. 11,380.192 million for six months were to be reviewed of the total budget for endorsement of Nu. 47,698.129 million, the Committee has consulted with relevant Ministries in the short duration and presented the following Report.

**(The Report of the Committee is provided in Annexure 4).**

The Committee submitted following **five recommendations** for the House to endorse:

1. To reduce wastage of Public Resources and to address the Fiscal Balance of Nu. 5 billion in the FY 2018-2019 and to reduce dependence on the internal borrowings and external borrowings like from Asian Development Bank, World Bank or the International Fund for Agricultural Development, for the correct usage of internal expenditures, the Committee recommends to use the Revolving Fund I and II Appropriation of Nu. 376 million for Drinking Water Supply and Rural Road Construction.
2. According to the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan developed by the Cabinet and GNHC, as the Ministry of Finance has appropriated equal Budget to Central Agencies and the Local Governments, the Committee expressed gratitude and pride to the Government as Local Governments see 100% increment in Budget.

With this, the provision of such huge budget to the Local Governments increases the accountability of Local Governments and also help bring developmental activities and from the Central Government, the Local Governors should be given more authority to evaluate on the Planning of Budget and the Plan, Financial management, Contract management

and Public Development Programs and to provide enough Human Resources, they should be immediately given trainings to develop capacity.

3. In most of the countries, the Reserve Fund is 5%. However, there is no fixed system in our country. The Committee therefore, recommends the Government to come up with Annual General Reserve Fund Appropriation System and present a Report in the 2<sup>nd</sup> Session.
4. The Committee, while reviewing the Budget came to know that the Disaster Management Fund is kept with the General Reserve Fund. Hereafter, seeing the possibilities of any kind of disasters and to make availing the fund for the victims easier, the Committee recommends to keep the Budget for Disaster Management under the Department of Disaster Management and also provide appropriate amounts to all Dzongkhags.
5. As per the Budget Appropriation Bill of FY 2018-2019, the Recurrent Expenditure of Nu. 29,075.167 million and the Capital Expenditure of Nu. 18,622.962 million totaling up to Nu.47,698.129 million should be endorsed by the Parliament.

Subsequentl, during the deliberation, the Member from Panbang Constituency supplemented on the Report stating that the Pledge of today's Government which is 'narrowing the gap' has been used as basis for planning budget. However, it was stated that there were no plans or programmes specific to narrowing the gap. The Minister of Finance clarified that the Government's function for the year was limited to continue the spillovers of the previous Government and that the programmes should be initiated gradually.

Similarly, while enquiring about the Commissioning of Hydropower Projects, Finance Minister clarified that the Mangde Chhu Hydropower

Project would be commissioned in 2019 and Punatsangchhu Hydropower Project (II) in 2022. However, it cannot be stated when the Commission would begun for Punatsangchhu Hydropower Project I and Nikachhu Hydropower Project. On clarifying about the higher recurrent expenditure than the Capital Expenditure, it was reported that internal productions has to be increased, to reduce loan ad external borrowings.

In terms of higher budget appropriation for Ministries compared to Local Governments, it was reported that the matter will be considered in the following budget and that the JICA Grant for Rural Water Supply and the ADB Loan for Phuntsholing town development by DHI were to be repaid by the Government.

On this, the Deputy Chairperson of the Public Accounts Committee (PAC), the Member from Nganglam Constituency stated that Public Accounts Committee is a Constitutional Joint Committee of the Parliament and is allocated with separate budget in the past. However, there was no provision for this term. On the clarification, the Prime Minister and other Members stated that not only PAC, but also other Committees should be provided separate budget as per requirement. Such provision to only PAC may lead to demand by other Committees. However, the Ministry should look into the matter and provide the same for Committees from the Reserve Fund.

The Government has full support to provide fund to all Committees but it was clarified that there was no way to provide fund from the Reserve Fund. The House therefore passed a resolution that the Economic and Finance Committee should review and move a Motion.

Continuing, on the First recommendation of the Committee, the Minister for Finance along with other Members stated that the

establishment of REDCL by the previous Government has provided Nu.485 million on loan and helped around 3900 agencies whereby around 4000 youth had gained employment. To discontinue such noble initiative would be inconvenient and from the Revolving Fund I and II, Extracting Appropriation Budget of Nu. 376 million was not seen as much effective.

The Minister supplemented that, REDCL should not be discontinued, but to help the farmers generally, a relevant system should be made and renamed as ‘Agriculture Bank’. While deciding on the first recommendation through show of hands, it failed in securing the majority support, and could not be endorsed.

On the Second recommendation, the Prime Minister and some Members stated that in Local Government at Gewog level, the lack of proper workplace and facilities has led to resignation of some Gewog Administrative Officers and few had to do planning and budget management for two Gewogs. Therefore, the Dzongkhag employees such as Engineers and Accountants should reach to Gewogs, and as proposed by the Committee the existing Gewog officials should be trained for Capacity Development.

They added that, the Government is willing to help in retaining the Gewog Administrative Officers and the Gaydrungs who are on Contracts at present. In terms of Human Resource, they stated that immediate recruitment of personnel may not be possible and therefore, the employees at Dzongkhag levels should be trained and equipped with capacity to help the Gewog. While ascertaining through the show of hands, the Second recommendation was unanimously adopted by the House, and concluded the first day of Deliberation on the budget.

On the Second Day, during the deliberation on the Third recommendation, the Members stated that although enough budget has been appropriated for the General Reserve, there was no Reports for the expenditure of the Fund. Therefore, it should be included in the financial report of FY 2019-2020. Moreover, as per Article 14 of the Constitution, Appropriation of Consolidated Fund should be in accordance with the law and except for public interests, it should not be used. Even for General Reserve, the activities of Public Interests should be reported thoroughly.

The Minister for Finance clarified that, the Expenditure of General Reserve would be presented in the future Reports and in terms of public interests, the activities were mostly based on Disaster management. Moreover, it would be used in times of need and emergency. The Third recommendation was endorsed unanimously through the show of hands.

Similarly, while deliberating on the Fourth recommendation, it was submitted that the Disaster Management Fund was kept with the Ministry, and the Rural Residents had to follow the processes from Chiwog to Gewog and to Dzongkhag to Ministries which would take very long time in availing the service. It was stated that it would be of no help in times of immediate requirement. Whereas, if the Fund was kept in the Dzongkhag, there would be opportunity to help the people in need and in terms of small disaster.

On that, the Finance Minister along with some Members stated that if the Disaster Management Fund is allocated with the Dzongkhags, the Dzongkhags may re-appropriate the Fund for other purposes at the end of Financial Year if there is no Disaster. However, if the Fund is kept with Ministry with a proper dispensing system in times of Disaster,

it would be convenient and as natural disasters are unpredictable, appropriating Disaster management funds to Dzongkhags should be well analyzed. The Budget kept at Ministry could be used for preventive measures and also for procurement of preventive tools for distribution to the Dzongkhags.

On that, the Member from Drametse\_Ngatshang questioned whether in the Consolidated Fund, the Procurement Budget Appropriation of Nu.200 Million was for Government to procure land and if so, the Budget should be kept under relevant Ministry. On the clarification, the Minister for Finance stated that while buying private land for Government, the fund was used for construction of road. The recommendation failed in securing the majority of the support and hence could not be endorsed.

Following that, the Chairperson of the Committee presented the Review Agenda as directed by the House about the provision of budget for PAC. The request for separate budget for PAC was related to the Recurrent Expenditure and the endorsement was for the Capital expenditure for the next six months. It was submitted that the Budget for FY 2019-2020 should not include both Recurrent and Capital expenditure and therefore, the issue would be best discussed in the Capital Expenditure for the Committees Fund. The Chairperson recommended to include PAC Fund under Committee Service Fund and should be provided continuously.

On that, the Member from Panbang Constituency stated that effectiveness of Parliament functions depends on the functioning of Committees. It was submitted that Public Consultations and field visits should be carried out and therefore, the parliament should



allocate adequate budget to the committees. The Member added that, although PAC is a constitutional committee, it has same functions as any other Committees and should not have separate budget. The House through show of hands decided for no separate budget for PAC.

Similarly, after the Fifth recommendation was adopted with majority support from the House, the House adopted four recommendations out of six. (Five recommendations from the Committee and one on PAC). The Speaker stated that the House deliberated on the Budget for the FY 2018-2019 two days and concluded the session by reminding the House that the budget will be adopted next day as per the due legislative procedure. **8<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 14, 2019.**

On 9<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 15, 2019, the Finance Minister moved the Motion to adopt the Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2018-2019, with Nu.29,075.197 million Recurrent Expenditure and Nu. 18,622.962 million Capital expenditure, amounting to total Budget of Nu. 47,698.129 Million.

Out of 45 Members present, 44 voted “Yes”, 1 “Abstained” and the Budget Appropriation Bill for FY 2018-2019 was endorsed.

**The Voting Result is provided in Annexure 5.**

## **11. Question Hour: Group D: Questions to the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Health**

The Speaker informed the House that, there were eight questions for oral responses. The Speaker informed that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be given only after all the oral questions had been answered, and commenced the session.

- 11.1 The Member from Panbang Constituency submitted that based on the petition of Zhemgang Dzongkhag Tshogdu, the 11<sup>th</sup> Session of the Second Parliament, after extensive deliberations and debate, had endorsed establishment of a college in Zhemgang Dzongkhag. The Member questioned the Minister for Education to inform the House on where and when the college would be established.
- 11.2 The Member from Jomotshangkha\_Martshala Constituency questioned the Minister for Health on when would the Government start paying maternity allowance to the mothers in rural areas.
- 11.3 The Member from Nganglam Constituency questioned the Minister for Education regarding the regularization of employees under contract categories such as Teachers, NFE Instructors, Cooks, Caregivers, Wardens and matrons, Lab Assistants, Librarians, Drivers, Sports Instructors and ECCD Instructors.
- 11.4 The Member from Wamrong Constituency questioned the Minister for Health on the Government's stand on private sector participation especially in outsourcing clinical services and diagnostics.
- 11.5 The Member from Khamdang\_Ramjar Constituency submitted that poor working condition or atmosphere, and unavailability of staff quarters within the school premises had affected the quality delivery by the teachers. The Member questioned the Minister for Education on the measures taken up by the Government to address the issues.
- 11.6 The Member from Nanong\_Shumar Constituency reported that during the election campaigning, DNT has pledged to establish a super specialist hospital in Thimphu, and take Thimphu referral hospital to regions; regional hospital to Dzongkhags, and Dzongkhag hospitals to Gewogs. The Member questioned the Minister for Health to inform the House about the status of the pledge.

- 11.7 The Member from Maenbi\_Tsenkhar Constituency submitted that the Government has decided to come up with a new education system with two categories: the first category with Classes PP-Six, and the other Category with Classes Seven-Twelve. The Member questioned the Minister for Education to clarify whether it was possible for all students in both the categories to avail Central School facilities.
- 11.8 The Member from Khar\_Yurung Constituency questioned the Minister for Education on whether the Government would implement its pledge to do away with the Class X cut-off point from the coming academic session.

**9<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 15, 2019.**

***Note:** Detailed answers and deliberations on the above mentioned oral questions are provided separately in the verbatim booklet published for reference.*

## **12. Resolution on Ratification of Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that deplete the Ozone Layer**

The Member In-Charge of the Bill (Chairperson of the National Environment Commission), Minister for Agriculture and Forests Minister moved the motion for the First Reading of Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that deplete the Ozone Layer. The Minister reported the House that with the development of industries and technology, it has reduced the thickness of the Ozone layer thus creating a hole in it. It was reported that it has further affected the people, animals and environment as a whole. He reminded the House to consider the importance of Ozone layer while ratifying the protocol. Accordingly, the House through the show of hands unanimously agreed to deliberate on the protocol.

Subsequently, During the Motion for Second Reading of the Bill, the Member In-Charge of the Bill, reported that Kigali Amendment was adopted at Rwanda, Kigali during the 28<sup>th</sup> Party Meeting in 2016. Further, it was informed in the House that agreement on Montreal Protocol was amended for five times and around 197 countries participated as a Party. The agreement was to reduce the production of Hydro chlorofluorocarbons and control the manufacture and use of HBFCs. On the other hand, HBFCs has been used in place of the Ozone depleting substances.

Moreover, on August 2014, during 82<sup>nd</sup> National Assembly Session, Bhutan has ratified Vienna Convention on protecting the Ozone Layer. Likewise, the Montreal protocols on substances affecting the Ozone Layer and the four Amendments such as London Amendment 1990, Copenhagen Amendment 1992, Montreal Amendment 1997 and Beijing Amendment 1999 were also endorsed and now with the ratification of Kigali Amendment would fulfil the global aim of maintaining global temperature below 2 Degree Cencius and hence contribute to the National Environment Policy.

Similarly, it was submitted that it would be beneficial to upgrade the skills for the factory and food processing unit workers. In addition, in order to reduce the substances that deplete Ozone layer, the expertise and financial support would be provided by Montreal Protocol Support and hence, he urged the House to ratify the protol.

In accordance with the Section 150(d) of the Rules of Procedure of the National Assembly of Bhutan 2014, the House deliberated on the articles of the protocol. The Members submitted that, with the developmental activities in the country, there were challenges of

global warming due to world-wide emission of certain substances in the air. It was reported that, it is imperative to conduct proper awareness programmes by relevant ministries on the negative affects of using refrigerator and air conditioner as those electronics emitted Chlorofluorocarbons that deplete Ozone layer.

Besides that, it was submitted that in order to effectively enforce the Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete Ozone Layer, the concerned Ministry and relevant agencies should take accountability and responsibility accordingly and would require huge expenditure to implement the protocol. After extensive deliberation on the protocol, the House concluded the sitting with the decision to ratify the protocol on January 16, 2019 as per the due legislative procedure.

**9<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 15, 2019.**

On 10<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 16, 2019, the Minister for Foreign Affairs on behalf of the Member-incharge of the bill moved the motion for the ratification of the Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete Ozone Layer. All 43 Members present unanimously supported and ratified the protocol.

**The voting list is provided in Annexure 6.**

### **13. Resolution of the Motion to move the community centres under Gewog Administration**

The Member from Panbang Constituency moved the Motion to bring the community centres under Gewog Administration. The Member submitted that Good Governance is one of the four pillars of the Gross National Happiness, and enhancing effectiveness and efficiency of public service delivery has been the key to strengthening

Good Governance at grassroots level. It was also submitted that the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan requires that developmental and management powers and authority should be decentralized and devolved to respective Local Governments. Therefore, since the Community Information Centres (CICs) were created to provide most of the public related services through IT-enabled One-Window Service Centres, it should function as vital and robust public service delivery centres.

It was submitted that the Community Centres were currently operated independent of Gewog Administrations under the aegis of Bhutan Development Bank Limited (BDBL), and thus, the local leaders had neither authority nor accountability over the delivery of all the public services as well as control over the personnel of Community Information Centres. Therefore, it was proposed that the Community Centres should be brought under Gewog Administration to enhance effective and efficient public service delivery for the benefit of the public at the grassroots. Furthermore, it was proposed that any policy and system which needed revision should be properly carried out, and henceforth the Community Centres should be brought under Gewog Administration with effect from July 1, 2019.

While deliberating on the motion, members submitted that the CICs are the focal point where the people could get services directly, and it was vital that the public services should be strengthened as best possible. However, submission was made that the CICs were operated under the Bhutan Post during the first government, and then under BDBL during the second government and has remained as a temporary institute. It was submitted that local government being the nearest centre for the people and community development, it was

recommended to bring the CICs under Gewog Administration.

Submission was made that although the CICs were mandated to provide effective service to the public, it was not satisfactory due to lack of strong CICs. It was therefore imperative that the Government should provide budget to the local government and assign accountability and responsibility thereof to the local government. Additionally, it was recommended that proper mechanism should be formulated properly to provide efficient and effective services to the public. Hence, the Government should bring Community Centres under Gewog Administration and accordingly, assign accountability to the local government to ensure proper service delivery to the people.

Some of the members opined that assigning direct accountability to the local government before carrying proper study by the Good Governance Committee and relevant agencies would be less appropriate. It was stated that such a move might create inconveniences to the existing public services provided by the BDBL. Submissions were also made that CICs should be made independent body to provide services for the benefit and sustainability of Community and people.

On that, Cabinet Ministers led by the Prime Minister reported that the Government has been providing about 160 various services particularly on banking, insurance, post office and monetary transaction under four online G2C Services. Moreover, the Government would establish Digital Drukyl project. Further submission was made that there were opportunities for the existing G2C Services which is under the Prime Minister's Office to be brought under Rural Enterprise Development Corporation Limited as well.

In addition, the Government reported that during its consultation with the Gups, it was found that Gups have expressed concerns regarding the proposal of bringing of CICs under the Gewog Centres. It was reported that local government was only responsible to look after whether the services were being delivered properly or not; and it would be wiser to retain the responsibility of service delivery under BDBL as before. It was found imperative that services and facilities should be made easier for the people, and not to assign all the responsibilities to the local governments in the era of decentralization. Therefore, it was submitted that it was indeed imperative for the Parliament to look into the matter.

Furthermore, it was also opined that assigning administrative duties solely to Gewog Centres would compromise in providing effective service delivery. It was also stated that it would arise inconveniences when each government comes into power and change administrative powers for every certain period of time. Concerns were also raised that lack of proper study and research might have been the cause of inefficient and ineffective public service delivery by Bhutan Post and BDBL. Thus, it was found that bringing CICs under the Gewog Administrations was not feasible, and it was imperative that proper study and research should be carried out prior to bringing CICs under the Gewog Administrations, solely for the benefit of the future.

On that, the House while ascertaining the support on the Motion to bring Community Centres under Gewog Administration, out of 42 Members, 17 Members voted “Yes”, 24 Members voted “No” and 2 Members Abstained. The Motion could not be adopted as it failed to acquire the Majority support of the House and the deliberation concluded. **10<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Male Dog Year**



corresponding to January 16, 2019. The voting list is provided in Annexure 7.

#### **14. Motion to retain the post of Gaydrungs under Gewog Administration**

The Member from Bongo-Chapcha Constituency moved the motion to retain the post of Gaydrungs under Gewog Administration. The Member submitted that, the Gyadrungs provided effective services to the people under Gups and Mangmis, when they were occupied in various activities of planning. Thus, people raised concerns in receiving those services if the Gyadrungs are removed.

The Member submitted that issue on Gaydrung has been deliberated intensively in the previous sessions and have had discussions with Royal Civil Service Commission. However it has concluded with no fruitful results. It was reported that the announcement to do away with the Post of Gaydrung commencing from March 05, 2019 has left local people and the Gaydrungs worried. The Member urged the House to support on following two recommendations:

1. To retain the post of Gaydrungs in the Gewog Administration
2. If possible, to include the Gaydrungs as Civil Servants.

Deliberating on the motion, the Members in support of the recommendations stated that, the Gaydrungs are not only the direct interaction point for the people, but also carries out most of the administrative work. Moreover, the post of Gyadrung existed from a very long ago and they played a very important role in preserving and promoting the national language. It was therefore, submitted that Gaydrungs should be retained regularized as civil servants. They further added that, while the elected leaders change according to their terms, Gaydrungs hold on as an institutional memory. Gaydrungs

were reported to have been great help to the rural people, and thus it was imperative that the status of Gaydrungs should be reviewed and regularized as Civil Servants.

Likewise, some Members stated that, although the issue has been deliberated in earlier sessions, it was left without much attention, and as per Article 22.19 of the Constitution, the Local Governments should be fully supported. It was submitted that if the well experienced Gaydrungs were removed, the unemployment issues would further rise and also the need of Human resource in gewog centres would worsen.

On that, Cabinet Ministers led by Finance Minister stated that the Gaydrungs were recruited in the past since the Local Government Leaders were illiterate. However, the present leaders are skilled with knowledge and experience. The regularization of Gaydrungs may not be possible and they should not be under Contract Category but it would be more effective if they are kept as Para-regular employees.

Moreover, it was reported that as of today, from 199 Gewogs, 70 Gewogs had Gaydrungs on Contract and for the Regularized Gaydrungs, the payment was Nu.13,000 per month. It was submitted that in terms of regularization, the RCSC has own set of Rules and Policies and it would be more favourable, if the authority is kept with RCSC only. It was recommended that since Gaydrungs had been preserving our culture and traditions at rural level, it was imperative to retain their posts.

After an extensive deliberation, while ascertaining the support on the first motion regarding the retaining of Gaydrungs in Gewog Administration, 40 Members voted “Yes” and 2 Members Abstained out of 42 Members present and voting and accordingly passed the motion with Majority support of the House.

**The Voting Result is provided in Annexure 8.**

Similarly, while ascertaining the support on the second Motion regarding the possibility of regularization of the Gaydrungs under Civil Service, 25 Members voted “Yes”, 8 Members voted “No” and 9 Members Abstained, and passed the motion. However, as the authority for regularization of Gaydrungs lies with the RCSC, it was decided that any strategic measures implemented by the RCSC could suffice on the matter and concluded the deliberation.

**The Voting Result is provided in Annexure 9.**

The Finance Minister in his dissenting opinion submitted that the issue has already been studied thoroughly by the RCSC and since the regularization of Gardrungs contravenes the principle of the Civil Service Act and its Rules, and hence retaining them on Contract would encourage better working and also be effective for the people. The Member of Panbang Constituency expressed that under second recommendation, it must be mandatory to regularize the post of Gyadrungs as Civil Servants and not ‘if possible’, owing its importance.

**15. Resolutions on the Ratification of the Air Service Agreement between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of the United Arab Emirates**

On January 17, 2019, the Member-Incharge of the bill, Minister for Information and Communications moved a Motion for the first reading of the Air Service Agreement between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of the United Arab Emirates. Accordingly, the House through majority show of hands agreed to deliberate on the agreement

Consequently, in the Second Reading, the Minister reported that the Air Service Agreement between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of the United Arab Emirates was based on Chicago Convention on International Civil Aviation, 1944. With the motive to increase international air routes, the draft Air Service Agreement between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of the United Arab Emirates, the previous cabinet has signed it on November 29, 2015 and including United Arab Emirates, and other seven nations.

It was submitted that if the Agreement is ratified by the Parliament, it would enable quality air services and generate employment opportunities. Moreover, it would bring down the cost of Air transport and increase business opportunities and also increase tourist inflow gradually leading to economic growth opportunity.

The Member of Lamgong\_Wangchang and other Members stated that Paro International Airport is beneficial to the nation but the people in the locality have been affected, and even if the agreement prove beneficial to the nation, it was imperative to implement strategies in order to address impacts on sovereignty, culture and environment. It was submitted that if the Agreement is endorsed, the MoIC should communicate with the two aviation industries and also communicate on the route from Paro to Delhi and to Dubai via Bangkok at the earliest by acquiring 5<sup>th</sup> Freedom Right.

Moreover, if the agreement is ratified, while there will be more inflow of western tourist due to cut in time and cost, it would impact the functioning of existing two air services in the country and the environment and culture of the country. It was submitted that, while

the advantages are known, it is also important to share in the House the disadvantages of the agreement to weigh its outcome and to gather the trust and confidence of the general public.

Clarifying on that, the Member-incharge of the bill stated that there might be few inconveniences, however, if the Agreement poses greater threat in the future, there would be opportunity to terminate the agreement, and therefore House need not worry on that. Following that, the House carried out thorough deliberation on each article of the Agreement.

On January 18, 2019, the Member In-Charge of the Bill, Minister for Information and Communication moved the Motion for ratification of the Air Service Agreement between the Royal Government of Bhutan and the Government of the United Arab Emirates. Accordingly, 38 Members voted “Yes”, 2 Members voted “No” and 1 Member Abstained out of 43 Members present and voting, and therefore ratified the agreement.

**The Voting Result is provided in Annexure 10.**

Subsequently, the Member from Lamgong\_Wangchang in his dissenting opinion expressed that the impacts of polluted air and noise has been affecting the people in the locality, and despite the lands being taken for Airport Construction, the Government and the Department of Civil Aviation could not provide justifiable compensation or assure any employment opportunities to the people of locality.

Similarly, the Member of Panbang Constituency submitted that after discussing with few employees of the Department of Civil Aviation, it was found out that if the 5<sup>th</sup> Freedom Right with Delhi and Nepal has not been made clear, there was no use of the agreement despite being ratified. However, the Member further expressed that before ratifying the agreement, it would be wiser if extensive deliberation

could be carried out between the two countries. He added that the agreement could be deferred upto 6 months or a year until the 5th Freedom right is confirmed.

**16. Question Hour: Group A: Questions to the Prime Minister, Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs, and Ministry of Information and Communications**

The Speaker informed the House that, there were six questions for oral responses. The Speaker informed that the opportunity to ask supplementary questions would be given only after all the oral questions had been answered, and commenced the session.

- 16.1 The Member from Khar\_Yurung Constituency reported that the Prime Minister has previously informed the House that Samtse Throm would be declared as Thromde A. The Member stated that despite having support on the proposal, it was felt that in the interest of balanced development, few other Throms like Bajo in Wangdiphodrang, Jakar in Bumthang and Mongar, and Trashigang were also ready to be declared as Thromde A. The Member questioned whether the Prime Minister would consider that proposal and if so, when the Government would initiate the process.
- 16.2 The Member from Khatoe\_Laya Constituency submitted that although it was imperative for the government and tourist drivers to have qualification, it was understood that regular taxi drivers did not require class VIII qualification for obtaining private taxi licenses. The Member submitted that, the issue must be reviewed. Thus, the Member questioned the Minister for Information and Communications as to whether the ministry after implementing the appropriate measures, would consider supporting on the matter or not.
- 16.3 The Member from Drametse\_Ngatshang Constituency submitted that one of the pledges to be initiated by the Government within 120

days was to initiate recruitment of foreign domestic workers. The Member questioned the Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs to inform the House about its status.

16.4 The Member from Dragteng\_Langthil Constituency submitted that Gelephu-Trongsa Highway has been one of the oldest national roads and lifeline for three Dzongkhags of Zhemgang, Trongsa and Bumthang. The Member stated that given the situation of continued landslides at Riotala and frequent roadblock at Ossey, it has affected the business of above mentioned Dzongkhags, and also asserted heavy risks to commuters' lives. Therefore, the Member asked the Minister for Information and Communications on the status and future plan of these two sites, and how would the ministry ensure route safety for the commuters.

16.5 The Member from Dewathang\_Gomdar Constituency questioned the Prime Minister regarding the increment of National Minimum Wage Rate to Nu. 450/- as pledged.

16.6 The Member from Boomdeling\_Jamkhar Constituency questioned the Minister for Information and Communications to update on the status of developing the mobile app "Suung Joen" which was pledged to be initiated within 120 days.

**12<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 18, 2019.**

*Note: Detailed answers and deliberations on the above mentioned oral questions are provided separately in the verbatim book published for reference.*

## **17. Resolution on Motion to institute special and targeted measures to promote tourism for balanced regional development**

The Member from Dewathang\_Gomdar Constituency submitted that Tourism has helped to generate US\$ 7.6 billion in the global economy and has even helped to generate international income

of around 10.2% and created employment opportunities worth 292 million. The Member submitted that in the year 2017, Bhutan had registered total of 254,704 tourists out of which 62,272 were international tourist and 183,287 were regional tourist. In 2017, the tourism sectors had contributed revenue of US\$ 79,807,169 to the government thereby becoming one of the important sectors to boost our country's economy.

Although tourism has helped to generate income and create employment opportunities but its benefits are reaped by only few Dzongkhags and all the 20 Dzongkhags had not been benefited equally. He informed that although the former government had instituted measures such as tourism levy exemption for development of tourism in the eastern regions, it has not been able to benefit at a larger range.

The Member further stated that although there were lots of challenges in equal development of tourism in all the 20 Dzongkhags, Government must initiate to institute infrastructures and policies for equal development of tourism in the eastern regions. With that, the following recommendations were submitted to which to which he asked the support of the House:

**Recommendations:**

1. To institute air service from Guwahati to Yonphula, Bumthang and Gelephu.
2. To institute measures through which tourists can enter from border towns like Samdrup Jongkhar, Gelephu, Samtse, Nganglam and Panbang and measures like driving of Bhutanese vehicles and accompanying of tourist guides should be instituted for their



safety and security.

While deliberating on this motion, some of the Members submitted that since tourism being is one of the important income generators in the country, it was important to develop tourism through equal regional development. Accordingly, it was imperative to institute necessary tourist amenities at the same time. Some Members also reported that since most of the regional tourists bring their own foods and drive their own cars, it has been affecting the international tourists as well as difficulties are faced in managing waste and maintaining clean environment.

Furthermore, it was deliberated that if air service is started from Guwahati to Yonphula, Gelephu and Bumthang, then it would help in reducing the number of regional tourist coming with their own vehicles. Some Members stated that except for the entry point from Phuntsholing, the entry points from other border towns are closed for security reasons. Now with the changing situation and development of country, if the entry points in other border towns could be reopened then it would greatly help in development of tourism in the eastern regions.

Some of the Members opined that although they supported for opening of new entry points in border towns like Samdrup Jongkhar and Gelephu, however, if the House passed an immediate resolution to start new air service, then it would have doubt on its advantages and disadvantages. On other hand, some Members stated that it is the responsibility of the government to get the permit, it should be done by the government. And if the government could get the permission for air service, then it would encourage the airline corporations to work harder.

Submission was also made that it was also important to see whether there is possibility for the Bhutanese airlines to fly to newly opened airports in Bagdora and Sikkim. Some Members also submitted that there is a need to formulate a Tourism Act. Regarding the opening of entry points, some Members suggested that one or two entry points may be opened first if it is not possible to open all the entry points at once, and then the rest of the entry points could be opened later after studying their necessity. Members also stated that two main reasons for unequal development of tourism was that if the tourists want to come via land, then there would be no entry point, and should tourists wish to come via air, then there would be no air service and thus, these challenges have greatly affected the tourism. Therefore, it was submitted that if the government could accept the motion on opening of entry points through border towns and introduction of air services, then it is important to work accordingly after prioritization its importance. In addition, some members stated that whether the regional tourist and international tourist could be treated as same without any segregation.

On that, the Ministers led by Prime Minister acknowledged and credited the employees of tourism and private sectors for rendering support in development of tourism sector. Prime Minister also stated that air service from Guwahati to Bhutan was to open then, however, Guwahati being in Indian land, Bhutan had to pay the airport charges. Regarding the entry points, it was submitted that since the government has promised to open the entry points from Samdrup Jongkhar, Gelephu, Samtse, Nganglam and Panbang, the government has full support and would accordingly review the relevant laws and policies to make it better.

Regarding the introduction of air service, it was reported that there was no problem in giving the approval; however, if the government has to bear the losses by giving exemptions to the airline corporations, then it would cause inconveniences to the government. Therefore, it is not wise to decide immediately. The Prime Minister agreed to provide support after consulting with the relevant stakeholders and after doing thorough research.

Similarly, regarding the improvement in tourism policy, it was reported that the government has started to work by exchanging the chairperson and members of tourism council. To further benefit the people equally through tourism, the government is working hard towards formulation of a tourism policy. However, it was also submitted that since it involved lots of research, it might take longer duration and government would not want to initiate any developmental activities without proper review and research. Nevertheless, if the government has to approve the air service in the aforementioned places and start flying immediately, Prime Minister stated that the government would not be able provide any support.

While deliberating on the first recommendation submitted by the Member from Dewathang\_ Gomdar Constituency on the establishment of air service from Guwahati to Yonphula, Bumthang and Gelephu, the House altered the recommendation by adding that the government would carry out thorough study and initiate working on it.

While deciding the recommendation one for government to carry out proper research for the establishment of air service from Guwahati to Yonphula, Bumthang and Gelephu, 40 Members voted “Yes” and 3 Members voted “No” out of 43 members present and voting, therefore

the House adopted the motion through the majority support of votes.

**The voting list is provided in Annexure 11.**

In his dissenting opinion, the Minister for Information and Communication stated that despite the support on the general recommendation, however, the establishment of air service from Guwahati to Yonphula, Bumthang or any other place, it is important to look at the conventions signed between Bhutan and international civil aviation as per the rules of International Civil Aviation.

While ascertaining the support on the second recommendation to institute measures to open entry points from border towns like Samdrup Jongkhar, Gelephu, Samtse, Nganglam and Panbang; and requiring the regional tourist to accompany tourist guide and travel in Bhutanese vehicle for their security, out of 43 Members present, 40 voted “Yes” and 2 Members voted “No” and one Abstained, and therefore, adopted the recommendation through the majority support of votes. **The voting list is provided in Annexure 12.**

The Finance Minister in his dissenting opinion stated that one should be cautious and careful in opening all the entry points in the border towns at one go besides keeping in mind the the issues of management and human resource. The Member from Lhamoizingkha-Tashiding Constituency requested the government to keep in mind to include the entry point from Lhamoizingkha while discussing to open the entry points in border towns. Following that, House directed the government to work accordingly and concluded the deliberation.

**12<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 18, 2019.**

## **18. Resolution on Report of Public Accounts Committee on review of Financial Audits**

Before the report of the Chairperson of Public Accounts Committee (PAC), the Secretary General read out the Royal Kasho of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo to convene the Joint Sitting of the House as directed by the Speaker, and then, the Speaker declared the Performance Audit Report on the Preparedness for implementation of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and Performance Audit Report on Bhutan Chamber of Commerce and Industry (BCCI) which was tabled in both English and Dzongkha as public documents which were presented before Parliament by the Royal Audit Authority (RAA) as per Article 25.1 of the Constitution.

**The Royal Kasho is provided in Annexure 13.**

Subsequently, the Chairperson of the Public Accounts Committee, the Eminent Member of National Council, Phuntsho Raptan presented the report which constituted of:

- 1) Synthesis of Annual Audit Report 2017
- 2) Follow up on Implementation Status of AAR 2010-2016 and Committee's observation and recommendations.

While deliberating on the issues in the chapter I of the synthesized report of Annual Audit Report 2017, some of the Members stated that although resolution was passed in the 11th session of the Third Parliament to resolve all the financial irregularities, the agencies have still not resolved all the audit issues and therefore, it was important for the government to come up with measures to fix the accountabilities. Furthermore, majority of the unresolved irregularities were observed in the hydropower projects which was of huge concern and therefore, it was important for the government to take extra responsibility to resolve these issues.

Some Members stated that it would be convenient while auditing, if the internal auditors are placed under RAA instead of keeping them under different agencies and besides, it was important to keep the Internal Auditors as independent. Further, statement was made that, it would be more convenient if Gewogs, Dzongkhags and agencies could be audited differently.

On this, some Members sought clarification from the Committee or relevant ministries as to why some of the agencies have not been able to resolve any irregularities when some had fully resolved the irregularities.

In clarification from the relevant ministries, the Minister for Labor and Human Resource submitted that out of two irregularities of MoLHR, one issue pertained to employment agency whereby the business did not go well and beside that, youths kept on opting for better opportunities thereby affecting the business. However, MoLHR agreed to settle this irregularity at the earliest. Similarly, Minister for Home and Cultural Affairs submitted that irregularities reflected under MoHCA pertained mostly to Gewogs and Dzongkhags and therefore, the ministry agreed to interfere and resolve the issues at the earliest. Further, it was stated that in the 12th FYP, around 50% of the budget has been allocated to local government and there was a need of support to enhance the capacity of local government while dealing with such budget so that such irregularities could be minimized in future.

Some Members enquired on underutilization of capital budget of around 7 billion, while some members expressed their concern over

huge irregularity of Nu. 17 million in Bhutan Film Association. In addition, since Thromdes had huge amount of irregularities, members expressed that government should come up with strong guidelines and measures to avoid such irregularities in future.

As a clarification, the chairperson of PAC stated that delay in getting No Objection Certificates for the construction works, delay in starting works after allotment of budget and sometimes contractors could not complete the works in time due to climatic reasons. Therefore, as a measure to avoid such problems, MoF has decided to keep the capital budget below 5% in the Annual Performance Agreement.

Few Members stated that although PAC has been able to come up with a good report within short span of time, there was a room for improvement in the reporting system such as observations in the annual audit, review of RAA's observation, observations in the certification of annual statement, standards in maintaining the accounts and problems and challenges faced by RAA as mentioned in the RoP of PAC. The Member stated that if the report could be presented with such information, it would be beneficial and beside that, if the committee could consult properly with relevant stakeholders and provide necessary recommendations, there would be a great opportunity to encourage and motivate the people actually working in the field.

Regarding the recommendation stated by RAA and the committee, the Finance Minister informed that the Ministry is reviewing the public procurement rules and regulations 2009 and is also planning to draft a Public Procurement Act. Moreover, the Ministry has started online e-procurement system and had already started training the

procurement officials of agencies so that it would help them while dealing with the procurement.

The Chairperson of National Council stated that it would be better if the committee could conduct public hearing with Hydropower projects on irregularities rather than having to go through MoEA. The Chairperson also stated that if the committee could review the recommendations made by RAA on the performance audit on Hydropower projects, it would enable the committee to understand the issues more clearly and would help to resolve the irregularities. To that, the Chairperson of the Committee stated that if the relevant agency has been mentioned in the recommendation, there would be possibility that the agency would also take extra responsibility to resolve the irregularities.

On that matter, the Minister for Economic Affairs stated that since hydropower projects were big projects and moreover the two countries have different policies and laws, such small irregularities were possible while dealing with the projects. Furthermore, it was informed that there was no need to be alarmed since such irregularities were not due to fraud or corruption and stated that the Ministry would work hard towards solving the irregularities by September 2019 and assured to submit its report to the committee.

Some other Members stated that House had passed several recommendations in the past mandating the agencies to resolve the irregularities, however, the agencies had paid less attention and failed to resolve the issues. Thus, it was recommended that henceforth, if the committee could conduct public hearing with the agencies in live, it would serve as a reminder and help in resolving the irregularities.



Regarding the second recommendation of RAA, one of the Members stated that their recommendation did not clearly specify who was going to implement the recommendation and therefore, in order to enhance the accountability, it would be better if RAA itself could institute the measures. And while deliberating on the additional recommendation requiring the non-hydropower agencies to initiate measures to resolve such issues and to accordingly submit its report to the committee within September 2019, the House accepted the recommendation and directed the committee to discuss the recommendation thoroughly and present in the second day of deliberation. With that, the House adjourned its first day of deliberation.

**On the Second Day of the Joint Sitting**, while continuing the deliberation on committee's report, the Chairperson presented the additional recommendation on AAR 2017 as per the direction of the House- "Public Accounts Committee recommends the respective agencies (excluding Hydropower projects) to follow up on the unresolved irregularities of AAR 2017 and report the status to PAC by September 2019". Regarding the RAA's second recommendation, since RAA has already enacted ways and means to impose the accountability, there was no need to give additional recommendation to which the House endorsed it unanimously through show of hands.

While deliberating on Chapter 2, some Members stated that it was important for the committee to take extra responsibility and review why the investigations related to irregularities mentioned in AAR 2010 by ACC was still pending for so long, and in some cases, the court has issued the judgement but still not enforced. It was also stated that it was imperative for the Parliament to pass a strong resolution and suggested for proper coordination between these three institutions. It

was also reminded that the agencies need to work hard to resolve the irregularities.

Moreover, the irregularities related to blacktopping of Dalbari to Dagapela highway has still not completed and hence, it has affected the people a lot. Therefore, to avoid such situation in future, it was important to develop the preventive measures. While some members recommended PAC to come up with new ideas to resolve the pending irregularities, on the other hand, some members stated that a, it should be left to PAC to resolve the issues but recommended the government to provide support in terms of both human resource and finance. And regarding the write off of issues, Members stated that it would be better if the committee could present the write off of issues as recommendation to be decided by the parliament.

Regarding the recommendation to keep Internal Auditors under RAA, some Members stated that RAA is a constitutional body with its own responsibility and Internal Auditors has their own Rules of Procedure. Moreover, MoF is planning to assign them extra responsibility of Monitoring Officer and was in the process of reviewing their rules of procedure; therefore, it might be fine to keep them as it was.

Some Members stated that amongst many ways to resolve the irregularities, one of the best ways is to conduct public hearing and review the issues by MoF, RAA and the committee together. Although Section 123 of the Audit Act of Bhutan 2018 states that if serious issues are not resolved within 12 months after the presentation of report to the Parliament, the relevant agency has to take the concerned official to the court and if the agency fails do so, then RAA can withhold the

issuance of audit clearance to the head of agencies, however, there should be a criteria to define what constitutes serious issues.

Moreover, some Members stated that regarding the write off of issues, it is important to see whether the Parliament has the authority to write off the issues or not. It was also stated that as mentioned in the RoP of PAC, it would be better if the committee could include the challenges of RAA while presenting the committee's report. With regard to the issues like non enforcement of court verdict and missing or absconding of accountable officials, it was important for the committee, ACC and RBP to sit together and come up with measures to resolve the issues.

Similarly, the prolonged irregularities related to Bhutan Education City can be resolved if the government provides adequate support and reviews the issues thoroughly. And most of the irregularities were in hydropower projects which if converted into percentage then it would come to around 91.5 %. Therefore, it was necessary to discuss how such irregularities have occurred and if left without any concern then irregularities from hydropower projects could cross the budget of five year plans. Hence, it was important to have extra deliberation on the irregularities of hydropower and in future, it would be better if the budget for hydropower projects could be deliberated and endorsed by the Parliament itself.

The House also reminded the relevant agencies to work hard to resolve the irregularities within June, 2019 as per the resolution passed by the 11<sup>th</sup> Session of the Second Parliament. While voting on the three recommendations of the committee, out of total 67 Members present and voting, 66 voted 'Yes' and 1 Abstained , and therefore endorsed

with Two-Third majority as follows:

1. PAC hereby, endorses all the four recommendations of RAA and urges MoF in particular to implement RAA's recommendations and report to PAC by September 2019.
2. Further PAC recommends MoEA to follow up in collaboration with RAA on the unresolved irregularities of Hydropower Projects for the period AAR 2017 and report to PAC by September 2019.
3. Public Accounts Committee recommends the respective agencies (excluding Hydropower projects) to follow up on the unresolved irregularities of AAR 2017 and report the status to PAC by September 2019

The Parliament agreed to provide support to PAC in terms of both human resource and finance as requested by Chairperson of PAC, Prime Minister and other members of the House. With that, the deliberation on PAC report concluded.

**16<sup>th</sup> Day of 12<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to January 22, 2019. The voting list is provided in Annexure 14.**

## **19. Resolution of re-deliberation on 2018-19 Budget and Budget Appropriation Bill**

The National Council after thorough deliberation on the Budget Appropriation Bill for fiscal year 2018-19, it was referred back to the National Assembly for re-deliberation as per Article 13.7 of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan with recommendation of three amendments and two general recommendations. The House deliberated each recommendation and endorsed as follows:

In recommendation 1, National Council recommended deleting short title, scope and section 3 under applicable time as it might contradict

with Article 14.3 of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan. To that, the Members stated that it just depends upon the interpretation of words and it did not contradict any laws. The Members also stated that there is no issue in endorsing as per the draft budget because Budget for FY 2018-19 was endorsed by the 11th Session of the Second Parliament and the new government had just endorsed it officially.

While some Members stated that although National Council has recommended for amendments but once it has been passed by the National Assembly, and then forwarded back by National Council, it would be only to deliberate whether to accept the recommendations of National Council or not, and not to change the recommendations. To that, the Members supported and endorsed the three recommendations of amendment to sections 3 and 4 and section 1 of Budget Appropriation Bill as mentioned in the draft bill.

Regarding the first general recommendation, National Council stated that although few flagship programmes have been included in this year's financial budget, the allocation of budget was not specifically mentioned and henceforth, requested the government to clearly specify the allocation of budget while presenting the budget report. To that, the Finance Minister stated that there could be slight changes if the budget for small activities could be finalized and submitted before endorsement. It was further informed that the Finance Ministry would finalize the details of activity after the endorsement of budget and would submit to the relevant ministries, agencies and even to the MPs which would enable them to understand more clearly.

While seeking the support of the House by show of hands, all the

Members supported and therefore, endorsed the first recommendation.

Regarding the second general recommendation, the National Council stated that works have not been able to start in some places due to climatic reasons for the Capital Budget passed for 6 months, therefore, requested to come up with new ideas so that the budget could be given back as grant to the gewogs in the next financial year. To that, some Members stated that as per the financial rules, the budget has been provided for the spillover works and has to be provided henceforth as well. Members stated that it might pose inconvenience in future if the underutilized budget of this financial year has been extraordinarily given back as a grant in next the financial year, therefore regretted to provide support to this recommendation. the House while ascertaining the support through the show of hands on recommendation, the House could not secure majority support, and therefore could not endorse the recommendation.

Following that, the Speaker extended his appreciation to the National Council for forwarding back the budget report to the National Assembly for re-deliberation after reviewing and deliberating it thoroughly. With that, re-deliberation on budget report concluded.

**18<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year Corresponding to January 23, 2019.**

## **20. Rectification of Resolution**

1. The Secretary General read out the resolutions of the National Assembly for rectification to the House on 23<sup>rd</sup> January, 2019. While reading the resolution on Budget report, the Member from Panbang constituency as well as other Members stated that like in the past, question-answer and the reports presented by government like Five Year Plan reports which were already presented in booklet form need not be read in the interest of time. The Member suggested that it would be beneficial if only the resolutions passed as a result of deliberation could be read out to which the House agreed and supported without any dissenting opinion. The House directed to rectify the draft resolutions as decided today.
2. Though other resolutions were rectified as per verbatim, the Opposition Leader stated that resolution agreed by the House to change the name of REDCL to Agriculture Bank for the benefit of people needs to be rectified. To that, when referred to verbatim, it was found out that although there were discussions to change the name of REDCL, however, at the end, the committee's recommendation did not get the required support and therefore, the resolution could not be rectified and decided to keep as it was in the draft resolution.

After reading out the resolutions, having no one to share the dissenting opinion, the House adopted the resolutions of National Assembly and therefore, concluded the session on the rectification of resolution.

## **21. Concluding Ceremony**

On 19<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year, corresponding to January 24, 2019, the Speaker of National Assembly, the Chairperson of National Council and two Secretaries General of

two Houses received His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo to the Gyalyong Tshogkhang Hall from Gate 1 and then commenced the Concluding Ceremony.

## **21.2 Concluding Address by the Speaker**

On behalf of the Members, the Speaker thanked and welcomed His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for gracing the Concluding Ceremony of the First Session of the Third Parliament.

The Speaker also thanked the Members of the Royal Family, representatives of the Central Monastic Body, leaders of the Armed Forces, senior government officials, foreign dignitaries, and all people who had come to witness this occasion.

The Speaker reported that the First Session has unanimously endorsed 9 Standing Committees and also passed capital budget of Nu. 11,380.192 million for the period 01/01/2019 to 30/06/2019 as a part of FY 2019-20 budget report.

The Speaker informed that the House has deliberated on 12<sup>th</sup> FYP and PAC's report on review of Annual Audit report 2017 and also adopted two international conventions and successfully carried out motions and question hour sessions.

The Speaker further informed that the House also directed the committee to follow up and report in the Second Session on the status of implementation of resolutions passed by the House. It was reported that the House has reminded the committees to carry out oversight and public hearings to effectively carry out the legislative functions.

On behalf of the parliament, the Speaker also thanked His Majesty



the Druk Gyalpo for granting generously kidus to the citizens to achieve food sufficiency and increase production. The Speaker further expressed deepest gratitude to His Holiness the Je Khenpo for conducting various religious activities for the benefit of people.

In conclusion, the Members and the Speaker led by Zhung Dratshang offered their prayers for the good health and long life of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and the Members of the Royal Family, His Holiness the Je Khenpo and all other noble beings. The House offered Zhapten to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and concluded the 1<sup>st</sup> Session of the Third Parliament of Bhutan.

**The full address is provided in Annexure 15.**



24 January, 2019

(Wangchuk Namgyel)

**SPEAKER**

**Annexure 1**

**Annexure 1: Inaugural Address by Tshogpon at the Opening Ceremony of the First Session of Third Parliament of Bhutan**

1. The First Session of the Third Parliament of Bhutan commences with effect from today on the most auspicious day graced by the kind presence of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

On behalf of the Parliament, it is my pleasure to welcome His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo with immense gratitude for gracing the opening ceremony of the First Session, leaving aside numerous royal engagements for the welfare of the people and the country.

2. I would also like to welcome Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen, Members of the Royal Family, Members of the Parliament, senior government officials, foreign dignitaries and the public who have come to witness the occasion. I would like to further welcome all people who are witnessing today's session through live broadcast and radio.
3. I would like to share that our successive monarch has granted full faith and trust to the people of Bhutan, and therefore granted the gift of democracy to the Bhutanese people. Accordingly, the Prime Minister, Cabinet Ministers and Members of parliament of the Second Parliament had reported fruitful achievements of the 11th Five Year Plan. Furthermore, the Speaker of the National Assembly of Bhutan and the Chairperson of the National Council of Bhutan had carried out successful proceedings in both the Houses and therefore, the Members of the Parliament of the Third Parliament would like to thank and extend our deepest appreciation to them.

Similarly, we would also like to thank and extend appreciation to the Leader of Opposition and the members of opposition party for shouldering great responsibilities and accountability with utmost

**Annexure 1**

dedication in the past Parliament. Under the good leadership of the incumbent Opposition Leader and experienced members, I am hopeful that the members of opposition party will continue to render full support and guidance during the Third Parliament as well.

4. The Election Commission of Bhutan (ECB) has carried out procedural reviews and advocacies for free and fair elections of Local Government and the Third Parliament Election in particular. The Parliament would like to thank and applaud the Election Commission of Bhutan (ECB) for their successful coordination.
5. The people of Bhutan entrusted Druk Nyamdrup Tshogpa (DNT) with the huge responsibility to form the government during the Third National Elections to Parliament of Bhutan in the era of our Democratic Constitutional Monarchical system.

It is, therefore, imperative for the Members of Parliament to serve with utmost dedication and loyalty to fulfill the hopes and needs of our people. It is also vital that Members of the Parliament serve genuinely and modestly, keeping in mind the present and future welfare of country, ensuring social development and fulfillment of planned objectives during the deliberation in the House.

6. In addition, it is also important to keep in mind - the foundation of the laws of the nation, profound philosophy of the Gross National Happiness, and the vision of the government to Narrowing the Gap at all times. Thus, it is of paramount importance for the Members of Parliament to ensure bringing in Bhutanese people together through eradication of rural poverty, minimizing youth unemployment, solving public debt, combating corruption, and development of strategic plans and measures to overcome the challenges.

**Annexure 1**

7. During the 111th National Day held in Samtse Dzongkhag, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo has resonated His most profound words of wisdom on the importance of uplifting national sovereignty and security of the nation, preservation and promotion of culture, conservation of the natural environment, maintaining mutual cooperation with other nations, and maintaining the sacred identity of the Bhutanese nation. We are hopeful that civil servants and public servants will forever keep these profound words of wisdom and serve with full dedication. As commanded by His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, it is our utmost duty to realize greater concern on the country's resources while implementing great projects and activities during the commencement of the 12th Five Year Plan in the country. It is also hopeful that members would strive to serve with greater vigor and enthusiasm.
8. If I may report to the House, Lyonchhen Dr. Lotay Tshering and his entourage has made a maiden state visit to New Delhi, India. The visit further strengthened the already existing close ties of friendship and cooperation between the two countries, and also strengthened bilateral ties and economic linkages. Therefore, the Parliament would like to thank Lyonchhen for his most successful visit.
9. During the 2018 national elections, the people of Nyishog-Saephu Constituency under Wangduephodrang Dzongkhag elected me as their representative to the National Assembly of Bhutan. Furthermore, Lyonchhen and Members of Parliament elected me to the post of the Speaker. More significantly, it is indeed a great honour for me to receive Dakyen from His Majesty as the Speaker of the Third Parliament. Therefore, I would like to deeply express my gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.
10. I also take this privilege to express that during my tenure as the Speaker, I will be fortunate enough to receive the words of wisdom

**Annexure 1**

and guidance from His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo. Additionally, I am anticipating that the Members of the Parliament would render their full support and cooperation to me. Hence, I as the Speaker would like to take this oath to serve the Tsa-Wa-Sum with the deepest of my faith and utmost dedication.

11. Under the glorious reign of the Wangchuck Dynasty with our successive monarchs, the people of Bhutan cannot be more prosperous and harmonious than today. Thus, it is crucial that people of Bhutan realize such fortunate era in all times.
12. Our benign His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo has been working tirelessly for the welfare of our people. His Majesty has personally met with the people of remote communities, and granted kidu graciously to our people in needs. Therefore, the Parliament would like to express our utmost gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.
13. During the 111<sup>th</sup> National Day Celebration, His Majesty has conferred the Highest Civilian Decoration in the country, the Order of The Druk Gyalpo (Ngadag Pelgi Khorlo) to His Holiness the 70<sup>th</sup> Je Khenpo. Therefore, the Parliament would like to express our utmost gratitude to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.
14. Under the patronage of His Holiness the Je Khenpo, Zhung Dratshangs, Rabdeys, Goendeys and religious institutions performed numerous initiatives for sustaining peace and harmony in the country. Moreover, His Holiness presided over the Salang Tendrel ceremony for the construction of a Buddhist temple at Rajgir, Bihar, India. His Holiness also presided over the World Peace Prayers (Moenlam Chenmo) at Bodh Gaya. Thus, the Parliament would like to express our gratitude to His Holiness the Je Khenpo.

**Annexure 1**

15. The First Session of the Third Parliament of Bhutan will be deliberating the following agenda:
- a. Formation of Committees and appointment of the Committee Members.
  - b. Adoption of Budget Appropriation Bill for the FY 2018-2019.
  - c. Adoption of the 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan.
  - d. Deliberation on Two Protocols, petitions from Two Dzongkhags, Motions and Question Hour sessions.
  - e. Deliberation of the Review Report on the Annual Audit Report 2017 by the Public Accounts Committee in the Joint Sitting of the Parliament.
16. I would like to report that apart from the two petitions, the additional agenda received from other Dzongkhags had been extensively deliberated during the Preliminary Meeting, and forwarded to relevant ministries and agencies for necessary action. It is imperative that the ministries and agencies take necessary actions at the earliest possible.
17. In conclusion, with the blessings of the Triple Gem, mighty grace of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and the Members of the Royal Family, collective merits of the people of Bhutan, I would like to offer prayers for the successful conclusion of the First Session of Third Parliament. The Parliament also offer its deep prayers for the long lives of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, Members of the Royal Family, all religious masters, continued flourishing of peace and harmony among the people and the country.

THANK YOU

\*\*\*\*\*

## **Annexure 2**

### **Annexure 2: Formation of Standing Committees of National Assembly, appointment of Members and its Terms of Reference**

#### **Public Accounts Committee**

##### **Members:**

1. Hon'ble Phuntsho Rapten, National Council of Bhutan\*\*
2. Hon'ble Choida Jamtsho, National Assembly of Bhutan\*
3. Hon'ble Ugyen Tshering, National Council of Bhutan
4. Hon'ble Ganesh Ghimiray, National Assembly of Bhutan
5. Hon'ble Dil Maya Rai, National Assembly of Bhutan

#### **Terms of Reference of the Committee**

##### **Functions of the Committee**

1. The Committee shall review and report to the Parliament on:
  - (i) The economy, efficiency, and effectiveness in the use of public resources in the implementation of policy rather than on the merits and demerits of the policy;
  - (ii) Transparency and accountability in the resource allocation and its utilization;
  - (iii) Various reports of the Auditor General the Committee chooses to review;
  - (iv) The reports of the independent auditor on operations of the Royal Audit Authority;
  - (v) The accounts, financial statements and performances of public corporations, public companies and agencies in which public funds have been invested; and
  - (vi) Such other accounts and reports as may be referred to the Committee by the Joint Sitting of the Parliament.

## **Annexure 2**

### **Duties of the Committee**

2. The duties of the Committee are to review, examine, evaluate and report on the financial and administrative activities of any agency cited in the Public Accounts and the Annual Audit Report of Royal Audit Authority.
- 2.1 The Committee will review:
  - (i) the information in the Public Accounts for reliability and appropriations
  - (ii) matters raised in the Annual Audit report or any other reports presented by the Auditor General which the Committee chooses; and
  - (iii) the audit report on the Royal Audit Authority.
- 2.2 The Committee will examine:
  - (i) past and committed expenditures insofar as they relate directly to and have an impact on matters falling within the year under review to assist the Committee in understanding the context;
  - (ii) the collection of and accounting for revenues;
  - (iii) the probity and value for money in expenditures;
  - (iv) the adequacy of safeguards to protect assets from loss, waste and misappropriation;
  - (v) whether appropriate financial management controls are in existence; and
  - (vi) examine and make such recommendations as the Committee may deem fit if any money has been spent on any service during a financial year in excess of the amount granted by the Parliament for that purpose;



**Annexure 2**

**2.3 The Committee will evaluate:**

- (i) the activities of all agencies in which public funds have been invested;
- (ii) the systems and practices to determine whether transfer payments are used for purposes intended;
- (iii) the efficiency, economy and effectiveness and value for money in implementation of government programs and in their achievement of stated goals in the operation and acquisition of goods and services;
- (iv) whether expenditures are within the limits and for purposes authorized by the Parliament and in general, in compliance with legislative authority; and
- (v) any financial management reforms in government to determine whether due regard is given to maintaining legislative accountability.

**2.4 The Committee will report to Parliament:**

- (i) with any comment it thinks fit, on any items or matters in those public accounts, financial statements and reports, or any circumstances connected with them, that the Committee thinks shall be drawn to the attention of the Parliament;
- (ii) any alteration that the Committee thinks desirable in:
  - (a) the form of the public accounts or in the method of keeping them; or
  - (b) the mode of receipt, control, issue or payment of public moneys;
- (iii) on any question connected with the public accounts which is referred to the Committee by the Parliament, including cases involving losses, nugatory expenditure and financial irregularities;

## **Annexure 2**

- (iv) on the status of implementation of the resolutions related to their respective area of concern by the government and other relevant agencies;
- (v) the operations and performance of the Royal Audit Authority;
- (vi) the resources of the Royal Audit Authority, including funding, staff and information technology;
- (vii) the reports of the Independent Auditor on operations of the Royal Audit Authority Office;
- (viii) report to Parliament on any matter arising out of the Committee's consideration of the matters listed in paragraphs (v), (vi) and (vii) or on any other matter relating to the Auditor-General's functions and powers, that the Committee considers shall be drawn to the attention of the Parliament;

### **2.5 Other duties of the Committee:**

- (i) determine the audit priorities of the Parliament and to advise the Auditor-General of those priorities;
- (ii) determine the audit priorities of the Parliament for audits of the Royal Audit Authority and to advise the Independent Auditor of those priorities;
- (iii) determine and recommend an Independent Auditor for the audit of the Royal Audit Authority;
- (iv) interact with relevant national, regional and international organization and stakeholders; and
- (v) undertake such other duties as are assigned to it by the Joint Sitting of the Parliament.

## **Legislative Committee**

### **Members:**

1. Hon'ble Tshewang Lhamo\*\*
2. Hon'ble Kuenga Loday\*

**Annexure 2**

3. Hon'ble Tshencho Wangdi
4. Hon'ble Ugen Tenzin
5. Hon'ble Kinga Penjor
6. Hon'ble Gyem Dorji
7. Hon'ble Dorjee Wangmo
8. Hon'ble Tenzin
9. Hon'ble Kinley Wangchuk
10. Hon'ble Ugyen Wangdi
11. Hon'ble Karma Wangchuk
12. Hon'ble Choki Gyeltshen

**Terms of Reference of the committee**

- a) Review any bills, convention, treaties, protocols or agreements referred to it by the Speaker or the House or on its own volition, for consistency with the Constitution, other laws and policies and submit its finding to the House;
- b) Review any act or laws referred to it by the Speaker or the House or on its own volition, recommend for necessary with the Constitution, other laws and policies and submit its findings to the House;
- c) Draft and introduce any bill into the House as and when directed by the Speaker or the House;
- d) Review, inquire and investigate any matter that is brought to the notice of the Committee;
- e) Interact with relevant national, regional and international organizations and stakeholders;
- f) Review and report to the House on the status of implementation of the resolutions related to the areas of concern by the government and other relevant agencies; and
- g) Carry out any other issues related to the area of concern referred to by the House and submit the findings, opinions and recommendations.

**Annexure 2**

**Economic and Finance Committee**

**Members:**

1. Hon'ble Kinley Wangchuk\*\*
2. Hon'ble Ganesh Ghimiray\*
3. Hon'ble Dorji Wangdi
4. Hon'ble Jurmi Wangchuk
5. Hon'ble Garja Man Rai
6. Hon'ble Dil Maya Rai
7. Hon'ble Tek Bahadur Rai
8. Hon'ble Bimal Thapa
9. Hon'ble Passang Dorji
10. Hon'ble Rinzin Jamtsho
11. Hon'ble Gyambo Tshering
12. Hon'ble Karma Thinley
13. Hon'ble Dupthob

**Terms of Reference of the committee**

- a) The Committee shall review, deliberate and debate on Socio-Economic Development matters including Private Sector Development and submit recommendations and resolutions to the Parliament.
- b) The Committee shall review, deliberate and debate on National Budget, National Financial Statements and any other fiscal matters and submit recommendations and resolutions to the Parliament.
- c) The Committee shall review, deliberate and debate on Monetary, Money, Finance and Taxation Matters and submit recommendations and resolutions to the Parliament.
- d) The Committee shall review, deliberate and debate on National Debt, National Borrowings, National Reserve and any other economic parameters and submit recommendations and resolutions to the Parliament.

## **Annexure 2**

- e) The recommendations and resolutions submitted to the Parliament could be of both policy and legislative reforms in nature.
- f) The Committee may review and reallocate the budget to achieve balanced development as per Article 9 (8) of the Constitution;
- g) The Committee shall present its reviewed Budget Report within ten working days after the introduction by Finance Minister in the House.
- h) The Committee shall advocate innovation and mainstreaming of GNH for Business and Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) in the Corporate and Private Sector.
- i) The Committee shall review and report on the status of implementation of the resolutions of the preceding sessions referred to it by the House.
- j) The Committee shall review on any other issues referred to it by the House or on any issues of national importance that the Committee deemed important to be reviewed on its own and submit the findings and recommendations to the Parliament;
- k) Review, inquire and investigate any matters that are brought to the notice of the Committee; and
- l) The Committee shall interact with relevant national, regional and international organizations and stakeholders.

## **Good Governance Committee**

### **Members**

- 1. Hon'ble Ugyen Wangdi\*\*
- 2. Hon'ble Kinga Penjor\*
- 3. Hon'ble Hemant Gurung
- 4. Hon'ble Ugyen Dorji
- 5. Hon'ble Tenzin
- 6. Hon'ble Garja Man Rai
- 7. Hon'ble Dorji Wangdi
- 8. Hon'ble Tshering Chhoden
- 9. Hon'ble Ugyen Tshering

## **Annexure 2**

### **Terms of Reference of the Committee**

- a) Review and recommend amendments of the existing laws and policies and propose new policies and legislations relating to good governance;
- b) Review and study the status of the quality of public service delivery by the government ministries and agencies including the public corporations;
- c) Review, inquire and investigate any matter that is brought to the notice of the committee and national issues deemed important by the Committee;
- d) Interact with relevant national, regional and international organizations and stakeholders;
- e) Review and report to the House on the status of implementation of the resolutions related to their respective area of concern by the government and other relevant agencies;
- f) Carry out any other issues related to their respective area of concern referred to by the House and submit the findings, opinions and recommendations; and
- g) Study and report on the annual anti-corruption commission's report to the House.

### **Social and Cultural Committee**

#### **Members**

1. Hon'ble Choki Gyeltshen\*\*
2. Hon'ble Dinesh kumar Pradhan\*
3. Hon'ble Tshencho Wangdi
4. Hon'ble Samdrup R Wangchuk
5. Hon'ble Ugyen Dorji
6. Hon'ble Karma Thinley
7. Hon'ble Karma wangchuk

**Annexure 2**

8. Hon'ble Yeshey Dem
9. Hon'ble Ugen Tenzin

**Terms of Reference of the committee**

- a) Review and recommend amendments of the existing laws, rules and policies relating to Social and Culture and also propose new legislations, if necessary;
- b) Review Laws, Rules & Regulations and Policies regarding labour and employment and suggest amendments or formulation of new Law.
- c) Review and Recommend appropriate measures for promotion and preservation of language, traditions, religion, arts and crafts, and cultural heritage;
- d) Review and make recommendations on issues related to Education, Health, Sports and Cultural development which is detrimental to the general public.
- e) Suggest research activities that will assist the government in formulating labour and employment policies and strategies and profiling emerging issues having impact on the unemployment problems in the country;
- f) Review, inquire and investigate any matter that is brought to the notice of the committee;
- g) Interact with relevant national, regional and international organizations and stakeholders;
- h) Review and report to the house on the status of implementation of the resolution related to their respective area of concern by the government and other relevant agencies;
- i) Carry out any other issues related to their respective area of concern referred to by the House and submit the findings, opinions and recommendations;

## **Annexure 2**

### **Women, Children and the Youth Committee**

#### **Members**

1. Hon'ble Tshering Chhoden\*\*
2. Hon'ble Dorjee Wangmo\*
3. Hon'ble Yeshey Dem
4. Hon'ble Tek Bahadur Rai
5. Hon'ble Bimal Thapa
6. Hon'ble Hemant Gurung
7. Hon'ble Dinesh Kumar Pradhan
8. Hon'ble Norbu Wangzom
9. Hon'ble Samdrup R Wangchuk
10. Hon'ble Kuenga Loday

#### **Terms of Reference of the Committee**

- a) Review and recommend amendments of the existing laws and policies relating to Women, Children and Youth and also propose new legislations;
- b) Review, inquire and investigate any matter that is brought to the notice of the committee;
- c) Support promotion of the rights of women and children;
- d) Interact with relevant National, Regional and International Organizations and Stakeholders;
- e) Review and report to the House on the status of implementation of the resolutions of the National Assembly related to Women, Children and Youth by the Government and other relevant Agencies;
- f) Carry out any other issues related to Women, Children and Youth referred to by the House and submit its findings, opinions and recommendations; and



## **Annexure 2**

- g) Ensure that legislations passed by the National Assembly are gender neutral.

### **Environment & Climate Change Committee**

#### **Members**

1. Hon'ble Dr. Pema Gyamtsho\*\*
2. Hon'ble Gyem Dorji\*
3. Hon'ble Ugyen Tshering
4. Hon'ble Ganesh Ghimiray
5. Hon'ble Tek Bahadur Rai
6. Hon'ble Gyambo Tshering
7. Hon'ble Choida Jamtsho
8. Hon'ble Lungten Namgyel
9. Hon'ble Norbu Wangzom

#### **Terms of Reference of the committee**

- a) Review and recommend amendments of the existing laws and policies, if necessary relating to Environment, mine & minerals, Road, Agriculture, Human-Wild Life conflict, Water, Waste management, air pollution and Urban Development.
- b) Review any bills, convention, amendments, treaties, protocols or agreements referred to it by the Speaker or the House or on its own volition, for consistency with the Constitution, other laws and policies and submit its findings to the House.
- c) Review and recommend possible course of actions on matters affecting the general public related to Environment, Land, Mines & Minerals, Water, Road, Agriculture, Waste, Human-Wild Life conflict management and Urban Development, if necessary.

## **Annexure 2**

- d) Review any act or laws referred to it by the Speaker or the House or on its own volition, recommend for necessary with the Constitution, other laws and policies and submit its findings to the House.
- e) Review, inquire and investigate any matter that is brought to the notice of the committee.
- f) Interact with relevant national, regional and international organizations and stakeholders.
- g) Conduct public hearing, Review and report to the house on the status of implementation of the Forest and Nature Conservation Act, Water Act, Road Act, Waste Management Act and Environment Act, Mines and Minerals Act and the resolutions related to their respective area of concern by the government and other relevant agencies, if necessary.
- h) Carry out any other issues related to their respective area of concern referred to it by the House and submit the findings, opinions and recommendations; and
- i) The committee may assume the responsibility of the issues pertaining to the matters related to agriculture and natural disaster.
- j) Review the measures adopted to assess Bhutan's commitment to remain carbon negative for all times to come;
- k) Review the strategies and modalities adopted to operationalize 'Bhutan for Life' fund.

## **Human Rights and Foreign Relations Committee**

### **Members**

- 1. Hon'ble Jurmi Wangchuk\*\*
- 2. Hon'ble Dupthob\*
- 3. Hon'ble Tenzin
- 4. Hon'ble Choki Gyeltshen
- 5. Hon'ble Rinzin Jamtsho

**Annexure 2**

6. Hon'ble Hemant Gurung
7. Hon'ble Lungten Namgyel
8. Hon'ble Gyem Dorji
9. Hon'ble Passang Dorji

**Terms of Reference of the Committee**

1. Review and recommend amendments of the existing laws and policies relating to Human Rights and Foreign Relations and also propose new legislation
2. The Committee shall monitor the incidents of Human Rights violation as and when deemed necessary and report to the House
3. The Committee shall review and report International Conventions, Covenants, Treaties, protocols and Agreements to the Parliament
4. The Committee shall conduct Public Hearings on pertinent issues related to Human Rights and Foreign Relations
5. The Committee shall oversee/review/follow up with relevant law enforcement agencies on Human Rights issues
6. Review measures to foster political, culture, economic and trade ties with foreign nations
7. Recommend measures for protection of Bhutanese interests abroad; and
8. Review Bhutan's engagement with bilateral countries, UN and Multilateral organizations including establishment of Embassies/ Missions/Consulates and appointment of Special Consular General of Bhutan to ensure that Bhutan's foreign policies are consistent with its national objectives

## **Annexure 2**

### **House Committee**

#### **Members**

1. Hon'ble Dorji Wangdi\*\*
2. Hon'ble Gyem Dorji\*
3. Hon'ble Dil Maya Rai
4. Hon'ble Kinga Penjor
5. Hon'ble Kinley Wangchuk
6. Hon'ble Tshewang Lhamo
7. Hon'ble Dorjee Wangmo
8. Hon'ble Rinzin Jamtsho
9. Hon'ble Karma Wangchuk
10. Hon'ble Ugyen Wangdi
11. Hon'ble Ugyen Dorji

#### **Terms of Reference of the committee**

- a) Deal with the comfort, convenience and privileges of the Members of the National Assembly;
- b) Represent all members of the National Assembly and report their administration problems to the Speaker;
- c) Will look into the problems and welfare of the Members of the National Assembly;
- d) Consider all issues raised by the non-committee members;
- e) Consider all trainings, seminars, conferences, study tours and other HR related matters of the Members of the National Assembly;
- f) Consider all logistics issues of the Members of the National Assembly;
- g) Be responsible for all public relations of the members of the National Assembly;

**Annexure 2**

- h) Review, inquire and investigate any matter that is brought to the notice of the committee;
- i) Oversee the moral and ethical conduct of members of National Assembly;
- j) Examine complaints/cases of unethical conducts of Members of the National Assembly or connected with the parliamentary misconduct referred to it and make recommendations;
- k) Review and recommend amendments of the provisions of code of conduct of Members of National Assembly;
- l) Interact with relevant national, regional and international organizations and stakeholders;
- m) Consider all issues related to the pay, perks, entitlements and privileges of the Members of the National Assembly;
- n) Any other matters related to the Members of the National Assembly;

**Annexure 3**

**Annexure 3: Procedures for Calling Parliamentary Committee Meetings**

**1. Setting Annual Work Plan(AWP)**

A Committee shall, after the conclusion of every Summer Session, set an annual Agenda and based on it, a Work Plan for the Committee for the following one year. The issues of priority in the annual Agenda and Work Plan may generally include the following:

- i. Follow-up to the resolutions of the Parliament;
- ii. Matters petitioned by the electorates and stakeholders directly to the Committee or referred to the Committee by the House; and
- iii. Issues of national importance that a Committee deems important to be reviewed on its own.

The Work Plan may be revised after every Winter Session or from time to time as deem desirable by the Committee.

**2. Setting Meeting Agenda**

The Chairperson shall send a communication to the members, at least one week in advance of the meeting, through letter or email or SMS or all to the members inviting agenda for the forthcoming meeting. The agenda shall generally be drawn from the following:

- i. Annual Work Plan;
- ii. Decisions of the preceding meetings; and
- iii. Proposals from individual members.

**3. Calling Meeting**

The Chairperson shall send a notification calling a meeting, at least 48 hours before the scheduled date of the meeting to the members, through letter or email or SMS or all. The notification shall be accompanied by the following:

- i. Draft Agenda

**Annexure 3**

- ii. Minutes of the preceding meeting; and
- iii. Notes, briefs, background documents or any other documents relevant to the meeting.

**4. Venue, Date and Timing of Meeting**

The notification for a meeting shall also clearly state the venue (e.g., place and Committee Room number), date and timing of the meeting.

**5. Confirmation of Participation**

Upon the issuance of the notification by the Chairperson, the concerned Committee Secretaries shall undertake the following:

- i. Confirm and ensure that the notification and all accompanying documents are received in good order by the members;
- ii. Seek confirmation of participation of members and report to the Chairperson; and
- iii. Inform the members timely of any change in agenda, venue, date and timing of the meeting.

\*\*\*

## **Annexure 4**

### **Annexure 4: Economic and Finance Committee's Review Report on National Budget for Financial Year 2018-19**

#### **Introduction**

At the feet of the Glorious Golden Throne, I, on behalf of the Hon'ble Members of the Economic and Finance Committee will like to sincerely thank Hon'ble Speaker for bestowing me with this opportunity to present the Budget Review Report. During the First Session of the National Assembly of the Third Parliament, the Minister for Finance presented the Budget Appropriation Bill for the Fiscal Year 2018-19 to the House and subsequently the House referred the Bill to the Committee for review in line with Section 240 of the National Assembly (Amendment) Act of the Kingdom of Bhutan 2014. The Committee thoroughly reviewed the Bill and also held stakeholder meeting with the Ministry of Finance.

As the Honourable Members are fully aware, I will like to inform the House that although as per the Rules of Procedures, the Committee is to be provided ten days to review the Budget Reports, it got only four days. As such, due to limited time, the Committee focused largely on reviewing the capital budget allocation of Nu. 11,380.192 million. This was since the current budget and capital budget for spill over and regular critical activities of total Nu. 37.321.937 million was already passed by the 11th session of the 2nd Parliament.

The following are the Hon'ble Members of the Economic and Finance Committee:

1. Hon'ble Kinley Wangchuk, Athang-Thedtsho Constituency, Chairperson
2. Hon'ble Ganesh Gimary, Phuntshopelri Constituency, Dy. Chairperson



**Annexure 4**

3. Hon'ble Dorji Wangdi, Panbang Constituency
4. Hon'ble Jurme Wangchuk, Drujeygang Tseza Constituency
5. Hon'ble Garja Man Rai, Sergithang-Tsirang Toed Constituency
6. Hon'ble Dil Maya, Tashichholing Constituency
7. Hon'ble Tek Bhaveur Rai, Shompangkha Constituency
8. Hon'ble Bimal Thapa, Kilkhorthang-Mendrelgang Constituency
9. Hon'ble Passang Dorji, Bartsham-Shongphu Constituency
10. Hon'ble Rinzin Jamtsho, Kengkhar-Weringla Constituency
11. Hon'ble Gyambo Tshering, Bardo-Trong Constituency
12. Hon'ble Karma Thinley, Wamrong Constituency
13. Hon'ble Dupthob, Bumdeling-Jamkhar Constituency

Committee Secretaries:

1. Tshering Yangzom
2. Karma Drupchu

**The Report is presented in the following order:**

1. Terms of Reference of the Committee
2. Consultation with Stakeholder
3. Compliance of the Budget Report with the provisions of relevant laws
4. Observations of the Committee
  - a. Chapter 1: Macro Economic Performance and Outlook
  - b. Chapter 2: Budget Estimates for FY 2018-19
5. Recommendations

**1. Terms of Reference of the Committee**

In Continuation, I will like to briefly present the Terms of Reference of the Committee.

- i. The Committee shall review, deliberate and debate on National

## **Annexure 4**

Budget, National Financial Statements and any other fiscal matters and submit recommendations and resolutions to the Parliament.

- ii. The Committee may review and reallocate the budget to achieve balanced development as per Article 9 (8) of the Constitution.
- iii. The Committee shall present its reviewed Budget Report within ten working days after the introduction by Finance Minister in the House.

### **2. Consultation with Stakeholder**

During the review of Annual Budget Report for fiscal Year 2018-19 and the Budget Appropriation Bill for the Fiscal year 2018-19, the Committee held two internal review meetings and one consultative meeting with the Secretary and officials of the Ministry of Finance wherein the Committee inquired clarifications on around 24 different issues. While the Committee has been mindful of the importance of consultation with the budgetary bodies such as ministries, departments, local governments and other agencies, due to time constraint, the Committee have consultation meeting only with the Ministry of Finance. The Committee feels it important in future to conduct thorough public hearings with the relevant stakeholders, make site visits and conduct physical review of some critical programmes to be able to provide more objective and accurate budget analysis report.

### **3. Compliance of the Budget Report with the provisions of relevant laws**

The Committee reviewed and ensured that the Budget Bill is in line with the provisions of the Constitution (Articles 14,22, and 9), the Terms of Reference of the Committee, the provisions of Public Finance Act (Sections 4,5,7,8), the policies of the 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan, and the policies of the Gross National Happiness.

**Annexure 4****4. Observations**

The Committee reviewed and ensured that the budget is appropriately allocated. During the consultation meeting with the Officials of the Ministry of Finance, the Committee observed that two flagship programs, namely Water (Ensuring Safe Drinking Water 24X7) and One Gewog One Product (OGOP) have been included in this Budget. The Committee felt that while OGOP is important and could go ahead, Water component could be deferred to the next budget to provide adequate preparation time for the Government to implement in more comprehensive way along with other flagship programs.

**a. Chapter 1: Macro Economic Performance and Outlook****Fiscal Deficit**

A fiscal deficit of Nu. 5,234.324 million in the Fiscal Year 2018-2019. The Committee raised concerns on the external interest free borrowings from World Bank and concessional borrowings from other sources to finance the fiscal deficit. Upon the Ministry's clarification, the Committee comprehended that due to the shortfall in the domestic borrowings to finance the fiscal deficit, external borrowing measures will be taken. For FY 2018-19 due to the status of Bhutan being a Least Developed Country, World Bank have agreed to provide interest free program borrowing with service charge of only 0.7%. For FY 2018-19, the fiscal deficit will be financed through interest free program of N. 2,143.865 million (US\$ 30 million) from the World Bank and the balance through concessional borrowings from the ADB and domestic borrowings.

**(Please refer to 'Financing' on page 14)**

**Annexure 4****b. Chapter 2: Budget Estimates for FY 2018-19****Tax and Non-Tax revenue**

The Committee observed that the tax and non-tax revenue have declined in the FY 2018-19. The Committee recognized that this decline was due to the poor hydrology which has resulted in low hydropower generation in 2018.

**Subsidies**

The Committee inquired about the basis on which the budget of Nu 606.560 million (earmarked as subsidies, equities and transfers) will be provided to the State-Owned Enterprises, particularly Nu.376.026 million to Revolving Funds I and II. The Committee felt the need to seriously consider the transfer of this amount including the need to reconsider the continuation of Rural Enterprise Development Corporation (REDCL) itself as an institution.

**General Reserves:**

The Article 14 Finance, Section 2 of the Constitution of Kingdom of Bhutan states that all public money shall be allocated for specific purposes by law. The Committee inquired about the specific works and budget allocated under Monsoon Restoration and Disaster Relief fund among the eight reserves mentioned in Table 2.20: Summary of General reserves.

The Finance Ministry clarified that Monsoon Restoration and Disaster Relief are specific works to which certain portion of the general reserve Budget has been allocated. The Monsoon Restoration Reserve is especially targeted towards road clearing and restoration during and after the monsoon season. The budget is maintained with the Regional offices, the Department of Road and the National level general reserve.

**Annexure 4**

In case of Disaster Relief Reserve the budget is allocated in line with the Disaster Management Act 2013 Chapter 2, Section 11(f) states “recommend allocation of fund for the purpose of recovery and reconstruction” and (h) “allocate resources from the national Disaster Management Budget”. A National Committee for Disaster Management overlooks the allocation of the budget. Currently the reserve is being maintained with the Ministry of Finance. (Please refer to 2.5.4 General Reserves on page 33)

**5. Recommendations:**

1. For minimal wastage of public resources and to minimise the burden of the proposed external borrowing from Asian Development Bank, World Bank, and International Environmental Development Fund to finance the fiscal deficit of Nu. 5 billion in the financial year 2018-19, the first recommendation of the Committee is to divert Nu. 376 million, which is proposed to be transferred as equity to Revolving Funds I & II to Water Supply and Rural Roads.
2. The committee extends its appreciation for the proper planning of 12<sup>th</sup> FYP by the Gross National Happiness Commission in collaboration with the Government and likewise the Finance Ministry for appropriation of equal budgets to the Central and Local Governments and in providing funds to the local governments in the form of block annual grants. The increase in budget appropriation to local government will increase the accountability of the Local Government leaders and will help in fulfilling the developmental activities in the local government. Hence the second recommendation of the Committee is, for the centre to provide capacity development

**Annexure 4**

to LG leaders on planning, budgeting, financial management and contract management, empowerment of the public in Monitoring and Evaluation of development programmes and provide adequate human resources.

3. While most countries in the world have a thumb rule of maintaining the General Reserve of around 5% of the annual budget, we do not have a clear rule. Therefore, the Committee recommends Government to propose a thumb rule for appropriation of annual General Reserve, in the Second Session of the Third Parliament.
4. The Committee during its review learned that, currently the disaster management fund is placed under Ministry of Finance with the general reserve fund. The Committee recommends the disaster management funds to be allocated to the Department of Disaster Management and to the respective 20 Dzongkhags for convenience and efficient responses during the times of disasters for the benefit of the general public.
5. The Committee recommends House to endorse the budget for the FY 2018-19 with total amount of Nu. 47,075.129 million including Nu. 29,075.167 million for current budget and Nu. 18,622.962 million for capital budget.

**Annexure 5****Annexure 5: Voting result on Budget for the FY 2018-19 and Budget Appropriation Bill 2018-19**

Voting: Passed: Yes: 44 Abstain: 1 No: 0 Total present: 45

1.	Lotay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
2.	Tandi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
3.	Sherub Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
4.	Yeshey Penjor	Delegate	Yes
5.	Karma Donnen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
6.	Dechen Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
7.	Loknath Sharma	Delegate	Yes
8.	Namgay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
9.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
10.	Jai Bir Rai	Delegate	Yes
11.	Dorji Tshering	Delegate	Yes
12.	Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
13.	Tshencho Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
14.	Karma Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
15.	Tshewang Lhamo	Delegate	Yes
16.	Jurmi Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
17.	Hemant Gurung	Delegate	Yes
18.	Yeshey Dem	Delegate	Yes
19.	Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
20.	Dorjee Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
21.	Kinga Penjor	Delegate	Yes
22.	Choki Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
23.	Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
24.	Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
25.	Ugyen Tshering	Delegate	Yes
26.	Tshering Chhoden	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 5**

27.	Lungten Namgyel	Delegate	Yes
28.	Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
29.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
30.	Ganesh Ghimiray	Delegate	Yes
31.	Dil Maya Rai	Delegate	Yes
32.	Dinesh Kumar Pradhan	Delegate	Yes
33.	Tek Bahadur Rai	Delegate	Yes
34.	Passang Dorji	Delegate	Yes
35.	Samdrup R Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
36.	Karma Thinley	Delegate	Yes
37.	Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
38.	Kuenga Loday	Delegate	Yes
39.	Gyem Dorji	Delegate	No
40.	Bimal Thapa	Delegate	Yes
41.	Garja Man Rai	Delegate	No
42.	Kinley Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
43.	Gyambo Tshering	Delegate	Yes
44.	Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
45.	Norbu Wangzom	Delegate	Abstain



**Annexure 6****Annexure 6: Voting result on the Amendment to the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete Ozone Layer**

Voting: Passed: Yes: 43 Abstain: 0 No: 0 Total present: 43

1.	Tandi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
2.	Karma Thinley	Delegate	Yes
3.	Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
4.	Kuenga Loday	Delegate	Yes
5.	Gyem Dorji	Delegate	Yes
6.	Bimal Thapa	Delegate	Yes
7.	Garja Man Rai	Delegate	Yes
8.	Kinley Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
9.	Gyambo Tshering	Delegate	Yes
10.	Lotay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
11.	Karma Donnen wangdi	Delegate	Yes
12.	Dechen Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
13.	Loknath Sharma	Delegate	Yes
14.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
15.	Jai Bir Rai	Delegate	Yes
16.	Dorji Tshering	Delegate	Yes
17.	Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
18.	Tshencho Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
19.	Karma Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
20.	Tshewang Lhamo	Delegate	Yes
21.	Jurmi Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
22.	Hemant Gurung	Delegate	Yes
23.	Yeshey Dem	Delegate	Yes
24.	Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
25.	Dorji Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
26.	Kinga Penjor	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 6**

27.	Choki Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
28.	Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
29.	Ugyen Tshering	Delegate	Yes
30.	Tshering Chhoden	Delegate	Yes
31.	Lungten Namgyel	Delegate	Yes
32.	Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
33.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
34.	Norbu Wangzom	Delegate	Yes
35.	Ganesh Ghimiray	Delegate	Yes
36.	Dinesh Kumar Pradhan	Delegate	Yes
37.	Tek Bahadur Rai	Delegate	Yes
38.	Passang Dorji	Delegate	No
39.	Sherub Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
40.	Dil Maya Rai	Delegate	No
41.	Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
42.	Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
43.	Samdrup R Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 7****Annexure 7: Voting result for the Motion on the Community Centres to be brought under Gewog Administration**

Voting: Passed: Yes: 17 Abstain: 2 No: 24 Total present: 43

1.	Tandi Dorji	Delegate	No
2.	Karma Thinley	Delegate	Yes
3.	Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
4.	Kuenga Loday	Delegate	No
5.	Gyem Dorji	Delegate	Yes
6.	Bimal Thapa	Delegate	No
7.	Garja Man Rai	Delegate	No
8.	Kinley Wangchuk	Delegate	Abstain
9.	Gyambo Tshering	Delegate	Yes
10.	Lotay Tshering	Delegate	No
11.	Karma Donnen wangdi	Delegate	No
12.	Dechen Wangmo	Delegate	No
13.	Loknath Sharma	Delegate	No
14.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	No
15.	Jai Bir Rai	Delegate	No
16.	Dorji Tshering	Delegate	No
17.	Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
18.	Tshencho Wangdi	Delegate	No
19.	Karma Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
20.	Tshewang Lhamo	Delegate	No
21.	Jurmi Wangchuk	Delegate	No
22.	Hemant Gurung	Delegate	No
23.	Yeshey Dem	Delegate	No
24.	Tenzin	Delegate	No
25.	Dorji Wangmo	Delegate	No
26.	Kinga Penjor	Delegate	No

**Annexure 7**

27.	Choki Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
28.	Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
29.	Ugyen Tshering	Delegate	Abstain
30.	Tshering Chhoden	Delegate	Yes
31.	Lungten Namgyel	Delegate	Yes
32.	Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
33.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
34.	Norbu Wangzom	Delegate	Yes
35.	Ganesh Ghimiray	Delegate	No
36.	Dinesh Kumar Pradhan	Delegate	No
37.	Tek Bahadur Rai	Delegate	No
38.	Passang Dorji	Delegate	Yes
39.	Sherub Gyeltshen	Delegate	No
40.	Dil Maya Rai	Delegate	No
41.	Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
42.	Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
43.	Samdrup R Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 8****Annexure 8: Voting result on the Motion to Retain the Posts of Gaydrung**

Voting: Passed: Yes: 40 Abstain: 2 No: 0 Total present: 42

1.	Lotay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
2.	Tandi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
3.	Sherub Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
4.	Yeshey Penjor	Delegate	Yes
5.	Karma Donnen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
6.	Dechen Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
7.	Loknath Sharma	Delegate	Yes
8.	Namgay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
9.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
10.	Jai Bir Rai	Delegate	Yes
11.	Dorji Tshering	Delegate	Yes
12.	Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
13.	Tshencho Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
14.	Tshewang Lhamo	Delegate	Yes
15.	Jurmi Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
16.	Hemant Gurung	Delegate	Yes
17.	Yeshey Dem	Delegate	Yes
18.	Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
19.	Dorjee Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
20.	Kinga Penjor	Delegate	Yes
21.	Ugyen Tshering	Delegate	Yes
22.	Tshering Chhoden	Delegate	Yes
23.	Lungten Namgyel	Delegate	Yes
24.	Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
25.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
26.	Norbu Wangzom	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 8**

27.	Ganesh Ghimiray	Delegate	Yes
28.	Dil Maya Rai	Delegate	Yes
29.	Dinesh Kumar Pradhan	Delegate	Yes
30.	Tek Bahadur Rai	Delegate	Yes
31.	Passang Dorji	Delegate	Yes
32.	Samdrup R Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
33.	Karma Thinley	Delegate	Yes
34.	Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
35.	Kuenga Loday	Delegate	Yes
36.	Gyem Dorji	Delegate	Yes
37.	Bimal Thapa	Delegate	Yes
38.	Garja Man Rai	Delegate	Yes
39.	Kinley Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
40.	Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
41.	Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Abstain
42.	Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Abstain

**Annexure 9****Annexure 9: Voting result on the Motion to recruit Gaydrungs under the Royal Civil Service Commission**

Voting: Passed: Yes: 25 Abstain: 9 No: 8 Total present: 42

1.	Lotay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
2.	Sherub Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
3.	Yeshey Penjor	Delegate	Yes
4.	Karma Donnen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
5.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
6.	Jai Bir Rai	Delegate	Yes
7.	Dorji Tshering	Delegate	Yes
8.	Tshewang Lhamo	Delegate	Yes
9.	Jurmi Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
10.	Hemant Gurung	Delegate	Yes
11.	Kinga Penjor	Delegate	Yes
12.	Choki Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
13.	Ugyen Tshering	Delegate	Yes
14.	Tshering Chhoden	Delegate	Yes
15.	Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
16.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
17.	Norbu Wangzom	Delegate	Yes
18.	Tek Bahadur Rai	Delegate	Yes
19.	Passang Dorji	Delegate	Yes
20.	Samdrup R Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
21.	Karma Thinley	Delegate	Yes
22.	Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
23.	Kuenga Loday	Delegate	Yes
24.	Gyem Dorji	Delegate	Yes
25.	Bimal Thapa	Delegate	Yes
26.	Garja Man Rai	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 9**

27.	Tandi Dorji	Delegate	Abstain
28.	Loknath Sharma	Delegate	Abstain
29.	Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Abstain
30.	Tshencho Wangdi	Delegate	Abstain
31.	Yeshey Dem	Delegate	Abstain
32.	Dorjee Wangmo	Delegate	Abstain
33.	Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Abstain
34.	Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Abstain
35.	Ganesh Ghimiray	Delegate	Abstain
36.	Dechen Wangmo	Delegate	No
37.	Namgay Tshering	Delegate	No
38.	Tenzin	Delegate	No
39.	Lungten Namgyel	Delegate	No
40.	Dil Maya Rai	Delegate	No
41.	Dinesh Kumar Pradhan	Delegate	No
42.	Kinley Wangchuk	Delegate	No
43.	Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	No



**Annexure 10****Annexure 10: Voting result on the Air Service Agreement between the Royal Government of Bhutan and Government of United Arab Emirates**

Passed: Yes: 38 Abstain: 1 No: 2 Total present: 41

1.	Lotay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
2.	Tandi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
3.	Sherub Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
4.	Karma Donnen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
5.	Dechen Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
6.	Loknath Sharma	Delegate	Yes
7.	Namgay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
8.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
9.	Jai Bir Rai	Delegate	Yes
10.	Dorji Tshering	Delegate	Yes
11.	Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
12.	Karma Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
13.	Tshewang Lhamo	Delegate	Yes
14.	Jurmi Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
15.	Hemant Gurung	Delegate	Yes
16.	Yeshey Dem	Delegate	Yes
17.	Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
18.	Dorjee Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
19.	Kinga Penjor	Delegate	Yes
20.	Choki Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
21.	Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
22.	Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
23.	Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
24.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
25.	Norbu Wangzom	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 10**

26.	Ganesh Ghimiray	Delegate	Yes
27.	Dil Maya Rai	Delegate	Yes
28.	Dinesh Kumar Pradhan	Delegate	Yes
29.	Tek Bahadur Rai	Delegate	Yes
30.	Passang Dorji	Delegate	Yes
31.	Samdrup R Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
32.	Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
33.	Kuenga Loday	Delegate	Yes
34.	Gyem Dorji	Delegate	Yes
35.	Bimal Thapa	Delegate	Yes
36.	Garja Man Rai	Delegate	Yes
37.	Kinley Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
38.	Gyambo Tshering	Delegate	Yes
39.	Karma Thinley	Delegate	Abstain
40.	Ugyen Tshering	Delegate	No
41.	Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	No

**Annexure 11****Annexure 11: Voting result on the Motion to Establish Flight Service from Gawahati to Yonphula, Bumthang, and Gelephu**

Passed: Yes: 40 Abstain: 0 No: 3 Total present: 43

1.	Lotay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
2.	Tandi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
3.	Sherub Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
4.	Karma Donnen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
5.	Dechen Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
6.	Loknath Sharma	Delegate	Yes
7.	Namgay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
8.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
9.	Dorji Tshering	Delegate	Yes
10.	Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
11.	Karma Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
12.	Tshewang Lhamo	Delegate	Yes
13.	Jurmi Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
14.	Hemant Gurung	Delegate	Yes
15.	Yeshey Dem	Delegate	Yes
16.	Kinga Penjor	Delegate	Yes
17.	Choki Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
18.	Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
19.	Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
20.	Ugyen Tshering	Delegate	Yes
21.	Tshering Chhoden	Delegate	Yes
22.	Lungten Namgyel	Delegate	Yes
23.	Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
24.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
25.	Norbu Wangzom	Delegate	Yes
26.	Ganesh Ghimiray	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 11**

27.	Dil Maya Rai	Delegate	Yes
28.	Dinesh Kumar Pradhan	Delegate	Yes
29.	Tek Bahadur Rai	Delegate	Yes
30.	Passang Dorji	Delegate	Yes
31.	Samdrup R Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
32.	Karma Thinley	Delegate	Yes
33.	Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
34.	Kuenga Loday	Delegate	Yes
35.	Gyem Dorji	Delegate	Yes
36.	Bimal Thapa	Delegate	Yes
37.	Garja Man Rai	Delegate	Yes
38.	Kinley Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
39.	Gyambo Tshering	Delegate	Yes
40.	Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
41.	Jai Bir Rai	Delegate	No
42.	Tenzin	Delegate	No
43.	Dorjee Wangmo	Delegate	No

**Annexure 12****Annexure 12: Voting result on the Motion to promote tourism for Regional Development (East, Central and South regions)**

Passed: Yes: 40 Abstain: 1 No: 2 Total present: 43

1.	Lotay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
2.	Tandi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
3.	Sherub Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
4.	Karma Donnen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
5.	Dechen Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
6.	Loknath Sharma	Delegate	Yes
7.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
8.	Dorji Tshering	Delegate	Yes
9.	Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
10.	Karma Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
11.	Tshewang Lhamo	Delegate	Yes
12.	Jurmi Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
13.	Hemant Gurung	Delegate	Yes
14.	Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
15.	Dorjee Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
16.	Kinga Penjor	Delegate	Yes
17.	Choki Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
18.	Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
19.	Rinzin Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
20.	Ugyen Tshering	Delegate	Yes
21.	Tshering Chhoden	Delegate	Yes
22.	Lungten Namgyel	Delegate	Yes
23.	Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
24.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
25.	Norbu Wangzom	Delegate	Yes
26.	Ganesh Ghimiray	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 12**

27.	Dil Maya Rai	Delegate	Yes
28.	Dinesh Kumar Pradhan	Delegate	Yes
29.	Tek Bahadur Rai	Delegate	Yes
30.	Passang Dorji	Delegate	Yes
31.	Samdrup R Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
32.	Karma Thinley	Delegate	Yes
33.	Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
34.	Kuenga Loday	Delegate	Yes
35.	Gyem Dorji	Delegate	Yes
36.	Bimal Thapa	Delegate	Yes
37.	Garja Man Rai	Delegate	Yes
38.	Kinley Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
39.	Gyambo Tshering	Delegate	Yes
40.	Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
41.	Yeshey Dem	Delegate	Abstain
42.	Namgay Tshering	Delegate	No
43.	Jai Bir Rai	Delegate	No

**Annexure 13**

**Annexure 13: Royal Kasho**

The Royal Assent is hereby granted on the submission for the deliberation on the Annual Audit Report 2017 in the Joint Sitting of the Parliament on January 21 and 22, 2019, during the First Session of the Third Parliament of Bhutan. On 12<sup>th</sup> Day of the 12<sup>th</sup> Month of the Earth Male Dog Year.

**DRUK GYALPO**

**Annexure 14****Annexure 14: Voting result on the Recommendation submitted by the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) on the Annual Audit Report 2017**

Passed: Yes: 66 Abstain: 1 No: 0 Total present: 67

1.	Lotay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
2.	Tandi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
3.	Karma Donnen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
4.	Dechen Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
5.	Loknath Sharma	Delegate	Yes
6.	Namgay Tshering	Delegate	Yes
7.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
8.	Jai Bir Rai	Delegate	Yes
9.	Dorji Tshering	Delegate	Yes
10.	Pema Gyamtsho	Delegate	Yes
11.	Tshencho Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
12.	Karma Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
13.	Tshewang Lhamo	Delegate	Yes
14.	Jurmi Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
15.	Hemant Gurung	Delegate	Yes
16.	Yeshey Dem	Delegate	Yes
17.	Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
18.	Ugen Tenzin	Delegate	Yes
19.	Dorjee Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
20.	Kinga Penjor	Delegate	Yes
21.	Choki Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
22.	Ugyen Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
23.	Ugyen Tshering	Delegate	Yes
24.	Tshering Chhoden	Delegate	Yes
25.	Lungten Namgyel	Delegate	Yes



**Annexure 14**

26.	Choida Jamtsho	Delegate	Yes
27.	Ugyen Dorji	Delegate	Yes
28.	Norbu Wangzom	Delegate	Yes
29.	Ganesh Ghimiray	Delegate	Yes
30.	Dil Maya Rai	Delegate	Yes
31.	Dinesh Kumar Pradhan	Delegate	Yes
32.	Tek Bahadur Rai	Delegate	Yes
33.	Samdrup R Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
34.	Karma Thinley	Delegate	Yes
35.	Dupthob	Delegate	Yes
36.	Kuenga Loday	Delegate	Yes
37.	Gyem Dorji	Delegate	Yes
38.	Bimal Thapa	Delegate	Yes
39.	Garja Man Rai	Delegate	Yes
40.	Gyambo Tshering	Delegate	Yes
41.	Dorji Wangdi	Delegate	Yes
42.	Tashi Dorji	Delegate	Yes
43.	Jigme Wangchuk	Delegate	Yes
44.	Tashi Wangyel	Delegate	Yes
45.	Tashi Wangmo	Delegate	Yes
46.	Karma Tshering	Delegate	Yes
47.	Kesang Chuki Dorji	Delegate	Yes
48.	Phuntsho Raptan	Delegate	Yes
49.	Nima	Delegate	Yes
50.	Sangay Dorji	Delegate	Yes
51.	Surja Man Thapa	Delegate	Yes
52.	Dorji Khandu	Delegate	Yes
53.	Ugyen Namgyel	Delegate	Yes
54.	Tempa Dorji	Delegate	Yes
55.	Sonam Pelzom	Delegate	Yes

**Annexure 14**

56.	Ugyen Tshering	Delegate	Yes
57.	Choney Dorji	Delegate	Yes
58.	Lhaki Dolma	Delegate	Yes
59.	Tirtha Man Thapa	Delegate	Yes
60.	Anand Rai	Delegate	Yes
61.	Tshewang Rinzin	Delegate	Yes
62.	Lhatu	Delegate	Yes
63.	Karma Gyeltshen	Delegate	Yes
64.	Tashi Samdrup	Delegate	Yes
65.	Dhan Kumar Sunwar	Delegate	Yes
66.	Pema Dakpa	Delegate	Yes
67.	Passang Dorji	Delegate	Abstain

**Annexure 15**

**Annexure 15: Address by Tshogpon at the Closing Ceremony of the First Session of Third Parliament**

1. On behalf of the Parliament, it is my pleasure to humbly welcome His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo for gracing the Closing Ceremony of the Third Parliament. We would like to express our deepest gratitude and reverence to His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo.

Likewise, i would like to welcome Her Majesty the Gyaltsuen, Members of the Royal Family, representatives of the Central Monastic Body, senior government officials, foreign dignitaries, and all people who have come to witness this occasion.

2. In the First Session, the National Assembly has endorsed 9 Standing Committees as per the provisions of the Constitution National Assembly Act of Bhutan.

The National Assembly has adopted the Terms of Reference (ToR) for the committees and therefore, it is imperative that the committees review and amend, and harmonize laws in line with the provisions of the Constitution for the well-being of the people with changing times.

3. In this session, the Parliament adopted Capital Budget of Nu. 11,380.192 million for the duration of six months (January 1-June 30, 2019).

Additionally, the 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan and the Annual Audit Report 2017 of the Public Accounts Committee were also deliberated in this session.

4. Similarly, two Protocols were ratified, few Motions were deliberated and Question Hour Sessions were carried out successfully.

**Annexure 15**

5. I had the great opportunity of presiding over the deliberation, and rendering equal opportunity to speak and debate in the House. The Members have carried out deliberations freely to ensure proper check and balance, and achieved fruitful outcomes.
6. It is of utmost importance to implement the resolutions of the House and to report back in the second session by the agencies and ministries concerned. I am hopeful that the committees would carry out effective legislative and oversight functions, and carry out public hearings and submit a report thereof to the House for deliberation.
7. To achieve food sufficiency in the country, our benign His Majesty has been working tirelessly for the welfare of our people thereby granting citizenship and land kidu graciously to our people in needs. His Majesty has recently granted building materials, seeds and seedlings as Soelrey to the people of Matabkha Gewog to support the community initiative to achieve food sufficiency and increase production. The Parliament offers its unwavering gratitude to His Majesty for such noble initiatives.
8. His Holiness the Je Khenpo has presided over World Peace Moenlam Chenmo in Punakha and Pema Gatshel Dzongkhags for eternal peace in the country and for the wellbeing of the Bhutanese people. His Holiness has also presided over Ka-Choe-Wang-Lung in various places, and therefore, the Parliament would like to offer our deepest gratitude to His Holiness the Je Khenpo.
9. With the blessing of the Triple Gem, mighty grace of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo, collective merits of the Bhutanese people and continued support of the Members of Parliament, the First Session

**Annexure 15**

has been successful. And, I would like to thank all Members for making this session a fruitful one.

10. Amid the concluding of the First Session and the commencement of the Second Session, I will like to convey my best wishes and prayers to all Members for successful gathering once again under the summit of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo's sacred Golden Throne.
11. The Royal Bhutan Police (RBP) security personnel have provided entire security cover throughout the session. The officials from Bhutan Agro and Food Regulatory Authority (BAFRA) has provided food safety, the Ministry of Health has provided health support, and the media was actively involved in broadcasting the sessions and bringing it to the people. The staff of the Department of National Properties (DNP) has fully supported the National Assembly Secretariat in the conduct of Parliament sessions. Furthermore, the staff of the National Assembly Secretariat always supported the Members of Parliament. Therefore, the House would like to thank all staff for their enormous support and dedication.
12. Lastly, before the Golden Throne, we would like to offer our prayers for the sovereignty of the country, good health and long life of His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo and the Members of the Royal Family. We would also like to offer our prayers for the good health and long life of His Holiness the Je Khenpo and all other noble beings. We pray for the eternal sun of peace and happiness to continue shining upon the people of Bhutan.

TASHI DELEK

\*\*\*\*\*

**Annexure 16**

**Annexure 16: List of Members present during the First Session of the Third Parliament**

1. Hon'ble Speaker Wangchuk Namgyel, Nyishog- Saephu constituency, Wangdiphodrang Dzongkhag
2. Hon'ble Prime Minister, Lotay Tshering, South Thimphu constituency, Thimphu
3. Hon'ble Leader of the Opposition Dr. Pema Gyamtsho, Chhoekhor-Tang constituency, Bumthang Dzongkhag
4. Hon'ble Minister for Home & Cultural Affairs, Lyonpo Sherb Gyeltshen, Monggar Constituency, Monggar Dzongkhag
5. Hon'ble Minister for Agriculture and Forests, Lyonpo Yeshey Penjor, Nubi-Tangsibji constituency, Trongsa Dzongkhag
6. Hon'ble Minister for Foreign Affairs Lyonpo Tandi Dorji, Lingmukha-Toedwang Constituency, Punakha Dzongkhag
7. Hon'ble Minister for Information and Communication, Lyonpo Karma Donnen Wangdi, Gelegphu Constituency, Sarpang Dzongkhag
8. Hon'ble Minister for Economic Affairs Lyonpo Loknath Sharma, Dophuchen- Tading Constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
9. Hon'ble Minister for Education, Lyonpo Jai Bir Rai, Phuentsholing Constituency, Chukha Dzongkhag
10. Hon'ble Minister for Health, Lyonpo Dechen Wangmo, North Thimphu Constituency, Thimphu Dzongkhag
11. Hon'ble Minister for Works and Human Settlement, Lyonpo Dorji Tshering, Radhi- Saketeng Constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag
12. Hon'ble Minister for Finance, Lyonpo Namgay Tshering, Dokar- Sharpa Constituency, Paro Dzongkhag
13. Hon'ble Minister for Labour and Human Resources, Lyonpo Ugyen Dorji, Thrimshing Constituency, Tashigang Dzongkhag
14. Hon'ble Deputy Speaker Tshencho Wangdi, Kabisa-Talog Constituency, Punakha Dzongkhag
15. Hon'ble Member Bimal Thapa, Kilkhorthang-Mendrelgang constituency, Tsirang Dzongkhag

**Annexure 16**

16. Hon'ble Member Choida Jamtsho, Nganglam constituency, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag
17. Hon'ble Member Choki Gyeltsehn, Maenbi-Tsenkhar constituency, Lhuentse Dzongkhag
18. Hon'ble Member Dil Maya Rai, Tashichhoeling constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
19. Hon'ble Member Dinesh Kumar Pradhan, Ugyentse-Yoeseltse constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
20. Hon'ble Member Dorjee Wangmo, Sombaykha constituency, Haa Dzongkhag
21. Hon'ble Member Dorji Wangdi, Panbang constituency, Zhemgang Dzongkhag
22. Hon'ble Member Dupthob, Boomdeling-Jamkhar constituency, Trashiyangtse Dzongkhag
23. Hon'ble Member Ganesh Ghimiray, Phuentshopelri constituency, Samtse Dzongkhag
24. Hon'ble Member Garja Man Rai, Sergithang-Tsirang Toed constituency, Tsirang Dzongkhag
25. Hon'ble Member Gyambo Tshering, Bardo-Trong constituency, Zhemgang Dzongkhag
26. Hon'ble Member Gyem Dorji, Dragteng-Langthil constituency, Trongsa Dzongkhag
27. Hon'ble Member Hemant Gurung, Lhamoidzingkha-Tashiding constituency, Dagana Dzongkhag
28. Hon'ble Member Jurmi Wangchuk, Drukjeygang-Tseza constituency, Dagana Dzongkhag
29. Hon'ble Member Karma Thinley, Wamrong constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag
30. Hon'ble Member Karma Wangchuk, Chhumig-Ura constituency, Bumthang Dzongkhag
31. Hon'ble Member Kinga Penjor, Gangzur-Minje constituency, Lhuentse Dzongkhag

**Annexure 16**

32. Hon'ble Member Kinley Wangchuk, Athang-Thedtsho Constituency, Wangdiphodrang Dzongkhag
33. Hon'ble Member Kuenga Loday, Khamdang-Ramjar constituency, Trashiyangtse Dzongkhag
34. Hon'ble Member Lungten Namgyel, Nanong-Shumar constituency, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag
35. Hon'ble Member Norbu Wangzom, Jomotshangkha-Martshala constituency, Samdrup Jongkhar Dzongkhag
36. Hon'ble Member Passang Dorji, Bartsham-Shongphu constituency, Trashigang Dzongkhag
37. Hon'ble Member Rinzin Jamtsho, Kengkhar-Weringla constituency, Mongar Dzongkhag
38. Hon'ble Member Samdrup R Wangchuk, Kanglung-Udzorong-Shompangkha constituency, Tashigang Dzongkhag
39. Hon'ble Member Tek Bahadur Rai, Shompangkha constituency, Sarpang Dzongkhag
40. Hon'ble Member Tenzin, Khatoed-Laya constituency, Gasa Dzongkhag
41. Hon'ble Member Tshering Chhoden, Khar-Yurung constituency, Pemagatshel Dzongkhag
42. Hon'ble Tshewang Lhamo, Bongo- Chhapcha, constituency, Chhukha Dzongkhag
43. Hon'ble Ugen Tenzin, Bji-Kar-Tshog-Uesu constituency, Haa Dzongkhag
44. Hon'ble Member Ugyen Dorji, Dewathang Gomdar constituency, Samdrup Jongkhar Dzongkhag
45. Hon'ble Member Ugyen Tshering, Lamgong-Wangchang constituency, Paro Dzongkhag
46. Hon'ble Member Ugyen Wangdi, Dramedtse-Ngatshang constituency, Mongar
47. Hon'ble Member Yeshey Dem, Khamaed-Lunana constituency, Gasa Dzongkhag



**Annexure 17**

**Annexure 17: Addendum - Proceedings and the Resolutions of the First Sitting of the Third Parliament of Bhutan**

**1. Inaugural Ceremony**

The First Sitting of the Third Parliament of Bhutan commenced on the Auspicious Descending Day of the Lord Buddha, on Wednesday, the 22nd Day of the 9th Month of the Earth Male Dog Year corresponding to October 31, 2018 with the ushering of the Ku, Sung, Thukten from the Golden Throne from Tashichhodzong.

**1.1 The Royal Order**

As per the 5<sup>th</sup> Section of the 10<sup>th</sup> Article of the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan which states that, “The Druk Gyalpo shall summon the first sitting of parliament after each general election”, His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo’s Order of Summon was read by the General Secretary to the House.

**The Royal Order**

As per the Constitution of the Kingdom of Bhutan, after the successful election of the Members of the National Assembly, I hereby summon the First Sitting to be held on October 31, 2018.

During the First Sitting, the Speaker and the Deputy Speaker to the National Assembly shall be elected as per the Constitution and the Guiding Rules of the nation. On the 20<sup>th</sup> Day of the 9<sup>th</sup> Month of Earth Male Dog Year, dated 29/10/2018.

His Majesty the Druk Gyalpo

**Annexure 17**

**1.2 The Members change their Scarves**

The Members received the Chakshen and Gyentag from His Majesty as recognized elected members of the 47 constituencies and wore Blue Burey scarves to represent their status as the Members of the Parliament.

**1.3 Zhugdrel Phunsum Tshogpa**

As Bhutan has a deeply rooted belief in interdependence, the First Sitting of the Third Parliament was considered auspicious for the members and the Zhugdrel Phunsum Tshogpa was coordinated by the Secretary General.

**1.4 Oath of Allegiance by the Members of the Parliament**

As per the Article 10, Section 19 of the Constitution of Bhutan, the Members of the National Assembly with the regulation of Chief Justice took the Oath of Allegiance as mentioned in the Third Schedule of the Constitution.

**1.5 Election of the Speaker and the Deputy Speaker of the House**

The Secretary General informed that the Speaker and the Deputy Speaker shall be elected as per the Article 12, Section 3 of the Constitution and spoke in detail about the nominees' speech and the process of the election and also presented the list of the nominees.

The Secretary General reported that from the ruling party, Wangchuk Namgyel of Nyishog- Sephu Constituency and from the opposing party, Ugyen Wangdi of Drametse- Ngatshang Constituency has been nominated for the seat of Speaker and for the seat of Deputy Speaker, the ruling party nominated Tshencho Wangdi of Kabji-

**Annexure 17**

Talo Constituency whereas the opposing party nominated Dr. Karma Wagchuk from Chume- Ura Constituency.

After that, the Secretary General having received the names of nominees in written form asked the nominees to speak about their opinions regarding the nomination and the nominees also thanked their parties for the faith and opportunity they were given by their respective parties to be nominated as candidates for Speaker and Deputy Speaker and asked for support from the mass so that they can be serve with their skills, knowledge and experience.

Then before the secret ballot, the biographies of the nominees were read out in order to inform the House about the professionalism of the nominees. The 47 members present casted secret votes and elected Wangchuk Namgyel of Nyisho- Sephug Constituency as the Speaker and Tshencho Wangdi of Kabji- Talo Constituency as the Deputy Speaker. The results were presented bring an end to the voting process.

**Election of the Speaker**

Sl. no	Dzong-khag	Constituency	Name	Count	Total	Re-marks
1	Mongar	Drametse-Ngatshang	Ugyen Wangdi	17	47	
2	Wangdue	Nyishog-Sephu	Wangchuk Namgyel	30	47	<b>Elected</b>

**Annexure 17****Election of the Deputy Speaker**

Sl. no	Dzongkhag	Constituency	Name	Count	Total	Remarks
1	Bumthang	Chume-Ura	Dr. Karma Thinley	16	47	
2	Punakha	Kabji-Talo	Tshencho Wangdi	31	47	<b>Elected</b>

**1.6 Vote of Thanks**

The Secretariat thanked the Chief Justice for regulating the Oath of Allegiance and also the Tsukla Lopen for coming to offer Nakchhu and also expressed thankfulness on behalf of the members. The First Sitting concluded with the expression of gratefulness to all the institutions and the agencies which have helped in the successful completion of the First Sitting of the Third Parliament.



Dated 31/10/2018

(Sangay Duba)  
**Secretary General**



འབྲུག་གི་སྤྱི་ཚོགས་གསུམ་པའི་རྒྱལ་ཡོངས་ཚོགས་འདུའི་ཞལ་འཛོམས་དང་པའི་ལས་རིམ།

གནམ་ལོ་ས་ལྷོ་ཁྱིམ་ ༣༨ གླ་ ༩ པའི་ཆེས་ ༢༢ ལྟ།



རྒྱ་ཆེད་ ལས་རིམ།

- ༡༠༠༠ ལྟ་ འབྲུག་མི་ཚུ་ ཚོགས་ཁང་ནང་ རྩོན་པ་དྲ་ མི་དབང་མངའ་བདག་རིན་པོ་ཆའི་ གསེར་ཁྱིམ་ རྩལ་དབང་བཅས་དྲ་  
བཞུགས་ཁྱིམ་ ༣༨ སའི་མཆོན་ཐོག་སྤྱི་ཡོད་མི་དང་འབྲེལ་བཞུགས་ནི།
- ༡༠༠༥ ལྟ་ མི་དབང་མངའ་བདག་རིན་པོ་ཆའི་ སྤྱི་འཛུགས་ལྟེན་ སྤྱི་གསུང་ཐུགས་རྟེན་ ཚོགས་ཁང་ནང་ གནམ་ལོ་ཞུ་ལྟེ་  
གསེར་ཁྱི་རྩམ་རྒྱལ་ཁང་བཟང་ནང་ བཞུགས་སུ་གསོལ་ནི།
- ༡༠༡༠ ལྟ་ ཡོངས་ཁྱབ་དྲུང་ཆེན་གྱིས་ བཀའ་ཤོག་རྒྱག་ཕུལ་ནི།
- ༡༠༡༥ ལྟ་ འབྲུག་མི་ཚུ་ རྩལ་ཤན་དང་ འགན་རྒྱལ་བཞེས་ཞིན་མ་ལས་ ན་བཟའ་སོར་ནི།
- ༡༠༢༠ ལྟ་ ཡོངས་ཁྱབ་དྲུང་ཆེན་གྱིས་ རྩོན་པ་ལེགས་སོ་ཞུ་ནི།
- ༡༠༢༥ ལྟ་ ཡོངས་ཁྱབ་དྲུང་ཆེན་གྱིས་ བཞུགས་གྲལ་དགོངས་བསྐྱོར་ཞུ་སྟེ་ བཞུགས་གྲལ་ཕུན་སུམ་ཚོགས་པ་གནང་ནི།  
- འབྲུག་གི་ཁྱིམ་སྤྱི་ཚོན་པོ་དང་ གཞུང་གྲུ་ཚང་གི་སྤྱོད་པ་དོན་ ཚོགས་ཁང་ནང་ན་ཞུ་ནི།
- ༡༠༣༥ ལྟ་ འབྲུག་གི་ཁྱིམ་སྤྱི་ཚོན་པོ་གིས་ འབྲུག་མི་ཚུ་གི་ གོ་གནས་ཀྱི་དམ་བཅའ་མ་ རོས་ལེན་གྱི་འགན་འཛིན་མཛད་ནི།  
- འབྲུག་གི་ཅུ་ཁྱིམ་ཆེན་མོའི་བྱུང་དེབ་གསུམ་པ་དང་འབྲེལ་ འབྲུག་མི་ཚུ་གིས་གོ་གནས་ཀྱི་དམ་བཅའ་མ་རོས་ལེན་ཕུལ་ནི།
- ༡༡༣༠ ལྟ་ གསོལ་ཇའི་བམ་འགྲོལ་ནི།
- ༡༢༠༠ ལྟ་ འབྲུག་མི་ཚུ་ ཡོག་ཚོགས་ཁང་ནང་འཛོམས་ནི།
- ༡༢༡༥ ལྟ་ ཚོགས་དཔོན་དང་ ཚོགས་དཔོན་འོག་མའི་ བཅོལ་འཐུའི་བྱ་རིམ་གྱི་གསལ་བཤད་ཕུལ་ནི།  
- བཅོལ་འཐུའི་རྩོན་ཚོགས་ཀྱི་ རོ་ཆེབ་ཀྱིས་ ཚོགས་རྒྱན་འཕུལ་ཆས་དང་འབྲེལ་བའི་ གོ་བཤད་གསལ་བཤད་ཕུལ་ནི།  
- ཚོགས་རྒྱན་ཐོག་ལས་ ཚོགས་དཔོན་དང་ ཚོགས་དཔོན་འོག་མ་ བཅོལ་འཐུ་མཛད་ནི།  
- བཅོལ་འཐུའི་བྱུང་འབྲས་གསལ་སྟོན་ཕུལ་ནི།
- ༡༢༢༠ ལྟ་ རྒྱལ་ཡོངས་ཚོགས་འདུའི་ མདོ་ཆེན་གྱིས་ བཀའ་ཤོན་ལེགས་སོ་ཞུ་ནི།
- ༠༡༠༠ ལྟ་ གསོལ་མཛད་གཅིག་ཁར་ ལས་རིམ་འགྲོལ་གནང་ནི།